EVALUATION ON BENEFITS AND PROBLEMS OF CONVENTIONAL AND BIM BASED DOCUMENTATION THROUGH COMPARISON METHOD

REZA BARATI

A project report submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Master of Science (Construction Management)

Faculty of Civil Engineering
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

January, 2013
To;

My Parents
&
My family

Thanks for your pray, attention and spiritual support
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

It is a great pleasure to address those people who helped me throughout this project to enhance my knowledge and practical skills especially in research area. My deepest and most heartfelt gratitude goes to my supervisors, MR. BACHAN SINGH. The continuous guidance and support from him have enabled me to approach work positively, and make even the impossible seem possible.

I wish to express my special thanks to my beloved parents, family who gives me spirit, support and encouragement in the completion this project.

Finally, thanks to all my classmates for their helped and support. I would also like to thank everyone who has contributed whether directly or indirectly to this project. This project would have been impossible without your guidance, advice and support.
ABSTRACT

Documentation is an important part in the process of construction. Currently, the conventional documentation method such as Computer Aided Design (CAD) is more commonly used in construction project. New modern approaches like Building Information Modelling-based (BIM-based) help in improvising the quality of construction documentation. There are main gaps between conventional-based documentation process (CAD) and BIM-based documentation process including fragmented nature of the software, lack of collaboration and integration between involved parties, considerable amount of missing data and also lack of capability of applicable visualization. This study, therefore, aim to evaluate the benefits of BIM based documentation with the attention to highlight the problems from CAD conventional–based documentation. The objectives used to achieve the aim are by identify the problems of the Conventional–based documentation using CAD, investigate the benefits, compare the differences and evaluate the benefits and problems of the documentation process of between BIM-based and conventional CAD methods. The study is carried out based on questionnaire survey within construction companies in Singapore. The data is analyzed using statistical analysis of average index. The differences between BIM-based documentation and conventional CAD documentation are BIM approach able to create smart 3D model, create 4D model by adding time dimension into the model and 5D model by additional aspect of project cost. In conclusion the benefits of the BIM–based documentation could overcome the majority of the conventional–based documentation’s problems that, except the minor indicators, the main outcomes of project was conformed the hypothesis of the research.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENT</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 Background of Study 3

1.3 Problem Statement 4

1.4 Aim of Study 6

1.5 Objectives of Study 6

1.6 Main Hypothesis 7

1.7 Research Questions 7

1.8 Scope of Research 7

1.9 Research Methodology 8

## 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction 7

2.2 Documentation 10

2.2.1 Definition of Documentation 10
2.2.2 Process of Document Implementation  11  
2.2.3 Benefit of Documentation  14  
2.3 Computer Aided Design (CAD)  15  
2.3.1 Computer Aided Design (CAD)  15  
2.3.2 Brief History of CAD  16  
2.3.3 Process of CAD Implementation  17  
2.3.4 Challenging  18  
2.4 BIM Review  19  
2.4.1 BIM Definition  19  
2.4.2 History of BIM  20  
2.4.3 Benefit of BIM  22  
2.4.4 Potential Building Information Modeling Tools  25  
2.4.5 Few Modeling Software  29  
2.4.6 BIM Future Challenges  36  
2.5 CAD vs. BIM  37  
2.6 Previous Works and Studies  38  
2.7 Summary  41  

3 METHODOLOGY  42  
3.1 Introduction  42  
3.2 Respondents of Study  43  
3.3 Research Instrument Used  43  
  3.3.1 Scope and Case Study  43  
  3.3.2 Questionnaire  44  
3.4 Research steps  45  
3.5 Methods of Data analysis  45  
  3.5.1 Frequency Analysis  46  
  3.5.2 Average Index Analysis  46  
3.6 Summary  47  

4 DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS  48  
4.1 Introduction  48  
4.2 Findings and Analysis  49
4.3 Finding Objective 1 51
4.4 Finding Objective 2 52
4.5 Finding Objective 3 56
4.6 Finding Objective 4 59
  4.6.1 Draw Object 59
  4.6.2 Automatically Creation Details 62
  4.6.3 Creation section without drawing 62
  4.6.4 Creation Schedule Base on the Database 63
  4.6.5 Modelling Within the Single, Integrated Database 65
  4.6.6 Automatically Update Changing in All Views 65
  4.6.7 Enables Early Design Energy Analysis 67
  4.6.8 Checking Interferences and Clash Detection 71
  4.6.9 Assigning Phase 73
  4.6.10 Development Smart 3D Model 74
  4.6.11 Error Checking Automatically 76
  4.6.12 Assign Specification to Material 76
  4.6.13 Creating Visual Planning and Scheduling 77
  4.6.14 Automatically Take-Off the Quantity of Material 80
     Identify Hazards in Pre- Construction Stage with 81
     4D Model
  4.6.15 Better Controlling the Risks in the Design Phase 82

5 CONCLUSION 84
  5.1 Introduction 84
  5.2 Conclusion 84

REFERENCES 87

APPENDICES 92
  APPENDIX A 92
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE NO.</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>BIM Software</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Rating Scale Questionnaire Responses</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Classification of the Rating Scales</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Respondent’s area of specialization</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Years of experience of the respondents</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Problems of the Conventional–based documentation using CAD</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>The benefits of using the BIM-based documentation</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>The problems of using the BIM-based documentation</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>A comparison of abilities and benefits of the drawing documentation between BIM and CAD</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>A comparison of abilities and benefits of the specification documentation between BIM and CAD</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>A comparison of abilities and benefits of the Planning and Scheduling documentation between BIM and CAD</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>A comparison of abilities and benefits of Bill of Quantity documentation between BIM and CAD</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>A comparison of abilities and benefits of Project Health and Safety Plan documentation between BIM and CAD</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE NO.</th>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Flowchart Diagram of the Research Process</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>An Object And Some of Its Properties</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Autodesk Revit</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>A screenshot Archicad</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>A screenshot of Google sketch up interface</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Comparison Between the Conventional CAD and the ‘New’ BIM Approach</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Respondent’s area of specialization</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Years of experience of the respondents</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>The elevation view of an office building in CAD</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>The elevation view of an office building in Revit Architecture™ 2013</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Automatically creation details in Revit Architecture™ 2013</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Automatically creation section in Revit Architecture™ 2013</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Automatically creation section in Revit Architecture™ 2013</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Modelling within the single, integrated database in Revit Architecture™</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Automatically Update Changing</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Automatically Update Changing In All Views in Revit</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Energy Analysis in Revit Architecture</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>Energy Analysis Reports In Revit Architecture</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>Energy Analysis Reports in Revit Architecture 2013</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>Checking Interferences in Revit Architecture 2013</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>Clash Detection in Autodesk Navisworks™ 2013</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>Clash Detection Reports in Autodesk Navisworks™ 2013</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>Assigning Phase in Revit Architecture 2013</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>Creation Smart Models in Architecture 2013</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>Error checking automatically in Architecture 2013</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>Assign Specifications to Material in Architecture 2013</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>Defining Tasks in Autodesk Navisworks</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>4D Simulation in Autodesk Navisworks 2013</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>Automatically Take-Off the Quantity of Material in Autodesk Quantity Takeoff</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>Identification Hazards in Pre-Construction Stage in Autodesk Navisworks</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.25</td>
<td>Better Controlling Hazards in Pre-Construction Stage in Autodesk Navisworks</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction

Currently, the industry is facing enormous technological and institutional transformations with their resultant difficulties and challenges. One very important instrument to such change is the use of information technology and application of sustainable practices. According to Levitt (2007) three emerging trends suggest the need to broaden the frame of future construction engineering and management research in several ways: better integrated delivery of construction; new governance structures for projects that can support a more global construction industry; and enhanced documentation through new approaches, methods, and information technology.

Bakens (1997) suggested that growing partnership between research community and industry, internationalization of competition and collaboration in the research community, growing emphasis on integrated topics and approaches in research, information technology in construction, electronic collaboration, and sustainable development and construction are the six international research trends and priorities in the construction industry.
The 21st century engineer and architect must be able to deal with a rapid pace of technological change i.e. conventional documentation methods such as CAD, a highly interconnected world, and complex problems that require multidisciplinary solutions. Both architecture and engineering professions are embracing new modes of interdisciplinary information sharing and focusing on two emerging and fast growing concepts: building information modeling _BIM_ and novel methods of documentation. A mutually beneficial industry/academia collaboration will lead to a growth in strategic research and also would address concerns of Issa and Anumba (2007) about computing and information technology research in civil engineering and architecture being self-fulfilling rather than industry transforming.

Over the years, there has been a significant demand for a positive attempt to ensure that construction projects are executed in accordance with the original intention for which such projects were conceived.

Project documentation and monitoring have been identified as management tools for achieving the above objectives and ideals. For the avoidance of doubts, documentation is defined as:

- The process of providing written information.
- Document provided as a reference or evidential material.

Documentation plays a major role in every construction project. The nature of a construction project is such that necessitates the generation of a wide range of information. This information must be collected and stored not only because they define the unique nature of a construction project, but also to preserve memory and act as a reference or evidential material.

The development of 2D as-built drawings through field survey is a time consuming process and, oftentimes, not accurate. BIM, supported by a centralized database, allows as-built models to be modified during construction to record geometrical variations in building components.
However, upgrading to BIM from a 2D documentation system is more than simply making a change in CAD software. Rather, BIM is a completely different method of communicating building design information. To accommodate the transition, it is likely that there will be a significant enhancement of the import capabilities of BIM software (Eastman, et al. 2008).

1.2 Background of Study

Some scholars have studied comparatively BIM and CAD processes and addressed their relevant issues and attributes.

Mehmet F. Hergunsel (2011) studied 3D, BIM-based scheduling, visualization and cost estimation potentials in three phases of pre-construction, construction and post construction and validated it by modeling a prototype of a research construction as a 4D BIM model and then integrated it with dynamic scheduling system obtained from Navisworks. He concluded that the Revit house model demonstrates benefits of parametric modeling in comparison to two dimensional computer aided drafting. The parametric model denied overlapping of the elements. There were no errors, omissions or conflicts of information at different views. Moreover, the role of Navisworks application as a successful tool for integrating project documentation was highlighted.

Andreas F. Phelps et.al (2011) investigated BIM capabilities in reducing wastes of material and time by modeling a concrete construction case study in the Revit software. They found that BIM provides a master object in which most of the project information can be captured. This minimizes the need to manage multiple documents specially when they are to be modeled and created with conventional documentation methods- their respective administrative issues, and interrelation with other objects. In the implemented case, concrete quantities are extracted from the accurate model and used to order concrete. The precision of the model-based
quantity survey enabled the project to order the appropriate amount of concrete, reducing the concrete wastes.

Raymond Rohena (2011) examined BIM utilization effects on a Naval construction projects to analyze presented road map to implement BIM in such constructions. He modeled the case in the Revit architecture and compared its features with 2D drawing method. It was observed that by incorporating BIM, the level of details required eliminate physical and sequence conflicts prior to construction. Furthermore, it was able to increase the collaboration level of project by minimizing occurred clashes among all disciplines in both design and construction phases.

1.3 Problem Statement

Currently, 3D object-oriented computer-aided design _CAD_ software models serve as communication between planning and design phases. These 3D models also have been used during preconstruction to resolve constructability problems, conduct interference analysis, and to perform scheduling and hazard analysis.

BIM represents real world elements such as walls, doors, and windows as three-dimensional _3D_ objects. In addition to geometry details, other information can be attached to these objects including manufacturers, fire rating, schedule, and cost estimates. Another BIM advantage is the ease to insert, extract, update, or modify digital data by owners, clients, engineers, architects, contractors, suppliers, and building officials.

The essential difference between BIM and CAD is through the use of objects rather than abstract shapes. A door is not merely a line and an arc in a BIM model; it is a graphic object with mathematical and other properties that reside in a database.
Once a door is created, the software automatically includes it in the door schedule. If the door is graphically changed on the drawing, the attributes in the schedule are automatically adjusted. The most immediate and profound attribute of a BIM model is its ability to facilitate visual decision making. Geometrically accurate 3D representations of any portion of the building can be quickly derived. Unlike 2D drawings which are frequently schematic in nature, BIM models require precise information at an early stage of design. Complete and geometrically accurate 3D views of design allow for quicker and more informed decisions by all members of the project team. Design alternatives are easier to generate and understand.

Traditional 2D coordination drawings are difficult to interpret. The ease of finding conflicts and errors in 3D is one of the significant benefits cited by early adapters of BIM technology and leads to fewer RFIs and change orders.

The ability of BIM software to solve complex geometric equations and process large amounts of data allows it to identify spatial conflicts between building components, which enables the design team to correct these problems well in advance of construction operations.

When subcontractors and fabricators are involved in the early stages of design development, their specialized knowledge is captured in the model. Construction sequencing and fabrication can be evaluated at the design development phase. Unlike the 2D drawing process, the first object drawn in a BIM design may still be present in the final construction documents.

Virtual construction sequencing, also known as 4D, allows contractors to understand the spatial dimension of their critical tasks, to avoid conflicts between trades and to choreograph the job site efficiently. The Contractor can initiate staging and sequencing plans at an early stage with BIM.
However, little has been done to implement BIM beyond the use of these models in conventional documentation process (CAD) albeit a substantial amount of information is still collected and transferred to the owner in boxes or file cabinets.

This information, including requests for information _RFI_, schedules, submittals, change orders, or as-built, rarely serves as a reliable database for future decision making and would be more effective if incorporated into the BIM.

All in all, by a holistic view on the previously mentioned gaps between conventional-based documentation process (CAD) and BIM-based documentation process, some general problems such as fragmented nature and lack of collaboration and integration between involved parties, the considerable amount of missing data and the lack of capability of applicable visualization are among of major issues which can be improved and resolved by incorporating BIM processes and tools in the documentation phase of any project.

1.4  Aim of Study

The aim of this study is to evaluate the benefits of BIM based documentation to cover and resolve the problems the conventional–based documentation.

1.5  Objectives of Study

1. To identify problems of the Conventional–based documentation using CAD.
2. To investigate the benefits and problems of using the BIM-based documentation.
3. To compare the differences between BIM-based documentation and Conventional–based documentation.
4. To evaluate the benefits, abilities and problems of the documentation process of BIM based documentation.

1.6 Main Hypothesis

The benefits of the BIM–based documentation can cover and resolve the problems of the conventional based documentation.

1.7 Research Questions

1. What are the problems of the Conventional–based documentation using CAD?
2. What are the benefits and problems of using the BIM-based documentation?
3. What are the differences between BIM-based documentation and Conventional–based documentation?
4. What extent the benefits of the BIM–based documentation can cover and resolve the problems of the conventional –based documentation?

1.8 Scope of Research

To achieve the aim, an administrative building of a power plant project located in Najaf, Iraq, as the case study, has been chosen. The cause of selecting this project is based on my last personal experience which can improve the findings accuracy.
The total area of this two story building amounts to 1700 m$^2$. This building constructed based on the reinforced concrete frames and brick walls. From a climate perspective, the case study is in the hot and dry area. Besides other important factors, this characteristic of the project can create possibilities to analysis energy efficiency.

Further, amongst the whole documentation process, the project will focus on the contract documentation (Drawing; ii) specification; iii) Bill of quantity; iv) Project Health and Safety Plan; v) Planning and scheduling).

### 1.9 Research Methodology

To achieve the goal of the research, in addition to the literature review, the chosen methodology that shows as follow diagram (Figure 1.1).
Identify problem

Determine scope and objective of study

Literature review

Objective 1
Objective 2
Objective 3

Data collection

Administration of Questionnaire
References, Technical papers and Books
Develop Case study

Data processing

- Data analysis
- Modelling

Conclusion

Figure 1.1 Flowchart Diagram of the Research Process
REFERENCES


Associated General Contractors of America (AGC), *The Contractors’ guide to BIM, 1ST ed AGC Research Foundation, Las Vegas, NV, p 1-5.*


Kymell W (2008); Building Information Modeling; A planning and Managing Construction Projects with 4D CAD and Simulation.


Mehmet F. Hergunsel (2011), ”*BENEFITS OF BUILDING INFORMATION MODELING FOR CONSTRUCTION MANAGERS AND BIM BASED SCHEDULING*”. A Thesis Submitted to the Faulty of WORCESTER POLYTECHNIC INSTITUTE.

Microsoft Encarta (2008)


