PAYMENT WOES AMONG MALAYSIAN CONTRACTORS

MUHAMMAD EHSAN B. CHE MUNAAIM

UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MALAYSIA
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my appreciation to all my lecturers who have given me ideas and advice during the writing of this dissertation. I would particularly like to mention in this respect my dissertation supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Aminah Md Yusuf, for her assistance and kind comments during the preparation of this project.

Special acknowledgement is dedicated to my parents, my beloved wife and my lovely daughter for their continuing support, patience and encouragement during these times. I would also like to express my thanks to my coursemates with whom I have exchanged ideas.

I am also deeply indebted to Majlis Amanah Rakyat (MARA) for their funding throughout the whole course without which I would have been unable to attend this course in the first place.

I would like to sincerely thank those organisations and individuals who spared their time to respond to the questionnaire. Their contribution to this study is invaluable.

Lastly, my appreciation also goes to all those who contributed directly and indirectly to making this dissertation possible.
ABSTRACT

Payment problems have prompted several developed countries to introduce construction-specific statutory security of payment acts typically known as construction contracts act to eliminate poor payment practices and smoothen the contractors’ cash flow. Malaysia too cannot pretend not to have these problems despite adequate mechanisms provided in many standard forms of construction contract. This paper presents findings of a study conducted amongst Malaysian contractors with the aims to determine the seriousness of late and non-payment problems, to identify the main causes and effects of late and non-payment and to identify remedies for securing payment debt as already been embedded in the construction contracts acts in other developed countries. It can be concluded that many local contractors have experienced late and non-payment problems in the Malaysian construction industry and the situation is far worse when it comes to government clients. This problem actually involves enormous amounts of money and leads to other problems that could affect the performance and image of the construction industry. The study via theoretical investigation and research survey found that the late and non-payment problems are contributed by inter alia: local culture/attitude, disagreement on the valuation of work done and paymaster's poor financial management. The study shows that late and non-payment can create cash flow problems, stress and undue financial hardship on the contractors. Amongst the most appropriate remedies to overcome or mitigate the problem of late and non-payment faced by local contractors include: a right to a speedy dispute resolution mechanism e.g. adjudication, a right to suspend work and a right to regular periodic payment. It is perhaps timely for Malaysia to introduce its own statute on the Payment and Adjudication Act.
ABSTRAK

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>III</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>IV</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>V</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>VI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>X1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF APPENDICES</td>
<td>XIII</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 INTRODUCTION            1

1.1 Introduction          1
1.2 Problem Statement     2
1.3 Aim and Objectives of Research  3
1.4 Significance of Research  4
1.5 Research Methodology  4
1.6 Limitation            7
1.7 Structure of Dissertation  7
1.8 Concluding Remark     9
2 THE ISSUES OF LATE AND NON-PAYMENT

2.1 Introduction
2.2 The Issues of Late and Non-Payment
2.3 Present Remedies under the Contract and Common Law
2.4 Concluding Remark

3 CAUSES AND EFFECTS OF LATE AND NON-PAYMENT

3.1 Introduction
3.2 Potential Causes of late and Non-Payment
   3.2.1 Paymaster’s Poor Financial Management
   3.2.2 Paymaster’s Withholding of Payment
   3.2.3 Conflict among Parties Involved
   3.2.4 The Use of ‘Pay When Paid’ Clauses in Sub-contracts
   3.2.5 Local Culture/Attitude
   3.2.6 Short of Current Year Project Budget
   3.2.7 Delay in Certification
   3.2.8 Disagreement on the Valuation of Work Done
3.3 Effects of Late and Non-Payment
   3.3.1 Creates Financial Hardship
   3.3.2 Creates Negative Chain Effect on Other Parties
   3.3.3 Create Cash Flow Problems
   3.3.4 Results in Delay in Completion of Projects
   3.3.5 Leads to Bankruptcy or Liquidation
   3.3.6 Leads to Abandonment of Projects
   3.3.7 Results in Formal Dispute Resolution E.g. Litigation / Arbitration
   3.3.8 Creates Negative Social Impacts
4 ALTERNATIVE REMEDIES FOR SECURING PAYMENT DEBT

4.1 Introduction 28
4.2 Remedies for Securing Payment Debt 29
  4.2.1 Payment of Stipulated Interest 29
  4.2.2 Suspension of Work 30
  4.2.3 Right to Slow Down Work 32
  4.2.4 Eradication of “Pay When Paid” Clause 32
  4.2.5 Right to refer dispute to Adjudication 33
  4.2.6 The Creation of a Right to a Lien 37
  4.2.7 Payment Bond 37
  4.2.8 The Mandatory Creation of a Trust Account or Retention Sums 38
4.3 Concluding Remark 38

5 DATA COLLECTION 39

5.1 Introduction 39
5.2 Methodology 40
5.3 Target Respondents 40
5.4 Questionnaire Structure 41
5.5 Definitions 42
5.6 Concluding Remark 43

6 DATA ANALYSIS 44

6.1 Introduction 44
6.2 Contractor’s Background and Experience with 45
Late and/or Non-Payment

6.3 The Seriousness of Late and Non-Payment Problems 53
6.4 Causes and Effects of Late and Non-Payment 59
   6.4.1 Local Culture/Attitude 60
   6.4.2 Disagreement on the Valuation of Work Done 60
   6.4.3 Paymaster's Poor Financial Management 61
   6.4.4 Create Cash Flow Problems 62
   6.4.5 Create Financial Hardship 63
   6.4.6 Create Stress on Contractors 63
6.5 Alternative Remedies for Securing Payment Debt 64
   6.5.1 Right to a Speedy Dispute Resolution 66
      Mechanism i.e. Adjudication
   6.5.2 Right to Suspend Work 66
   6.5.3 Right to Regular Periodic Payment 67
6.6 Concluding Remark 68

7 FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS 70

7.1 Introduction 70
7.2 Findings 70
   7.2.1 Finding 1: The Seriousness of Late and Non-Payment Problems 71
   7.2.2 Finding 2: Causes of Late and Non-Payment 71
   7.2.3 Finding 3: Effects of Late and Non-Payment 71
   7.2.4 Finding 4: Alternative Remedies for Securing Payment Debt 72
7.3 Conclusion 72

REFERENCES 74

APPENDIX 75
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE NO.</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Late Payment in Government Funded Projects</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Late Payment in Private Funded Projects</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Non-Payment in Government Funded Projects</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Non-Payment in Private Funded Projects</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Total value of Government Projects Undertaken by Contractors since January 2000</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Total value of Private projects undertaken by contractors since January 2000</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Value of Projects (In RM) of late or Non-Payment Experienced by Contractors since January 2000</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Total Amount Which Remains Overdue for Contractors since January 2000</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE NO.</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Framework of Research Methodology</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Contractual Payment Chain and Legal Relationships between Parties</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Contractors’ CIDB Grades</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Respondents' Current Position in Company</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Company's Main Business Activity since January 2000</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Company’s Years of Experience</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Number of Full-time Staff Employed by the Company</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Late Payment in Government Funded Projects</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Late Payment in Private Funded Projects</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Non-Payment in Government Funded Projects</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>Contractors’ Experience with Non-Payment in Private Funded Projects</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>Total value of Government Projects Undertaken by Contractors since January 2000</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.11</td>
<td>Total value of Private projects undertaken by contractors since January 2000</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>Causes for Late Payment</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.13</td>
<td>Causes for Non-Payment</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.14</td>
<td>Effects of Late Payment</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.15</td>
<td>Effects of Non-Payment</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.16</td>
<td>Alternative Remedies for Securing Payment Debt</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPENDIX</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Sample of Questionnaire Survey</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction

The practice of efficient and timely payment in construction projects is a major factor leading to a project’s success. The importance of payment is further amplified by the fact that the construction industry relatively involves long durations to complete, large amounts of money to spend and the widely use of credit payment term rather than payment on delivery in purchasing of materials (Ameer Ali, 2005b). It is generally accepted that late and/or non-payment will cause severe cash flow problems especially to contractors, and this would have a devastating knock-on effect down the contractual payment chain. The importance of cash flow was also recognized by late Lord Denning in *Dawnays Ltd. v. FG Minter* \(^1\) who regarded cash flow as the “lifeblood of the enterprise”. Late and non-payment issues or rather contractors’ payment woes are considered to affect many players in the local construction industry, whether in government or private funded projects.

---

\(^1\) 1971 1WLR 1205.
Due to these problems, some countries like United Kingdom, Singapore, New Zealand and some states in Australia have legislated their construction specific statutory payment security regimes that purposely enact provisions to address issues on prompt payment in the construction industry, and to eliminate as much as possible poor payment practices and smoothen the contractor’s cash flow. Malaysia too cannot pretend not to have this problem. A study conducted by the Master Builder Association of Malaysia (MBAM) shows an unsurprising discovery of the subsistence of the late-payment culture in the Malaysian Construction Industry. As such, there is an urgency for us to find alternative remedies which could effectively put an end to the cash flow problem in our industry. It is important to note that some of the remedies have been incorporated in many Construction Contracts Acts across the globe. Basically, a typical construction contract Act contains two sections. The first section deals with adjudication provisions and the second section governs the payment mechanism. Once the Act is in place, it will provide mandatory requirements for construction contracts to include adjudication and payment provisions failing which a default Scheme will be incorporated and acts as implied terms of the contract. Currently, Malaysia is in the midst of drafting its very own Adjudication and Payment Act, which is targeted to be in force in 2007. Extensive efforts are being conducted by the Construction Industry Development Board (CIDB) to promote the use of the Act in the future should the Act receive its Royal Assent. If the bill becomes an act, all the standard forms of contracts available in Malaysia have to be amended to reflect the new parameters introduced by the Act.

1.2 Problem Statement

Although there are adequate mechanisms provided in many standard forms of construction contracts, yet there remains a chronic problem of late and non-payment issues in the Malaysia construction industry (Ameer Ali, 2005b). It is anticipated that
the protections against the employer’s failure to pay, suspension of works, determination and claim on interest are considered as the major problems associated with late and non-payment issues in Malaysia. The main issues that require particular attention are as follows:

1. Why do Malaysian contractors still experiencing late or/and non-payment situation despite adequate mechanisms provided by many standard forms of contracts?
2. How to overcome this problem and to smoothen contractors’ cash flow, which will ultimately improve the quality of end products.

1.3 **Aim and Objectives of Research**

This aim of this study is to address the problems of late and non-payment by way of providing evidence about the seriousness of late and non-payment issues in the Malaysian construction industry.

The above aim is supported by the following objectives:

i. To determine the seriousness of late and non-payment problems among Malaysian contractors and sub-contractors;

ii. To study the causes of late and non-payment in the local scene;

iii. To analyse the effects of delayed and non-payment to the payees down the contractual payment chain and to the society in general; and

iv. To identify and establish contractual and/or statutory remedies to resolve or mitigate contractors’ payment woes.
1.4 Significance of Research

Findings of this study may assist the government and relevant parties in addressing problems associated to late and non-payment in an effective and timely manner to create a win-win situation for all parties in the Malaysian construction industry. It is hoped that the government and relevant parties will adopt and implement the necessary plan of action in order to minimise disputes on payment in any construction project, so as to create a friendly and enjoyable working environment for all parties and to improve the payment flows in the Malaysian construction industry. The result of this research may be of significance to the introduction of a legislation known as the Construction Payments or Security of Building Payment Act, which already enacted in many advanced countries.

1.5 Research Methodology

A framework of the methodology has been designed to show the distinct stages and the sequence in which they occur. The framework is represented diagrammatically in Figure 1.1.
Figure 1.1: Framework of Research Methodology

Literature survey and review

Determination of the objectives and scope of research

Gather data from literature review and start writing report
Areas covered:
  a. The issues of late and non-payment
  b. Causes of late and non-payment
  c. Effects of late and non-payment
  d. Remedies for securing payment debt

Conduct questionnaire survey

Collection of questionnaire and gathering data in detail

Analysis of data collected from questionnaire

Conclusion and recommendation based on analysis
The research for this dissertation was conducted using the following approaches:

a) Literature Review

This includes the latest secondary data and information collected from different sources which can be used for the survey being conducted. The sources include books, journals, magazines, dissertations, conference papers, periodicals and information from the internet. These materials were used for background reading to obtain full understanding and information needed for discussion and analysis in the research. References were obtained from the libraries in University of Technology of Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur and University of Malaya.

Research papers and journals provided invaluable information regarding the causes, effects and probable solutions related to the issues of late and non-payment in the global construction industries.

b) Questionnaire Survey

Due to the restrictive nature of the study, the principal information was obtained solely from a questionnaire survey. The questionnaire survey was conducted to collect primary data from contractors in Malaysia for research purposes. Details and analysis of the survey are presented in Chapter 6. A sample copy of the questionnaire is included in Appendix ‘A’.
1.6 Limitation

The questionnaire survey undertaken is confined to studying the responses to and opinion of contractors in Malaysia about the seriousness of the issue of late and non-payment and the contributing factors for its existence. The contractors’ favourable remedies in securing payment debt from their respective clients were also recorded in this survey.

It is anticipated that the small sample selected in the questionnaire survey and the poor response may limit the reliability of the findings. Notwithstanding this, the findings can still be used and further research should be able to verify the matter.

1.7 Structure of Dissertation

The dissertation is structured into seven chapters.

a. Chapter 1 - Introduction

The introductory chapter provides an overview of the context in which the research was conducted.
b. Chapter 2 – The Issues of Late and Non-Payment

This chapter deals with the problem of late and non-payment experienced by other developed countries and Malaysia in particular.

c. Chapter 3 – Potential Causes and Effects of Payment Problems

In this chapter the potential causes of such problem are discussed and scrutinized. Thereafter, the effects of untimely payment and non-payment to the payees down the contractual payment chain and to the society in general are identified and established.

d. Chapter 4 – Alternative Remedies for Securing Payment Debt

This chapter discusses the remedies available in securing payment debt that are being practiced in developed countries. The suitability of each remedy in Malaysia scenario is also examined.

e. Chapter 5 – Data Collection

This chapter presents the data collected from the questionnaire survey. The findings reveal the response from Malaysian contractors pertaining the issue of delayed and non-payment.

g. Chapter 6 – Data Analysis

This chapter analyses the data collected in Chapter 5 together with the discussion of results.
f. Chapter 7 – Findings and Conclusions

This chapter draws together all the research results to present the overall findings and conclusions.

1.8 Concluding Remark

This dissertation aims to study the payment problems experienced by many contractors and sub-contractors in Malaysia by providing statistical and tangible data of the seriousness of the problems which have persisted for ages but not fully addressed and attended to. The foundation of this dissertation is clearly stated in this chapter in order to give a clear view before proceeding further to the following chapters. The next chapter deals with the issues of late and not-payment faced by other developed countries and Malaysia.
REFERENCES


