EFFECTIVENESS OF SEDIMENT BASIN AND SILT TRAPS AT OIL PALM PLANTATIONS

NUR SYAHIZA BINTI ZAINUDDIN

A project report submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Master of Engineering (Civil-Environmental Management)

> Faculty of Civil Engineering Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

> > JUNE 2007

То

Beloved parents; Mr. Zainuddin Said & Mrs. Jamilah Yusoff

k

Beloved sisters & brothers; Halawati, Aini, Nazmi & Syafiq

For all of their patience and understanding In the past, present, and future

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

"In the name of God, the most Gracious, the most Compassionate"

First & foremost, it is pleasure to record my love and gratitude to my parents, Mr. Zainuddin Said and Mrs. Jamilah Yusoff, and my family for their love, patience, support, encouragement and sustaining my spirits.

I wish to extent my sincerest thanks to PM Dr Mohd Ismid bin Mohd Said, from whom I received the greatest supervisor throughout my work. His criticisms and suggestions have been extremely valuable in the development of this study. Without his patience and unfailing support and guidance, this report would not have been same as presented here.

I also would like to express my special thanks to Mr. Zaidi Zin from IZ Environmind Sdn. Bhd. and his staff, for supplying invaluable data and maps which are crucial for this study. Thanks again to them for the kindness and helping hand whenever I encountered difficulties while accomplishing the project.

Finally, I would like to extend my appreciation and thanks to all my beloved friends and for those who had given me assistance directly or indirectly for their understanding during ups and downs as I pursued my Master degree.

May all the good deeds that were done will be blessed by Allah. Wassalam...

ABSTRACT

In recent year, there has been an increasing comment over deterioration of water quality in many river systems in Malaysia. Therefore, this study analyse the effectiveness of implementing various types of sediment basin and silt trap in oil palm plantation located at Gua Musang. The district of Gua Musang is a major producer of oil palm plantation in Kelantan with the total area of 55 191 hectares. The aim of this study is to identify whether the water from this oil palm plantation be a part of contributor of the problem happened in Sg. Kelantan which is nowadays become shallow and polluted because of sedimentation problem. In this study there were three sediment basins has been analysed. A field measurement on suspended solid, turbidity and sediment loading was carried out before and after sediment basin. The range of Suspended Solid is between 5 mg/L to 50 mg/L before the sediment basins and 1 mg/L to 14 mg/L after sediment basins. Turbidity gives a result between 4.7 NTU to 79.0 NTU before the sediment basins and 5.8 NTU to 42.0 NTU after the sediment basins. From these data, total sediment loading per hectares was calculated and compared to the amount calculate by using USLE and MSLE formula. Beside that, the examination upon efficiency of sediment elimination was done and each sediment basin gave a result of 80%, 37.5% and 72%. However from questionnaire analysis on environmental awareness, the result shows that most developers and their workers awareness are still in moderate and low level.

ABSTRAK

Dewasa ini isu berkenaan kemerosotan kualiti air sungai-sungai yang terdapat di Malaysia semakin meningkat. Oleh yang demikian, kajian ini bertujuan untuk mengenalpasti keberkesanan kepelbagaian perangkap keladak yang dilaksanakan di ladang kelapa sawit di Gua Musang sebagai salah satu usaha pengawalan kemerosotan kualiti air. Daerah Gua Musang merupakan kawasan perladangan kelapa sawit utama di negeri Kelantan dengan keluasan 55 191 hektar. Matlamat kajian ini adalah untuk mengenalpasti samada aliran yang mengalir dari ladang kelapa sawit ini turut menyumbang kepada masalah yang berlaku di Sungai Kelantan di mana pada hari ini didapati semakin cetek & dan tercemar akibat daripada masalah pemendapan. Tiga perangkap keladak dianalisis. Pengukuran terhadap beberapa parameter kualiti air seperti pepejal terampai, kekeruhan dan beban sediment dibuat sebelum dan selepas perangkap keladak. Pepejal terampai memberi keputusan antara 5 mg/L hingga 50 mg/L sebelum perangkap keladak manakala 1 mg/L hingga 14 mg/L untuk selepas perangkap keladak. Kekeruhan memberi nilai antara 4.7 NTU hingga 7.90 NTU dan 5.8 NTU hingga 42 NTU masing-masing untuk sebelum dan selepas perangkap keladak. Daripada data tersebut, beban sedimen dikira dan perbandingan dibuat dengan menggunakan kaedah USLE dan MSLE. Selain itu, pemeriksaan terhadap keberkesanan penyingkiran keladak juga dianalisis dan ketigatiga perangkap yang dikaji masing-masing memberi peratus 80%, 37.5% dan 72%. Walaubagaimanapun, daripada keputusan analisa soal selidik, didapati tahap kesedaran terhadap kepentingan alam sekitar dikalangan pengusaha dan pekerjanya masih di peringkat sederhana dan perlu dipertingkatkan.

TABLE OF CONTENT

CHAPTER

PAGE

TITLE	i
DECLARATION	ii
DEDICATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	iv
ABSTRACT	V
ABSTRAK	vi
TABLE OF CONTENT	vii
LIST OF TABLE	xi
LIST OF FIGURE	xiii
LIST OF PHOTO	XV
LIST OF SYMBOL	xvi
LIST OF ABBREVIATION	xvii
LIST OF APPENDICES	xviii

I INTRODUCTION

1.1	Preamble	1
1.2	Problem Statement	2
1.3	Aim of Study	6
1.4	Objective	6
1.5	Scope of Study	6

II LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1	Introd	uction	8
2.2	Applie	cation of Sediment Basin	8
	2.2.1	Sediment Basin Efficiency	10
2.3	Applie	cation of Silt trap	11
2.4	Suspe	nded Solids	11
	2.4.1	Factors affecting Settlement of TSS	12
2.5	Funda	mental of Sedimentation	13
	2.5.1	Newton's and Stokes' Sedimentation	14
		Laws	
	2.5.2	Hazen's Surface Load Theory	14
2.6	Sedim	ent Loading	15
2.7	Pollut	ant Load Modeling System	15
	2.7.1	Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE)	16
	2.7.2	Modified Soil Loss Equation (MSLE)	16
	2.7.3	Event Mean Concentration (EMC)	17
	2.7.4	Pollutant Export Rate Method	18
2.8	Soil E	rosion	18
	2.8.1	Theory of Erosion by Water	19
	2.8.2	Primary Factors Influencing Soil Erosion	19
		By Water	
	2.8.3	Soil and Water Erosion Pollution Control	21
2.9	Oil Pa	Im Plantation	21
	2.9.1	Typical Project Activities	22
		2.9.1.1 Pre-Development	22
		2.9.1.2 Nursery Development	23
		2.9.1.3 Site Preparation	23
		2.9.1.4 Field Establishment	24
		2.9.1.5 Maintenance & Harvesting	24
2.10	Enviro	onmental Preservation	25
2.11	Effect	of Rainfall Distribution and Climates	25
	Chang	ge on Oil Palm Plantation	
2.12	Summ	ary	27

III METHODOLOGY

3.1	Data F	Requirement	28
3.2	Prima	ry Data	28
3.3	Secon	dary Data	29
	3.3.1	Water Quality Parameter	29
	3.3.2	Rainfall Distribution Data	31
3.4	Metho	od of Analysis	31
	3.4.1	Trend analysis	31
	3.4.2	Comparison with Standard Requirement	31
	3.4.3	Questionnaire Study	32
		3.4.3.1 Survey Question	32
		3.4.3.2 Data Interpretation	33

IV STUDY AREA

4.1	Introduction	34
4.2	Project Site Background	37
4.3	Existing Physical Environment	39
	4.3.1 Surrounding Land Use	39
	4.3.2 Topography	39
4.4	Meteorology Characteristic	41
	4.4.1 Average Rainfall	41
4.5	Existing Drainage Pattern	43
4.6	Existing Sediment Basin & Silt Trap	43

V RESULT AND DISCUSSION

5.1	Introd	uction	49
5.2	Sedim	ent Basin and Silt Trap Analysis	50
	5.2.1	Total Suspended Solids (TSS)	50
	5.2.2	Turbidity	51
	5.2.3	Other Water Quality Parameters	51
	5.2.4	Sediment Elimination Efficiency	53
	5.2.5	Sediment Basin Design Efficiency	54

		5.2.5.1 Sizing of Sediment Basin	54
		5.2.5.2 Settling Zone	56
5.3	Erosio	on Risk Analysis	57
	5.3.1	Total Sediment Loading Estimation	58
		5.3.1.1 Flowrate	58
		5.3.1.2 Sediment Loading Estimation	58
	5.3.2	Assessment of Factors Influencing Soil	60
		Erosion And Sedimentation	
		5.3.2.1 Rainfall Factor (R)	60
		5.3.2.2 Soil Erodibility (K)	60
		5.3.2.3 Length-Slope Factor (LS)	61
		5.3.2.4 Cover Management Factor (C)	61
		5.3.2.5 Conservation Practice Factor (P)	62
		5.3.2.6 Management Factor (VM)	62
	5.3.3	Assessment of Soil Erosion Rates using	62
		USLE Methods	
	5.3.4	Assessment of Soil Erosion Rates using	63
		MSLE Methods	
5.4	Water	Quality Analysis	65
	5.4.1	River Classification based on WQI	65
	5.4.2	Trend Analysis for Suspended Solids	68
		Parameter	
5.5	Correl	ation Between Planting Stage and Rainfall	70
	Distril	oution Analysis	
5.6	Questi	ionnaire Analysis	72
5.7	Discus	ssion	76

VI CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1	Conclusion	79
6.2	Recommendations	80

REFERRENCES	82
APPENDICES	88

LIST OF TABLE

TITLE

NO

PAGE

1.1	Flood impact in Kelantan	3
1.2	Statistics of oil palm land area at Malaysia	4
2.1	Factors contribute to erosion phenomenon	19
3.1	Date on purpose sampling process for plantation 1	30
3.2	Date on purpose sampling process for plantation 2	30
3.3	Topic in the questionnaire	32
3.4	Questionnaire scale	33
4.1	Cultivated area by district in Kelantan	36
4.2	Characteristic for each project site	41
4.3	Characteristic for each sediment basin located in both study	44
	areas	
5.1	Suspended solids result	50
5.2	Turbidity result	51
5.3	Water quality result for each of sediment basins found in the	52
	study area	
5.4	Dry sediment basin sizing guidelines	55
5.5	Sediment basin size required based on MASMA guideline	56
5.6	Characteristic for each sediment basin	56
5.7	Sediment loading estimation per hectare per year	59
5.8	Exponent m based on slope percent	61
5.9	Erosion analysis using USLE method	63
5.10	Erosion analysis using MSLE method	63

5.11	Classification for soil erosion risk	64
5.12	Water quality index (WQI) results for Sg. Wah and Sg.	65
	Sungkai	
5.13	Water Quality Index (WQI) (DOE, 1986)	66
5.14	Water quality monitoring results for Sg. Wah and Sg.	67
	Sungkai	

LIST OF FIGURE

NO

TITLE	I	PAGE

1.1	Satellite view of Kelantan River	3
2.1	Percent reduction in TSS vs. the TSS concentrations in the	13
	inflow	
2.2	Example of flow disturbances in a basin	14
2.3	Flow diagram of typical oil palm plantation development	26
	activities	
4.1	Location of Gua Musang	35
4.2	Total percentage for each types of plantation area at Gua	36
	Musang	
4.3	The location plan for both project sites	38
4.4	Topography map of plantation 1 project site	40
4.5	Topography map of plantation 2 project site	40
4.6	Trend of rainfall distribution at Cameron Highlands rainfall	42
	station	
4.7	Sediment basin cross section	44
4.8	Location of SB1 and SB2 in plantation two site area	47
4.9	Location of SB3 in plantation 2 site area	48
5.1	Suspended solids trend at Sg. Wah	68
5.2	Suspended solids trend at Sg. Sungkai in plantation 1	69
5.3	Suspended solids trend at Sg. Sungkai in plantation 2	70
5.4	Correlation between planting stage and rainfall amount	71
5.5	Result from questionnaire analysis for part A	73

5.6	Result from questionnaire analysis for part B	73
5.7	Result from questionnaire analysis for part C	74
5.8	Result from questionnaire analysis for part D	74
5.9	Result from questionnaire analysis for part E	75
5.10	Result from questionnaire analysis for part F	75

LIST OF PHOTO

TITLE

NO

2.1	Sediment basin can be temporary or permanent	10
2.2	Sediment basin are used to trap sediments on larger	10
	construction sites	
4.1	Well establish sediment basin found in plantation 1 labeled	45
	as SB1	
4.2	Condition of SB2 sediment basin which is still in	46
	construction phase	
4.3	Single sediment basin (SB3) found located in plantation 2	46
	site area	

PAGE

LIST OF SYMBOL

А	- Catchment area
а	- An empirical coefficient
С	- Erosion control practice factor
Ĉ	- EMC of pollutant
E	- Mean annual soil loss
e	- An empirical exponent
ha	- hectare
Κ	- Factor of the soil erodibility
km	- Kilometer
L	- Annual load of Pollutant
m	- Meter
mg	- Milligram
Р	- Factor expressing the effects of conservation
R	- Rainfall erosivity factor
S	- Slope steepness factor
S	- second
V	- Settling zone
VM	- Vegetation management factor
V_R	- Annual runoff depth
W	- Average width
Y	- Zone depth

LIST OF ABBREVIATION

AN	-	Ammoniacal Nitrogen		
BOD	-	Biochemical Oxygen Demand		
COD	-	Chemical Oxygen Demand		
DO	-	Dissolved Oxygen		
DOE	-	Department of Environment		
EIA	-	Environmental Impact Assessment		
EME	-	Environmental Monitoring Exercise		
EMP	-	Environmental Monitoring Plan		
INWQSM -		Interim national Water Quality Standard for		
		Malaysia		
IZE		I. Z. Environmind		
JUPEM	-	Jabatan Ukur dan Pemetaan		
KHSB	-	Kapasiti Harapan Sdn. Bhd.		
MPOB	-	Malaysian Palm Oil Board		
MSLE	-	Modified Soil Loss Equation		
POMs		Palm Oil Mills		
PVSB	-	Peransang Venture Sdn. Bhd.		
SS	-	Suspended Solid		
TSS	-	Total suspended solids		
USLE	-	Universal Soil Loss Equation		
WQI	-	Water Quality Index		

LIST OF APPENDICES

TITLE

NO

1.1	Articles in The Star Newspaper (28/03/07) Report on	88
	Kelantan's Lojing Highlands in Danger of Being Logged	
	Bare	
1.2	Article in The Star Newspaper (28/03/07) Report on Forest	89
	Reserve Under Treat Issue	
3.1	Records of Monthly Rainfall Amount	90
3.2	Records of Number Of Raindays	91
3.3	DOE Water Quality Index Classes	92
3.4	Interim National Water Quality Standards For Malaysia	93
3.5	Questionnaire Form	95
5.1	Sediment Basin Types	97

PAGE

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Preamble

When land is disturbed either for construction, agriculture, road building, mining, logging, or other activities, the soil erosion rate increase from 2 to 40 000 times (Goldman et. al., 1986). The effect of this phenomenon is millions of tons of the soil end up in our rivers, lakes, and reservoirs. Each year, billions of dollars have to spend by land developers or property owner in order to cleaning up sediment and repairing eroded stream banks, gullied hillsides, washed-out roads, mud chocked drains and other erosion damage.

Most erosion will cause sediment problem and this can be greatly reduced by proper planning and maintenance. Some of the methods are by using sediment basin and silt trap. We should bear in mind that these structures does not stop erosion. They only trap eroded soil before it can reach water body or adjacent property.

Generally, a sediment basin is designed to remove and retains portions of the sediment being carried by runoff. In essence, they work by slowing the velocity of runoff and letting suspended soil particles settle by gravity. During periods of heavy rainfall sediment basin or silt trap constructed in oil palm plantation site must be fully function to soakaways retain water and soil run-off. Therefore, leaf matter left on slope from trimming the palm trees to harvest the fruit should be used to reinforce terraces or to otherwise create erosion barriers on contours. The other way is by construct silt pits along roads and in fields to trap eroded soil carried in runoff.

From management aspect, before any land is to be developed for oil palm cultivation, an Environment Impact Assessment (EIA) must be undertaken to ensure that there are no adverse effects on the environment arising from the cultivation of the crop. A detailed Environmental Monitoring Plan (EMP) with institutional reporting requirements, and parameters for monitoring of water quality, agrochemical usage, impact on aquatic life, changes in forest and wildlife and other impacts as based on public consultations must be included in the EIA study.

Environmental monitoring, auditing and surveillance must be conducted to ensure that all the works done are comply with the regulations and conditions lay down by the Department of Environment (DOE) prior to the commencement of a project.

1.2 Problem Statement

Kelantan River or namely as Sungai Kelantan in Malay language is the major river in Kelantan, Malaysia. It drains a catchment area of about 12 000 km² in northeast Malaysia and flows northwards into the South China Sea. The rainfall over the area varies between 0 mm in the dry season (March-May) to 1750 mm in the monsoon season (November-January). The average runoff from the area is about 500 m³/s. Figure 1.1 shows the satellite view of Kelantan River.

The Kelantan River regularly overspills its banks either during the months of November to February because of the northeast monsoon season or others reason. Some of the worst floods in recent years are listed in table 1.1 (Hazalizah, 2005).



Figure 1.1: Satellite view of Kelantan River
(source: http://www.worldwindcentral.com)

Year	Evacuees	Deaths	Damage (US\$1000)		
2004	10 476	12	3 767		
2003	2 228	2	1 461		
2001	5 800	0	2 227		
1993	13 587	0	3 98		
1988	41 059	0	*		
1986	7 963	0	1 603		
1983	33 815	0	*		

 Table 1.1: Flood impact in Kelantan

* Data not available

This flood phenomenon occurs because of many reasons. Latest issues contribute to this problem was report in The Star newspaper on 28 March 2007 where the last frontier in Lojing Highlands, Kota Bharu state with lush forest reserve is now in danger of being log bare and will give big impact on the state's ecology. The articles of this report are shown in Appendix 1.1 and 1.2. The existing impact has been studied and the result found that nowadays Kelantan River is become shallow and cannot provide irrigation resources to paddy farmers nearby. If this problem is not protected, it will affect the state's future natural resources which may be compromised by excessive logging. The purpose of logging activities carried out at this area is for development of oil palm plantation.

Oil palm (*Elaeis guineensis*) was first introduced into Malaysia as an ornamental plant in 1870 (Williams et. al., 1970). The cultivation of oil palm has grown every year since 1960 when the Malaysian government embarked on a massive agricultural diversification programme. It has now become the cornerstone of the country's agricultural sector, with a planted area of 4 165 215 hectares in 2006 (MPOB, 2006). Table 1.2 shows the statistics of oil palm land area at Malaysia for a few latest years. From that total area, Kelantan was covered about 80 152 hectares and Gua Musang is the main oil palm manufacturer for this state. Based on Country & Land Office of Gua Musang, the total area of oil palm cultivation in 2001 situated in Gua Musang is 51 170.5 hectares.

Land Area (ha) under Oil Palm Cultivation (1975-2006)								
1980	1985	1990	1995	2000	2003	2004	2005	2006
1 023 306	1 482 399	2 029 464	2 540 087	3 376 644	3 802 040	3 880 000	4 051 374	4 165 215

Table 1.2: Statistics of oil palm land area at Malaysia

(Source: MPOB Malaysia, 2006)

Oil palm cultivation can cause erosion and sedimentation during its operation. This sediment will wash away into the lakes, rivers and waterways. Although this sediment is only a fraction of the total sediment load, it is a major source of pollution of many lakes, streams and river. Eroded soil contains nitrogen, phosphorus, and other nutrients (Goldman et. al., 1986). When carried into water bodies, these nutrients trigger algal bloom that reduce water clarity, deplete oxygen, lead to fish kills and create odors. Turbidity from sediment also reduces in-stream photosynthesis, which leads to reduce food supply and habitat.

To prevent eroded soil or sediment from polluted the nearest river or stream, one of the methods that can be implementing is by using sediment basin or silt trap. Nowadays, there is very little performance data on sediment or silt structures at one site. All too often these structures have been constructed with major flaws which prevent good performance. In other cases, these sediment basin and silt trap have been properly constructed but not monitored or maintained.

The fact is, those structures required maintenance and cleaning at regular intervals. If too much sediment is allowed to accumulate in them, they will cease to function. Little or no settling will occur, and trapped sediment will be resuspended and washed away. Finally, sediment basin can pose a safety hazard to human when water is impounded in them.

Awareness on above phenomenon was the main reason why this study was conducted. Two main areas were chosen around Gua Musang. First project site was initiated by Kapasiti Harapan Sdn. Bhd. (KHSB) which is located at PT 4957 & 4958, Mukim Ulu Nenggiri, Daerah Bertam, Gua Musang, Kelantan Darul Naim. This oil palm site is situated adjacent to the north, south and east of Hutan Rizab Sungai Betis and west of Hutan Rizab Sungai Papan. Total area for this project site is 3 000.00 acres (1, 214.06 hectares).

The second project site was initiated by Peransang Venture Sdn. Bhd. (PVSB). PVSB have been given responsibility to develop approximately 2,000.00 acres (809.39 hectares) land located at PT 5011, Mukim Ulu Nenggiri, Daerah Bertam, Gua Musang, Kelantan into an oil palm plantation project. This project site is located adjacent to the north, south, west and east of Hutan Rizab Sungai Betis. Both project sites are situated near the main river and small rivulets which found scattered within the project area. Therefore, it is important to study the effectiveness of sediment basin and silt trap constructed at both side in order to check the efficiency.

1.3 Aim of Study

The aim of this study primarily at deriving the level of effectiveness and awareness on sediment basin and silt trap implemented in oil palm plantation at Gua Musang.

1.4 Objective

The objective of this study was three-fold, namely:

- i. To determine the efficiency of sediment basin and silt trap implemented in oil palm plantation.
- ii. To analyze the trend of water quality at the project sites.
- iii. To identify the level of environmental awareness among developers or planters involve in oil palm plantation project.

1.5 Scope of Study

The scope of the study covers all types of sediment basin and silt trap located at two oil palm plantation given below:

 Oil palm plantation at PT 4957 & 4958, Mukim Ulu Nenggiri, Daerah Bertam, Gua Musang, Kelantan Darul Naim which initiated by Kapasiti Harapan Sdn. Bhd. (KHSB), and Oil palm plantation at PT 5011, Mukim Ulu Nenggiri, Daerah Bertam, Gua Musang, Kelantan Darul Naim which initiated by Peransang Venture Sdn. Bhd. (PVSB).

This study will concentrate on deriving the effectiveness of sediment basin and silt trap implemented in oil palm plantation in Gua Musang. The effectiveness will be determined based on considering a few factors. Suspended solid and turbidity are the main parameter studied for both sediment basin and silt trap. Assessment on water quality of water bodies on selected parameters namely pH, Dissolved Oxygen (DO), temperature, Biochemical Oxygen Demand (BOD), Chemical Oxygen Demand (COD), Suspended Solid (SS), Ammoniacal Nitrogen (AN), E-Coli and Oil & Grease are also conducted to analyze water quality at the site.

Beside that, erosion risk analysis was also done by comparing with Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE) method and Modified Soil Loss Equation (MSLE) method. This study also conducted interview session with project proponent and workers in order to analyze their level of environmental awareness on implementing oil palm plantation project.