DEVELOPMENT-INDUCED DISPLACEMENT OF INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS IN MAKKAH, SAUDI ARABIA

MAJRASHI, ABDULRAHMAN ABDULAZIZ M

UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MALAYSIA
DEVELOPMENT-INDUCED DISPLACEMENT OF INFORMAL SETTLEMENTS IN MAKKAH, SAUDI ARABIA

MAJRASHI, ABDULRAHMAN ABDULAZIZ M

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Urban and Regional Planning)

Faculty of Built Environment
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

APRIL 2017
DEDICATION

Specially dedicated to my family

To the great father

To the Kind mother

To my beloved brothers and sisters

To My wife

To My kids
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, all praises and thanks are due to Allah (SWT), the Omnipotent, the Merciful, and the Compassionate for giving me the strength, patience, courage, and determination to complete this work. Alhamdulillah.

I would also like to thank the Ministry of Education, Umm Al-Qura university, Department of Islamic Architecture, for funding my study.

It is difficult to overstate my gratitude to my Ph.D. supervisor, Prof. Dr. Ho Chin Siong and Prof. Dr. Ibrahim Bin Ngah. I have been amazingly fortunate to have supervisors who gave me the freedom to explore on my own, and at the same time, the guidance to recover when my steps faltered. Their patience, encouragement, and support helped me overcome many difficult situations and finish this thesis.

Never forget the unofficial external Supervisor from Umm Al-Qura University who started the journey with me but he left this world to better life ‘May Allh have mercy on soul of Prof. Dr. Al-Shareef Mohammed’

Special thanks for Albalad Alameen Company for Development and Urban Regeneration to carry out my survey progress.

Also, I would like to express my Great thanks to Omraniyoun Company for their kind assist during all the stages of this journey.

Finally, My sincerest gratitude goes to my friends that support me during this journey.
ABSTRACT

Development of urban infrastructure and amenities has been the major driver of development-induced displacement of settlements particularly in developing nations. The holy city of Makkah, Saudi Arabia, is undergoing massive urban redevelopment and is displacing residents of informal settlements. This development has affected the displaced residents of informal settlements by creating economic, social and environmental problems. Therefore, this study is aimed at assessing the impact of development-induced displacement of informal settlement in Makkah and proposing a model for development-induced displacement and self-resettlement (DID-SR). Accordingly, this study employs a mixed-method research approach of qualitative and quantitative research design. The data was obtained from 30 interviews with selected stakeholders and 415 online questionnaire survey that were administered to displaced households. The data were analysed using descriptive analysis, inferential analysis, and structural equation modelling (SEM). The result shows that house unit size and condition, social relationship, neighbourhood services and facilities, environment safety and economic well-being factors have positive effects on households’ satisfaction. Using those factors, the DID-SR satisfaction model was developed that can predict household’s satisfaction after displacement. The research implies that in order to improve the living condition and satisfaction level of the displaced people, policy makers should provide a resettlement programme that take in consideration the components of DID-SR model. The idea of giving the affected persons financial compensation to purchase property in other parts of the city as revealed in the study has not been successful. These outcomes become pertinent not only in advancing knowledge but also in terms of informing policy decisions targeting solving difficulties faced by the displaced people.
ABSTRAK

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DEDECLARATION</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LIST OF APPENDICES</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background                                            1
1.2 Problem Statement                                      4
1.3 Research Aim and Objectives                           7
1.4 Research Questions                                     7
1.5 Significance of the Study                              8
1.6 Scope of the Study                                     8
1.7 Structure of the Thesis                                9

## 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction                                           12
2.2 The Nature of Informal Settlements in Developing Countries  13
   2.2.1 Definitions of informal settlements                 13
2.2.2 The Characteristics of Informal Settlements 15
2.2.3 Causes of Informal Settlement Proliferation in Developing Countries 16
2.2.4 Approaches to Development of Informal Settlements 20
  2.2.4.1 Clearance 21
  2.2.4.2 Upgrading and Self-Help 21
  2.2.4.3 Urban Renewal 22

2.3 Development Induced Displacement 25
  2.3.1 The Concept of Development Induced Displacement 25
  2.3.2 Causes of Development Induced Displacement 27
  2.3.3 Factors that lead to Development Induced Displacement on Makkah 32
    2.3.3.1 Al-Masjid Al-Haram Expansion 34
    2.3.3.2 The Holy Sites Development 34
    2.3.3.3 Informal Settlements Re-development 35
    2.3.3.4 Transportation Infrastructure Development 35
    2.3.3.5 Urban Development Management Scheme 36
  2.3.4 Consequences of Development Induced Displacement (DID) 36
  2.3.5 International Law and Development Induced Displacement and Resettlement (DIDR) 41

2.4 Comparative Experiences of Displaced People around the World 42

2.5 Theoretical Model of Analysing Development-Induced Displacement 44
  2.5.1 Cernea’s Theory on Development Induced Displacement 44
    2.5.1.1 Landlessness 46
    2.5.1.2 Joblessness 46
2.5.1.3 Homelessness 47
2.5.1.4 Marginalization 48
2.5.1.5 Food Insecurity 48
2.5.1.6 Increased Morbidity 49
2.5.1.7 Loss of Access to Common Property 50
2.5.1.8 Community Disarticulation 51
2.5.2 Resettlement 51
2.5.3 Scudder-Colson Model of successful Resettlement 52
2.5.4 Theory of Satisfaction 53

2.6 Conclusion 56

3 INFORMAL SETTLEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT-INDUCED DISPLACEMENT IN MAKKAH 57
3.1 Introduction 57
3.2 An Overview of Saudi Arabia 57
3.2.1 Ruling System and Governance 60
3.2.2 Urban Planning System in Saudi Arabia 61
3.2.3 The System of Government 62
3.3 Makkah Province 63
3.3.1 History and Uniqueness of Makkah 65
3.3.2 Function of Makkah 67
3.4 Informal Settlements in Makkah 68
3.4.1 Current Situation of Makkah Informal Settlements 70
3.4.2 Jabal Al-Sharashif Informal Settlement 74
3.5 Adequacy of Measures towards Addressing the Problem of Informal Settlements in Makkah 75
3.5.1 Views Household about Important Factors for the development 78
3.5.2 Views of stakeholders about important factors for the development 78
4  METHODOLOGY  

4.1  Introduction  
4.2  Research Approaches  
   4.2.1  Selection of Research Method  
4.3  Research Design and Procedure  
   4.3.1  Phase 1: Research Establishment  
   4.3.2  Phase 2: Research Methodology  
   4.3.3  Phase 3: Data Collection  
   4.3.4  Phase 4: Data Analysis  
   4.3.5  Phase 5: DID-SR validation by experts  
4.4  Sampling Design  
4.5  Instruments for Data Collection  
   4.5.1  Questionnaire  
    4.5.1.1  Pilot Study  
   4.5.2  Interview  
4.6  Data Collection Method  
4.7  Quantitative Data Analysis  
   4.7.1  Descriptive analysis  
   4.7.2  Exploratory Factor Analysis  
   4.7.3  Structural Equations Modeling (SEM)  
    4.7.3.1  Goodness-of-Fit Criteria  
   4.7.4  Justification for using SEM  
4.8  Ethical Issues  
4.9  Summary
## 5 THE CONSEQUENCES OF DEVELOPMENT INDUCED DISPLACEMENT

- **5.1 Introduction**
- **5.2 Background of Respondents**
- **5.3 Descriptive Analysis of Socio-Economic Change of Affected People before and After Displacement**
- **5.4 Analysis of Level of Satisfaction of Affected People After Displacement**
- **5.5 Descriptive Analysis of Dependent Variables**
- **5.6 Validity and Reliability Test**
- **5.7 Exploratory Factor Analysis**
- **5.8 Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Measurement Models**
  - **5.8.1 Measurement Model for House Unit**
  - **5.8.2 Measurement Model of Neighbourhood Facilities and Services**
  - **5.8.3 Measurement Model of Social Relationship**
  - **5.8.4 Measurement Model of Environment Safety**
  - **5.8.5 Measurement Model of Economic well-being**
  - **5.8.6 Measurement Model of Households’ Satisfaction**
  - **5.8.7 Pooled Measurement Model**
- **5.9 Full Structural Model**
- **5.10 Hypothesis Testing**
- **5.11 Resultant DID-SR Model**
- **5.12 DIDS-R Model Validation by Experts**
- **5.13 Summary**

## 6 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

- **6.1 Introduction**
- **6.2 Summary of Findings**
  - **6.2.1 Informal Settlement in Makkah**
  - **6.2.2 Socio-economic consequences Before and After Displacement**
6.2.3  Level of Satisfaction and Factors Affecting Satisfaction 175

6.2.4  A proposed SEM Model for Understanding the Consequences of DID-SR 176

6.3  Theoretical Implications 176

6.4  Policy Implications 177

6.5  Limitation of the Study Future Research 180

6.6  Future Research 180

6.7  Conclusion 181

REFERENCES 182

Appendices A-H 209-241
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE NO</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Resettlement Compensation Options</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>The Four Stage process for Achieving Successful Resettlement</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Table showing Regions in Saudi Arabia, their Area, Capital and Population</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Table showing Makkah Province, their Area and Population</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Jabal Al-Sharashif Land use Pattern</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Jabal Al-Sharashif Structural System Percentage</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Summary of actions to be taken to address proliferation of informal settlements in Makkah city</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Variables and their Sources</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Cronbach's Alpha Reliability Coefficient Rules</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Validity of the pilot study</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Fit Indices Used</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Respondents Citizenship</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Gender of Respondents</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Age Group of Respondents</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Respondent’s Place of Birth</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Respondent’s Level of Education</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Respondent’s Occupation</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Duration of stay before displacement</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>Household size before and after displacement</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>Family type before and after displacement</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>Tenure type before and after displacement</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.11</td>
<td>Reasons for staying in the neighbourhood before and after displacement</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.12 Monthly income before and after displacement
5.13 Monthly expenditure before and after displacement
5.14 School location before and after displacement
5.15 Health centre location before and after displacement
5.16 Shopping centre location before and after displacement
5.17 Parking location before and after displacement
5.18 Al-Masjid Al-Haram location before and after displacement
5.19 House unit size and condition after displacement
5.20 Neighbourhood Services and Facilities measurement items
5.21 Social measurement items
5.22 Environment safety measurement items
5.23 Economic well-being measurement items
5.24 Satisfaction measurement items
5.25 Reliability coefficient of the constructs under study
5.26 KMO Measure of Sampling
5.27 The Pattern Matrix of All Variables
5.28 EFA for All Constructs Summary
5.29 CFA Measurement Model for House Unit Results
5.30 CFA Measurement Model for Neighbourhood Services and Facilities Results
5.31 Revised CFA Measurement Model for Social
5.32 CFA Measurement Model for Environment Safety
5.33 CFA Measurement Model for Economic
5.34 First order CFA Measurement Model for Satisfaction
5.35 Structural Model Results
5.36 The Validity Results of the Hypothesized Paths
5.37 Hypotheses Test Results
5.38 DID-SR Model Usefulness
5.39 DID-SR Model Improvement
5.40 DID-SR Model Applicability
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE NO</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Research Flow Chart</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Population growth of Saudi Arabia.</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Number of people displaced in Latin America because of Dam Construction. Sources: Cernea 1997 and Terminski 2013</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Number of People Displaced in Africa because of Dam Construction. Sources: Cernea 1997 and Terminski 2013</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Number of People Displaced in Asia because of Dam Construction. Sources: Cernea 1997 and Terminski 2013</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Major causes of DID (Terminski, 2012)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Projects that lead to Development Induced Displacement in Makkah</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Causes and consequences of DID</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>Impoverishment Risks and Reconstruction (IRR) Framework</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>Causes and Consequences of Displacement and Household Satisfaction</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>Proposed Model for the Study</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Map of Saudi Arabia.</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Flow of the administration system in Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Map of Makkah showing its cities and neighbours</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Map of Makkah Informal Settlement</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>The five informal settlements in the centre of Makkah city.</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Map show the study area before and after displacement of Informal Settlements</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Hypothesized House Unit Measurement Model</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>House Unit Measurement Model</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Hypothesized Neighbourhood Services and Facilities Measurement Model</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Neighbourhood Services and Facilities Measurement Model with factor loading</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Hypothesized Social Relationship Measurement Model</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Revised Measurement Model for Social</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Hypothesized Environment safety Measurement Model</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>Measurement Model for Environment Safety with factor loading</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>Hypothesized Economic well-being Measurement Model</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>Economic well-being Measurement Model with factor loading</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.11</td>
<td>Hypothesized Household’ Satisfaction Measurement Model</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.12</td>
<td>Satisfaction Measurement Model with factor loading</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>Revised Proposal Measurement Model</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.14</td>
<td>Second Revised Proposal Measurement Model</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.15</td>
<td>Hypothesized Structural of DID-SR Model</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>Resultant DID-SR Model</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.17</td>
<td>Standardized Estimates of the Resultant Framework</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABAM</td>
<td>Albalad Alameen Company for Development and Urban Regeneration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFA</td>
<td>Confirmatory Factor Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCOMM</td>
<td>The Development Commission of Makkah Al Mukarramah and Mashaaer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DID</td>
<td>Development Induced Displacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIDR</td>
<td>Development Induced Displacement and Resettlement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>Exploratory Factor Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GFI</td>
<td>Goodness-of-Fit Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMM</td>
<td>Holy Makkah Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDMC</td>
<td>Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDPs</td>
<td>Internally Displaced Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRR</td>
<td>Impoverishment Risks and Reconstruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KMO</td>
<td>Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRC</td>
<td>The Norwegian Refugee Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAPs</td>
<td>Project-Affected Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMR</td>
<td>Root Mean Square Residual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRMR</td>
<td>Standardized Root Mean Square Residual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCD</td>
<td>The World Commission on Dams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMSEA</td>
<td>Root Mean Square Effort of Approximation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JSIS</td>
<td>Jabal Al-Sharashif Informal Settlement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DID-SR</td>
<td>Development-Induced Displacement and Self Resettlement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPENDIX</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Output of Exploratory Factor Analysis</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Output of Structural Equation Modeling</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Study Area Maps</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Stakeholders Interview Questions</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Households Interview Questions</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Summary of Experts Participated on Stakeholders Interview</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>Experts Validation of DID-SR Model</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

Development induced displacement is the main issue among all the internally displaced populations (IDPs) around the world (Robinson, 2003). Most development-induced displacement and resettlement (DIDR) activities have traditionally been associated with mega projects ranging from infrastructure development to conservation and urban renewal projects which force the inhabitants to move away from their areas (Cahlikova and Stojanov, 2013; Agrawal and Redford, 2009; Vandergeest, 2007). Throughout the world, experts estimate the number of people that were displaced due to development projects in the last twenty years to be 250 million (Kagan, 2006). Majority of the displaced are from India and China; about 50 million people in India and 40 million in China have been displaced due to development projects in the last 50 years (IDMC, 2008; Robinson, 2003). The number of people that are likely to be affected will continue to soar in the coming years with urban growth rate exceeding 6% annually, which calls for more urban expansion and redevelopment of the existing settlements (UN, 2008). By 2030, the population of urban areas of the world is anticipated to rise from the present 3.4 billion to almost 5 billion (UN, 2008; Montgomery, 2008) and more than 2 billion people (about one-third of the earth’s population) will be residing in large cities with population of more than one million by the year 2025 (Robinson, 2003).

DIDR is associated with a number of problems with various dimensions. The World Bank in its Involuntary Resettlement Sourcebook (2004: p.35) states that:
“involuntary resettlement under development projects, if unmitigated, often gives rise to severe economic, social, and environmental risks: production systems are dismantled; people face impoverishment when their productive assets or income sources are lost; people are relocated in environments where their productive skills may be less applicable and the competition for resources greater; community institutions and social networks are weakened, kin groups are dispersed; and cultural identity, traditional authority, and the potential for mutual help are diminished or lost.”

Regeneration or renewal and urban development program are the main approaches used in overcoming urban related problems such as informal settlements, squatter settlements and or slum areas. Most of these development approaches target informal settlements, squatters and slums area inhabited by disadvantaged and low-income households. And relocation of these people from the inner city to the periphery areas would certainly affect their livelihood, as they are more likely to lose important locations linked to their survival. Cernea (2000) revealed that forced population displacement causes disruption to socioeconomic and cultural identities of those affected; tends to break up living patterns, dismantles existing modes of production, disrupts social networks and increases the risk of epidemics and health problems. Cernea (2006) also observed similar negative effects of displacement of by development, including exposure to epidemics, loss of physical and mental health and reduced access to health facilities such as hospitals and clinics. They equally noted that access to educational facilities is also hindered which leads to delayed educational opportunities for children.

In large cities of developing countries where land available for development are limited and with strong pressure for urban expansion, land occupied by informal settlements has become the priority of urban redevelopment. This is because the cost of redevelopment will be relatively lower compared to redevelopment of formal settlements. Furthermore, social services and income generating opportunities are more concentrated in such areas compared to sub-urban. Seraj and Al-Shareef (1992) categorized informal settlements as illegal residential areas mostly located in the outskirts of the large cities characterized by non-observance of the rules and foundations of urban planning of the land use, as well as the laws and the provisions
of the building regulations by official bodies. The land occupied by informal settlement in some cases normally belongs to the state, and thus compensation will be limited and more on the basis of humanitarian grounds. The re-development of informal settlement was also justified on the basis of their lack of satisfactory basic amenities such as water, electricity and sanitation (Tuladhar, 2005). Unfavourable land policies as well as urban and land use development programs in most of the developing countries contribute to the spread of informal settlement. Today, informal settlements are habitat for quite number of underprivileged people in most underdeveloped and developing countries. The reason for this phenomenon is widespread poverty and inadequate funding for shelter and land development caused by a lack of affordability.

In Makkah, the recent mega projects for the expansion of the Al-Masjid Al-Haram, together with the construction of accommodations for the pilgrims, construction of roads, railway tracks and other facilities to accommodate the increasing number of pilgrims during Hajj, have led to redevelopment of informal settlements and displacement. Development induced displacement of informal settlements in Makkah is unique, not only in terms of its large scale and relatively short time frame of development, but also in terms of the location of the area near Al-Masjid Al-Haram, nature of people who live in the informal settlements and regulations regarding the illegal immigrants. The population of these areas comprises of citizens and expatriates with low income and low level of education. Informal settlements are perceived to become a burden on the society as they served as hotspots for crime and other vices. They are dominated by urban poor, irregular immigrants and draw imbalance in the composition of the population. The people being displaced by the development projects of Makkah city were subjected to different treatment, for example, citizens of Saudi Arabia were eligible to receive compensation while illegal immigrants were not compensated. Due to the speed of development, no deliberate plan was in place for the resettlement of the people affected and they have to find their own way to resettle. However, the resettlement of displaced people globally involves not only monetary compensations; it also involves housing replacement and possibilities for generating income. Proper resettlement of the displaced people paves the way to sustainable development of the city, which can only be achieved in the presence of affordable and equitable access to opportunities.
Therefore, this study attempts to examine the nature of informal settlements in Makkah; consequences of development-induced displacement of informal settlements on the people affected; by developing a model for Development – Induced Displacement and Self Resettlement (DID-SR). It will look into the different impacts of the displacement in terms of the different socio-economic backgrounds of those affected and seeks to find the best way to pursue the programme of resettlement for the development induced displacement in the future.

1.2 Problem Statement

In the 1960’s and 1970’s, Saudi Arabia grew along Makkah and Madinah corridors. The growth brought about the creation of a grid of broad streets to ease the traffic to the northern and eastern part. The country is experiencing rapid urban growth because of its effort to accommodate an ever-increasing number of pilgrims who annually come to the Kingdom from all parts of the world to attend religious ceremonies. As a result, the older parts of the city were absorbed into the modern fabric. While efforts are being made to shape the modern city with planned streets and regular subdivisions within the new urban arrangement, the old villages turned into informal settlements. Similarly, poor Saudi families and migrants who are in dire need of cheaper accommodation created many informal settlements along the fringes of the city. All these areas have been categorized as unplanned settlements or slums (Karimi and Parham, 2012). According to Municipality of Jeddah report (2009), there are about 50 unplanned or informal settlements in Jeddah with an estimated population of one million. Most of these informal settlements are undergoing redevelopment.

Over the years, the practice in Saudi Arabia has been displacing large numbers of people from their settlements in the name of urban renewal and beautification without adequate arrangement for their resettlement, and this has greatly affected the social and economic wellbeing of the people. Prominent approach by the government through the developers in developing the cities is the King Abdullah reconstruction of Makkah, which includes expansion of Al-Masjid Al-Haram and construction of transportation system, public infrastructure,
facilities/services as well as accommodation to meet the increasing demand. This has affected some parts of informal settlements in Makkah region, where thousands are displaced, and more are expected to be displaced in near future.

Despite efforts of Saudi authorities and private developers to address the problem of informal settlement by provision of housing needs through market-driven infrastructure development programs, the problem of informal settlement persists (DAG, 2007). Al-Shareef (2002) contends that informal settlement is one of the major problems in Saudi Arabia cities. Informal settlement may be seen as a purely urban problem, but it is a product of political, economic and social factors. For example, the development project in Makkah is expected to displace 25,000 households (Al-Khudairi, 2012) and the programme is expected to compensate the affected households without any plan for formal resettlement. Most of these informal settlements are undergoing redevelopment.

Makkah urban boundary is estimated to occupy 114,000 hectares of land and about 18,500 hectares of the land is occupied by planned settlement, while 6,103 hectares is occupied by informal settlement (DCOMM, 2008). With the informal settlements occupying significant portion of Makkah urban boundary and the government’s desire to change the city’s fabric through proper planning of settlements and provision of infrastructure, urban renewal through displacement and development has become necessary. However, the development is faced by a lot of criticisms by the people due to over-emphasis given to urban development, particularly infrastructural development, thereby, neglecting the socio-economic well-being of the people. This is despite the emphasis by the World Bank Resettlement Policy, which emphasizes that, even with the absence of land title, those affected by development should receive compensation that replaces lost income, asset and well-being. The current development in Makkah provides compensation to residents without planned replacement of their land or residence. This has affected the people socially and economically, and has made them dissatisfied with their new residence. The displacement of thousands of people from their settlements has caused land prices to increase, over-stretching the existing housing supply and other infrastructure facilities in other neighbourhoods where the displaced people look for shelter. Many of the displaced residents were not able to
own new property as money given to them as compensation was insufficient to purchase house or landed property which converted them to tenants, not as owners as before. Due to their illegal dwelling status, some of them received no compensation. Many displaced residents faced difficulty to find suitable accommodation within the vicinity of the formal places. This development has also made room for manipulation in real estate to derive benefit as demand for rental increased.

Makkah, particularly, Jabal Al-Sharashif is unique due to its location next to Al-Masjid Al-Haram. The area was formerly a village dominated by different communities around the world, but due to the increasing urban growth and also increasing number of visitors to the Holy Land, the area is absorbed to be part of the city. Due to incompatibility of development in the area with that of the urban area, the area is considered as informal settlement, and part of the residents are displaced for expansion of urban infrastructure to meet the increasing demand. More are also to be displaced. Therefore, due to uniqueness of the area, there is need for a model that can guide future displacement of the people living in informal settlement in Makkah.

In addition to the compensation approach to displacement, little or no attention was given to public participation, which should be an integral part of the planning process for the expansion projects of Makkah. Apart from neglecting local people, the redevelopment of informal settlements in Makkah also gives less consideration to local experts. Fekade (2000) argues that due to failure of market driven infrastructural programs and ineffective land delivery system, the urban renewal programme has not yielded the desired result. Thus, informal settlements in Makkah were relocated spontaneously in new places, posing urban and social problems to the city.

Few researches have been conducted on informal settlements in Makkah. The focus of the few researches is on slum/informal settlements evolution, identification, location and subsequent problems (Al-Shareef, 2003; Al-Zahrani, 2014 and Al-Sobhi, 2014). These studies were based on documentary sources and focused only on the predictive approach based on Cernea’s Impoverishment Risks and Reconstruction model. The authors failed to adopt survey research and interview to explore in-depth understanding of the phenomenon, or investigate the direct and in-
direct impacts of displacement on the people. Conducting a research on this subject matter can reveal what has been done and what needs to be done in order to reduce the number of informal settlements and as well minimise the impact of displacement in Makkah. Therefore, this research is aimed at conducting in-depth investigation of the impact of development-induced displacement on the people through the use of survey, interview and observation to obtain in-depth understand of both the direct and indirect impacts of displacement on their socio-economic well-being, compare their experience before and after displacement, and develop a model for Development-Induced Displacement and Self-Resettlement.

1.3 Research Aim and Objectives

The aim of this research is to examine the impact of development-induced displacement of informal settlement in Makkah and to develop a model for development-induced displacement and self-resettlement. To achieve this aim, four objectives have been formulated. These objectives are:

i. To examine the current situation of Makkah informal settlements.
ii. To compare the socio-economic change of affected households before and after displacement.
iii. To assess the level of satisfaction of affected households with house unit size/condition, neighbourhood services/facilities, social relationship, environment safety and economic well-being after displacement.
iv. To develop a model for understanding and predicting the impact of future development of informal settlements in Makkah.

1.4 Research Questions

i. What is the current situation of Makkah informal settlements?
ii. What are the differences between the socio-economic factors before and after displacement?
iii. What is the level of satisfaction of the affected households with house unit size/condition, neighbourhood services/facilities, social relationship, environment safety and economic well-being after displacement?

iv. What are the causal relationships between house unit size/condition, neighbourhood services/facilities, social relationship, environment safety and economic well-being with satisfaction?

v. What is the appropriate model for future development of informal settlements in Makkah?

vi. What are the experts’ opinions about the (DID-SR) model?

1.5 Significance of the Study

Conducting a rigorous empirical study on this subject matter will help in identifying the various obstacles that impede successful achievement of urban development programs and beautification embarked upon by government in its bid to address the problem of informal settlement in Makkah region. The study is also important for government and policy makers as it will shed light on the need to look at the land policies and other related issues surrounding informal settlement, so that such laws and policies may be reviewed in order to accommodate such unforeseen circumstance. To urban managers, the study can reveal the social and economic impacts of the urban renewal programme by looking at the present condition of the people that have been displaced.

1.6 Scope of the Study

The scope of this study is limited to Jabal Al-Sharashif informal settlement. Jabal Al-Sharashif informal settlement is limited to the mountain that includes Jabal Omar, Al-Hafaer, Al-Tundabawy and Jurhom. The JAIS is bordered by Ibrahim Al-Khalel road, Jurhom Street, and Al-Mansour Street. The choice of this settlement among other settlements in Makkah city is based on the fact that it is located in the heart of city with a large population and where most developments are being carried out. Thus, government sees this settlement as having a negative impact on the image
of the city. Due to high influx of people into this settlement and the high demand for housing, structures without planning approval spring up indiscriminately. The residents of the study area include both the Saudi citizens and other nationalities that were already displaced. The consequences before (pre-displacement) and after (post-displacement) displacement were assessed and analysed in line with the diagnostic approach of Cernea’s Impoverishment Risk and Reconstruction Model. Different socio-economic backgrounds of the affected resident’s pre and post displacement were assessed. Moreover, consequences of displacement were finally assessed, and a model was developed for DID-SR.

1.7 Structure of the Thesis

This section provides a brief outline on the organization of the thesis chapters. The research flowchart is shown in Figure 1.1. This includes the following:

Chapter One presents a general introduction of the thesis. The research problem that includes causes and consequences of this proliferation is also presented, with particular reference to Jabal Al-Sherasheef in Makkah. The study objectives and research questions to address them are also presented in this chapter. The significance of the study to government, policy and decision makers as well to urban managers are discussed. Finally, the scope of the study is clearly stated in the chapter.

Chapter Two presents literature review on the concept of development-induced displacement (DID) concept. This chapter focuses on the concept of informal settlement in general, including its causes and consequences, and presents a review of theories and previous studies in the field. The various development projects that are likely to bring about involuntary displacement are also examined based on past experiences. The socio-economic impact associated with involuntary displacement of people due to development projects is highlighted. The various aspects of DID theory as propounded by Cernea are examined. Then, a framework incorporating some of the variables in this theory is developed.
**Chapter Three** presents an overview of the study area, rulings and the urban planning system. This chapter also discusses the origin of informal settlements in Makkah city, their characteristics, causes and factors that lead to development induced displacement. Finally, the primary study for problem identification was discussed through interview with households and stakeholders.

**Chapter Four** provides the methodological approach used in data collection and the data analysis procedure. In particular, research design guiding the study, sampling technique and size and statistical techniques adopted for the data analysis are discussed in detail. The various household and stakeholders involved in the interview are also highlighted. Procedure for testing the proposed model of Development Induced Displacement and Self-Resettlement was explained in detail. The model was assessed using fitness indices as suggested by literature.

**Chapter Five** discusses the results from the quantitative analysis. The main aim of this chapter is to provide answers to research questions posed in this thesis. Thus, the chapter looks at the socio-economic consequences of urban renewal programme on people residing in the informal settlements and their perception towards the whole issue. The level of satisfaction of the affected households with between house unit size/condition, neighbourhood services/facilities, social relationship, environment safety and economic well-being after displacement were identified. Moreover, the causal relationships between the factors and the satisfaction finally defined the appropriate model for future development of informal settlements in Makkah. In addition, validation of the model by experts in field of urban renewal and resettlement programme in Makkah was conducted.

**Chapter Six** provides a general conclusion for the study. In this chapter, a brief summary of findings from the study are highlighted, implication of the study was also presented and discussed. Based on the findings, recommendations are made on how to address some of the issues raised.

The next chapter presents a review of the literature of theoretical and empirical research pertaining to development-induced displacement and related subjects.
Chapter 1

Introduction

Determine the Objectives & Formulate the Research Questions & Develop Methodology

Chapter 2

Literature Review

Theoretical & Empirical Studies

Chapter 3

Study Area

Chapter 4

Data Collection

Primary Data

Qualitative
Interview Observation

Quantitative
Questionnaire

Secondary Data

Desktop Research, government documents, books and journals

Chapter 5

Chapter 6

Conclusion & Recommendation

Data Analysis

Quantitative Data

Descriptive Statistics
Mean, Standard deviation, Frequency and percentage

Inferential Statistics
Reliability analysis, exploratory factor analysis, Structural equation Modeling

Figure 1.1: Research Flow Chart


Al-Zahrani, K. (2014). *Slum areas in Makkah between hope and reality " toward a safe environment and sustainable*. Master's degree in architecture, department Islamic architecture Umm al-Qura University.


criteria for evolutionary architectural design. In Applications of Evolutionary Computation (pp. 204-213). Springer Berlin Heidelberg.


Central Department of Statistics & Information Saudi Arabia (CDSI), Saudi Arabia.


International Displacement Monitoring Centre (2005) Development Induced Displacement. Training on the protection of IDPs.


Housing by People: Towards Autonomy in Building Environments1976.


Walter Fernandes. "Displacement-What is all the fuss about?" Humanscape, November 1999.


