

PARKING GENERATION MODELLING OF GOVERNMENT HOSPITALS IN
PENINSULAR MALAYSIA

ABDUL RAZAK BIN ALI

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the
requirements for the award of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

School of Civil Engineering
Faculty of Engineering
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

JUNE 2021

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my father, who taught me that the best kind of knowledge to have is that which is learned for its own sake. It is also dedicated to my mother, who taught me that even the largest task can be accomplished if it is done one step at a time.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

In preparing this thesis, I was in contact with many people, researchers, academicians, and practitioners. They have contributed towards my understanding and thoughts. In particular, I wish to express my sincere appreciation to my main thesis supervisor, Ir. Dr. Siti Asmah binti Hassan, for encouragement, guidance, critics and friendship. Without her continuous support and interest, this thesis would not have been the same as presented here.

With this opportunity, I would love to express my utmost gratitude to Ministry of Health Malaysia (MOH), especially all the Clinical Research Centre (CRC) professionals and personnels that have given their support and valuable information that have made the basis for this study and analysis.

I am also indebted to Universiti Teknologi Malaysia (UTM) for funding my PhD study. Librarians at UTM also deserve special thanks for their assistance in supplying the relevant literatures.

My fellow postgraduate student should also be recognised for their support. My sincere appreciation also extends to Ir. Mohd Nasir B. Kamal Mokhtar, all my colleagues, Prima Reka Staff and others who have provided assistance at various occasions. Their views and tips are useful indeed. Unfortunately, it is not possible to list all of them in this limited space. I am grateful to all my family member.

ABSTRACT

Parking has long been an issue in government hospital, especially the one which are located within urban environment. Scarcity of parking caused traffic issue, while over-providing would cost unnecessary expenditure on the infrastructures. There are few parking guidelines available, but none of these been established based on empirical data from actual site investigation. This study analyse the actual parking demand and develop a parking demand model for government hospitals in Malaysia. Quantitative study approach was carried out for the data collection via primary data survey at six (6) state hospitals from June 2016 to March 2017. Effective boundary for hospital compound were established and divided into zones which further assigned to the enumerators. Subsequently, Automated Traffic Counter (ATC) were installed for a week at each hospital to ascertain peak day which the parking survey shall be carried out. Then, license plate matching survey method was further carried out throughout a 12 hours period, from 7.00 a.m. to 7.00 p.m. where highest parking activity was anticipated. Parking information, including daily parking volume, hourly parking demand, average parking duration, parking turnover and parking index were captured from the survey and presented via descriptive statistical analysis. On the other hand, the independent variables for the modelling such as number of beds, professional staff, support staff, gross floor area, daily outpatient, and occupied bed were retrieved from Clinical Research Centre (CRC) or administration office from each hospital. Next, four type of predictive models based on regression modelling by utilising linear-, square-, inverse-, and natural logarithmic[~] based variable structures were developed which summed up to 60 different models been analysed. These models were evaluated based on the overall model F[~] test; coefficient of determination (R²); mean square error (MSE); root mean square error (RMSE) and mean absolute error (MAE). Inverse 6 from inverse based model has the lowest MSE, RMSE and MAE as well as the highest R² among all models which represented by number of beds, number of total staff and number of daily outpatients as the root predictors. These three measurements are non[~] confidential data which obtainable from the hospitals and does not include sensitive information. Model validation was conducted by comparing the estimates of parking demand by the developed model with the estimates by other available guidelines as well as the actual parking demand. The developed model was proved to yield the least error, proving that it could better mimic the demand of parking spaces at hospitals in Malaysia. This model could benefit relevant stakeholder in establishment of parking facilities, especially town planner in way to instigate sustainable development approach.

ABSTRAK

Parkir telah lama menjadi isu di hospital kerajaan, terutamanya bagi yang terletak di kawasan bandar. Kekurangan parkir menyebabkan masalah trafik, manakala penyediaan yang berlebihan akan membebankan kos pembangunan infrastruktur. Terdapat beberapa garis panduan parkir sedia ada, namun tidak ada yang dibangunkan berdasarkan data empirikal dari penyiasatan tapak sebenar. Kajian ini menganalisis permintaan parkir sebenar dan membangunkan model permintaan parkir untuk hospital-hospital kerajaan di Malaysia. Pendekatan kajian kuantitatif dijalankan untuk pengumpulan data melalui cerapan data primer di enam (6) buah hospital negeri bermula Jun 2016 sehingga Mac 2017. Sempadan yang efektif di perkarangan hospital telah ditetapkan dan dibahagikan kepada zon-zon untuk ditugaskan kepada kumpulan penyelidik. Selanjutnya, Pembilang Lalu Lintas Automatik (PLLA) telah dipasang selama seminggu di setiap hospital untuk memastikan hari puncak di mana kajian parkir akan dijalankan. Kemudian, kaedah tinjauan pengecaman nombor pendaftaran kereta telah dijalankan sepanjang tempoh 12 jam, dari 7.00 pagi hingga 7.00 petang di mana aktiviti parkir tertinggi dijangkakan. Maklumat parkir, termasuk jumlah parkir harian, permintaan parkir setiap jam, purata tempoh parkir, pusingan balik parkir dan indeks parkir telah diperolehi daripada kajian tersebut dan dibentangkan melalui analisis statistik deskriptif. Selain daripada itu, pemboleh ubah bebas bagi permodelan, seperti bilangan katil, kakitangan profesional, kakitangan sokongan, luas lantai kasar, pesakit luar harian, dan bilangan katil dihuni telah diperolehi daripada Pusat Penyelidikan Klinikal (PPK) atau pejabat pentadbiran di setiap hospital. Seterusnya, empat jenis model ramalan berdasarkan pemodelan regresi dengan menggunakan struktur pembolehubah berasaskan „linear“, „square“, „reverse-“, dan „natural logarithmic“ telah dibangunkan dengan jumlah sehingga 60 model berbeza yang telah dianalisis. Model-model ini dinilai berdasarkan model keseluruhan ujian-F; pekali penentuan (R^2); ralat min kuasa dua (RMKD); ralat min punca kuasa dua (RMPKD) dan min ralat mutlak (MRM). Inverse 6 dari model berasaskan „inverse“ mempunyai RMKD, RMPKD dan MRM terendah di samping mempunyai nilai R^2 tertinggi di antara semua model, yang mana diwakili oleh bilangan katil, bilangan staf keseluruhan dan jumlah pesakit luar harian digunakan sebagai peramal punca. Ketiga-tiga pengukuran ini adalah bukan data sulit, dan dapat diperolehi dari hospital-hospital dan tidak termasuk dalam maklumat sensitif. Pengesahan model telah dijalankan dengan membandingkan anggaran permintaan parkir oleh model yang dibangunkan dengan anggaran garis panduan lain serta permintaan parkir yang sebenar. Model yang dibangunkan telah terbukti menghasilkan jurang kesilapan yang paling kecil, membuktikan bahawa model yang dibangunkan dapat mewakili permintaan parkir di hospital-hospital di Malaysia. Model ini dapat memberi manfaat kepada pihak-pihak berkaitan yang relevan dalam pembangunan infrastruktur parkir, terutamanya perancang bandar bagi memupuk pendekatan pembangunan yang lestari.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	TITLE	PAGE
	DECLARATION	iii
	DEDICATION	iv
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	v
	ABSTRACT	vi
	ABSTRAK	vii
	TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
	LIST OF TABLES	xii
	LIST OF FIGURES	xvi
	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xx
	LIST OF SYMBOLS	xxii
	LIST OF APPENDICES	xxiii
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
	1.1 Background of the Study	1
	1.2 Problem Statement	3
	1.3 Aim and Objectives	4
	1.4 Scope of the study	5
	1.5 Significance of the study	6
	1.6 Structure of Thesis	6
CHAPTER 2	LITERATURE REVIEW	9
	2.1 Introduction	9
	2.2 Public and Private Transport	9
	2.2.1 Public Transportation and Sustainability	13
	2.3 Transportation Policy	17
	2.4 Parking Policy	19
	2.4.1 Parking Policy in Asia	19
	2.4.2 Parking Policy in Malaysia	20
	2.5 Parking Studies	23

2.6	Types of Parking Studies	29
2.6.1	Parking Inventories	29
2.6.2	Parking Usage Studies	30
2.6.3	Accumulation and Generation Studies	32
2.7	Parking Generation Studies at Hospitals	34
2.7.1	Statistical Analysis	35
2.7.2	Statistical Validation	36
2.7.3	Potential Factors	37
2.8	Government Hospitals in Malaysia	38
2.9	Conclusion	40
CHAPTER 3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	43
3.1	Introduction	43
3.2	Study Site	45
3.2.1	Criteria for Selection of Study Site	46
3.3	Parking survey methodological approach	47
3.3.1	Period and Duration of Surveys	47
3.3.2	Method to carry out parking survey	51
3.4	Equipment	56
3.5	Data Collection	57
3.5.1	Variables for Observational Study	57
3.5.2	Variables for Model Development	58
3.6	Data Analysis	59
3.6.1	Descriptive Analysis	59
3.6.2	Parking Demand Model Development	61
3.6.2.1	Parking Demand Model Assumptions	62
3.6.2.2	Variable Structure Types	64
3.6.2.3	Parking Demand Model Selection	65
3.6.3	Parking Demand Model Validation	65
3.7	Conclusion	66

CHAPTER 4	RESULT AND DISCUSSION	69
4.1	Introduction	69
4.2	Preliminary Study on Hospital Parking	69
4.3	Parking Study for Hospitals	77
4.3.1	Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	78
4.3.2	Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	85
4.3.3	Hospital Melaka	95
4.3.4	Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	104
4.3.5	Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	111
4.4	Observational Studies	118
4.4.1	Daily Traffic Volume	118
4.4.2	Hourly Parking Demand	124
4.4.3	Average Parking Duration	128
4.4.4	Parking Turnover	131
4.5	Parking Model Development	133
4.5.1	Model Assumption Assessment	133
4.5.1.1	Multicollinearity of independent variables	133
4.5.1.2	Normality of error assumption	138
4.5.1.3	Linearity of model	139
4.5.1.4	Homoscedasticity	139
4.5.2	Parking Demand Model Development	140
4.5.2.1	Linear-based models	141
4.5.2.2	Square-based models	142
4.5.2.3	Inverse-based models	144
4.5.2.4	Natural logarithm-based models	147
4.5.2.5	Comparing the parking demand models	149
4.6	Parking Demand Model Validation	152
4.7	Conclusion	155

CHAPTER 5	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	159
5.1	Introduction	159
5.2	Major Findings	159
5.3	Contributions of the Study	161
5.4	Limitations of the Study	162
5.5	Suggestions for Future Works	163
REFERENCES		165
APPENDICES		173
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS		287

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
Table 2.1	Effectiveness of TDM Strategies (<i>Source: Seattle Department of Transportation, 2008</i>)	13
Table 2.2	Air Pollution Indicators in Mega-Cities in US, China, and India (Laffel, 2006)	16
Table 2.3	National Automotive Policy Objectives (Ministry of International Trade & Industry, 2014)	17
Table 2.4	Approaches to Parking Policy (Barter, 2010)	21
Table 2.5	Parking demand studies	25
Table 2.6	Provision of Parking space based on Land Use (Jabatan Perancang Bandar dan Desa, 2011)	28
Table 2.7	List of information required for parking inventory.	29
Table 2.8	Parking Spaces available, Numbers of Vehicle Parking and Daily Turnover by type of facility and block (ITE, 2010b)	31
Table 2.9	Other Parking Usage Characteristic by Number of Vehicles Parked and Time used in different facilities (ITE, 2010b)	31
Table 2.10	Comparison of Observed Vehicle Hours of Parking, Space Hours Available and Deficiency (ITE, 2010b)	32
Table 2.11	Performance of MOH Hospitals by Functional Categories, 2011-2012 (Ministry of Health Malaysia, 2013)	38
Table 3.1	Selection of Hospital for Study / Data Collection	47
Table 3.2	Activity hours and work shift for Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	49
Table 3.3	Comparison of variables used by various Agencies and proposed variables for study.	58
Table 4.1	Overall statistics of parking behaviour at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	76
Table 4.2	Statistics of public parking behaviour at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	76

Table 4.3	Statistics of staff parking behaviour at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	77
Table 4.4	Overall statistics of parking behaviour at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	84
Table 4.5	Statistics of public parking behaviour at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	84
Table 4.6	Statistics of staff parking behaviour at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	85
Table 4.7	Overall statistics of parking behaviour at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	94
Table 4.8	Statistics of public parking behaviour at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	95
Table 4.9	Statistics of staff parking behaviour at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	95
Table 4.10	Overall statistics of parking behaviour at Hospital Melaka	102
Table 4.11	Statistics of public parking behaviour at Hospital Melaka	103
Table 4.12	Statistics of staff parking behaviour at Hospital Melaka	103
Table 4.13	Overall statistics of parking behaviour at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	110
Table 4.14	Statistics of public parking behaviour at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	110
Table 4.15	Statistics of staff parking behaviour at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	111
Table 4.16	Overall statistics of parking behaviour at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	117
Table 4.17	Statistics of public parking behaviour at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	117
Table 4.18	Statistics of staff parking behaviour at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	117
Table 4.19	Daily volume of trips at each hospital	119
Table 4.20	Descriptive statistics of trip volume on weekdays and weekends	121
Table 4.21	Shapiro-Wilk test for normality of daily volume of trips	122

Table 4.22	Mann-Whitney U test for mean difference of daily volume of trips	122
Table 4.23	Descriptive statistics of peak trip volume for all hospitals	123
Table 4.24	Peak hour parking demand for public and staff	126
Table 4.25	Descriptive statistics of peak hour parking demand for public and staff	128
Table 4.26	Average parking duration for public and staff	129
Table 4.27	Descriptive statistics of parking duration averages for public and staff	130
Table 4.28	Parking turnover at each hospital	131
Table 4.29	Descriptive statistics of parking turnover for public and staff	132
Table 4.30	VIF for multiple regression based on enter, remove (Model 1) and backward methods.	134
Table 4.31	VIF for multiple regression based on stepwise method.	134
Table 4.32	VIF for multiple regression based on remove method (Model 2).	135
Table 4.33	VIF for multiple regression based on forward method.	135
Table 4.34	Correlation analysis for multicollinearity	136
Table 4.35	VIF for multicollinearity	137
Table 4.36	Revised correlation analysis	138
Table 4.37	Shapiro-Wilk test for normality of residuals	138
Table 4.38	Linear-based models and their assessment findings	141
Table 4.39	Significance of individual independent variable	142
Table 4.40	Square-based models and their assessment findings	143
Table 4.41	Significance of individual independent variable	144
Table 4.42	Inverse-based models and their assessment findings	144
Table 4.43	Significance of individual independent variable	146
Table 4.44	Natural logarithm-based models and their assessment findings	147
Table 4.45	Significance of individual independent variable	148
Table 4.46	Error measurements for all models	151

Table 4.47	Description about the model	152
Table 4.48	Difference and error measures in parking estimates	154

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
Figure 2.1	Percentage of Registered Vehicles in Malaysia as of 2015 (Road Traffic Department Malaysia, 2016)	11
Figure 2.2	Passenger-Kilometres per 1 Ton CO2 Emission (Breithaupt, 2011)	14
Figure 2.3	Space Requirement by Various Modes of Transport (Breithaupt, 2011)	15
Figure 2.4	Comprehensive Timeline (Suruhanjaya Pengangkutan Awam Darat, 2012)	18
Figure 2.5	Method carrying out site inventory (ITE, 2010b)	30
Figure 2.6	Parking Accumulation Curve (ITE, 2010b)	33
Figure 3.1	Research methodology flow chart	44
Figure 3.2	Location of State Hospital (Peninsular)	46
Figure 3.3	Location of Automated Traffic Counter at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	48
Figure 3.4	License Plate Parking Survey Method carried out at sample site	50
Figure 3.5	Survey Team Zoning in Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	52
Figure 3.6	Data Collection format to be used to capture vehicle plate number at site.	54
Figure 3.7	Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah Work Zoning	55
Figure 3.8	Parking Survey at Site by walking and motorcycle	56
Figure 4.1	Daily volume of trips at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	70
Figure 4.2	Parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	71
Figure 4.3	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	72
Figure 4.4	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone A at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	73
Figure 4.5	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone B at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	73

Figure 4.6	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone C at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	74
Figure 4.7	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone D at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	74
Figure 4.8	Staff parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah	75
Figure 4.9	Daily volume of trips at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	78
Figure 4.10	Parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	79
Figure 4.11	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	80
Figure 4.12	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone A at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	81
Figure 4.13	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone B at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	81
Figure 4.14	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone C at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	82
Figure 4.15	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone D at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	82
Figure 4.16	Staff parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan	83
Figure 4.17	Daily volume of trips at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	86
Figure 4.18	Parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	87
Figure 4.19	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	88
Figure 4.20	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone A at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	89
Figure 4.21	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone B at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	89
Figure 4.22	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone C at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	90
Figure 4.23	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone D at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	90
Figure 4.24	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone E at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	91

Figure 4.25	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone F at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	91
Figure 4.26	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone G at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	92
Figure 4.27	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day across the zones at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	92
Figure 4.28	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone Multi-level Parking at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	93
Figure 4.29	Staff parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tuanku Jaafar	93
Figure 4.30	Daily volume of trips at Hospital Melaka	96
Figure 4.31	Parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Melaka	97
Figure 4.32	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Melaka	98
Figure 4.33	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone A at Hospital Melaka	99
Figure 4.34	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone B at Hospital Melaka	99
Figure 4.35	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone C at Hospital Melaka	100
Figure 4.36	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone D at Hospital Melaka	100
Figure 4.37	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone Multi-level Parking at Hospital Melaka	101
Figure 4.38	Staff parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Melaka	102
Figure 4.39	Daily volume of trips at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	104
Figure 4.40	Parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	105
Figure 4.41	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	106
Figure 4.42	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone A at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	107

Figure 4.43	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone B at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	107
Figure 4.44	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone C at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	108
Figure 4.45	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone D at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	108
Figure 4.46	Staff parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II	109
Figure 4.47	Daily volume of trips at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	112
Figure 4.48	Parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	113
Figure 4.49	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	113
Figure 4.50	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone A at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	114
Figure 4.51	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone B at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	115
Figure 4.52	Public parking demand distribution across the peak day in Zone C at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	115
Figure 4.53	Staff parking demand distribution across the peak day at Hospital Tuanku Fauziah	116
Figure 4.54	Daily volume of trips at each hospital	120
Figure 4.55	The highest volume of trips across the week for each hospital	123
Figure 4.56	Distribution of hourly parking demand at each hospital	125
Figure 4.57	Peak hour parking demand for public and staff	127
Figure 4.58	Average parking duration for public and staff	130
Figure 4.59	Parking turnover at each hospital	132
Figure 4.60	Regression studentized residuals against regression standardized predicted values	139
Figure 4.61	Plot to assess homoscedasticity	140
Figure 4.62	Parking demand estimates based on different models	150
Figure 4.63	Comparison between the actual demand, provided parking and estimates from the developed model and guidelines	153

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

3D	–	Three-dimensional
ALOS	–	Average Length of Stay
APTA	–	American Physical Therapy Association
ATC	–	Automated Traffic Counter
BOR	–	Bed Occupancy Rate
CO ₂	–	Carbon dioxide
CRC	–	Clinical Research Center
EEV	–	Energy Efficient Vehicle
EPU	–	Economic Planning Unit
GA	–	Genetic Algorithm
GDP	–	Gross Domestic Product
GFA	–	Gross Floor Area
HRPB	–	Hospital Raja Permaisuri Bainun
ICU	–	Intensive Care Unit
ITE	–	Institute of Transportation Engineers
JPBD	–	Jabatan Perancang Bandar dan Desa
JPJ	–	Jabatan Pengangkutan Jalan
KKM	–	Kementerian Kesihatan Malaysia
MAE	–	Mean Absolute Error
MLP	–	Multi-layered perception Neural Network
MLR	–	Multiple Linear Regression
MOH	–	Ministry of Health
MSE	–	Mean Square Error
MTE	–	Metrocount Traffic Executive Software
NAP	–	National Automotive Policy
NICU	–	Neonatal Intensive Care Unit
RMSE	–	Root Mean Square Error
RSU	–	Road Side Unit

SLR	–	Simple Linear Regression
SOV	–	Single Occupancy Vehicle
SPAD	–	Suruhanjaya Pengangkutan Awam dan Darat
Sq.ft	–	Square Feet
SUMP	–	Seattle Urban Mobility Plan
TDM	–	Transport Demand Management
TOD	–	Total Patient Days
TOI	–	Turn Over Interval
TSF	–	Thousand Square Foot
UAE	–	United Arab Emirates
US	–	United States of America
VIF	–	Variation Inflation Factor
VIP	–	Very Important Person

LIST OF SYMBOLS

R^2	-	Coefficient of Determination
Z	-	Z-score
df	-	Degree of freedom
Sig.	-	Significance probability
B	-	Regression coefficient
t	-	t-statistics
X1	-	Number of beds
X2	-	Number of professional staff
X3	-	Number of support staff
X4	-	Gross floor area
X5	-	Daily outpatients
X6	-	Number of Occupied Beds

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX	TITLE	PAGE
Appendix A	Parking Requirement Based on Available Parking Guidelines	173
Appendix B	List of Hospitals/Institutions by Type	174
Appendix C	Available Information from State Hospital in East Malaysia	175
Appendix D	Site Photos	176
Appendix E	Site Layout Hospital	187
Appendix F	Zoned Parking Demand Summary	199
Appendix G	SPSS Program output Appendix	208

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

Availability of adequate parking spaces is a key to smooth traffic movement and operation of an area. Adequate parking spaces increase public safety since it potentially reduces illegal parking. Moreover, parking facilities is also an important element for the success of businesses. An adequate parking facility attracts more traffic and therefore increases business transactions in the area. However, parking facilities are also costly and space intensive. The question of what will be the optimum number of parking requirement has always been a topic of discussion among transport engineers and planners to minimize development costs and to provide sufficient parking spaces to the users.

In the United States, parking generation is determined by referring to the Parking Generation Report, 4th Edition by the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE). It provides statistical data on average, ranges and quality values that can help analyst to determine the general nature of parking demand for a given land use. There are 106 types of land use prescribed in the report. These land use types are divided into nine (9) categories such as Port and Terminal, Industrial, Residential, Lodging, Recreational, Institutional, Medical, Office, Retail and Services.

In Malaysia, parking requirements for any development are based on the guidelines provided by the Malaysian Town Planning Department (JPBD, 2011), which are based on six (6) different types of land use namely Residential, Commercial, Industrial, Recreational, Institutional and Disabled people. The independent variables are units of development, employees and gross floor area. A specific rate was applied on each type of land use which was categorized by the size

of population (more or less than 1 million) and the type of development (commercial or institutional area). The provision for visitors and motorcycle parking are also considered by the guidelines. These criteria had not been revised since the year 2000, a period of twenty years. Other parking guide referable in Malaysian context are *Garis Panduan Dan Peraturan Bagi Perancangan Bangunan Oleh Jawatankuasa Kecil Piawaian Dan Kos Bagi JPPN* by Economic Planning Unit (EPU), and Ministry of Health very own parking norm by the internal Engineering Service Division.

There are 139 government hospitals enlisted in the Ministry of Health Website. These hospitals are situated in urban and sub-urban area. These hospitals are subdivided into two categories namely (i) specialist hospitals and institutions and (ii) non-specialist hospitals and district hospitals. The specialist hospitals provide minimum 15 resident specialist/sub-specialist while non-specialist only provide 5 minimum support services. There is a total of 40,158 patient beds in all of these hospitals. Specialist hospitals appear to have the greatest number of patient beds as compared to other hospitals with 27,756 patient beds. All of the specialist hospitals are located in urban area where serious traffic congestion issue exist related to insufficient number of available parking spaces, an issue that has been frequently highlighted. For instance, an article from online news portal Perak Today (2012) highlighted the worsening parking issue at Hospital Raja Perempuan Bainun (HRPB) Ipoh, which agreed and receive conforming responses from the fellow netizens. This trend of issues arises in nearly all major hospitals throughout Malaysia.

This issue of parking space scarcity should be dealt with appropriately because the consequences could threaten the security and smooth flow of medication process as well as those driving around the facilities. Learning about the needs of parking spaces and the future demand could assist the authorities to plan well ahead in resource allocation. A predictive model to estimate the parking needs at each hospital is crucial since it could guide the authorities to plan and develop ample parking spaces at optimum level. Globally, many researchers attempted to construct parking demand models based on different approaches including quantitative methods. These quantitative methods are based on statistical or non-statistical

concepts and they have their own advantages and disadvantages. In the end, what matters most is the accuracy of parking demand prediction.

1.2 Problem Statement

Parking spaces are vital especially in the areas related to some critical facilities such as hospitals. Critical facilities like hospitals tend to receive many visitors with desperate and extra needs. They are most probably having severe health problems and they require comfortable parking spaces to allow them to get appropriate in time medications. Having to search and park for illegal parking spaces which are normally far from the facilities could lead to the uneasiness of the visitors, especially the patients. This also could lead to unwanted events such as accidents, especially when visitors park in the shared facilities like roadsides. The cost of death would be increased and the tendency to disrupt the anticipated smooth flow of medical treatments could increase.

The parking issues is as highlighted in the background of study, where currently in Malaysian hospitals, no published study was done to evaluate the existing parking demand as well as performance of the existing parking norms and guidelines. It is of the utmost importance to understand the needs of parking spaces at each hospital. Without learning about the current parking demand at each hospital, it is possible to acquire incorrect picture of the overall parking needs. The process of studying the hospitals is also crucial to discover relevant and significant trends which could explain the variance in demand between all the sites. Henceforth, this research is in view to fill the gap of no statistical data or any numerical information regarding parking deficiency at hospitals.

While learning about the current parking demand is important, predicting the future trends of parking demand is equally important. In the current scenario, parking space estimations are conducted based on application of rates. By estimating and modelling the needs of future parking, resources could be better planned to overcome the scarcity in parking spaces as well as avoid unnecessary cost for unnecessary

parking spaces. Failing to correctly estimate the parking demand would also lead to late construction of parking spaces, hence, the same issue of scarce parking spaces could remain. Moreover, developing parking spaces based on the current needs could incur frequent ongoing costs as the developers would need to revise the demand periodically. Learning from the historical data of parking demand could yield an estimate of the future demand and this could be executed through some mathematical or statistical modelling.

A parking demand model based on quantitative methodologies could yield various levels of accuracy. The model that is totally based on the historical quantitative data depends largely on the accuracy of the data and the formulation of the model itself. While there are many available guidelines that are based on various foundations, it is best to compare the performance of the model with the available guidelines as an alternative to validate the model. This is to ensure that the model is relevant to the context of the geographically dependent parking demand. Without validating the model, the reliability of the model is highly dubious. Thus, validation through comparisons of the performance of the model with other parking generation guidelines is essential.

1.3 Aim and Objectives

The aim of the study is to investigate and formulate a mathematical model on parking generation for government hospitals in Malaysia. To achieve the aim of the study, some objectives were outlined as follows:

- (a) To determine parking demand on public hospitals in urban area.
- (b) To develop the best parking generation model for the selected land use type.
- (c) To validate the goodness of the parking generation model by comparing its estimates with the available parking generation guidelines as well as the actual parking demand.

1.4 Scope of the study

The study involves states hospitals in Peninsular Malaysia which are believed to encounter the scarcity of legal parking spaces. In Ministry of Health, the medical facilities can be categorized to Specialist Hospitals and Institutions, Non-specialist hospitals, Special Medical Institution, Institution and College. In term of hierarchy, State Hospitals is the most visited of all facilities, provisioning up to 45 resident specialties and sub-specialties. It also makes up about 25% percent of total beds to accommodate in-patient. Detailed study was carried out on six hospitals, namely Hospital Sultanah Bahiyah, Hospital Tengku Ampuan Afzan, Hospital Tuanku Jaafar, Hospital Melaka, Hospital Raja Perempuan Zainab II and Hospital Tuanku Fauziah. These Specialist Hospitals were chosen due to their fit conditions to conduct the study, as they are located in urban area and make up the greatest number of patient beds comparable to other type of hospitals. The hospitals also have no potential data abnormality due to construction or major renovation. These conditions were believed to make a good representation of findings of the overall data population in terms of statistics. The study also does not cover the behavioural aspects of parking, focussing on the study objectives which to obtain the actual parking demand information at hospitals.

Apart from that, the data collected are only data from June 2016 to March 2017. It is believed that the parking demand model could be representative of other years because the data were collected in the best way possible to ensure the representation of data. Data collected were all quantitative in nature; parking demand, number of beds, number of staff, gross floor area, number of daily outpatients, and number of occupied beds, which can be further deliberated using both descriptive and inferential statistics.

In addition, this study employs some variable structure-based regression models due to the ease of interpretation of findings especially on the relationships and effects of the parking demand factors. The variable structures used are linear, squaring, inversion and natural logarithm-based, which the main variable structures in regression modelling.

1.5 Significance of the study

This study is expected to contribute to the body of knowledge in parking generation research. With the main contribution of mathematical modelling perspective, this study could act as a guide for other researchers to further contribute to the research area by utilising more mathematical models which are vital to predict future trends. This study could also catalyse more rigorous research works on parking generation, especially in Malaysia.

Moreover, this study is crucial for practitioners, especially the policy makers, to estimate the future demand of parking at hospitals and consequently prepare the necessary plans to ensure that parking space scarcity problem could be alleviated at present and avoided in the future. Since this model is generalisable to other hospitals, it is worth applying the model in predicting the actual parking demand at the remaining hospitals.

1.6 Structure of Thesis

This thesis is organised in five chapters which describe different aspects of the study. Chapter 1 presents the background of the study, the statement of problems, the aim and objectives of the study, the scope of the study, and the significance of the study. As the first chapter, Chapter 1 presents the general ideas of the whole thesis. Chapter 2 reviews all related works which are crucial to lay down the foundational concepts and some important studies which are believed to be useful as references of this thesis. This chapter outlines the concept of public and private transportation, its policies, parking policies, some related parking studies, and the government hospitals in Malaysia.

Chapter 3 describes the methodology of the study. The entire procedure, which includes the study site, the equipment used, data collection as well as data analysis steps, are explained in detail. The chapter plays an important role to validate the findings of the study which are then presented in the next chapter, Chapter 4. Chapter 4 displays and provides a thorough discussion of the findings systematically. The chapter primarily presents the findings on the preliminary study conducted, some individual subsequent studies executed, summary on the parking studies conducted, the development of parking demand model and its validation.

The final chapter, Chapter 5, is the chapter that summarises the whole thesis. With the main content consisting of the conclusion of the study, the contributions of the study, some limitations encountered as well as some recommendations for future works, this chapter reflects the overall significance of the study.

REFERENCES

- Al-Masaeid, H., Al-Omari, B., Al-Harashsheh, A., (1999). Vehicle parking demand for different land uses in Jordan. *ITE J.* 69 (5), 79–84
- Aderamo, A. J., & Salau, K. A. (2013). Parking patterns and problems in developing countries: A case from Ilorin, Nigeria. *African Journal of Engineering Research*, 1(2), 40–48.
- Ajeng, C., & Gim, T. (2018). Analyzing on-Street Parking Duration and Demand in a Metropolitan City of a Developing Country: A Case Study of Yogyakarta City, Indonesia. *Sustainability*, 10, 591. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10030591>
- Al-Sahili, K., Eishah, S. A., & Kobari, F. (2018). Estimation of new development trip impacts through trip generation rates for major land uses in Palestine. *Jordan Journal of Civil Engineering*, 12(4), 669–682.
- Askin, R. G. (1982). Multicollinearity in regression: Review and examples. *Journal of Forecasting*, 1(3), 281–292. <https://doi.org/10.1002/for.3980010307>
- American Public Transportation Association (2007). *Public Transportation: Benefits for the 21st Century*.
- Badland, H. M., Garrett, N., & Schofield, G. M. (2010). How does car parking availability and public transport accessibility influence work-related travel behaviors? *Sustainability*, 2(2), 576–590. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su2020576>
- Bai, H., Liu, X., & Zhao, Y. (2011) Parking demand forecasting model based on principal component analysis and BP neural network. *11th International Conference of Chinese Transportation Professionals, Nanjing*. p. 2011
- Barter, P. A. (2010) Parking Policy in Asian Cities. Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy Research Paper No. LKYSPP: 10-15 . Available at SSRN:<https://ssrn.com/abstract=1780012>
- Barter, P. A. (2011). Parking Requirements in Some Major Asian Cities. *Transportation Research Record*, 2245(1), 79–86. <https://doi.org/10.3141/2245-10>
- Borhan, M. N., Nazrul, A., & Ibrahim, H. (2019). *Why Public Bus is a Less Attractive Mode of Transport : A Case Study of*.
- Borhan, M. N., Syamsunur, D., Akhir, N.M., Yazid, M. R.M., Ismail, A., & Rahmat,

- R. A. (2014). Predicting the use of public transportation: A case study from Putrajaya, malaysia. *Scientific World Journal*, 2014. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/784145>
- Breithaupt, M. (2011). *Sustainable Transport in Developing Cities - Examples of Success*.
- Erin, M., & Sue, M. (1991). Statistical Models to Predict Commercial- and Parking-Space Occupancy. *Journal of Urban Planning and Development*, 117(4), 129–139. [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)0733-9488\(1991\)117:4\(129\)](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)0733-9488(1991)117:4(129))
- Gakenheimer, R., & Zegras, C. (2004). Drivers of travel demand in cities of the developing world. In *Mobility 2030: Meeting the Challenges to Sustainability* (pp. 155-170).
- George, D., & Mallery, M. (2010). *SPSS for Windows Step by Steps: A Simple Guide and Reference* (10a Ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Ghasemi, A., & Zahediasl, S. (2012). Normality tests for statistical analysis: a guide for non-statisticians. *International journal of endocrinology and metabolism*, 10(2), 486–489. <https://doi.org/10.5812/ijem.3505>
- Ghuzlan, K., Al-Omari, B., & Khasawneh, M. (2016). Parking Demand for Residential Apartment Buildings in Jordan. *Institute of Transportation Engineers*, 86, 32–36.
- Han, B., Xiao-xue, L., Yang-dong, Z., & Chun-hua, S. (2011). Parking Demand Forecasting Model Based on Principal Component Analysis and BP Neural Network. *ICCTP 2011*, 372–379. [https://doi.org/doi:10.1061/41186\(421\)38](https://doi.org/doi:10.1061/41186(421)38)
- Hills, L., & Coomer-Smit, B. (1997). *Parking Demand Associated with Integrated Healthcare Services*. Retrieved from https://www.transportationgroup.nz/papers/2001/O1_Hills.pdf
- Hilvert, O., Toledo, T., & Bekhor, S. (2012). Framework and Model for Parking Decisions. *Transportation Research Record: Journal of the Transportation Research Board*, 2319, 30–38. <https://doi.org/10.3141/2319-04>
- Hook, W. (1994). Role Of Nonmotorized Transportation And Public Transport In Japan's Economic Success. *Transportation Research Record 1441*. National Academy Press.
- Ibeas, Á., Cordera, R., dell'Olio, L., & Moura, J. L. (2011). Modelling demand in restricted parking zones. *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice*, 45(6), 485–498.

- <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tra.2011.03.004>
- Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE). (2010a). *Manual of Transportation Engineering Studies*, 2nd Edition. Washington DC, USA.
- Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE). (2010b). *Parking Generation*, 4th Edition. Washington DC, USA.
- Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE). (2019). *Parking Generation*, 5th Edition. Washington DC, USA.
- Jabatan Perancang Bandar dan Desa, Semenanjung Malaysia. (2011). *Garis Panduan Tempat Letak Kereta, May 2011*. Malaysia.
- Jingbo, Y., Tiexin, C., & Miaomiao, T. (2009). *Demand Forecasting of Parking Lot Based on Discrete Choice Model in Planned Special Events*. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICMSS.2009.5304335>
- Kamba, A. N., Rahmat, R. A. O. K., & Ismail, A. (2007). Why Do People Use Their Cars: A Case Study In Malaysia. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(3), 117–122. <https://doi.org/10.3844/jssp.2007.117.122>
- Kelly, A., & Pekol, A. (2013). *Transit Proximity and Car Parking Demand at Medium / High Density Residential Developments*. In Australasian Transport Research Forum, ATRF 2013-Proceedings (pp. 1-18).
- Laffel, N. (2006). *Promoting Public Transportation for Sustainable Development*. The Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs Princeton University Task Force on Energy for Sustainable Development Spring, 124-149.
- Lau, W., Poon, P., Tong, C., & Wong, S. (2005). The Hong Kong second parking demand study. *Proceedings of The Institution of Civil Engineers-Transport - Proc Inst Civil Eng-Transport*, 158, 53–59. <https://doi.org/10.1680/tran.2005.158.1.53>
- Lee, Y.W. (2015). Study on the Variables for On-street Parking Demand Estimation through Parking Survey. *Advanced Science and Technology Letters*, 100, 43-46. <https://doi.org/10.14257/astl.2015.100.10>
- Lim, H., Williams, G. T., Abdelqader, D., Amagliani, J., Ling, Z., Priester, D. W., & Cherry, C. R. (2017). Alternative Approach for Forecasting Parking Volumes. *Transportation Research Procedia*, 25, 4171–4184. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trpro.2017.05.360>
- Mytelka, L. K., & Boyle, G. (Eds.). (2008). *Making choices about hydrogen*:

- transport issues for developing countries. IDRC.
- Mathew, T.V. (2009). Lecture notes in Transportation Systems Engineering. Retrieved from https://www.civil.iitb.ac.in/~vmtom/1100_LnTse/535_InTse/plain/
- McGuinness, E., McNeil, S. (1991) Statistical models to predict commercial- and parking-space occupancy. *Journal of Urban Planning and Development*, 117 (4), pp. 129-139
- McKnight, P.E., & Najab, J. (2010). Mann-Whitney U Test. *The Corsini encyclopedia of psychology*, 1-1.
- Mela, C. F., & Kopalle, P. K. (2002). The impact of collinearity on regression analysis: The asymmetric effect of negative and positive correlations. *Applied Economics*, 34(6), 667–677. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00036840110058482>
- Millard-Ball, A. (2002). Putting on their parking caps. *Planning*, 68(4), 16-21.
- Miller, P., Barros, A. G. De, Kattan, L., & Wirasinghe, S. C. (2016). *Public Transportation and Sustainability: A Review*. 20, 1076–1077. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12205-016-0705-0>
- Ministry of Health Malaysia (2013). Annual Report 2012. Malaysia .
- Ministry of International Trade and Industry (2014). Press Statement National Automotive Policy (NAP) 2014. <https://www.miti.gov.my/miti/resources/fileupload/Press%20Statement%20NAP%202014.pdf>
- Mishra, P., Pandey, C. M., Singh, U., Gupta, A., Sahu, C., Keshri, A. (2019). Descriptive statistics and normality tests for statistical data. *Ann Card Anaesth* 2019;22:67-72
- Naser, M., Qdais, S. A., & Faris, H. (2015). Developing trip generation rates for hospitals in Amman. *Jordan Journal of Civil Engineering*, 9(1), 8–19.
- Rosni, N.N.M., Jobli, A.F. & Negin, M. (2019). Driver Parking Behaviour: An Observational and Experimental Intervention Study. *IOP Conf Ser.: Mater. Sci. Eng.* **601** 012002
- Okail, O., Mohamady, A., & El-Gamal, E. (2019). Parking Demand Rates for Some Selected Land Uses in Egyptian Cities. *International Journal of Engineering and Advanced Technology*, 8(4), 259–262.

- O'Brien, R. M. (2007). A Caution Regarding Rules of Thumb for Variance Inflation Factors. *Quality & Quantity*, 41(5), 673–690. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-006-9018-6>
- Osborne, J., & Waters, E. (2002). Four Assumptions of Multiple Regression That Researchers Should Always Test. *Practical Assessment, Research & Evaluation*, 8.
- Perak Today. Masalah Parkir HRPB Semakin Meruncing (2012) Retrieved 2 August 2012 from <http://peraktoday.com.my/2012/08/masalah-parkir-hrpb-semakin-meruncing/>
- Pojani, D., & Stead, D. (2015). Sustainable urban transport in the developing world: Beyond megacities. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 7(6), 7784–7805. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su7067784>
- Rahman, A., Ashikin, N., & Ayu, A. Y. (2016). *Theorizing the Concept of Urban Public Transportation Institutional Framework in Malaysia*. In *MATEC Web of Conferences (Vol. 66, p. 00043)*. EDP Sciences.
- Road Traffic Department Malaysia (2016). Total Motor Vehicles by Type and State, Malaysia, 2015. https://www.data.gov.my/data/ms_MY/dataset/jumlah-terkumpul-kenderaan-bermotor-mengikut-jenis-dan-negeri-total-motor-vehicles-by-type-and-state
- Seattle Department of Transportation. (2008) Best Practices Transportation Demand Management (TDM) https://www.ctc-n.org/files/resources/07_seattle_best_practices_in_transportation_demand_management.pdf
- Shen, T., Hua, K. & Liu, J. (2019) "Optimized Public Parking Location Modelling for Green Intelligent Transportation System Using Genetic Algorithms," in *IEEE Access*, vol. 7, pp. 176870-176883, 2019, doi: 10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2957803.
- Shoup, D.C., 1999. The Trouble With Minimum Parking Requirements. *Transportation Research Part A* Vol. 33 (1999), pp. 549-574
- Schuster, T., & Volz, R. (2019). *Predicting Parking Demand with Open Data BT - Digital Transformation for a Sustainable Society in the 21st Century* (I. O. Pappas, P. Mikalef, Y. K. Dwivedi, L. Jaccheri, J. Krogstie, & M. Mäntymäki, Eds.). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Sen, S., Ahmed, M., & Das, D. (2016). A Case Study on On-Street Parking Demand

- Estimation for 4-Wheelers in Urban CBD. *Journal of Basic and Applied Engineering Research*, 3, 254–258.
- Shapiro, S., & Wilk, M. (1965). An Analysis of Variance Test for Normality (Complete Samples). *Biometrika*, 52(3/4), 591-611. doi:10.2307/2333709
- Suruhanjaya Pengangkutan Awam Darat (2012). *National land Public Transport Masterplan*. Malaysia.
- Suthanaya, P. A. (2017). Development of Parking Demand Model for Private Hospital in Developing Country (Case Study of Denpasar City, Indonesia). *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 10(5), 52-60.
- van Exel, N.J.A., de Graaf, G. & Rietveld, P. “I can do perfectly well without a car!” An exploration of stated preferences for middle-distance travel. *Transportation* 38, 383–407 (2011). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11116-010-9315-8>
- Wilcoxon, F. (1949). Some Rapid Approximate Statistical Procedures. American Cyanamid Co.. Stamford Research Laboratories.
- Wong, S. C., Tong, C. O., Lam, W. C. H., & Fung, R. Y. C. (2000). Development of Parking Demand Models in Hong Kong. *Journal of Urban Planning and Development*, 126(2), 55–74. [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)0733-9488\(2000\)126:2\(55\)](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)0733-9488(2000)126:2(55))
- Wu, Z., & Fan, Y. (2011). Model of the parking demand prediction for urban complex. In ICCTP 2011: Towards Sustainable Transportation Systems (pp. 519-526).
- Yap, B. W., & Sim, C. H. (2011). Comparisons of various types of normality tests. *Journal of Statistical Computation and Simulation*, 81(12), 2141–2155. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00949655.2010.520163>
- Yue, J., Cheng, T., & Tai, M. (2009) Demand Forecasting of Parking Lot Based on Discrete Choice Model in Planned Special Events, *2009 International Conference on Management and Service Science, Beijing, China.*, pp. 1-4, doi: 10.1109/ICMSS.2009.5304335.
- Zakaria, S. & Sufian, Z. (2009). Public Works Department Malaysia (Ensuring Road Quality In Malaysia).
- Zegras, P. C., & Gakenheimer, R. (2006). Driving forces in developing cities' transportation systems: Insights from selected cases. Massachusetts Institute of Technology: Cambridge, 46.

Zhizhou, W., & Yujie, F. (2011). Model of the Parking Demand Prediction for Urban Complex. *ICCTP 2011*, 519–526. [https://doi.org/doi:10.1061/41186\(421\)51](https://doi.org/doi:10.1061/41186(421)51)

LIST OF PUBLICATIONS

Indexed Journal

1. **Ali, Abdul & Hassan, Sitti.** (2019). *Review of Malaysian current practice in supply/demand of parking in the hospital.* IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering. 512. 012057. 10.1088/1757-899X/512/1/012057.

Conference Proceedings

1. **Ali, Abdul & Hassan, Sitti.** (2019, December). *Parking Characteristics in Malaysia Public Hospitals.* Paper presented at the Sustainable & Integrated Engineering International Conference (SIE) 2019. The Everly Hotel, Putrajaya, Malaysia.