

OFF-CHAIN SOLUTION FOR SCALABLE BLOCKCHAIN-BASED
VEHICULAR NETWORK

MOHAMAD HAFIZAT BIN ZAINAL ABIDIN

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree of
Master of Philosophy

Malaysia-Japan International Institute of Technology
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

SEPTEMBER 2022

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my mother, who taught me that even the largest tasks can be accomplished if it is done one step at a time. It is also dedicated to my late father who taught me that knowledge should be learned for oneself. I would also dedicate this thesis to my uncle, whose guidance and assistance is instrumental to me.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I wish to express my sincere appreciation to my main supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Ooi Chia Yee, for her teaching, guidance and advice and for her endless patience. I am also very thankful to my external supervisor Professor Dr. Koichiro Mashiko for his encouragements, motivation and guidance. I am also indebted to co-supervisor Madam Nordinah Binti Ismail and Ir. Ts. Dr. Mohd Azlan Bin Abu for their guidance and advice. Without their continued support and interest, this work would not have been possible.

I would like to express my deepest appreciation and thanks to my mother for her support, encouragement, assistance and guidance. A million thanks to my uncle, siblings and other relatives for their continued support and assistance.

Finally, my sincere appreciation to all my colleagues and staff who have provided support and assistance on many occasions. I am also indebted to the staff of Malaysia-Japan International Institute of Technology (MJIIT) and Universiti Teknologi Malaysia (UTM) for their assistance.

ABSTRACT

Autonomous vehicles are rapidly developing a technology that has the potential to greatly impact the traditional automobile industry. The autonomous vehicle technology promises safer driving and more efficient vehicles than the current human operated vehicles. These vehicles are capable of constantly communicating information such as current position, speed and direction to other vehicles in real-time. The industry accepted model for managing communication between autonomous vehicles is by wirelessly connecting the vehicles by means of fixed roadside units via an ad hoc peer-to-peer vehicular network. As wireless networks are easily compromised, vehicular networks must be secured against any unwanted tampering. Recent research involving incorporating blockchain technology into the vehicular networks have shown promising results to secure the vehicular networks. However, conventional blockchain-based vehicular networks can suffer from performance degradation and limited scalability. One way of improving the performance and scalability of a blockchain-based vehicular network is by carrying out most of the data processing usually associated with the conventional blockchain outside of the blockchain. This study aims to show that the performance and scalability issues in a blockchain-based vehicular network can be improved by incorporating an off-chain network into the vehicular network. Simulations of vehicular network operations under different conditions were carried out to measure the network performance and scalability. Performance of the blockchain network was measured in terms of data throughput, data processing latency, and growth in data size. The results from the simulations for the conventional blockchain-based network and off-chain assisted network were compared. The simulation results showed that the off-chain assisted blockchain network performed and scaled better than the conventional blockchain network. Results of the simulations of the 80 nodes blockchain network showed that the off-chain assisted network improved the throughput by 17 times while lowering the latency by 99%, and the data size by 78% when compared to the conventional blockchain network.

ABSTRAK

Teknologi kenderaan autonomi yang sedang membangun mempunyai potensi untuk memberi kesan besar kepada industri automobil tradisional. Teknologi ini menjanjikan pemanduan yang lebih selamat serta penggunaan tenaga yang lebih efisien berbanding kenderaan yang dipandu manusia. Kenderaan ini juga berupaya untuk sentiasa saling menghubungkan maklumat seperti kedudukan semasa, kelajuan dan arah dengan kenderaan lain dalam masa sebenar. Kaedah perhubungan yang diterimapakai oleh industri masakini untuk menguruskan komunikasi antara kenderaan autonomi dan unit-unit kawalan di tepi jalan adalah secara wayarles melalui rangkaian kenderaan *ad hoc* rakan ke rakan. Oleh kerana rangkaian wayarles mudah terjejas, rangkaian kenderaan perlulah dijamin selamat daripada pengubahan yang tidak dibenarkan. Penyelidikan terkini yang melibatkan penggabungan teknologi rantaian blok dengan rangkaian kenderaan telah menunjukkan hasil yang memberangsangkan untuk menjamin keselamatan rangkaian kenderaan. Walau bagaimanapun, rangkaian kenderaan berasaskan rantaian blok konvensional boleh melalui kemerosotan dalam prestasi dan skala pertumbuhan yang terhad. Salah satu cara untuk menambahbaik prestasi dan skala pertumbuhan rangkaian kenderaan berasaskan rantaian blok adalah dengan melaksanakan pemprosesan data berkaitan rantaian blok konvensional diluar rantaian blok. Tesis ini bertujuan untuk menunjukkan prestasi dan skala pertumbuhan dalam rangkaian kenderaan berasaskan rantaian blok boleh ditambahbaik dengan menggabungkan rangkaian *off-chain* dengan rangkaian kenderaan. Simulasi rangkaian kenderaan telah dijalankan dalam situasi yang berbeza untuk mengukur prestasi dan skala pertumbuhan rangkaian. Prestasi rantaian blok diukur mengikut keadaan daya pengeluaran data, perubahan kependaman pemprosesan dan pertumbuhan saiz data. Keputusan daripada simulasi untuk rangkaian berasaskan rantaian blok konvensional dan rangkaian dibantu *off-chain* telah dibandingkan. Hasil simulasi menunjukkan bahawa rangkaian kenderaan berasaskan rantaian blok yang dibantu *off-chain* dapat mengekalkan prestasi dan mampu menambah skala pertumbuhan berbanding rangkaian berasaskan rantaian blok konvensional. Keputusan simulasi dengan 80 nod rantaian blok telah menunjukkan rantaian blok yang dibantu *off-chain* telah menambahbaik daya pengeluaran sebanyak 17 kali pengeluaran data manakala menurunkan kependaman pemprosesan sebanyak 99% dan juga menurunkan pertumbuhan saiz data sebanyak 78% apabila dibandingkan dengan rantaian blok konvensional.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	TITLE	PAGE
	DECLARATION	iii
	DEDICATION	iv
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	v
	ABSTRACT	vi
	ABSTRAK	vii
	TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
	LIST OF TABLES	x
	LIST OF FIGURES	xi
	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xii
	LIST OF SYMBOLS	xiii
	LIST OF APPENDICES	xiv
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Background	1
1.2	Problem Statement	3
1.3	Research Objectives	3
1.4	Scope of the Study	4
1.5	Significance of the Study	5
1.6	Thesis Outline	5
CHAPTER 2	LITERATURE REVIEW	7
2.1	Autonomous Vehicle	7
2.2	Vehicular Network	9
	2.2.1 Vehicular Network Challenges	11
2.3	Blockchain	14
	2.3.1 Blockchain Structure	14
	2.3.2 Blockchain Application	15
	2.3.3 Blockchain in Vehicular Network	16

	2.3.4 Blockchain Scalability	18
2.4	Chapter Summary	25
CHAPTER 3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	27
3.1	Introduction	27
3.2	Design of the Blockchain-Based Vehicular Network	27
3.3	Simulation Design and Parameters	32
	3.3.1 Variable Parameter	34
	3.3.2 Simulation Performance Metrics	36
	3.3.3 Simulation Setup	37
	3.3.4 Measurement of Performance Metrics	40
3.4	Chapter Summary	42
CHAPTER 4	RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS	43
4.1	Introduction	43
4.2	Performance of the Blockchain Network	44
	4.2.1 Data Size	44
	4.2.2 Latency	45
	4.2.3 Throughput	48
4.3	Scalability Performance of the Blockchain Network	49
	4.3.1 Data Size	50
	4.3.2 Latency	51
	4.3.3 Throughput	52
4.4	Chapter Summary	54
CHAPTER 5	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	55
5.1	Research Outcomes	55
5.2	Contributions to Knowledge	58
5.3	Future Works	58
	REFERENCES	61
	LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	86

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
Table 2.1	Application of blockchain technology	16
Table 2.2	Comparison of blockchain scalability solutions	24
Table 3.1	Parameters of the simulation	35
Table 3.2	Parameter of the simulation for the scalability test	36
Table 3.3	Command to start the nodes and members	38

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
Figure 2.1	Overview of the autonomous navigation process (Van Brummelen et al, 2018)	8
Figure 2.2	Overview of vehicular network	10
Figure 2.3	A blockchain structure	15
Figure 3.1	The blockchain-based vehicular network as adapted from Ahmad et al. (2018)	28
Figure 3.2	System architecture of the blockchain-based vehicular network	29
Figure 3.3	Flowchart of the vehicular network	31
Figure 3.4	Raiden network implementation on Ethereum blockchain	32
Figure 3.5	Overview of the blockchain network	33
Figure 3.6	Smart contract for data exchange between computer and Raspberry Pi	39
Figure 3.7	Example of data size of the blockchain	40
Figure 3.8	Benchmark script	41
Figure 3.9	Sample of the BLOCKBENCH output from log data	41
Figure 4.1	Data size of Ethereum and Raiden-Ethereum blockchain network	45
Figure 4.2	Latency of Ethereum blockchain network	47
Figure 4.3	Latency of Raiden-Ethereum blockchain network	47
Figure 4.4	Throughput of Ethereum and Raiden-Ethereum blockchain network	48
Figure 4.5	Data size for scalability evaluation	50
Figure 4.6	Latency for scalability evaluation of Ethereum network	52
Figure 4.7	Latency for scalability evaluation of Raiden-Ethereum network	52
Figure 4.8	Throughput for scalability evaluation	53

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

IoT	-	Internet of Things
VANET	-	Vehicular Ad-hoc Network
DoS	-	Denial of Service
LiDAR		Light Detection and Ranging
RSU	-	Road Side Unit
GPS	-	Global Positioning System
SAE	-	Society of Automotive Engineers
OBU	-	On Board Unit
V2V	-	Vehicle to Vehicle
V2I	-	Vehicle to Infrastructure
V2C	-	Vehicle to Cloud
BARS	-	Blockchain-based Anonymous Reputation System
VECON	-	Vehicular Edge Computing and Networks
BTQT	-	Binary Tree embedded Quad Tree
NBI	-	Northbound Interface
SDVN	-	Software-Defined Vehicular Networking
MAST	-	Merkelized Abstract Syntax Tree
PoW	-	Proof of Work
PoS	-	Proof of Stake
API	-	Application Programming Interface
MB	-	Megabyte

LIST OF SYMBOLS

t	-	Time
L	-	Latency
tx	-	Number of transactions
T	-	Throughput

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX	TITLE	PAGE
Appendix A	Deploying the Ethereum Blockchain on the Computer	69
Appendix B	Deploying the Ethereum Blockchain on the Raspberry Pi	73
Appendix C	Deploying the Raiden Network	76
Appendix D	Deploying the Smart Contract	81
Appendix E	Deploying the BLOCKBENCH	85

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

With the mass adoption and acceptance of the Internet, more and more devices, not just computers, are connected. These “smart” devices, such as domestic appliances, security systems and agricultural machineries are connected to a network or the Internet to enable certain remote transactions such as control or automation to take place. These connected devices constitute a class on the Internet, called Internet of Things (IoT), and due to the nature of operation of these connected devices they place new requirements on the network.

Because the devices usually operate remotely, with no manual supervision, communication must be absolutely secure to ensure integrity of operation. In addition, many of these devices operate in real-time; thus, they require a very fast communication network. These two critical requirements, namely high security and fast network, pose significant challenges.

This study will look at one approach in meeting the challenges for the specific case of the communication network for autonomous vehicles. Fully autonomous vehicles can, on its own, successfully navigate through its environment, avoiding obstacles and reaching its destination without any human guidance. These vehicles rely on a variety of sensors and technologies, such as Light Detection and Ranging (LiDAR), radar, location sensors, odometer and computer vision to map their surroundings in real-time. A control system interprets the information gathered to identify optimum navigation paths while avoiding or navigating around obstacles and other vehicles.

In a scenario with many autonomous vehicles operating within the vicinity, it is necessary for the vehicles to be able to communicate with each other, exchanging vital information such as location, direction and speed in real-time to avoid collision between autonomous vehicles or with other obstacles. Communication among vehicles is carried out over a specialised vehicular network, which is the Vehicular Ad-hoc Network (VANET). Besides the requirement for real-time communication, it is also important that data integrity is maintained at all times to ensure the programmed autonomy of the vehicles are not compromised. Thus, a vehicular network must be fast and secure against threats that can disrupt data exchange within the network such as Denial of Service (DoS) attack, message tampering, wormholes attack and spread of false information (Engoulou et al., 2014).

One of the methods to ensure security against threats is to implement blockchain technology for the vehicular network. Blockchain technology provides a private and decentralized network where a transaction can only be completed upon agreement by a majority of nodes. A single entity, such as a hacker, cannot therefore easily disrupt information exchange. Despite its benefits to vehicular networks, most popular blockchain suffer from scalability issues. Most blockchain cannot handle high speed transactions and the speed of transactions degrades rapidly with an increasing number of users. Several solutions have been proposed to speed up and improve the scalability of the blockchain that can be classified into on-chain, off-chain, side-chain and inter-chain solutions (Kim et al., 2018).

In this work we will use a payment channel based off-chain solution to improve the speed and scalability of the blockchain network. The off-chain solution speeds up transaction times and improves the scalability by processing all transactions separately outside of the main blockchain by creating a temporary off-chain channel. Consequently, this off-chain solution reduces the number of transactions in the main blockchain, thus improving the data throughput of the entire network.

1.2 Problem Statement

In order to ensure the preservation of the programmed autonomy of autonomous vehicles, it is of vital importance that the vehicular network is absolutely secure and capable of handling large data exchanges in real-time. The development and implementation of vehicular networks comes with many challenges and issues. Some of these challenges include security, privacy, volatility, node mobility and scalability (Engoulou et al., 2014). Blockchain technology has been shown to provide a solution to the security vulnerabilities faced by vehicular networks (Kim et al., 2018). While a blockchain technology when implemented into a vehicular network can ensure the security and privacy of the network, the speed of transaction is usually not fast enough for use in managing a large number of autonomous vehicles. Data over the vehicular network changes dynamically and rapidly, with vehicles randomly entering and exiting the network. The scalability issue, which is the ability of the network to scale and maintain performance when the network grows in size from the increasing number of vehicles and Road Side Unit (RSU), is essential in the viability of a vehicular network. A scalable blockchain-based vehicular network must be able to handle unexpected large fluctuations in data exchange without degrading the performance of the network. Methods to speed up and improve the scalability of the network that can be easily integrated to existing open-source blockchain-based vehicular networks are preferable compared to those that require outright development of a completely new blockchain-based vehicular network.

1.3 Research Objectives

The main purpose of this research is to develop a scalable, blockchain-based vehicular network for autonomous vehicles. This research is conducted with the following objectives:

- 1) To investigate the scalability issue of blockchain-based vehicular networks.

- 2) To develop a new scalable blockchain-based vehicular network using off-chain solution with improved throughput, latency and data size compared to conventional blockchain networks.

1.4 Scope of the Study

This research focuses on the scalability issues of using blockchain-based technology in vehicular networks. Scalability of a network is defined as the ability of the network to maintain a specified performance level even with network growth, that is, when the number of roadside units (RSU) and vehicles in the network increases. We propose a blockchain-based vehicular network that uses off-chain scaling solutions to improve network scalability. In this study both the main block chain and the off-chain networks are chosen from among the most used, open-source technologies available. Because these are open-sourced and most used, stability of technology is assured and documentations are easily available. The proposed vehicular network will be simulated on the Ethereum Blockchain with the Raiden off-chain network implemented on top of the Ethereum Blockchain as the off-chain solution modification. In the simulation, each Road Side Unit (RSU) represents a node of the network and autonomous vehicles are members of the network. Simulations of transactions between members in the blockchain network are measured to evaluate the performance in terms of growth in data size, speed of data throughput and data exchange latency. The performance and scalability of the proposed Raiden off-chain network incorporated onto the Ethereum Blockchain network and the purely Ethereum Blockchain-based network are compared by simulating the growth in data size (storage requirements), speed of data throughput and data exchange latency. The simulation is conducted in a closed network to prevent any outside interference or interruptions from affecting the performance of the network. The simulation will focus solely on communications between RSU and vehicles in a vehicular network. The contribution of communication between vehicle and vehicle is ignored. This is justified in the present study because the simulation focuses on comparing the performance of the blockchain-based vehicular network in a controlled environment.

1.5 Significance of the Study

It is accepted that wireless-based networks are highly insecure and can be easily compromised. However, many devices are connected via wireless because of the flexibility afforded. The blockchain technology can provide the needed security to a wireless network but at the price of performance degradation with network growth. The aim of this study is to demonstrate that it is possible to maintain the security of the blockchain-based wireless network without performance degradation by incorporating an off-chain network onto the blockchain. The results from this study will be useful for those developing very secure wireless-based, high speed, dynamically growing networks such as for autonomous vehicles and Internet of Things.

1.6 Thesis Outline

This thesis reports the research work that has been done with the objectives mentioned. Chapter 1 introduces this work and outlines its focus. It begins with the background of research work, defines the problem statements and lays out the objectives. Chapter 2 presents an overview on vehicular network, blockchain technology, the scalability issue of blockchain based vehicular network and the proposed solution to the scalability issue. Chapter 3 describes the research methodology, covering the overall design, construction and implementation of the simulation experiments. Chapter 4 presents the results and discussion of the simulation experiments. Chapter 5 provides the discussions and conclusions of the research as well as discussions on the directions for future work.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, F., Adnane, A., Franqueira, V., Kurugollu, F., & Liu, L. (2018). Man-in-the-middle attacks in vehicular ad-hoc networks: Evaluating the impact of attackers' strategies. *Sensors*, 18(11), 4040. doi:10.3390/s18114040
- Akhtar, A., Ma, J., Shafin, R., Bai, J., Li, L., Li, Z., & Liu, L. (2019). Low latency scalable point cloud communication in VANETs using v2i communication. *ICC 2019 - 2019 IEEE International Conference on Communications (ICC)*, 1-7. doi:10.1109/icc.2019.8761285
- Badue, C., Guidolini, R., Carneiro, R. V., Azevedo, P., Cardoso, V. B., Forechi, A., Jesus, L., Berriel, R., Paixã, T. M., Veronese, L. D. P., Oliveira-Santos, T., & De Souza, A. F. (2021). Self-driving cars: A survey. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 165, 113816. doi:10.1016/j.eswa.2020.113816
- Bhatia, T. K., Ramachandran, R. K., Doss, R., & Pan, L. (2020). A comprehensive review on the vehicular ad-hoc networks. *2020 8th International Conference on Reliability, Infocom Technologies and Optimization (Trends and Future Directions) (ICRITO)*, 515–520. <https://doi.org/10.1109/icrito48877.2020.9197778>
- Brousmiche, K. L., Heno, T., Poulain, C., Dalmieres, A., & Ben Hamida, E. (2018). Digitizing, securing and sharing vehicles life-cycle over a consortium blockchain: Lessons learned. *2018 9th IFIP International Conference on New Technologies, Mobility and Security (NTMS)*, 1–5. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ntms.2018.8328733>
- Chadha, D., & Reena (2015). Vehicular Ad hoc Network (VANETs): A Review. *International Journal of Innovative Research in Computer and Communication Engineering*, 3, 2339-2346.
- Chauhan, B. K., & Patel, D. B. (2021). A systematic review of blockchain technology to find current scalability issues and solutions. *Proceedings of Second Doctoral Symposium on Computational Intelligence*, 15-29. doi:10.1007/978-981-16-3346-1_2

- Chen, Z., He, F., Yin, Y., & Du, Y. (2017). Optimal design of Autonomous Vehicle Zones in Transportation Networks. *Transportation Research Part B: Methodological*, 99, 44–61. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trb.2016.12.021>
- Choudhary, P., & Umang. (2015). A literature review on vehicular Adhoc Network for intelligent transport. 2015 2nd International Conference on Computing for Sustainable Global Development (INDIACom), 2209–2213.
- Christidis, K., & Devetsikiotis, M. (2016). Blockchains and smart contracts for the internet of things. *IEEE Access*, 4, 2292–2303. <https://doi.org/10.1109/access.2016.2566339>
- Conner, E., & Buterin, V. (2019). EIP-1559: Fee market change for ETH 1.0 chain. *Ethereum Improvement Proposals*. Retrieved February 9, 2022, from <https://eips.ethereum.org/EIPS/eip-1559>
- Deeksha, Kumar, A., & Bansal, M. (2017). A review on VANET security attacks and their countermeasure. 2017 4th International Conference on Signal Processing, Computing and Control (ISPCC), 580–585. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ispcc.2017.8269745>
- Dinh, T. T., Wang, J., Chen, G., Liu, R., Ooi, B. C., & Tan, K.-L. (2017). BLOCKBENCH: A Framework for Analyzing Private Blockchains. *Proceedings of the 2017 ACM International Conference on Management of Data*, 1085–1100. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3035918.3064033>
- Dong, N., & Fu, J. (2021). Development path of smart agriculture based on Blockchain. 2021 IEEE Asia-Pacific Conference on Image Processing, Electronics and Computers (IPEC), 208–211. doi:10.1109/ipec51340.2021.9421125
- Dorri, A., Kanhere, S. S., Jurdak, R., & Gauravaram, P. (2017). Blockchain for IOT security and privacy: The case study of a smart home. 2017 IEEE International Conference on Pervasive Computing and Communications Workshops (PerCom Workshops), 618–623. <https://doi.org/10.1109/percomw.2017.7917634>
- Ehmke, C., Wessling, F., & Friedrich, C. M. (2018). Proof-of-property. *Proceedings of the 1st International Workshop on Emerging Trends in Software Engineering for Blockchain*, 48–51. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3194113.3194122>

- Engoulou, R. G., Bellaïche, M., Pierre, S., & Quintero, A. (2014). VANET security surveys. *Computer Communications*, 44, 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.comcom.2014.02.020>
- Favarò, F., Eurich, S., & Nader, N. (2018). Autonomous vehicles' disengagements: Trends, triggers, and regulatory limitations. *Accident Analysis & Prevention*, 110, 136–148. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aap.2017.11.001>
- Fox, E. (2021, December 29). Tesla likely to achieve level 4 autonomy in 2022, says Elon Musk. Retrieved March 13, 2022, from <https://www.tesmanian.com/blogs/tesmanian-blog/tesla-likely-to-achieve-level-4-autonomy-in-2022-says-elon-musk>
- Hees, H., 2016. Raiden network: Off-chain state network for fast DApps. Retrieved July 10, 2022, from <https://archive.devcon.org/archive/playlists/devcon-2>
- Javaid, U., Aman, M. N., & Sikdar, B. (2020). A scalable protocol for driving trust management in internet of vehicles with Blockchain. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal*, 7(12), 11815-11829. doi:10.1109/jiot.2020.3002711
- Javaid, U., & Sikdar, B. (2021). A secure and scalable framework for blockchain based edge computation offloading in social internet of vehicles. *IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology*, 70(5), 4022-4036. doi:10.1109/tvt.2021.3060002
- Jeon, J. M., & Hong, C. S. (2021). Scalable private P2P network for distributed and hierarchical machine learning in VANETs. 2021 International Conference on Information Networking (ICOIN), 627-629. doi:10.1109/icoin50884.2021.9333988
- Kang, J., Yu, R., Huang, X., Wu, M., Maharjan, S., Xie, S., & Zhang, Y. (2019). Blockchain for secure and efficient data sharing in vehicular edge computing and Networks. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal*, 6(3), 4660–4670. <https://doi.org/10.1109/jiot.2018.2875542>
- Kaur, M., Murtaza, M., & Habbal, M. (2020). Post study of Blockchain in smart health environment. 2020 5th International Conference on Innovative Technologies in Intelligent Systems and Industrial Applications (CITISIA), 1-4. doi:10.1109/citisia50690.2020.9371819
- Khan, D., Jung, L. T., & Hashmani, M. A. (2021). Systematic literature review of challenges in blockchain scalability. *Applied Sciences*, 11(20), 9372. doi:10.3390/app11209372

- Kim, S., Kwon, Y., & Cho, S. (2018). A survey of scalability solutions on Blockchain. 2018 International Conference on Information and Communication Technology Convergence (ICTC), 1204–1207. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ictc.2018.8539529>
- Kokoris-Kogias, E., Jovanovic, P., Gasser, L., Gailly, N., Syta, E., & Ford, B. (2018). Omniledger: A secure, scale-out, decentralized ledger via Sharding. 2018 IEEE Symposium on Security and Privacy (SP), 583-598. doi:10.1109/sp.2018.000-5
- Lau, J., 2016. Merkelized abstract syntax tree. BIP: 114. Retrieved July 10, 2022, from <https://github.com/bitcoin/bips/wiki/Comments:BIP-0114>.
- Leon Calvo, J. A., & Mathar, R. (2018). Secure blockchain-based communication scheme for connected vehicles. 2018 European Conference on Networks and Communications (EuCNC), 347–351. <https://doi.org/10.1109/eucnc.2018.8442848>
- Long, J., & Wei, R. (2021). Off-chain micropayment pool for high-throughput bandwidth sharing rewards. 2021 IEEE International Conference on Blockchain and Cryptocurrency (ICBC), 1-3. doi:10.1109/icbc51069.2021.9461137
- Lopez-Pimentel, J. C., Rojas, O., & Monroy, R. (2020). Blockchain and off-chain: A solution for audit issues in Supply Chain Systems. 2020 IEEE International Conference on Blockchain (Blockchain), 126-133. doi:10.1109/blockchain50366.2020.00023
- Lu, Z., Wang, Q., Qu, G., & Liu, Z. (2018). Bars: A blockchain-based anonymous reputation system for trust management in VANETs. 2018 17th IEEE International Conference On Trust, Security And Privacy In Computing And Communications/ 12th IEEE International Conference On Big Data Science And Engineering (TrustCom/BigDataSE), 98–103. <https://doi.org/10.1109/trustcom/bigdatase.2018.00025>
- Luu, L., Narayanan, V., Zheng, C., Baweja, K., Gilbert, S., & Saxena, P. (2016). A secure sharding protocol for open blockchains. Proceedings of the 2016 ACM SIGSAC Conference on Computer and Communications Security, 17-30. doi:10.1145/2976749.2978389
- Malavolta, G., Moreno-Sanchez, P., Schneidewind, C., Kate, A., & Maffei, M. (2019). Anonymous multi-hop locks for blockchain scalability and interoperability.

- Proceedings 2019 Network and Distributed System Security Symposium, 1-15. doi:10.14722/ndss.2019.23330
- Malik, N., Nanda, P., Arora, A., He, X., & Puthal, D. (2018). Blockchain based secured identity authentication and expeditious revocation framework for Vehicular Networks. 2018 17th IEEE International Conference On Trust, Security And Privacy In Computing And Communications/ 12th IEEE International Conference On Big Data Science And Engineering (TrustCom/BigDataSE), 674–679. <https://doi.org/10.1109/trustcom/bigdatase.2018.00099>
- Malik, S., Dedeoglu, V., Kanhere, S. S., & Jurdak, R. (2019). Trustchain: Trust Management in Blockchain and IOT supported supply chains. 2019 IEEE International Conference on Blockchain (Blockchain), 184-193. doi:10.1109/blockchain.2019.00032
- Mendiboure, L., Chalouf, M. A., & Krief, F. (2020). A scalable blockchain-based approach for authentication and access control in software defined vehicular networks. 2020 29th International Conference on Computer Communications and Networks (ICCCN), 1-11. doi:10.1109/icccn49398.2020.9209661
- Mollah, M. B., Zhao, J., Niyato, D., Guan, Y. L., Yuen, C., Sun, S., Lam, K. Y., & Koh, L. H. (2021). Blockchain for the internet of vehicles towards Intelligent Transportation Systems: A survey. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal*, 8(6), 4157-4185. doi:10.1109/jiot.2020.3028368
- Mundhe, P., Verma, S., & Venkatesan, S. (2021). A comprehensive survey on authentication and privacy-preserving schemes in VANETs. *Computer Science Review*, 41, 100411. doi:10.1016/j.cosrev.2021.100411
- Nasir, M. H., Arshad, J., Khan, M. M., Fatima, M., Salah, K., & Jayaraman, R. (2022). Scalable blockchains - a systematic review. *Future Generation Computer Systems*, 126, 136-162. doi:10.1016/j.future.2021.07.035
- Nguyen, Q. K. (2016). Blockchain - a financial technology for future Sustainable Development. 2016 3rd International Conference on Green Technology and Sustainable Development (GTSD), 51–54. <https://doi.org/10.1109/gtsd.2016.22>
- Novo, O. (2018). Blockchain meets IOT: An architecture for Scalable Access Management in IOT. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal*, 5(2), 1184–1195. <https://doi.org/10.1109/jiot.2018.2812239>

- Ondruš, J., Kolla, E., Vertal', P., & Šarić, Ž. (2020). How do autonomous cars work? *Transportation Research Procedia*, 44, 226-233. doi:10.1016/j.trpro.2020.02.049
- Poon, J., Dryja, T., 2016. The bitcoin lightning network: Scalable off-chain instant payments. Retrieved July 10, 2022, from <https://www.bitcoinlightning.com/bitcoin-lightning-networkwhitepaper>
- Profentzas, C., Almgren, M., & Landsiedel, O. (2020). TinyEVM: Off-chain smart contracts on low-power IOT devices. *2020 IEEE 40th International Conference on Distributed Computing Systems (ICDCS)*, 507-518. doi:10.1109/icdcs47774.2020.00025
- Reyna, A., Martín, C., Chen, J., Soler, E., & Díaz, M. (2018). On blockchain and its integration with IOT. challenges and opportunities. *Future Generation Computer Systems*, 88, 173–190. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.future.2018.05.046>
- Sanka, A. I., & Cheung, R. C. (2021). A systematic review of blockchain scalability: Issues, solutions, analysis and Future Research. *Journal of Network and Computer Applications*, 195, 103232. doi:10.1016/j.jnca.2021.103232
- Shah, P., & Kasbe, T. (2021). A review on specification evaluation of broadcasting routing protocols in VANET. *Computer Science Review*, 41, 100418. doi:10.1016/j.cosrev.2021.100418
- Stepien, K., & Poniszewska-Maranda, A. (2020). Security methods against black hole attacks in vehicular ad-hoc network. *2020 IEEE 19th International Symposium on Network Computing and Applications (NCA)*, 1-4. doi:10.1109/nca51143.2020.9306724
- Taeihagh, A., & Lim, H. S. (2018). Governing Autonomous Vehicles: Emerging Responses for safety, liability, privacy, cybersecurity, and industry risks. *Transport Reviews*, 39(1), 103–128. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01441647.2018.1494640>
- Van Brummelen, J., O'Brien, M., Gruyer, D., & Najjaran, H. (2018). Autonomous Vehicle Perception: The technology of today and Tomorrow. *Transportation Research Part C: Emerging Technologies*, 89, 384–406. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trc.2018.02.012>
- Vijayenthiran, V. (2021, April 13). Volvo Highway pilot promises unsupervised driving on highways*. Motor Authority. Retrieved March 13, 2022, from

https://www.motorauthority.com/news/1117344_volvo-highway-pilot-promises-unsupervised-driving-on-highways

- Wang, C., Shen, J., Lai, J., & Liu, J. (2021). B-TSCA: Blockchain assisted trustworthiness scalable computation for V2I authentication in VANETs. *IEEE Transactions on Emerging Topics in Computing*, 9(3), 1386-1396. doi:10.1109/tetc.2020.2978866
- Weng, J., Weng, J., Zhang, Y., Luo, W., & Lan, W. (2019). BENBI: Scalable and dynamic access control on the northbound interface of SDN-based VANET. *IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology*, 68(1), 822-831. doi:10.1109/tvt.2018.2880238
- Wutthikarn, R., & Hui, Y. G. (2018). Prototype of blockchain in dental care service application based on Hyperledger Composer in Hyperledger fabric framework. 2018 22nd International Computer Science and Engineering Conference (ICSEC), 1-4. doi:10.1109/icsec.2018.8712639
- Zamani, M., Movahedi, M., & Raykova, M. (2018). RapidChain: Scaling Blockchain via Full Sharding. *Proceedings of the 2018 ACM SIGSAC Conference on Computer and Communications Security*, 931-948. doi:10.1145/3243734.3243853
- Zhang, L., & Fan, D. (2020). Analysis of the application of blockchain technology in the financial industry. 2020 International Conference on Big Data Economy and Information Management (BDEIM), 105-108. doi:10.1109/bdeim52318.2020.00033
- Zheng, Z., Xie, S., Dai, H., Chen, X., & Wang, H. (2017). An overview of blockchain technology: Architecture, Consensus, and future trends. 2017 IEEE International Congress on Big Data (BigData Congress), 119–125. <https://doi.org/10.1109/bigdatacongress.2017.85>