

THE PHYSICOCHEMICAL CHARACTERIZATION AND THE EFFECT OF
STORAGE CONDITIONS ON QUALITY OF JOHOR STINGLESS BEE HONEY

NUR FATIHA NORHISHAM

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree of
Master of Philosophy

School of Chemical Engineering
Faculty of Chemical and Energy Engineering
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

AUGUST 2020

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

In the name of Allah, the Most Gracious and the Most Merciful, Alhamdulillah, all praises to Allah for the strengths and blessing in completing this thesis. I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. Harisun Ya'akob for her guidance, supervision and constant support. Her comments, suggestion, and criticisms throughout the experimental works have contributed to the success of this research.

Not forgotten, my appreciation to all research officer, research assistant and technicians of Institute of Bioproduct Development (IBD) UTM, especially to Mrs. Muna, Mrs. Zila, Mrs. Norasiah, and Mr Subri. I am also grateful to the Ministry of Education, Malaysia under GUP, Research Grant Scheme for funding my master study.

Lastly, my sincere thanks to all my colleagues, especially Iylia Arina, Husnul Hanani, Fitrien Husin, Nurul Dalilah, Zunairah, Afif Najihah, Farah Asyikin Farahiyah, my beloved father, Norhisham Sulaiman, mother, Julaiha Adnan, my siblings, Muhammad Imran, Nurfazila, and Muhammad Hanafi and those whom directly and indirectly had helped in making this project a success and the input they offered especially during editing and proofreading. Thank you.

ABSTRACT

Stingless bee is the most commonly reared here in Malaysia for its beneficial and profitable honey. However, the information on physical and chemical characteristics of the stingless bee honey is still limited, because of limited honey production due to the physical characteristic of the bee. Besides that, the need concerning the most effective storage conditions for stingless bee honey arises since storage of honey is important to maintain the nutritional benefits of the honey. Therefore, the objectives of this study aimed to determine the physicochemical characterization and to investigate the effect of storage conditions on Johor stingless bee honey quality. This study represents the characteristics of 27 stingless bee honey samples, obtained from 10 districts of Johor, Malaysia. This study was first to characterized Johor stingless bee honey quality by evaluating the physical parameters and chemical parameters of the stingless bee honey. After that, the effect of the temperature (4°C, 24°C and 35°C) and duration (30 to 90 days) of storage on the selected Johor stingless bee honey sample were examined using three parameters, moisture content, acidity and hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) content. Physicochemical parameters were assessed in triplicates and the data were analysed statistically. The results showed a correlation between moisture content with total soluble solids and carbohydrate, color with total phenolic content, HMF content with pH, while 2,2-diphenyl-1-picrylhydrazyl radical scavenging activity was not correlated with both total phenolic and flavonoid content. Principal component analysis presented that the stingless bee honey distributions from the same districts were distinguishable. The experiment on the effect of storage conditions on Johor stingless bee honey showed a strong correlation between storage conditions with moisture content, acidity, and HMF content which showed that the changes in the nutritional characteristics of the stingless bee honey was influenced by the storage. All parameters showed the smallest increased in 30 days at 4°C respectively, hence were the most desirable conditions. The findings from this study were expected to contribute useful information for the physicochemical standardization of stingless bee honey in Malaysia especially in Johor and help the Malaysian stingless bee honey industry to control safety, quality, and efficacy of honey.

ABSTRAK

Lebah kelulut adalah jenis lebah yang paling banyak ditenak di Malaysia kerana manfaat dan keuntungan madu tersebut. Bagaimanapun, maklumat mengenai ciri-ciri fizikal dan kimia madu lebah kelulut masih terhad, oleh sebab pengeluaran madu yang sedikit disebabkan oleh ciri fizikal lebah tersebut. Selain itu, keperluan mengenai keadaan penyimpanan yang paling berkesan untuk madu kelulut timbul kerana penyimpanan madu adalah penting untuk mengekalkan faedah pemakanan madu. Oleh itu, objektif kajian ini adalah untuk menentukan pencirian fizikokimia dan untuk mengetahui kesan keadaan penyimpanan terhadap kualiti madu lebah kelulut Johor. Kajian ini menunjukkan ciri-ciri 27 sampel madu lebah kelulut, yang diperoleh dari 10 daerah di Johor, Malaysia. Kajian ini adalah untuk mengenal pasti kualiti madu lebah kelulut Johor dengan menilai parameter fizikal dan parameter kimia madu lebah kelulut tersebut. Selepas itu, kesan suhu (4 °C, 24 °C dan 35 °C) dan jangka masa (30 hingga 90 hari) penyimpanan pada sampel madu lebah kelulut Johor yang dipilih diperiksa menggunakan tiga parameter, kandungan kelembapan, keasidan dan kandungan hidrosimetilfurfural (HMF). Parameter fizikokimia dinilai dalam tiga kali bacaan dan data dianalisis secara statistik. Keputusan menunjukkan hubung kait antara kandungan kelembapan dengan jumlah pepejal larut dan karbohidrat, warna dengan jumlah kandungan fenolik, kandungan HMF dengan pH, manakala aktiviti pemerangkapan radikal 2-2-bifenil-1-pikrilhidrazil tidak dikaitkan dengan kandungan fenolik dan flavonoid. Analisis komponen utama menunjukkan bahawa pengagihan madu lebah kelulut dari daerah yang sama dapat dibezakan. Kajian mengenai kesan keadaan penyimpanan sampel madu lebah kelulut Johor yang dipilih menunjukkan hubung kait yang kuat antara keadaan penyimpanan dengan kandungan lembapan, keasidan dan kandungan HMF yang menunjukkan bahawa perubahan ciri pemakanan madu lebah kelulut dipengaruhi oleh penyimpanan. Semua parameter masing-masing menunjukkan peningkatan paling sedikit dalam 30 hari pada 4°C, oleh itu ini adalah keadaan yang paling diingini. Dapatan kajian ini dijangka menyumbangkan maklumat yang berguna bagi piawaian fizikokimia madu lebah kelulut di Malaysia terutamanya di Johor dan membantu industri madu lebah kelulut Malaysia untuk mengawal keselamatan, kualiti dan keberkesanan madu.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	TITLE	PAGE
	DECLARATION	iii
	DEDICATION	iv
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	v
	ABSTRACT	vi
	ABSTRAK	vii
	TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
	LIST OF TABLES	xiv
	LIST OF FIGURES	xvi
	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xviii
	LIST OF SYMBOLS	xx
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Background of the study	1
1.2	Problem Statement	3
1.3	Objective of the study	5
1.4	Scope of the study	5
1.5	Significance of the study	6
CHAPTER 2	LITERATURE REVIEW	7
2.1	Introduction to Stingless Bees	7
2.2	Health Benefits of Stingless bee Honey	11
2.2.1	Anti-microbial activity	12
2.2.2	Anti-inflammatory	12
2.2.3	Antioxidant Activities	13
2.2.4	Gastrointestinal tract disease	13
2.2.5	Anti-cancer Activity	14
2.2.6	Anti-diabetic Activity	14

2.3	Other Benefits Obtained from Stingless Bees	15
2.4	Stingless Bee Honey Composition	16
2.5	Honey Quality	19
2.6	The Importance of Storage Duration and Temperature for the Quality of Stingless Bee Honey	
2.6.1	The effect of storage on moisture content	19
2.6.2	The effect of storage on acidity	19
2.6.3	The effect of storage on hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) content	20
2.6.4	The effect of temperature and duration of storage on honey quality	22
2.7	Compositional Properties of Stingless Bee Honey	22
2.7.1	Moisture Content	23
2.7.2	Acidity	23
2.7.3	pH	24
2.7.4	Ash Content	24
2.7.5	Electrical Conductivity	25
2.7.6	Color	25
2.7.7	Protein Content	26
2.7.8	Fat	26
2.7.9	Carbohydrate	27
2.7.10	Total Soluble Solid	27
2.7.11	Phenolic Compounds in Stingless Bee Honey	27
2.7.12	Antioxidant Activity	28
2.8	Standardization of Stingless Bee Honey	29
2.9	Factors Affecting Quality of Stingless Bee Honey	32
2.10	Correlation among Physicochemical Properties of Stingless Bee Honey Quality by Pearson's Correlation Coefficient (r)	33
2.11	Statistical Analysis Used to Measure the Compositions of Stingless Bee Honey	34
2.11.1	Univariate One-way ANOVA Analysis	34
2.11.2	Pearson's Correlation Coefficient	36

2.11.3	Multivariate Analysis-Principal Component Analysis (PCA)	37
2.12	Design of Experiment	38
2.12.1	Factorial Experimental Design	39
2.12.2	Factorial ANOVA Analysis	42
2.13	The Use of Factorial Design Study for Industrial Needs	42
2.14	Application of Factorial Design in Various Study on Honey	44
CHAPTER 3	METHODS AND MATERIALS	47
3.1	Overview of Overall Study	47
3.2	Raw Materials	49
3.2.1	Collection of Johor Stingless Bee Honey Samples	49
3.3	Chemicals	49
3.4	Evaluation of Physical and Chemical Properties of Johor Stingless Bee Honey	51
3.4.1	Evaluation of pH	51
3.4.2	Evaluation of Color	51
3.4.3	Evaluation of Moisture Content	52
3.4.4	Evaluation of Ash Content	52
3.4.5	Evaluation of Electrical Conductivity	52
3.4.6	Evaluation of Total Soluble Solid	53
3.4.7	Evaluation of Free, Lactone and Total Acidity	53
3.4.8	Evaluation of Protein Content	53
3.4.9	Evaluation of Fat Content	54
3.4.10	Evaluation of Carbohydrate	54
3.4.11	Evaluation of Hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) by High-Performance Liquid Chromatography (HPLC)	55
3.4.12	Evaluation Total Phenolic Content (TPC)	55
3.4.13	Evaluation of Total Flavonoid Content (TFC)	56

3.4.14	Evaluation of DPPH Free Radical Scavenging Activity	56
3.4.15	Phenolic Compounds Evaluation by High-Performance Liquid Chromatography (HPLC)	57
3.4.15.1	Sample Extraction	57
3.4.15.2	HPLC Analysis for Phenolic Compounds	57
3.4.16	Statistical Analysis	58
3.5	Storage Condition of Johor Stingless Bee Honey	58
3.5.1	Design of Experiment	58
3.5.2	Analysis of Moisture Content, Acidity and HMF Content After Storage	61
3.5.2.1	Moisture Content	61
3.5.2.2	Acidity	61
3.5.2.3	Evaluation of Hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) by HPLC	62
3.5.3	Verification Test of moisture Content, Acidity and HMF Content After Storage	63
3.5.4	Correlation between Storage Conditions with Moisture Content, Acidity and HMF Content	63
CHAPTER 4	RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS	65
4.1	Introduction of Overall Findings	65
4.2	Physical Properties of Johor Stingless Bee Honey Samples	66
4.2.1	pH	66
4.2.2	Moisture Content	66
4.2.3	Ash Content	67
4.2.4	Electrical Conductivity	68
4.2.5	Acidity	70
4.2.6	Protein Content	72
4.2.7	Fat	72
4.2.8	Carbohydrate	74

4.2.9	Total Soluble Solids	74
4.2.10	Color	76
4.3	Chemical Properties of Johor Stingless Bee Honey	77
4.3.1	Hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) Content	77
4.3.2	Total Phenolic Content (TPC)	77
4.3.3	Total Flavonoid Content (TFC)	78
4.3.4	Antioxidant Analysis	80
4.3.5	Phenolic Compounds of Johor Stingless Bee Honey	80
4.4	Correlation between Physical and Chemical Characteristics	85
4.5	Multivariate Statistical analysis of Physical and Chemical Characteristics	88
4.6	Experimental Design and ANOVA analysis of Storage Conditions on Stingless Bee Honey Quality	93
4.6.1	Analysis of variance (ANOVA)	95
4.6.2	Null Hypothesis of the Polynomial Model in Storage Conditions of Stingless Bee Honey for Moisture Content, Acidity and HMF Content	95
4.6.3	Analysis of Moisture Content, Acidity and HMF Content by Factorial Design	108
4.6.4	Effect of Storage Duration and Temperature on Moisture Content	112
4.6.5	Effect of Storage Duration and Temperature on Acidity	114
4.6.6	Effect of Storage Duration and Temperature on HMF Content	115
4.6.7	Effect of Storage Conditions of Stingless Bee Honey by Factorial Design	117
4.6.8	Verification Phase of Moisture Content, Acidity and HMF Content Upon Storage by Using Factorial Design	118
4.6.9	Correlation between Moisture Content, Acidity and HMF Content in Storage Conditions of Stingless Bee Honey	119

CHAPTER 5	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	123
5.1	Conclusion	123
5.2	Recommendation	124
REFERENCES		127
LIST OF PUBLICATION		143
APPENDIX A		145

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE NO	TITLE	PAGE
Table 2.1	Color classification of honey, according to Pfund scale.	26
Table 2.2	Quality standards of honey from different countries (<i>Apis mellifera</i> , Meliponine, and Malaysian stingless bee honey).	31
Table 3.1	Sources of samples collected from 10 districts in Johor.	50
Table 3.2	Processing parameters and coded level for storage condition of Johor stingless bee honey.	59
Table 3.3	General factorial (coded values) design for storage condition of Johor stingless bee honey.	60
Table 4.1	Physical parameters of Johor stingless bee honey.	69
Table 4.2	Physical parameters of Johor stingless bee honey.	71
Table 4.3	Physical parameters of Johor stingless bee honey.	73
Table 4.4	Physical and chemical parameters of Johor stingless bee honey.	75
Table 4.5	Chemical parameters of Johor stingless bee honey.	79
Table 4.6	Correlation matrix between physicochemical parameters of 27 samples of Johor stingless bee honey	87
Table 4.7	General factorial experimental design for storage conditions of stingless bee honey.	94
Table 4.8	The data from Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) for moisture content from storage of stingless bee honey.	96
Table 4.9	The data from Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) for acidity from storage of stingless bee honey.	97
Table 4.10	The data from Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) for HMF content from storage of stingless bee honey.	98
Table 4.11	Experimental value and predicted value for moisture content from the model.	99
Table 4.12	Experimental value and predicted value for acidity from the model.	100
Table 4.13	Experimental value and predicted value for HMF content from the model.	101

Table 4.14	Coefficient estimate of interaction model for moisture content.	109
Table 4.15	Coefficient estimate of interaction model for acidity.	110
Table 4.16	Coefficient estimate of interaction model for HMF content.	111
Table 4.17	The predicted solution of the effect of factor variables of storage conditions on stingless bee honey.	117
Table 4.18	Comparison between predicted value and experimental value on storage conditions of stingless bee honey.	118
Table 4.19	Correlation matrix (r) of storage conditions with moisture content, acidity, and HMF content.	119

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE NO	TITLE	PAGE
Figure 2.1	Stingless bees guarding the entrance of the hive.	8
Figure 2.2	Map of Johor, Malaysia (Adapted and modified from Abdullahi et al., 2019).	9
Figure 2.3	Stingless bee honey.	9
Figure 2.4	Pollen attached on the tibia of the hind leg of the stingless bee.	10
Figure 2.5	Bee pollen in pots filled by stingless bees.	11
Figure 2.6	Structure of 5-hydroxymethylfurfural (Melo et al. 2014).	21
Figure 2.7	Example of scatter plot.	37
Figure 2.8	Principal components analysis (Ringnér, 2008).	38
Figure 2.9	A pictorial graph for 3 ² factorial design.	41
Figure 3.1	Flow chart of the nutritional characterization and storage condition of Johor stingless bee honey.	48
Figure 4.1	Gallic acid content (mg/kg) of Johor stingless bee honey samples.	82
Figure 4.2	Caffeic acid content (mg/kg) of Johor stingless bee honey samples.	82
Figure 4.3	p-Coumaric acid content (mg/kg) of Johor stingless bee honey samples.	83
Figure 4.4	Quercetin content (mg/kg) of Johor stingless bee honey samples.	83
Figure 4.5	Catechin content (mg/kg) of Johor stingless bee honey samples.	84
Figure 4.6	Kaempferol content (mg/kg) of Johor stingless bee honey samples.	84
Figure 4.7	Principal component analysis: 2D-score plot of the first and second principal components. Moi: moisture content; E.C: electrical conductivity; FA: free acidity; lactones: lactone acidity; TSS: total soluble solids; Prot: protein; CHO: carbohydrate; TPC: total phenolic content; TFC: total flavonoid content; IC50: Inhibition concentration minimized at 50%.	90

Figure 4.8	Principal component analysis: 2D-score plot of the first and second principal components for 27 samples of Johor stingless bee honey from 10 districts.	91
Figure 4.9	Principal component analysis: Biplot of the first and second principal components with. Moi: moisture content; E.C: electrical conductivity; FA: free acidity; lactones: lactone acidity; TSS: total soluble solids; Prot: protein; CHO: carbohydrate; TPC: total phenolic content; TFC: total flavonoid content; IC50: Inhibition concentration minimized at 50%.	92
Figure 4.10	Actual values versus predicted values for moisture content.	102
Figure 4.11	Actual values versus predicted values for acidity.	103
Figure 4.12	Actual values versus predicted values for HMF content.	103
Figure 4.13	Outlier T of moisture content.	104
Figure 4.14	Outlier T of acidity.	105
Figure 4.15	Outlier T of HMF content.	105
Figure 4.16	Normal residual plot for moisture content.	106
Figure 4.17	Normal residual plot for acidity.	107
Figure 4.18	Normal residual plot for HMF content.	107
Figure 4.19	Interaction effect of storage duration and temperature on moisture content.	113
Figure 4.20	Interaction effect of storage duration and temperature on acidity.	114
Figure 4.21	Interaction effect of storage duration and temperature on HMF content.	116
Figure 4.22	Correlation between moisture content and acidity in storage condition of stingless bee honey.	120
Figure 4.23	Correlation between moisture content and HMF content in storage condition of stingless bee honey.	121
Figure 4.24	Correlation between HMF content and acidity in storage condition of stingless bee honey.	121

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

2D	-	2-Dimensional
2FI	-	2 Factor Interaction
ABTS	-	2,2'-azino-bis(3-ethylbenzothiazoline-6-sulfonic acid
ANOVA	-	Analysis of Variance
AOAC	-	Association of Official Agricultural Chemists
BBD	-	Box-Behnken Design
CCD	-	Central Composite Design
ChaGo-I	-	Lung undifferentiated cancer cell line
CHO	-	Carbohydrate
CTGase	-	Cyclodextrin glycosyltransferase
CODEX	-	Particle Swarm Optimization
DF	-	Degree of freedom
DN	-	Diastase Number
DOE	-	Design of Experiment
DPPH	-	2,2-diphenyl-1-picrylhydrazyl
E.C	-	Electrical conductivity
EHC	-	European Honey Commission
FA	-	Free acidity
GAE	-	Gallic acid equivalent
HCl	-	Hydrochloric acid
HepG2	-	Human liver cancer cell line
HMF	-	Hydroxymethylfurfural
HPLC	-	High-Performance Liquid Chromatography
HSD	-	Honestly significance difference
IBM	-	International Business Machines
IC ₅₀	-	Inhibition concentration minimized at 50%
IHC	-	International Honey Commission
JSBH	-	Johor Stingless Bee Honey
JMP	-	JUMP Statistical Software
KGaA	-	Kommanditgesellschaft auf Aktien (Merck Group)
LDL	-	Low Density Lipoproteins

MARDI	-	Malaysian Agricultural Research and Development Institute (MARDI)
Max	-	Maximum
MoA	-	Ministry of Agriculture and Agro-based Industry
Moi	-	Moisture
MSB	-	Mean value of the squares between groups
MSW	-	Mean value of the squares between groups
NaOH	-	Sodium hydroxide
OFAT	-	One-Factor-at-a-Time
ORAC	-	Oxygen Radical Absorbance Capacity
<i>p</i>	-	Probability
PABA	-	Para-aminobenzoic acid
PCA	-	Principal Component Analysis
PCs	-	Principal components
Prot	-	Protein
RE	-	Rutin equivalent
RSA	-	Radical Scavenging Activity
SD	-	Standard deviation
sp.	-	Species
SPSS	-	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences
SSB	-	Sum of the squares between groups
SSW	-	Sum of the squares within groups
TEAC	-	Trolox Equivalent Antioxidant Capacity
TFC	-	Total flavonoid content
TPA	-	Tissue polypeptide antigen
TPC	-	Total phenolic content
TSS	-	Total soluble solid
UV	-	Ultraviolet
UV-Vis	-	Ultraviolet-visible spectroscopy
XLSTAT	-	Microsoft Excel statistical analysis add-in

LIST OF SYMBOLS

β_0	-	Constant term
H_0	-	Null hypothesis
H_A	-	Alternative hypothesis
ε	-	Residual
x_k	-	Variables
μ	-	Response variable
g	-	gram
h	-	hour
M	-	Molarity
n	-	Number of sample
N	-	Normality
r	-	Correlation coefficient
R^2	-	r-squared
kg	-	Kilogram
mg	-	Milligram
mL	-	Millilitre
mm	-	Millimetre
mm Pfund	-	Millimetre Pfund
nm	-	Nanometre
mg/kg	-	Milligram per kilogram
mg/L	-	Milligram/litre
mg/mL	-	Milligram per millilitre
mEq/kg	-	Milliequilibrium per kilogram
mEq/100 g	-	Milliequilibrium per hundred gram
mS/cm	-	milliSiemen per centimetre
μ S/cm	-	Micrometre per centimetre
w/w	-	Weight per weight
w/v	-	Weight per volume
g/mL	-	Gram per millilitre
g/L	-	Gram per litre
g/100 g	-	Gram per hundred gram

rpm	-	Revolutions per minute
μm	-	Micrometre
α	-	Level of significance
%	-	Percentage
$^{\circ}\text{Brix}$	-	Degree Brix
$^{\circ}\text{C}$	-	Degree Celsius
®	-	Registered trademark symbol

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

Food quality has been an important aspect to maintain the product's value especially to be used by the consumers. This could be meant by controlling the occurrence of the food from being spoiled due to the contamination by various microorganisms and filth, and also to retain the food quality by looking into consideration on the attribution of some factors such as color, taste, flavour, texture and processing method. Good quality of food usually follows the recommended standard by various organizations and they had listed various types of food according to the properties from handling to the storage of the food.

Honey, a gold-like liquid, has a great contribution in many fields of industries mainly food industries and medicine field. It can be used as a food sweetener, avoiding the sugar, heal wounds, act as an antibacterial agent and other advantages. The emergence of stingless bee honey was long before the great discovery of honeybee honey. However, the popularity of honeybee honey conceals the greatness of stingless bee honey. Honey utilization has been focusing on common honeybee honey from *Apis mellifera sp.* as the introduction of honey was first to come from these types of species. Only recently that the stingless bee honey emergence has come to the surface as one of the types of honey. In Malaysia, there are more than 30 species of stingless bee honey found and the beekeepers of stingless bee honey found in Malaysia to date were about 700 stingless beekeepers (Ismail and Ismail, 2018). Johor, as one of Malaysia's districts, also followed the call from the Ministry of Agriculture and Agri-Industry (MOA) to establish the National Industrial Development Plan for Stingless Bee Honey in the year of 2020-2030 in an attempt to advance and improve the country's international export industry.

Stingless bee honey is not very much different from *Apis mellifera* honey. because the bees produced honey from the nectar that was collected from floral sources and exudates of plant-sucking insects. The difference between these two types of honey is that only honey from *Apis mellifera* spp. was included in the standard (Alimentarius, 2001). Insufficient knowledge on stingless bee honey and at the same time the extensive study on the *Apis mellifera* honey lead to the This could be insufficient knowledge of the stingless bee honey. Hence, many studies had been done to determine and identify the characteristics of this honey based on the physicochemical properties of the honey. However, the researchers only identify the characteristics of the stingless bee honey from different types of species from different countries and no specific legislation had been produced yet. Therefore, the stingless bee honey quality is only based on how the honey will be handled from the caring of the bees until the storage of the honey. Fortunately, in the year of 2017, Malaysia had released the standard specifically for stingless bee honey which is the Malaysia Standard, MS 2683: 2017: Kelulut (Stingless bee) Honey-Specification (Standards Malaysia, 2017).

Storage of honey is an important aspect of maintaining the quality of the honey. Most of the time, beekeepers, suppliers, and consumers store their honey in a close tight container (glass or plastic) to prolong the shelf-life of the honey. A close tight container is functions to prevent the absorption of honey to the moisture outside of the bottle because honey is a good absorbent. Besides, if the water content is higher in the honey, the possibility for the fermentation by yeast is high. This is due to the properties of the yeast that favour the moisture environment. Therefore, the importance of monitoring the moisture content during storage is essential for maintaining the nutritional values in the stingless bee honey.

However, due to high moisture content, most of the beekeepers will apply heat to remove the water content. Heat exposure on the honey could cause the production of a toxic compound named hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) compound. HMF compound is not only present in honey but could be formed in most of the foods. However, there are no studies proving the toxicity effects of the HMF compound in humans. The HMF compound is produced due to the breakdown of fructose in the

presence of the acid. This could be predicted that the fructose level will be lessened and there will be an increased in acidity level if the HMF content in honey is high. Hence, the storage time with the addition of the exposure to high temperature could be the cause of the deterioration of the honey which will then lower the honey quality.

The establishment of the quality standards specifically for Malaysian stingless bee honey has been developed recently. Determination of characteristics of Johor stingless bee honey is important as additional future data for the standard regulation. In addition to that, the honey also needs to be stored very well to ease the process during transportation of the honey until the storage of the honey. The maintenance of the stingless bee honey in terms of its storage condition can be used to help for a better quality of Johor stingless bee honey.

1.2 Problem Statement

The rearing of stingless bees for the purpose of obtaining their honey has been increased in all states in Malaysia including Johor. Most of the study on Malaysian stingless bee honey was evaluating on the characterization of honey at the most renounce rearing locations or comparison of the characterization of stingless bee honey based on different types of the species. The information on this type of honey has been profoundly studied, but the information of Johor stingless bee honey characteristics is still unknown. The establishment of nutritional characterization is very important

In addition, storage conditions of stingless bee honey were important to maintain the quality of honey for better consumption. A concern appears for the stingless bee honey concerning the problem faced by the honey during the storage of the honey. Storage condition like long-term storage with thermal exposure reduced the nutritional quality of stingless bee honey. However, to maintain the appropriate temperature and duration during storage is difficult due to our climate condition (high humidity level and temperatures averaging between 28°C - 30°C, thus could lower the quality of the honey

Most of the time, consumers would like to obtain the honey freshly. However, honey could face certain negative conditions. These conditions are fermentation, honey more acidic, and the probability of formation of the toxic compound like hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) compound that may cause a carcinogenic effect to the human. In Malaysia, there has been little research for the study of storage conditions of stingless bee honey focusing on its freshness and quality. The factors involved are moisture content, acidity, and hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) content. In some study, the storage conditions on Malaysian stingless bee honey was studied on the various factors. However, the study on storage conditions and its relationship with the quality of Johor stingless bee honey is still remained unknown. This information is important to help the stingless bee honey industry specifically in Johor for beekeepers, manufacturing and consumer.

Moreover, there is a very limited study on the effect of storage conditions on Malaysian stingless bee honey using computer-generated statistical design methodology. This method was effective compared to the traditional method such as one-factor-at-a-time (OFAT) design by offering shorter time (low number of the experimental run), cost-effective and precise and accurate data analysis. The present study attempts to determine the best storage conditions of stingless bee honey by using a computer-generated design method and provide guidance for the development of the Malaysian stingless bee honey industry.

1.3 Objective of the Study

The objective of this study was:

- i. To determine the physicochemical characterization of Johor stingless bee honey.
- ii. To evaluate the effect of temperature and duration of storage and its relationship with quality of stingless bee honey.

1.4 Scope of the Study

- i. Determination of the physicocharacteristics of 27 stingless bee honey collected from 26 places in 10 districts of Johor by physical characterization (pH, moisture, ash, electrical conductivity, and acidity) and chemical characterization (total phenolic content, total flavonoid content, antioxidant activity, and hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) content).
- ii. Evaluation of the correlation between physical and chemical characteristics of Johor stingless bee honey by statistical analysis (Pearson's correlation coefficient) and Principal Component analysis to get the best stingless bee honey sample
- iii. Determination of the effect of temperature (4°C, 24°C, and 35°C) and duration (30 to 90 days) of storage on Johor stingless bee honey quality (moisture content, acidity and hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) content) by using Factorial design (Design-Expert Version 6.0.6 software).
- iv Evaluation of the correlation between storage conditions (duration and temperature) of selected stingless bee honey sample by Pearson's correlation coefficient.

1.5 Significance of the Study

Stingless bee honey has long been introduced to the consumer due to its beneficial purposes such as therapeutic effects. The quality of this type of honey is important since this honey will be used by consumers in daily life. Besides, the advantages of consuming stingless bee honey were studied in most researches that can lead to a healthy lifestyle of the consumers. An increase in awareness and demands for more stingless bee honey can further improve the production and maintenance of the stingless bee honey.

The producers and marketers of Johor stingless bee honey may, therefore, act in response to the demands from the consumers more quickly by following the guideline of production and storage of the honey. The improvement of the quality of Johor stingless bee honey to gain consumer confidence will, therefore, follow the policy which stated that stingless bee honey is known as a superfood that was announced by the Ministry of Agriculture and Agro-based Industry (MoA) (MARDI, 2016). Meanwhile, the benefits of stingless bee honey also can help most researchers to develop stingless honey bee-based products that can benefits the consumers, increase the stingless bee honey industry to the highest and improve the economic status of Malaysia stingless bee honey towards better future.

REFERENCES

- A-Rahaman, N.L., Chua, L.S., Sarmidi, M.R. and Aziz, R. (2013) 'Physicochemical and radical scavenging activities of honey samples from Malaysia', *Agricultural sciences*, 4(05), p. 46.
- A-Rahaman, N.L. (2014) Correlation Between Physical and Chemical Properties of Honey Samples from Malaysia. Master Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai.
- Abdullahi, T., Harun, Z., Othman, M. H. D., Nuhu, A. H., and Usman, J. (2019) 'Conversion and characterization of synthetic zeolite using low grade kaolin from Mersing area of Johor', in *AIP Conference Proceedings*, 2068(1), p. 020102.
- Al-Asheh, S., Jumah, R., Banat, F. and Hammad, S. (2003) 'The use of experimental factorial design for analysing the effect of spray dryer operating variables on the production of tomato powder', *Food and bioproducts processing*, 81(2), pp. 81-88.
- Al-Diab, D. and Jarkas, B. (2015) 'Effect of storage and thermal treatment on the quality of some local brands of honey from Latakia markets', *Journal of Entomology and Zoology Studies*, 3(3), pp. 328-334.
- Abraham, K., Gürtler, R., Berg, K., Heinemeyer, G., Lampen, A. and Appel, K.E. (2011) 'Toxicology and risk assessment of 5-Hydroxymethylfurfural in food', *Molecular nutrition & food research*, 55(5), pp. 667-678.
- Acquarone, C., Buera, P. and Elizalde, B. (2007) 'Pattern of pH and electrical conductivity upon honey dilution as a complementary tool for discriminating geographical origin of honeys', *Food Chemistry*, 101(2), pp. 695-703.
- Ahmed, M., Khiati, B., Meslem, A., Aissat, S. and Djebli, N. (2014) 'Evaluation of physicochemical and antioxidant properties of raw honey from Algeria', *Journal of Microbial & Biochemical Technology*, S4.
- Ajlouni, S. and Sujirapinyokul, P. (2010) 'Hydroxymethylfurfuraldehyde and amylase contents in Australian honey', *Food Chemistry*, 119(3), pp. 1000-1005.

- Akhtar, M.S. and Khan, M.S. (1989) 'Glycaemic responses to three different honeys given to normal and alloxan-diabetic rabbits', *Journal of Pakistan Medical Association*, 39(4), pp. 107-13.
- Al-Ghamdi, A., Mohammed, S.E.A., Ansari, M.J. and Adgaba, N. (2019) 'Comparison of physicochemical properties and effects of heating regimes on stored *Apis mellifera* and *Apis florea* honey', *Saudi journal of biological sciences*, 26(4), pp. 845-848.
- Ali, H., Abu Bakar, M. F., Majid, M., Muhammad, N., & Lim, S. Y (2020) 'In vitro anti-diabetic activity of stingless bee honey from different botanical origins', *Food Research*, 4(5), pp. 1421-1426.
- Alimentarius, C. (2001) 'Codex Standard for Honey, FAO, Rome', *Alinorm*, 1, pp. 19-26.
- Alqarni, A.S., Owayss, A.A., Mahmoud, A.A. and Hannan, M.A. (2014) 'Mineral content and physical properties of local and imported honeys in Saudi Arabia', *Journal of Saudi Chemical Society*, 18(5), pp. 618-625.
- Amano, K., Nemoto, T. and Heard, T.A. (2000) 'What are stingless bees, and why and how to use them as crop pollinators?-a review', *Japan Agricultural Research Quarterly*, 34(3), pp. 183-190.
- Andualem, B. (2014) 'Physico-chemical, microbiological and antibacterial properties of *Apis mellifera* and *Trigona* spp. honey against bacterial pathogens', *World Journal of Agricultural Sciences*, 10(3), pp. 112-120.
- AOAC Official Method. (2000) in Horwitz, W. (ed). *Official Method of Analytical of AOAC International*. Washington DC: AOAC International.
- Arendse, E., Fawole, O.A. and Opara, U.L. (2014) 'Influence of storage temperature and duration on postharvest physico-chemical and mechanical properties of pomegranate fruit and arils', *CyTA-Journal of Food*, 12(4), pp. 389-398.
- Aziz, M.S.A., Giribabu, N., Rao, P.V. and Salleh, N. (2017) 'Pancreatoprotective effects of *Geniotrigona thoracica* stingless bee honey in streptozotocin-nicotinamide-induced male diabetic rats', *Biomedicine & Pharmacotherapy*, 89, pp. 135-145.
- Bahçecitapar, M.K., Karadağ, Ö. and Aktaş, S. (2016) 'Estimation of sample size and power for general full factorial designs', *İstatistikçiler Dergisi: İstatistik ve Aktüerya*, 9(2), pp. 79-86.

- Baig, S. and Attique, H. (2014) 'Cytotoxic activity of honey in hepatoma cells: in vitro evaluation', *Pakistan Journal of Medicine and Dentistry*, 3(1), pp. 12-16.
- Bakar, M.A., Sanusi, S.B., Bakar, F.A., Cong, O.J. and Mian, Z. (2017) 'Physicochemical and antioxidant potential of raw unprocessed honey from Malaysian stingless bees'. *Pakistan Journal of Nutrition*, 16(11), pp. 888-894.
- Bárbara, M., Machado, C., Sodré, G., Dias, L., Estevinho, L. and de Carvalho, C. (2015) 'Microbiological assessment, nutritional characterization and phenolic compounds of bee pollen from *Mellipona mandacaia* Smith, 1983', *Molecules*, 20(7), pp. 12525-12544.
- Baroni, M.V., Chiabrandi, G.A., Costa, C. and Wunderlin, D.A. (2002) 'Assessment of the floral origin of honey by SDS-page immunoblot techniques', *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 50(6), pp. 1362-1367.
- Bijlsma, L., de Bruijn, L.L., Martens, E.P. and Sommeijer, M.J. (2006) 'Water content of stingless bee honeys (Apidae, Meliponini): interspecific variation and comparison with honey of *Apis mellifera*', *Apidologie*, 37(4), pp. 480-486.
- Biluca, F.C., Della Betta, F., de Oliveira, G.P., Pereira, L.M., Gonzaga, L.V., Costa, A.C.O. and Fett, R. (2014) '5-HMF and carbohydrates content in stingless bee honey by CE before and after thermal treatment', *Food Chemistry*, 159, pp. 244-249.
- Biswa, R., Sarkar, A. and Khewa, S.S. (2017) 'Ethnomedicinal uses of honey of stingless bee by Nepali community of Darjeeling foothills of West Bengal, India', *Indian Journal of Traditional Knowledge*, 16(4), pp. 648-653.
- Bogdanov, S., Martin, P. and Lüllmann, C., (1997) 'Harmonised methods of the European Honey Commission', *Apidologie*.
- Bogdanov, S., Martin, P. and Lullmann, C. (2002) *Harmonised methods of the international honey commission*. Swiss Bee Research Centre, FAM, Liebefeld.
- Bogdanov, S., Ruoff, K. and Oddo, L.P. (2004) 'Physico-chemical methods for the characterisation of unifloral honeys: a review', *Apidologie*, 35(Suppl. 1), pp. S4-S17.
- Bogdanov, S., Jurendic, T., Sieber, R. and Gallmann, P. (2008) 'Honey for nutrition and health: a review', *Journal of the American College of Nutrition*, 27(6), pp. 677-689.

- Boorn, K.L., Khor, Y.Y., Sweetman, E., Tan, F., Heard, T.A. and Hammer, K.A. (2010) 'Antimicrobial activity of honey from the stingless bee *Trigona carbonaria* determined by agar diffusion, agar dilution, broth microdilution and time-kill methodology', *Journal of applied microbiology*, 108(5), pp. 1534-1543.
- Borsato, D.M., Prudente, A.S., Döll-Boscardin, P.M., Borsato, A.V., Luz, C.F., Maia, B.H., Cabrini, D.A., Otuki, M.F., Miguel, M.D., Farago, P.V. and Miguel, O.G. (2014) 'Topical anti-inflammatory activity of a monofloral honey of *Mimosa scabrella* provided by *Melipona marginata* during winter in Southern Brazil', *Journal of medicinal food*, 17(7), pp. 817-825.
- Campos, J.F., Santos, U.P.D., Rocha, P.D.S.D., Damião, M.J., Balestieri, J.B.P., Cardoso, C.A.L., Paredes-Gamero, E.J., Estevinho, L.M., de Picoli Souza, K. and Santos, E.L.D. (2015) 'Antimicrobial, antioxidant, anti-inflammatory, and cytotoxic activities of propolis from the stingless bee *Tetragonisca fiebrigi* (Jataí)', *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, 2015, pp. 1-11.
- Cano, C.B., Felsner, M.L., Matos, J.D.R., Bruns, R.E., Whatanabe, H.M. and Almeida-Muradian, L.B.D. (2001) 'Comparison of methods for determining moisture content of citrus and eucalyptus Brazilian honeys by refractometry', *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*, 14(1), pp. 101-109.
- Carvalho, C.A., Sodré, G.S., Fonseca, A.A., Alves, R.M., Souza, B.A. and Clarton, L. (2009) 'Physicochemical characteristics and sensory profile of honey samples from stingless bees (Apidae: Meliponinae) submitted to a dehumidification process', *Anais da Academia Brasileira de Ciências*, 81(1), pp. 143-149.
- Castoldi, K., Milani, M.I., Rossini, E.L., Pezza, L. and Pezza, H.R. (2016) 'Flow injection analysis of 5-(hydroxymethyl)-2-furaldehyde in honey by a modified Winkler method', *Analytical Sciences*, 32(4), pp. 413-417.
- Chan, B.K., Haron, H., Talib, R.A. and Subramaniam, P. (2017) 'Physical properties, antioxidant content and anti-oxidative activities of Malaysian stingless kelulut (*Trigona* spp.) Honey', *Journal of Agricultural Science*, 9(13), pp. 32-40.
- Chan-Rodríguez, D., Ramón-Sierra, J., Lope-Ayora, J., Sauri-Duch, E., Cuevas-Glory, L. and Ortiz-Vázquez, E. (2012) 'Antibacterial properties of honey produced by *Melipona beecheii* and *Apis mellifera* against foodborn microorganisms', *Food Science and Biotechnology*, 21(3), pp. 905-909.

- Chanchao, C. (2009) 'Antimicrobial activity by *Trigona laeviceps* (stingless bee) honey from Thailand', *Pakistan Journal of Medical Sciences*, 25(3), pp. 364-369.
- Chua, L.S., Rahaman, N.L.A., Adnan, N.A., Tan, E. and Tjih, T. (2013) 'Antioxidant activity of three honey samples in relation with their biochemical components', *Journal of analytical methods in chemistry*, 2013, pp. 1-8.
- Chua, L.S. and Adnan, N.A. (2014) 'Biochemical and nutritional components of selected honey samples', *Acta Scientiarum Polonorum Technologia Alimentaria*, 13(2), pp. 169-179.
- Chuttong, B., Chanbang, Y., Sringarm, K. and Burgett, M. (2016) 'Effects of long term storage on stingless bee (Hymenoptera Apidae: Meliponini) honey', *Journal of Apicultural Research*, 54(5), pp. 441-451.
- Chuttong, B., Chanbang, Y., Sringarm, K. and Burgett, M. (2016) 'Physicochemical profiles of stingless bee (Apidae: Meliponini) honey from South east Asia (Thailand)', *Food Chemistry*, 192, pp. 149-155.
- Colucci, G., De Vito, V., Varricchio, E., De Cunzo, F. and Coccia, E. (2016) 'Identification of traceability markers in Italian unifloral honeys of different botanical origin', *Journal of Nutrition and Food Sciences*, 6(462), p. 2.
- da Silva, I.A.A., da Silva, T.M.S., Camara, C.A., Queiroz, N., Magnani, M., de Novais, J.S., Soledade, L.E.B., de Oliveira Lima, E., de Souza, A.L. and de Souza, A.G. (2013) 'Phenolic profile, antioxidant activity and palynological analysis of stingless bee honey from Amazonas, Northern Brazil', *Food chemistry*, 141(4), pp. 3552-3558.
- da Silva, P.M., Gauche, C., Gonzaga, L.V., Costa, A.C.O. and Fett, R. (2016) 'Honey: Chemical composition, stability and authenticity', *Food Chemistry*, 196, pp. 309-323.
- de Almeida-Muradian, L.B., Stramm, K.M., Horita, A., Barth, O.M., da Silva de Freitas, A. and Estevinho, L.M. (2013) 'Comparative study of the physicochemical and palynological characteristics of honey from *Melipona subnitida* and *Apis mellifera*', *International Journal of Food Science & Technology*, 48(8), pp. 1698-1706.
- de Rodríguez, G.O., de Ferrer, B.S., Ferrer, A. and Rodríguez, B. (2004) 'Characterization of honey produced in Venezuela', *Food Chemistry*, 84(4), pp. 499-502.

- de Sousa, J.M.B., de Souza, E.L., Marques, G., de Toledo Benassi, M., Gullón, B., Pintado, M.M. and Magnani, M. (2016) 'Sugar profile, physicochemical and sensory aspects of monofloral honeys produced by different stingless bee species in Brazilian semi-arid region', *LWT-Food Science and Technology*, 65, pp. 645-651.
- do Nascimento, A.S., Marchini, L.C., de Carvalho, C.A.L., Araújo, D.F.D., de Olinda, R.A. and da Silveira, T.A. (2015) 'Physical-chemical parameters of honey of stingless bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae)', *American Chemical Science Journal*, 7(3), pp. 139-149.
- Dardón, M.J., Maldonado-Aguilera, C. and Enríquez, E. (2013) *The pot-honey of Guatemalan bees*, in Vit, P., Pedro, S. R. M., and Roubik, D. *Pot-Honey*. Springer, New York, pp. 395-408.
- Del Sarto, M.C.L., Oliveira, E.E., Guedes, R.N.C. and Campos, L.A.O. (2014) 'Differential insecticide susceptibility of the Neotropical stingless bee *Melipona quadrifasciata* and the honey bee *Apis mellifera*', *Apidologie*, 45(5), pp. 626-636.
- DeMera, J.H. and Angert, E.R. (2004) 'Comparison of the antimicrobial activity of honey produced by *Tetragonisca angustula* (Meliponinae) and *Apis mellifera* from different phytogeographic regions of Costa Rica', *Apidologie*, 35(4), pp. 411-417.
- Demirci, B.K.S.K.M. (2011) 'The relationship between some physico-chemical, microbiological characteristics and electrical conductivity of milk stored at different temperature', *Tekirdağ Ziraat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 8(2), pp. 13-21.
- Eleazu, C. O. Iroaganachi, M. A., Eleazu, K. C. And Okoronkwo, J. O. (2013) 'Determination of the physico-chemical composition, microbial quality and free radical scavenging activities of some commercially sold honey samples in Aba, Nigeria: 'The effect of varying colors'', *Nutrition & Food Sciences*, 04(01), pp. 32-41.
- Erejuwa, O.O., Sulaiman, S.A. and Wahab, M.S.A. (2012) 'Fructose might contribute to the hypoglycemic effect of honey', *Molecules*, 17(2), pp. 1900-1915.
- Fallico, B., Zappala, M., Arena, E. and Verzera, A. (2004) 'Effects of conditioning on HMF content in unifloral honeys', *Food Chemistry*, 85(2), pp. 305-313.
- Fallico, B., Arena, E. and Zappala, M.. (2009) 'Prediction of honey shelf life', *Journal of Food Quality*, 32(3), pp. 352-368.

- Farnesi, A.P., Aquino-Ferreira, R., Jong, D.D., Bastos, J.K. and Soares, A.E.E. (2009) 'Effects of stingless bee and honey bee propolis on four species of bacteria', *Genetics and Molecular Research*, 8(2), pp. 635-640.
- Fauzi, A.N., Norazmi, M.N. and Yaacob, N.S. (2011) 'Tualang honey induces apoptosis and disrupts the mitochondrial membrane potential of human breast and cervical cancer cell lines', *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, 49(4), pp. 871-878.
- Feás, X., Vázquez-Tato, M.P., Estevinho, L., Seijas, J.A. and Iglesias, A. (2012) 'Organic bee pollen: botanical origin, nutritional value, bioactive compounds, antioxidant activity and microbiological quality', *Molecules*, 17(7), pp. 8359-8377.
- Guerrini, A., Bruni, R., Maietti, S., Poli, F., Rossi, D., Paganetto, G., Muzzoli, M., Scalvenzi, L. and Sacchetti, G. (2009) 'Ecuadorian stingless bee (Meliponinae) honey: A chemical and functional profile of an ancient health product', *Food Chemistry*, 114(4), pp. 1413-1420.
- Guo, W., Liu, Y., Zhu, X. and Zhuang, H. (2011) 'Sensing the water content of honey from temperature-dependent electrical conductivity', *Measurement Science and Technology*, 22(8), p. 085706.
- Hasali, N.H., Zamri, A.I., Lani, M.N., Mubarak, A., Ahmad, F. And Chilek, T.Z.T. (2018) 'Physico-Chemical Analysis And Antibacterial Activity Of Raw Honey Of Stingless Bee Farmed In Coastal Areas In Kelantan And Terengganu', *Malaysian Applied Biology Journal*, 47(4), pp. 145–151.
- Hazirah, H., Yasmin, A. M., & Norwahidah, A. (2019) 'Antioxidant Properties of Stingless Bee Honey and Its Effect on the Viability of Lymphoblastoid Cell Line', *Medicine & Health*, 14, pp. 91-105.
- Hoskins, D., Turban, R.C. and Colbourn, C.J. (2004) 'Experimental designs in software engineering: d-optimal designs and covering arrays', in *Proceedings of the 2004 ACM workshop on Interdisciplinary software engineering research*, pp. 55-66.
- Ibrahim, N., Niza, N.F.S.M., Rodi, M.M.M., Zakaria, A.J., Ismail, Z. and Mohd, K.S. (2016) 'Chemical and biological analyses of Malaysian stingless bee propolis extracts', *Malaysian Journal of Analytical Sciences*, 20(2), pp. 413-422.

- Ilechie, A.A., Kwapong, P.K., Mate-Kole, E., Kyei, S. and Darko-Takyi, C. (2012) 'The efficacy of stingless bee honey for the treatment of bacteria-induced conjunctivitis in guinea pigs', *Journal of experimental pharmacology*, 4, p. 63.
- Illias, R.M., Tien, S.F., Rahman, R.A., Rashid, N.A.A., Yusoff, W.M.W., Hamid, A.A., Hassan, O. and Kamaruddin, K. (2003) 'Application of factorial design to study the effects of temperature, initial ph and agitation on the production of cyclodextrin glucanotransferase from alkalophilic *Bacillus* sp. G1', *ScienceAsia*, 29, pp. 135-140.
- International Honey Commission. (2002) *Harmonised methods of the international honey commission*. Liebefeld, Switzerland.
- Ismail, M.M. and Ismail, W.I.W. (2018) 'Development of stingless beekeeping projects in Malaysia', in *E3S Web of Conferences: Towards Inclusive & Sustainable Agriculture – Harmonizing Environmental, Social and Economic Dimensions: Is it Possible?*, 52, p. 00028.
- Issaro, N., Weerakul, T., Machana, S., Ornnim, P., Phanudulkitti, C., Srijan, T., Laiwattanaphaisal, J. and Pattarapanich, C. (2013) 'Stingless bee honey II: Qualitative and quantitative studies on honey produced by three stingless bee species collected from a mangosteen garden in Chantaburi province, Thailand', *Thai Journal of Pharmaceutical. Sciences*, 38, pp. 16-18.
- James, O. O., Mesubi, M. A., Usman, L. A., Yeye, S. O., Ajanaku, K. O., Ogunniran, K. O., Ajani, O.O., Siyanbola, T. O. (2009) 'Physical characterisation of some honey samples from North-Central Nigeria', *International Journal of Physical Sciences*, 4(9), pp. 464-470.
- Kao, L.S. and Green, C.E. (2008) 'Analysis of variance: is there a difference in means and what does it mean?' *Journal of Surgical Research*, 144(1), pp. 158-170.
- Kek, S.P., Chin, N.L., Yusof, Y.A., Tan, S.W., & Chua, L.S. (2014) 'Total phenolic contents and color intensity of Malaysian honeys from the *Apis* spp. and *Trigona* spp. Bees', *Agriculture and Agricultural Science Procedia*, 2, pp. 150-155.
- Kek, S.P., Chin, N.L., Tan, S.W., Yusof, Y.A. and Chua, L.S. (2017) 'Classification of honey from its bee origin via chemical profiles and mineral content', *Food analytical methods*, 10(1), pp. 19-30.

- Kelly, N., M. S. N. Farisya, T. K. Kumara, and P. Marcela. (2014) 'Species Diversity and External Nest Characteristics of Stingless Bees in Meliponiculture', *Pertanika Journal of Tropical Agricultural Science*, 37(3).
- Khalil, M.I., Sulaiman, S.A. and Boukraa, L. (2010) 'Antioxidant properties of honey and its role in preventing health disorder', *The Open Nutraceuticals Journal*, 3(1).
- Khalil, M., Moniruzzaman, M., Boukraâ, L., Benhanifia, M., Islam, M., Sulaiman, S.A. and Gan, S.H. (2012) 'Physicochemical and antioxidant properties of Algerian honey', *Molecules*, 17(9), pp. 11199-11215.
- Khongkwanmueang, A., Nuyy, A., Straub, L. and Maitip, J. (2020) 'Physicochemical Profiles, Antioxidant and Antibacterial Capacity of Honey from Stingless Bee *Tetragonula laeviceps* Species Complex', in *E3S Web of Conferences: Research, Invention, and Innovation Congress*, p. 03007.
- Kim, H.Y. (2014) 'Analysis of variance (ANOVA) comparing means of more than two groups', *Restorative dentistry & endodontics*, 39(1), pp. 74-77.
- Kivrak, Ş., Kivrak, I. and Karababa, E. (2017) 'Characterization of Turkish honeys regarding of physicochemical properties, and their adulteration analysis', *Food Science and Technology*, 37(1), pp. 80-89.
- Kokot, Z. J., Matysiak, J., Kłs, J., Kędzia, B., and Hołderna-Kędzia, E. (2009) 'Application of Principal Component Analysis for evaluation of chemical and antimicrobial properties of honey bee (*Apis mellifera*) venom', *Journal of apicultural research*, 48(3), pp. 168-175.
- Komosinska-Vassev K, Olczyk P, Kaźmierczak J, Mencner L, Olczyk K. (2015) 'Bee pollen: chemical composition and therapeutic application', *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, 2015.
- Krishnasree, V. and Ukkuru, M.P. (2017) 'In vitro antidiabetic activity and glycemic index of bee honeys', *Indian Journal of Traditional Knowledge*, 16(1), pp. 134-140.
- Kugonza, D.R. and Nabakabya, D. (2008) 'Honey quality as affected by handling, processing and marketing channels in Uganda', *Tropicultura*, 26(2), pp. 113-118.
- Kustiawan, P.M., Puthong, S., Arung, E.T. and Chanchao, C. (2014) 'In vitro cytotoxicity of Indonesian stingless bee products against human cancer cell lines', *Asian Pacific journal of tropical biomedicine*, 4(7), pp. 549-556.

- Lage, L.G., Coelho, L.L., Resende, H.C., Tavares, M.G., Campos, L.A. and Fernandes-Salomão, T.M. (2012) 'Honey physicochemical properties of three species of the Brazilian *Melipona*', *Anais da Academia Brasileira de Ciências*, 84(3), pp. 605-608.
- LeBlanc, B.W., Eggleston, G., Sammataro, D., Cornett, C., Dufault, R., Deeby, T. and St. Cyr, E. (2009). 'Formation of hydroxymethylfurfural in domestic high-fructose corn syrup and its toxicity to the honey bee (*Apis mellifera*)', *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 57(16), pp. 7369-7376.
- Lee, D.S., Sinno, S. and Khachemoune, A. (2011) 'Honey and wound healing', *American journal of clinical dermatology*, 12(3), pp. 181-190.
- Lim, D.C.C., Bakar, M.A. and Majid, M. (2019) 'Nutritional composition of stingless bee honey from different botanical origins', in *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 269(1), p. 012025.
- Liu, H., Shah, S. and Jiang, W. (2004) 'On-line outlier detection and data cleaning', *Computers & chemical engineering*, 28(9), pp. 1635-1647.
- Majid, M., Bakar, M. F. A., & Mian, Z. (2019) 'Determination of xanthine oxidase inhibition in stingless bee honey from different botanical origin', in *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 269(1), p. 012029.
- Makawi, S.Z.A., Taha, M.I., Zakaria, B.A., Siddig, B., Mahmud, H., Elhussein, A.R.M. and Kariem, E.A.G. (2009) 'Identification and quantification of 5-hydroxymethyl furfural HMF in some sugar-containing food products by HPLC', *Pakistan journal of nutrition*, 8(9), pp. 1391-1396.
- Marcucci, M.C., Toledo, D.B., Christine, A., Sawaya, H.F., López, B.G.C., Gonçalves, I.D., de Camargo, T.C. and Gonçalves, C.P. (2019) 'Quality control parameters, antioxidant activity and chemometrics of Brazilian honey', *Electronic Journal of Biology*, 15(1), pp. 010-19.
- MARDI. (2016) *Sweet profit in stingless bee farm*, [online] Malaysian Agricultural Research and Development Institute. Available at: <https://blogmardi.wordpress.com/2016/09/03/sweet-profit-in-stingless-bee-farms/#more-1893> [Accessed 21 May 2018].
- Melo, F. C. D., Souza, R. F. D., Coutinho, P. L., & Souza, M. O. D. (2014) 'Synthesis of 5-hydroxymethylfurfural from dehydration of fructose and glucose using ionic liquids', *Journal of the Brazilian Chemical Society*, 25(12), pp. 2378-2384.

- Mendonça, S., Torres, E. A. F. S., Bastos, D. H. M., and Dos Santos, M. C. M. (2007) 'Antioxidant capacity and phenolic content of stingless bee honey from amazon in comparison to apis bee honey', in *II International Symposium on Human Health Effects of Fruits and Vegetables: FAVHEALTH 200*, pp. 483-486.
- Mercês, M.D., Peralta, E.D., Uetanabaro, A.P.T. and Lucchese, A.M. (2013) 'Antimicrobial activity of honey from five species of Brazilian stingless bees', *Ciência Rural*, 43(4), pp. 672-675.
- Monggudal, M.B., Radzi, M.N.F.M., Ismail, M.M. and Ismail, W.I.W. (2018) 'Effect of Six Month Storage on Physicochemical Analysis and Antioxidant Activity of Several Types of Honey', in *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering*, p. 012047.
- Montgomery, D.C. (2009) *Design and analysis of experiments*. John wiley & sons: New Jersey.
- Moniruzzaman, M., Amrah Sulaiman, S. and Gan, S.H. (2017) 'Phenolic acid and flavonoid composition of malaysian honeys', *Journal of Food Biochemistry*, 41(2), p. e12282.
- Moo-Huchin, V.M., González-Aguilar, G.A., Lira-Maas, J.D., Pérez-Pacheco, E., Estrada-León, R., Moo-Huchin, M.I. and Sauri-Duch, E. (2015) 'Physicochemical Properties of Melipona beecheii Honey of the Yucatan Peninsula', *Journal of Food Research*, 4(5), p. 25.
- Motri, S., Touil, A., Benselma, Z., Hassini, L., Bettaieb, E. and Zagrouba, F. (2015) 'Application of factorial design to the study of the effect of drying conditions on α -tocopherol content in prickly pear seed oil', *Journal of New Sciences*, 19(8), pp. 759-765.
- Myint, K. H., & Htun, P. W. (2019) Exporting Physiochemical Changes during the Fermentation of Aloe Vera, *International Journal of Biotechnology and Bioengineering*, 13(11), pp. 276-279.
- Nashratul Shera, M. G., Yus Aniza, Y., Hasanah, M. G., Nyuk Ling, C., Siti Hajar, O., Lee Sin, C., and Yanty Noorzianna, A. M. (2019) 'Effects of Conventional Storage Method on Geniotrigona thoracica Stingless Bee Honey Properties', *Konvensyen Kebangsaan Kejuruteraan Pertanian Dan Makanan*, pp.115-117.

- Nasir, N.M., Mohd, K.S., Ibrahim, N., Rodi, M.M.M. and Zakaria, A.J. (2019) 'Physicochemical Analysis and Antioxidant Activity of Honey from Three Malaysian Stingless Bees Species', *Journal Of Agrobiotechnology*, 10(2), pp. 1-11.
- Norowi, M.H., Mohd, F., Sajap, A.S., Rosliza, J. and Suri, R. (2010) 'Conservation and sustainable utilization of stingless bees for pollination services in agricultural ecosystems in Malaysia', in *International Seminar on Enhancement of Functional Biodiversity Relevent to Sustainable Food Production in ASPAC Tsukuba*.
- Nurdianah, H.F., Firdaus, A.A., Azam, O.E. and Adnan, W.W. (2016) 'Antioxidant activity of bee pollen ethanolic extracts from Malaysian stingless bee measured using DPPH-HPLC assay', *International Food Research Journal*, 23(1), p. 403.
- Nweze, J.A., Okafor, J.I., Nweze, E.I. and Nweze, J.E. (2016) 'Comparison of Antimicrobial Potential of Honey Samples from *Apis mellifera* and Two Stingless Bees from Nsukka, Nigeria', *Journal of Pharmacognosy and Natural Products*, 2(124), pp. 2472-0992.
- Nweze, J.A., Okafor, J.I., Nweze, E.I. and Nweze, J.E. (2017) 'Evaluation of physicochemical and antioxidant properties of two stingless bee honeys: a comparison with *Apis mellifera* honey from Nsukka, Nigeria', *Biomed Central research notes*, 10(1), p. 566.
- Oddo, L.P., Heard, T.A., Rodríguez-Malaver, A., Pérez, R.A., Fernández-Muiño, M., Sancho, M.T., Sesta, G., Lusco, L. and Vit, P. (2008) 'Composition and antioxidant activity of *Trigona carbonaria* honey from Australia', *Journal of medicinal food*, 11(4), pp. 789-794.
- Oliveira, R.G.D., Jain, S., Luna, A.C., Freitas, L.D.S. and Araújo, E.D.D. (2017) 'Screening for quality indicators and phenolic compounds of biotechnological interest in honey samples from six species of stingless bees (Hymenoptera: Apidae)', *Food Science and Technology*, 37(4), pp. 552-557.
- Omar, W.A.W., Azhar, N.A., Fadzilah, N.H. and Kamal, N.N.S.N.M. (2016) 'Bee pollen extract of Malaysian stingless bee enhances the effect of cisplatin on breast cancer cell lines', *Asian Pacific Journal of Tropical Biomedicine*, 6(3), pp. 265-269.

- Parker, K., Salas, M. and Nwosu, V.C. (2010) 'High fructose corn syrup: production, uses and public health concerns', *Biotechnology and Molecular Biology Reviews*, 5(5), pp. 71-78.
- Pereira, D.M., Valentão, P., Pereira, J.A. and Andrade, P.B. (2009). 'Phenolics: From chemistry to biology', *Molecules*, 14, pp. 2202-2211.
- Prica, N., Živkov-Baloš, M., Jakšić, S., Mihaljev, Ž., Kartalović, B., Babić, J. and Savić, S. (2014) 'Moisture and acidity as indicators of the quality of honey originating from Vojvodina region', *Archive of Veterinary Medicine*, 7(2), pp. 99-109.
- Ranneh, Y., Ali, F., Zarei, M., Akim, A.M., Hamid, H.A. and Khazaai, H. (2018) 'Malaysian stingless bee and Tualang honeys: A comparative characterization of total antioxidant capacity and phenolic profile using liquid chromatography-mass spectrometry', *Lebensmittel-Wissenschaft & Technologie*, 89, pp. 1-9.
- Rebiai, A. and Lanez, T. (2014) 'Comparative study of honey collected from different flora of Algeria', *Journal of Fundamental and Applied Sciences*, 6(1), pp. 48-55.
- Ringnér, M. (2008) 'What is principal component analysis?', *Nature biotechnology*, 26(3), p. 303.
- Salim, H.M., Dzulkiply, A.D., Harrison, R.D., Fletcher, C., Kassim, A.R. and Potts, M.D. (2012) 'Stingless bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae: Meliponini) diversity in dipterocarp forest reserves in Peninsular Malaysia', *Raffles Bulletin of Zoology*, 60(1).
- Saxena, S., Gautam, S., & Sharma, A. (2010) 'Physical, biochemical and antioxidant properties of some Indian honeys', *Food Chemistry*, 118(2), pp. 391-397.
- Sedgwick, P. (2012). 'Pearson's correlation coefficient', *British Medical Journal*, 345, p. e4483.
- Shah, M. and Garg, S.K. (2014) 'Application of full factorial design in optimization of solvent-free microwave extraction of ginger essential oil', *Journal of Engineering*, 2014.
- Shahnawaz, M., Sheikh, S.A, Hussain, M., Razaq, A, and Khan, S.S (2013) 'A study of the determination of the physiochemical properties of honey from different valleys of Gilgit – Baltistan', *International Journal of Agriculture Science Research*, 2(2), pp. 049-05-3.

- Shamsudin, S., Selamat, J., Sanny, M., Abd. Razak, S.B., Jambari, N.N., Mian, Z. and Khatib, A. (2019) 'Influence of origins and bee species on physicochemical, antioxidant properties and botanical discrimination of stingless bee hone', *International Journal of Food Properties*, 22(1), pp. 239-264.
- Shapla, U.M., Solayman, M., Alam, N., Khalil, M.I. and Gan, S.H. (2018) '5-Hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) levels in honey and other food products: Effects on bees and human health', *Chemistry Central Journal*, 12(1), p. 35.
- Silva, T.M.S., dos Santos, F.P., Evangelista-Rodrigues, A., da Silva, E.M.S., da Silva, G.S., de Novais, J.S., dos Santos, F.D.A.R. and Camara, C.A. (2013) 'Phenolic compounds, melissopalynological, physicochemical analysis and antioxidant activity of jandaíra (*Melipona subnitida*) honey', *Journal of Food Composition and analysis*, 29(1), pp. 10-18.
- Silvano, M.F., Varela, M.S., Palacio, M.A., Ruffinengo, S. and Yamul, D.K. (2014) 'Physicochemical parameters and sensory properties of honeys from Buenos Aires region', *Food chemistry*, 152, pp. 500-507.
- Solayman, M., Islam, M.A., Paul, S., Ali, Y., Khalil, M.I., Alam, N. and Gan, S.H. (2016) 'Physicochemical properties, minerals, trace elements, and heavy metals in honey of different origins: a comprehensive review', *Comprehensive Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety*, 15(1), pp. 219-233.
- Sousa, J.M., de Souza, E.L., Marques, G., Meireles, B., de Magalhães Cordeiro, Â.T., Gullón, B., Pintado, M.M. and Magnani, M. (2016) 'Polyphenolic profile and antioxidant and antibacterial activities of monofloral honeys produced by Meliponini in the Brazilian semiarid region', *Food Research International*, 84, pp. 61-68.
- Souza, B.A., Roubik, D.W., Barth, O.M., Heard, T.A., Enríquez, E., Carvalho, C., Villas-Bôas, J., Marchini, L., Locatelli, J., Persano-Oddo, L. and Almeida-Muradian, L. (2006) 'Composition of stingless bee honey: setting quality standards', *Interciencia*, 31(12), pp. 867-875.
- Standards Malaysia. (2017) Malaysia Standard MS ISO 9001: 2015 Kelulut (Stingless bee) honey – Specification. Malaysia: Department of Malaysian Standards.
- Suntiparapop, K., Prapaipong, P. and Chantawannakul, P. (2012) 'Chemical and biological properties of honey from Thai stingless bee (*Tetragonula leaviceps*)', *Journal of Apicultural Research*, 51(1), pp. 45-52.

- Syam, Y., Usman, A.N., Natzir, R. and Pratiwi, S. (2016) 'Nutrition and pH of Trigona Honey from Masamba, South Sulawesi, Indonesia', *International Journal of Sciences: Basic and Applied Research*, 27(1), pp. 32-36.
- Szweda, P., 2017. *Antimicrobial activity of honey. Honey analysis*, pp. 215-232 [online]. Available at: <https://www.intechopen.com/books/honey-analysis/antimicrobial-activity-of-honey> [Accessed: 7 July 2019].
- Terrab, A., Recamales, A. F., Hernanz, D., and Heredia, F. J. (2004) 'Characterisation of Spanish thyme honeys by their physicochemical characteristics and mineral contents', *Food Chemistry*, 88(4), pp. 537-542.
- The National Honey Board (2003) *Honey-Health and therapeutic qualities*. [online] Available at: www.nhb.org [Accessed: 20 January 2018].
- Truchado, P., Vit, P., Heard, T.A., Tomás-Barberán, F.A. and Ferreres, F. (2015) 'Determination of interglycosidic linkages in O-glycosyl flavones by high-performance liquid chromatography/photodiode-array detection coupled to electrospray ionization ion trap mass spectrometry. Its application to Tetragonula carbonaria honey from Australia', *Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry*, 29(10), pp. 948-954.
- Truzzi, C., Illuminati, S., Annibaldi, A., Finale, C., Rossetti, M. and Scarponi, G. (2014) 'Physicochemical properties of honey from Marche, Central Italy: classification of unifloral and multifloral honeys by multivariate analysis', *Natural Product Communications*, 9(11), p. 1934578X1400901117.
- Tuksitha, L., Chen, Y.L.S., Chen, Y.L., Wong, K.Y. and Peng, C.C. (2018) 'Antioxidant and antibacterial capacity of stingless bee honey from Borneo (Sarawak)', *Journal of Asia-Pacific Entomology*, 21(2), pp. 563-570.
- Vit, P., Medina, M. and Eunice Enríquez, M. (2004) 'Quality standards for medicinal uses of Meliponinae honey in Guatemala, Mexico and Venezuela', *Bee world*, 85(1), pp. 2-5.
- Vit, P., Rodriguez-Malaver, A., Almeida, D., Souza, B.A., Marchini, L.C., Diaz, C.F., Tricio, A.E., Villas-Boas, J.K. and Heard, T.A. (2006) 'A scientific event to promote knowledge regarding honey from stingless bees: 1. Physical-chemical composition', *Magistra*, 18(4), pp. 270-276.
- Vit, P., Pedro, S.R. and Roubik, D. (2013) *Pot-honey: a legacy of stingless bees*. Springer Science & Business Media: New York.

- Vit, P., Pedro, S.R.M., Vargas, J.C., Andino, M. and Maza, F. (2016) 'Chemical composition of Ecuadorian (Hymenoptera: Apidae: Meliponini) commercial pot-honeys: *Trigona fuscipennis*" abeja de tierra", *Melipona mimetica*" bermejo", and *Scaptotrigona ederi*" catiana', *Mellifera*, 16(2), pp. 13-24.
- Vyas, S. and Kumaranayake, L. (2006) 'Constructing socio-economic status indices: how to use principal components analysis', *Health policy and planning*, 21(6), pp. 459-468.
- Wahid, Z. and Nadir, N. (2013) 'Improvement of one factor at a time through design of experiments', *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 21, pp. 56-61.
- West, S.G., Aiken, L.S. and Krull, J.L. (1996) 'Experimental personality designs: Analyzing categorical by continuous variable interactions', *Journal of personality*, 64(1), pp. 1-48.
- Won, S.R., Lee, D.C., Ko, S.H., Kim, J.W. and Rhee, H.I. (2008) 'Honey major protein characterization and its application to adulteration detection', *Food Research International*, 41(10), pp. 952-956.
- Wong, P., Ling, H.S., Chung, K.C., Yau, T.M.S. and Gindi, S.R.A. (2019) 'Chemical Analysis on the Honey of *Heterotrigona itama* and *Tetrigona binghami* from Sarawak, Malaysia', *Sains Malaysiana*, 48(8), pp. 1635-1642.
- Yaacob, M., Rajab, N.F., Shahar, S., Sharif, R. and Sharif, M. (2018) 'Stingless bee honey and its potential value: a systematic review', *Food Research*, 2(2), pp. 124-133.
- Yadata, D. (2014) 'Detection of the electrical conductivity and acidity of honey from different areas of Tepi,' *Food Science and Technology*, 2(5), pp. 59-63.
- Yazan, L.S., Zainal, N.A., Ali, R.M., Zali, M., Shyfiq, M.F., Sze, O.Y., Sim, T.Y., Gopalsamy, B., Ling, V.F., Sapuan, S. and Esa, N. (2018) 'Antiulcer Properties of Kelulut Honey against Ethanol-Induced Gastric Ulcer', *Pertanika Journal of Science & Technology*, 26(1).
- Yunus, M.A.C., Lee, C.Y. and Idham, Z. (2011) 'Effects of variables on the production of red-fleshed pitaya powder using response surface methodology', *Jurnal Teknologi*, 56(1), pp. 15-29.

LIST OF PUBLICATION

Indexed Journal

1. Ya'akob, H., Norhisham, N.F., Mohamed, M., Sadek, N. & Endrini, S. (2019) Evaluation of Physicochemical Properties of Trigona sp. Stingless Bee Honey from Various Districts of Johor. *Jurnal Kejuruteraan*, 2(1), 59-67. [https://doi.org/10.17576/jkukm-2019-si2\(1\)-08](https://doi.org/10.17576/jkukm-2019-si2(1)-08). **(Indexed by WOS-ESCI)**