PRODUCTION AND CHARACTERISATION OF COCOA BUTTER EQUIVALENT FROM FORMULATED HARD PALM OIL MIDFRACTION AND CANOLA OIL BLENDS

REIZA MUTIA

UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MALAYSIA

PRODUCTION AND CHARACTERISATION OF COCOA BUTTER
EQUIVALENT FROM FORMULATED HARD PALM OIL MIDFRACTION
AND CANOLA OIL BLENDS

REIZA MUTIA

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree of
Master of Engineering (Bioprocess)

Faculty of Chemical Engineering
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

JUNE 2015

For My Beloved Family,

My father Azwir M. Zen and mother Rita Hendryyaty
My brothers Mohd. Riansyah Putra and Rofi Rendra Ramadhan
Big family of my grandparents (alm. Hj.Syamsudin Maisa and alm. M. Zen)

For Project Group,

Thanks for the prayers and the wonderful laughters,
Salmiyati, Desrihastuti, Fitra Lestari, Cici Maarasyid,and Rino Ferdian

For My Bestfriends,

Thank for your support and always accompany me in my happiness and sadness,
Arti Manikam, Lili Wulandhari, Siska Kurnia Gusti, Iis Afrianty, Yudha Aditya,
Zulfatman, and Eramanda

For All My Friends

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

In the name of Allah the Most Gracious and the Most Merciful, I thank Thee with all my heart, Prostration of gratitude for granting Thy Servant immeasurable help during the study.

I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor Prof. Dr. Ida Idayu Muhamad and Dr. Dayang Norulfairuz Abang Zaidel for your support and encouragement in completing this study.

My sincere thanks go to Amanah Pelalawan Foundation for Master Degree Scholarship Program for funding my study and this research.

I would like to express my gratitude to Prof. Dr-Ing. Eko Supriyanto, Sime Darby Kempas and FOBERG (Food and Biomaterial Engineering) family for giving me their assistance, useful feedback and insightful comments on my research.

I express my gratitude to my parents and family members, all of my friends, and Persatuan Pelajar Indonesia (PPI) - UTM for their prayers and supports.

ABSTRACT

There has been increased interest in cocoa butter equivalent (CBE) due to high price, uncertainty in supply and variability in quality of authentic cocoa butter (CB). This study investigated the blending of hard palm oil midfraction (PMF) with canola oil to produce CBEs which contain omega-3 and omega-6 fatty acids using immobilized lipase from *Rhizomucor miehei.* The experiments were designed using Response Surface Methodology (RSM) to optimize the percentage of triacylgycerols (TAGs) including palmitic-oleic-palmitic (POP), palmitic-oleic-stearic (POS), stearic-oleic-stearic (SOS) and diacylglycerol (DAG). The experiment was performed at hard PMF concentration of 50 to 90%, lipozyme load between 5% and 10% with reaction time of 2 to 14 hours. The best reaction conditions to attain these targets were 58.85% of hard PMF concentration, 2 hours of reaction time and 7.29% of lipozyme load (based on the weight of substrate). Under these conditions, the produced CBE contained 28.65±2.00% of POP, 19.52±0.96% of POS, 3.57±0.11% of SOS and 4.81±0.47% of DAG. The addition of canola oil improved the nutritional value of CBEs which was marked by the higher percentage of linoleic acid (omega-6, 7.98±0.92%) and linolenic acid (omega-3, 2.47±0.47%) in CBE than commercially available CBE (omega-6, 2.63±1.01%) and CB (omega-6, 2.68±0.34%). Enzymatic interesterification has not altered fatty acid content in the CBE, especially linoleic acid (omega-6) and linolenic acid (omega-3) which was characterised by no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) between the fatty acid profile of initial mixture and CBE. Slip melting point (SMP) value of CBE (46.25 °C) was significantly higher ($p < 0.05$) than the SMP value of CB (32-35 °C). In addition, the solid fat content (SFC) value of CBE was different from CB. It was due to the high amount of POP, free fatty acid (FFA) or saturated-saturated-saturated (StStSt) type of TAGs in CBE produced and also lower amount of TAGs which has oleic acid at sn-2 position. Moreover, the produced CBE behaved as pseudoplastic flow. Although there were differences of characteristics between the produced CBE with the authentic CB, it was possible to produce a high nutritional value of CBE with a physicochemical composition that was very close to that of CB by using enzymatic interesterification.

ABSTRAK

Pencarian kepada kesetaraan mentega koko (CBE) telah berkembang, kerana masalah harga premium, ketidaktentuan dalam bekalan dan kepelbagaian dalam kualiti mentega koko (CB). Kajian ini menyiasat pengadunan peringkat tengah minyak sawit keras dengan minyak *canola* untuk menghasilkan CBE yang mengandungi asid lemak omega-3 dan omega-6 dengan menggunakan lipase imobilisasi dari *Rhizomucor miehei*. Eksperimen direka bentuk menggunakan Kaedah Tindakbalas Permukaan (RSM) untuk mengoptimumkan peratusan triasilgliserol (TAG) termasuk palmitik-oleik-palmitik (POP), palmitik-oleik-stearik (POS), stearik-oleik-stearik (SOS) dan diasilgliserol (DAG). Keadaan proses dijalankan pada kepekatan peringkat tengah minyak sawit keras sebanyak 50 hingga 90%, beban *lipozyme* antara 5% dan 10% dengan masa tindak balas 2 hingga 14 jam. Syarat-syarat terbaik untuk mencapai sasaran ini ialah 58.85% kepekatan peringkat tengah minyak sawit keras, 2 jam masa tindak balas, dan 7.29% beban *lipozyme* (berdasarkan berat substrat). CBE yang dihasilkan mengandungi 28.65±2.00% POP, 19.52±0.96% POS, 3.57±0.11% SOS dan 4.81±0.47% DAG. Penambahan minyak *canola* meningkatkan nilai pemakanan CBE yang ditandai dengan peratusan asid linoleik (omega-6, 7.98±0.92%) dan asid linolenik (omega-3, 2.47±0.47%) yang lebih tinggi dalam CBE daripada CBE komersial (omega-6, 2.63±1.01%) dan CB (omega-6, 2.68±0.34%). Interesterifikasi enzim tidak mengubah kandungan asid lemak dalam CBE, terutamanya asid linoleik (omega-6) dan asid linolenik (omega-3) di mana campuran awal mempunyai ciri-ciri profil asid lemak yang tidak berbeza (p > 0.05) daripada CBE. Nilai slip takat lebur (SMP) CBE (46.25 °C) adalah jauh lebih tinggi (p < 0.05) dari nilai slip takat lebur CB (32 − 35 °C). Di samping itu, nilai kandungan lemak pepejal (SFC) daripada CBE adalah berbeza dari CB. Ia adalah disebabkan oleh jumlah POP, asid lemak bebas (FFA) atau jenis tepu-tepu-tepu TAG (StStSt) yang tinggi dalam CBE yang dihasilkan dan jumlah TAG yang mempunyai asid oleik di kedudukan sn-2 yang lebih rendah. Sebagai tambahan, CBE yang dihasilkan berkelakuan sebagai aliran pseudoplastik. Walaupun terdapat perbezaan ciri-ciri antara CBE yang dihasilkan dengan CB, ia adalah mungkin untuk menghasilkan CBE yang mempunyai nilai pemakanan yang tinggi dengan komposisi fizikokimia yang sangat dekat dengan CB menggunakan interesterifikasi enzim.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

LIST OF FIGURES

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

A	-	Arachidic acid
AOCS	-	American Oil and Chemists' Society
CB	-	Cocoa butter
CBA(s)	-	Cocoa butter alternative(s)
CBE(s)	-	Cocoa butter equivalent(s)
CBR(s)	-	Cocoa butter replacer(s)
CCD	-	Central Composite Design
DAG(s)	-	Diacylglycerol(s)
DF	-	Degree of freedom
FAM	-	Fatty acid mixture
FFA(s)	-	Free fatty acid(s)
FHSO	-	Fully hydrogenated soybean oil
GC	-	Gas chromatography
HOSO	-	High oleic sunflower oil
ICCO	-	International Cocoa and Commodities Organisation
IM	-	Immobilized
L	-	Linoleic acid
LDL	-	Low density lipid
Ln	-	Linolenic acid
MAG(s)	-	Monoacylglycerols
O	-	Oleic acid
P	-	Palmitic acid
PMF	-	Palm oil midfraction
pNMR	-	Pulse nuclear magnetic resonance
PORIM	-	Palm Oil Research Institute of Malysia
RBD-PO	-	Refined, bleached, and deodorized palm oil
RM	-	*Rhizomucor miehei*

ROPO	-	Refined olive pomace oil
RSM	-	Response surface methodology
S	-	Stearic acid
SF(s)	-	Specialty fats
St	-	Saturated fatty acid
SMP	-	Slip melting point
SFC	-	Solid fat content
TAG(s)	-	Triacylglycerol(s)
TL	-	*Thermomyces lanuginosis*
U	-	Unsaturated fatty acid

LIST OF SYMBOLS

$^{\circ}$C	-	Degree celcius
$^{\circ}$K	-	Degree kelvin
%	-	Percentage
C_{16}	-	Palmitic acid
C_{18}	-	Stearic acid
$C_{18:1}$	-	Oleic acid
$C_{18:2}$	-	Linoleic acid
α	-	Alpha
β	-	Beta
γ	-	Shear rate
τ	-	Shear stress
H_2	-	Gas of hydrogen
rpm	-	Revolutions per minute
Y_i	-	Responses
βo	-	Constant
βi	-	Linear
βii	-	Quadratic
βij	-	Interactive coefficient
k	-	The number of independent variables
k	-	The consistency coefficient
$\sum$	-	Sigma
X	-	Independent parameter
Wt	-	Weight
V	-	Volume
v	-	Velocity
d	-	Diameter

m	-	Meter
cm	-	Centimeter
mm	-	Millimeter
μm	-	Micrometer
ml	-	Mililiter
n	-	Flow behavior index
Psig	-	Pounds per square inch gauge
R^2	-	Coefficient determination
p	-	Probability
Pa	-	Pascal
MPa	-	Megapascal
s	-	Second
mPas	-	Milipascal second

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1   Background of the Research

Cocoa butter (CB) is a highly valued and important ingredient of chocolate and confectionery products. It gives desired physical properties to the chocolate product like gloss, snap, and melting properties (Lipp *et al.*, 2001). High and fluctuated price, uncertainty in supply and variability in quality have led the industry to find alternatives for CB (Wang *et al*., 2006; Zaidul *et al*., 2007; Jahurul *et al*., 2013).

Numerous fats and oils can be used for replacing the CB, collected under the name of cocoa butter alternatives (CBAs). One of CBAs groups is cocoa butter equivalents (CBEs). These non-lauric fats have similar physicochemical characteristics as CB and are therefore compatible with it. Compatibility in this context corresponds to the ability of the triacylglycerol (TAG) of two distinct fats to crystallize together without forming a eutectic (Lonchampt and Hartel, 2004). Therefore, CBEs may be combined with CB in any ratio for coating formulation of chocolate products.

The increasing of healthy lifestyle awareness leads consumers to consume products with high polyunsaturated fatty acids, low calories, enriched lipids and structured lipids. High oleic acid oils, such as canola oil, olive oil, sunflower oil, contain a low level of saturated fatty acids and an appreciable amount of

polyunsaturated fatty acid, which has the potential to be modified into other products (Rousseau and Marangoni, 2002). By using proper methods, modification of high oleic acid oil can be conducted properly without altering the nutrition of oil.

Canola oil, which contains a balanced ratio (2:1) of linoleic acid (omega-6) and linolenic acid (omega-3), provides more of unique healthy benefits than many other vegetable oils (Prsybylski *et al*., 2005). Moreover, the presence of oleic acid in canola oil makes it potential as a raw material for CBE production. This advantage is required to maintain sharp melting point characteristic on CBE. Therefore, canola oil was chosen as raw material in this study.

Modification of fats and oils through lipase-catalyzed interesterification has been studied since the 1890's (Undurraga *et al*., 2001). Recently, preparation of CBEs through 1,3-specific lipase-catalyzed interesterification has received much attention due to certain advantages of enzymes over chemical catalysts (Wang *et al*., 2006). One of the advantages of using 1,3-specific lipase is the ability of incorporating fatty acids, only at the 1- and 3- positions of the glycerol, without changing the fatty acid residues in the sn-2-position, while chemical catalysts will randomize all of the fatty acids in a TAG mixture (Wang *et al*., 2006). This advantage gives a product which is unobtainable by chemicals such as structured lipids in medical foods or enriched lipids with specific fatty acids to improve the nutritional properties of fats and oils (Willis and Marangoni, 2002). Therefore, the use of enzymatic interesterification was expected to maintain the nutritional content of CBE produced in this study.

Previous research has been using mixture of hydrogenated cottonseed oil and olive oil (1:1) to produce CBE (Chang *et al*., 1990). Slip melting point (SMP) of CBE produced from this study was 39˚C. It has TAG composition, 23% of palmitic-oleic–stearic (POS) and 28% of stearic-oleic-stearic (SOS). Furthermore, CBE from refined olive pomace oil (ROPO), palmitic acid, and stearic acid (1:2:6) was made by Ciftci *et al*. (2009). CBE produced has TAG composition 11% of palmitic-oleic-palmitic (POP), 21.8% of POS and 15.7% of SOS. It has SMP around 29.9˚C. Soekopitojo *et al*. (2009) used the mixture of PMF and fully hydrogenated soybean

oil (FHSO) at 1:2 ratio. The yield of CBEs obtained was 20.5% (based on the weight of the original substrate) with TAG composition 9.5% of POP, 26% of SOS, and 37.7% of POS. It has SMP around 30-34.5˚C.

All previous studies mentioned only concerned about the physicochemical of CBE produced, but neglected the fatty acid composition. In fact, the raw materials used in previous studies contained a lot of nutrition and might have given more nutritional value into CBE produced. Therefore, current study tried to modify fatty acid composition by adding canola oil to the CBE production, expecting CBE with higher nutritional value.

Lipase immobilization is necessary in order to improve the reusability and stability of lipase. Due to its reusability for multiple times, immobilized enzymes become economically attractive for interesterification (Goh *et al*., 1993). Therefore, this study used immobilized enzyme for producing CBE.

CBE production by enzymatic interesterification is affected by many factors such as raw material composition, lipozyme load, and reaction time. Thus, a statistical tool is needed to optimize the process condition. The optimization can be carried out effectively by response surface methodology (RSM). It helps in achieving optimum conditions with minimum number of experiments, but the results are statistically acceptable (Kadivar and Shekarchizadeh, 2012). Therefore, this study used RSM to determine the number of experiments and optimum condition of CBE production.

Previous research used RSM to produce CBE from high oleic sunflower oil (HOSO) (Naessens, 2012). RSM was used to maximize the percentage of saturate-unsaturated-saturated (StUSt) TAGs and minimize saturate-unsaturated-unsaturated (StUU) TAG from five factors, namely reaction time, temperature, water content, enzyme load, and substrate ratio. Optimum conditions given by this method were 7.98 of reaction times, 65ºC of reaction temperature, 1% of water content, 8.54 of enzyme load, and 7.99 of substrate ratio. These conditions generated 70.14% of SUS

and 26.76% of SUU. Kadivar *et al*., (2013) used RSM to maximize (StUSt) TAGs on CBE production from high oleic sunflower oil (HOSO). CBE containing 70.03% of StUSt was produced by combining five selected factors (1:7 of HOSO and fatty acid ratio with 8.5% enzyme and 1% water at 65∘C for 8 hours).

1.2 Problem Statement

Due to its unique composition and specific characteristic, CB becomes highly appreciated and is expensive compared with all other natural vegetable fats and oils. On the other hand, uncertainty in supply due to the low amount of CB in cocoa beans (yield of CB around 50-57% based on dry weight basis of cocoa beans), the limitation of cacao plant cultivation (the major cocoa beans growing countries in the world are Ivory Coast, Ghana, Indonesia, Cameroon, Nigeria, Brazil, Ecuador, Dominician Republic, and Malaysia), and the declined of the world total cocoa beans production from 3,752 million tonnes in 2007/2008 to 3,613 million tonnes in 2009/2010 contributed to the higher price of CB (Zaidul *et al*., 2007, Jahurul *et al*., 2013). Moreover, CB has some weaknesses when it is used in confectionery product, including complicacy for distributing in hot climates due to the low slip melting point, variability in quality by depending on source location, and the *blooming* problem which exists if whole product uses CB (Torbica *et al.*, 2006). Therefore, the alternative solutions, either full replacement or partial replacement of CB, are needed.

Cocoa butter equivalent (CBE) is modified to possess TAG composition similar to CB so it can be used as an alternative. It is usually prepared from lower value fats and oils, so it is able to reduce the selling price. Besides, CBE has several purposes, including: improving chocolate tolerance of milk fat, increasing the stability of chocolate at high temperature, and controlling chocolate blooming (Wainwright, 1999).

Many efforts have been made to produce CBE, including blending natural fats, fractionation, hydrogenation and interesterification, chemically or enzymatically. The simplest way to generate CBE is by blending exotic fats. But, exotic fats have a problem in supply because it is collected in the wild. This problem can make uncertainty in supply and triggering higher price of CBE (Kang and Kim, 2013). Moreover, the other method like hydrogenation is not recommended due to the compatibility issue of vegetable fat with the CB. After all, CBE is not normally containing trans fatty acids, unless it is modified or combined with another method to reduce trans fatty acid content in the final product (Talbot, 2007; Zarringhalami *et al.*, 2012). Furthermore, fractionation could be an effective method for obtaining CBE. This method is usually combined with others, such as blending or interesterification to produce CBE (Hashimoto *et al.*, 2001; Ali *et al.*, 1997; Kang and Kim, 2013)

Interesterification, either chemically or enzymatically, is a common method used for obtaining CBE and has been developed by many studies. Chemical interesterification is the popular method used by industry due to the lower costs of initial investment and ease of processing. Nevertheless, this method has less conformity for CBE production since the harsh condition process relieves the fine flavor of the product (Rousseau and Marangoni, 2002). On the other hand, enzymatic interesterification condition process is mild and easy to control. Since the main objective of this study was to produce high nutritional CBE, enzymatic interesterification became the chosen option. This method was expected to retain the linolenic acid (omega-3) and linoleic acid (omega-6) content on CBE properties by utilizing its benefits such as milder processing condition, unchanged the fatty acid composition and its regiospecifity.

1.3   Objective of the Study

i.   To produce a high nutritional value of CBE by blending hard palm oil midfraction (PMF) with canola oil by using enzymatic interesterification.

ii.   To optimize the CBE characteristic by using Response Surface Methodology (RSM).

1.4   Hypothesis

i.   The blending of hard palm oil midfraction (PMF) with canola oil, which contains high linolenic acid (omega-3) and linoleic acid (omega-6) will produce CBE containing a high nutritional value.

ii.   Enzymatic interesterification will not affect the fatty acid profile (including linolenic acid (omega-3) and linoleic acid (omega-6)) of CBE.

1.5   Research Scopes

The scopes of the study consist of:

i.   Physical and chemical characterizations of hard PMF and canola oil used in this study.

ii.   Preliminary study to investigate the significant effect of lipozyme load, reaction time, and stearic acid addition on TAG and SMP of CBEs.

iii.   Investigation of the chosen parameters such as hard PMF concentration, reaction time, and lipozyme load on CBE production to optimize the percentage of POP, POS, SOS and DAG, which were determined by using response surface methodology (RSM).

iv.   Characterization of CBE obtained, including fatty acid profile, triacylglycerol (TAG) composition, solid fat content (SFC), slip melting point (SMP), and rheological properties.

1.6   Significance of Study

By conducting this study, a method and formulation to obtain a partial replacement of CB in chocolate product could be determined. High nutritional cocoa butter equivalents (CBEs) were produced to improve the commercial benefit of the product. Futhermore, the influences of the process variables were studied and the model for optimization of CBEs production from enzymatic interesterification could be obtained.

REFERENCES

Abigor, R. D., Marmer, W. N., Foglia, T. A., Jones, K. C., DiCiccio, R. J., Ashby, R., and Uadia, P. O. (2003). Production of Cocoa Butter-Like Fats by The Lipase-Catalyzed Interesterification of Palm Oil And Hydrogenated Soybean Oil. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist Society.* 80(12), 1193-1196.

Afoakwa, E.O., Paterson, A., Fowler, M. & Vieira, J. (2009). Comparison of Rheological Models for Determining Dark Chocolate Viscosity. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*. 44, 162-167.

Ali, A. R. M., Tan, S. Y., and Azman, K. (1997). Effect of First Stage Dry Fractination on The Quality of CBE Based on Palm Oil and Sal Fat. *Elaeis*. 9(1), 17-24.

American Oil Chemists' Society. (2005). Cc 3-25. Illinois: Official Methods and Recommended Practices of the American Oil Chemists' Society Press

Balle J. (2006, October 3). Business Area Chocolate and Confectionery Fats. *Capital Market Day*. Retrieved October 25, 2013. www.aak.com

Bas, D. and Boyaci, I. H. (2007). Modeling and Optimization I: Usability of Response Surface Methodology. *Journal of Food Engineering*. 78, 836-845.

Bennett, J. C. (1994). *European Patent EP0612478B1*. Retrieved on August 24, 2013, http://ep.espacenet.com/

Bloomer, S., Adlercreutz, P., and Mattiasson, B. (1990). Triglyceride Interesterification by Lipases: Cocoa Butter Equivalents from A Fraction of Palm Oil. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist Society*. 67(8), 519-524.

Braun, D. D and Rosen, M. R. (2013). *Rheology Modifiers Handbook: Practical Use and application*. United State, N. Y.: Elsevier.

Brondz, I. (2002). Review: Development of Fatty Acid Analysis by High-Performance Liquid Chromatography, Gas Chromatography, and Related Techniques. *Analytica Chimica Acta*. 465, 1-37.

Chaiseri, S. and Dimick, P.S. (1989). Lipid and Hardness Characteristics of Cocoa Butters from Different Geographic Regions. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist Society*. 66(11), 1771-1776.

Chang, M. K., Abraham, G., and John, V. T. (1990). Production of Cocoa Butter-Like Fat from Interesterification of Vegetable Oils. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist Society*. 67(11), 832-834.

Chong, C. N., Hoh, Y. M., and Wang, C. W. (1992). Fractination Procedures for Obtaining Cocoa Butter-Like Fat from Enzymatically Interesterified Palm Olein. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist Society*. 69(2), 137-140.

Ciftci, O., Fadiloglu, S., Kowalski, B., and Gogus, F. (2008). Synthesis of Cocoa Butter Triacylglycerols using A Model Acidolysis System. *Grasas Y Aceites*. 59(4), 316-320.

Ciftci, O. N., Fadiloglu, S., and Gogus, F. (2009). Conversion of Olive Pomace Oil to Cocoa Butter-Like Fat in A Packed Bed Enzyme Reactor. *Journal of Bioresource Technology*. 100, 324-329.

Danthine, S. B., and Gibon, V. (2007). Comparative Analysis of Triacylglycerol Composition, Melting Properties and Polymorphic Behavior of Palm Oil and Fractions. *European Journal Lipid Science Technology*. 109, 359-372.

De Clerq, N. D. (2011). *Changing The Functionality of Cocoa Butter*. Doctor Philosophy, Ghent University, Belgium.

De Graef, V., Depypere, F., Minnaer, M., and Dewenttinck, K. (2011). Chocolate Yield Stress as Measured by Oscillatory Rheology. *Food Research International*. 44: 2660-2665.

Deffense, E. (1985). Fractionation of Palm Oil. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 62(2), 376-385.

Depoortere, L. (2011). *The Use and Applicability of Cocoa Butter Equivalents (CBEs) In Chocolate Products*. Master Thesis, Ghent University, Belgium.

Gutnikov, G. (1995). Review: Fatty Acid Profiles of Lipid Samples. *Journal of Chromatography B*. 671, 71-89.

Foubert, I. (2003). *Modelling Isothermal Cocoa Butter Crystallization: Influence of Temperature and Chemical Composition*. Doctoral Philosophy Thesis, Ghent University, Belgium.

Goh, S. H., Yeong, S. K., and Wang, C. W. (1993). Transesterification of Cocoa Butter by Fungal Lipases: Effect of Solvent on 1,3-Specificity. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 70(6), 567-570.

Goncalves, E. V., and Lannes, S. C. S. (2010). Chocolate Rheology. *Ciência e Tecnologia de Alimentos*. 30(4), 845-851.

Hashimoto, S., Nezu, T., Arakawa, H., Ito, T., and Maruzeni, S. (2001). Preparation of sharp-melting hard palm mid-fraction and its use as hard butter in chocolate. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 78(5), 455-460.

Hinrichsen, N. and Steinhart, H. (2006), Techniques and Applications in Lipid Analysis. In: Mossoba, M., Magdi M. M, John, K. G. K., J. T. B., and Richard, E. M. (eds). *Lipid Analysis and Lipidomics: New Technidues and Applications*. (pp.3-26). Illinois: AOCS Press.

Idris, N. A., and Dian, N. L. H. M. (2005). Interesterified Palm Products as Alternatives to Hydrogenation. *Asia Pacific Journal of Clinical Nutrition*. 14(4), 396-401.

Illingworth, D. (2002). Fractionation of Fats. In: Marangoni, A. G. and Suresh S. N. (eds). *Physical Properties of Lipids*. (pp. 317-325). New York: Marcel Dekker, Inc.

International Cocoa and Commodities Organisation. (2013). World Cocoa Bean Production, Grindings and Stocks. *Quarterly Bulletin of Cocoa Statistic vol. XXXIX, no 2 Cocoa Year 2012/2013*, 39, 13 – 15.

Ison, A. P., Macrae, A. R., Smith, C. G., and Bosley, J. (1994). Mass Transfer Effects in Solvent Free Fat Interesterification Reactions: Influence on Catalyst Design. *Biotechnology and Bioengineering*. 43, 122–130.

Jahurul, M. H. A., Zaidul, I. S. M., Norulaini, N. A. N., Sahena, F., Jinap, S., Azmir, J., Sharif, K. M., Mohd Omar, A. K. (2013). Cocoa Butter Fats and Possibilities of Substitution in Food Products Concerning Cocoa Varieties, Alternative Sources, Extraction Methods, Composition, and Characteristics. *Journal of Food Engineering*. 117, 467-476.

Johnson, L. A. (2002). Recovery, Refining, Converting, and Stabilizing Edible Fats and Oils. In: Akoh, C.C. and Min, D. B. (Eds.) *Food Lipids: Chemistry, Nutrition, and Biotechnology Second Edition* (pp. 241-291). New York: Marcel Dekker Inc.

Kadivar, M., and Shekarchizadeh, H. (2012). A Study on Parameters of Potential Cocoa Butter Analogue Synthesis from Camel Hump by Lipase-Catalysed Interesterification in Supercritical CO_2 using Response Surface Methodology. *Journal of Food and Chemistry.*135, 155-160.

Kadivar, S., Clerq, N. D., Walle, D. V. D., and Dewettinck, K. (2013). Optimisation of enzymatic synthesis of cocoa butter equivalent from high oleic sunflower oil. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*. 10, 1-7.

Kang, J. H., Lee, S. B., Song, S. H., and Lee, K. T. (2011). *European Patent No. EP2352382 A1*. Retrieved on April 10, 2013, from http://ep.espacenet.com/

Kang, K. K., Joen, H., Kim, I. H., and Kim, B. H. (2013). Cocoa Butter Equivalents Prepared by Blending Fractionated Palm Stearin and Shea Stearin. *Food Science Biotechnology*. 22(2), 347-352.

Kang, J. H., and Kim, M. J. (2013). *European Patent No. EP2561763A1*. Retrieved on April 10, 2013, from http://ep.espacenet.com/

Kellens, M., Gibon, V., Hendrix, M., and De Greyt, W. (2007). Palm oil fractionation. *European Journal of Lipid Science and Technology*. 109, 336-349.

Khumalo, L. W., Majoko, L., Read, J. S., and Ncube, I. (2002). Characterisation of some Underutilised Vegetable Oils and Their Evaluation as Starting Materials for Lipase-Catalysed Production of Cocoa Butter Equivalents. *Journal of Industrial Crops and Products*.16, 237-244.

Kim, M. J., Kim, T. J., Kim, W. C., Lee, K. P., Lee, M. H. Lee, S. B., Lee, Y. J., Lim, C. S., and Park, S. W. (2012). *European Patent EP2508079A1*. Retrieved on August 26, 2013, http://ep.espacenet.com/

Kim, S., Kim, I. H., Akoh, C., and Kim, B. H. (2014). Enzymatic Production of Cocoa Butter Equivalents High in 1-Palmitoyl-2-oleoyl-3-stearin in Continuous Packed Bed Reactors. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 10, 1-11.

Konishi, H., Neff, W. E., and Mounts, T. L. (1993). Chemical Interesterification with Regioselectivity for Edible Oils. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 70(4), 411-415.

Kuo, S. J., and Parkin, K. L. (1993). Substrate Preferences for Lipase Mediated Acyl-Exchange Reactions with Butter Oil are Concentration-Dependent. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 70(4), 393-399.

Li, D., Adhikari, P., Shin, J. A., Lee, J. H., Kim, Y. J., Zhu, X. .M, Hu, J. N., Jin, J., Akoh, C. C., Lee, K. T. (2010). Lipase-catalyzed interesterification of high oleic sunflower oil and fully hydrogenated soybean oil comparison of batch and continuous reactor for production of zero trans shortening fats. *LWT – Food Science and Technology*. 43, 458-464.

Lipp, M., and Anklam, E. (1998) Review of Cocoa Butter and Alternatives Fats for Use In Chocolate – Part A. Compositional Data. *Food Chemistry*. 62(1), 73-97.

Lipp, M., Simoneau, C., Ulberth, F., Anklam, E., Crews, C., Brereton, P., De Greyt, W., Schwack, W., and Wiedmaier, C. (2001). Composition of Genuine Cocoa Butter and Cocoa Butter Equivalents. *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*. 14, 399-408.

Liu, K. J., Cheng, H. M., Chang, R. C., and Shaw, J. F. (1997). Synthesis of Cocoa Butter Equivalent by Lipase-Catalyzed Interesterification In Supercritical Carbon Dioxide. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 74(11), 1477-1482.

Liu, K. J., Chang, H. M., and Liu, K. M. (2007). Enzymatic Synthesis of Cocoa Butter Analog Through Interesterification of Lard and Tristearin In Supercritical Carbon Dioxide by Lipase. *Food Chemistry*. 100, 1303-1311.

Lonchampt, P., and Hartel, R. W. (2004). Fat Bloom in Chocolate and Compound Coatings. *European Journal of Lipid Science and Technology*. 106, 241-274.

Lusas, E. W., Alam, M. S., Clough, R. C., and Riaz, M. N. (2012). Animal and Vegetable Fats, Oils, and Waxes. In: Kent, J. A. (Ed.) *Handbook of Industrial Chemistry and Biotechnology* (pp. 355 – 370). New York: Springer Science.

Malcata, F. X., Reyes, H. R., Garcia, H. S., Hill Jr., C. G., and Amundson, C. H. (1990). Immobilized Lipase Reactors for Modification of Fats and Oils-A Review. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 67(12), 890-910.

Momeny, E., Vafael, N., and Ramli, N. Physicochemical Properties And Antioxidant Activity Of A Synthetic Cocoa Butter Equivalent Obtained through Modification of Mango Seed Oil. (2013). *Journal of Food Science and Technology*. 48, 1549-1555.

Montgomery, D.C. (2005). *Design and Analysis of Experiments*. (6th ed). Arizona State University, USA: John Wiley and Sons Inc.

Naessens, L. (2012). Production of Cocoa Butter Equivalent Through Enzymatic Acidolysis. Master Thesis, Gent University, Belgium.

Neff, W. E., List, G. R., and Byrdwell, W. C. (1999). Effect of Triacylglycerol Composition on Functionality of Margarine Basestocks. *Lebensm-Wiss u-Technology*. 32, 416-424.

Nielsen, S.S. (2010). *Food Analysis Laboratory Manual.* (2nd ed). New York: Springer.

Nguyen, Q. and Nguyen, N. (2012). Incompressible Non-Newtonian Fluid Flows. In Gan, Y. X. (Ed.) *Continuum Mechanics - Progress in Fundamentals and Engineering Applications*, (pp. 47-72). Shanghai: InTech.

O'Brien, R. D. (2009). *Fats and Oils: Formulating and Processing Applications* (3rd ed). United States: CRC Press.

Osborn, H. T., and Akoh, C. C. (2002). Structured Lipids − Novel Fats With Medical, Nutraceutical, and Food Applications. *Comprehensive Reviews In Food Science And Food Safety*. 3, 110-120.

Palm Oil Research Institute of Malaysia. (1995). *PORIM Test Method*. Malaysia: Palm Oil Research Institute of Malaysia.

Pease, J.J. (1985). Confectionary Fats from Palm Oil And Lauric Oil. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society.* 62(2), 426-430.

Pinyaphong, P., and Phutrakul, S. (2009). Synthesis of Cocoa Butter Equivalent from Palm Oil by *Carica papaya* Lipase-Catalyzed Interesterification. *Chiang Mai Journal of Science*. 36(3), 359-368.

Prsybylski, R., Mag, T., Eskin, N. A. M., and McDonald, B. E. (2005). Canola oil. In: Shahid, F. (Ed.) *Bailey's Industrial Oil and Fat Products, Sixth Edition, Six Volume Set* (pp. 1-61). London: John Wiley and Sons Inc.

Rousseau, D., and Marangoni, A. (2002). Chemical Interesterification of Food Lipids: Theory and Practice. In Akoh, C.C. and Min, D. B. (Eds.) *Food Lipids: Chemistry, Nutrition, and Biotechnology Second Edition* (pp. 319-352). New York: Marcel Dekker Inc.

Sahin, S. and Sumnu, S. G. (2006). *Physical Properties of Foods*. New York: Springer.

Santini, S., Crowet J. M., Thomas, A., Paquot, M., Vandenbol, M., Thonart, P., Wathelet, J. P., Blecker, C., Lognay, G., Brasseur, R., Lins, L., and

Charloteaux, B. (2009). Study of Thermomyces Lanuginosa Lipase in The Presence of Tributyrylglycerol and Water. *Biophysic Journal*. 96, 4814-4825.

Satiawihardja, B. (2008). Studi Pembuatan Mentega Cokelat Tiruan Dari Minyak Sawit Dengan Proses Interesterifikasi Enzimatik. *Jurnal Teknologi Industri Pertanian*. 10(3), 129-138.

Shekarchizadeh, H., Kadivar, M., Ghaziaskar, H. S., and Rezayat, M. (2009). Optimization of Enzymatic Synthesis of Cocoa Butter Analog from Camel Hump Fat in Supercritical Carbon Dioxide by Response Surface Method (RSM). *Journal of Supercritical Fluid.* 49, 209-215.

Shekarchizadeh, H., and Kadivar, M. (2012). A Study on Parameters of Potential Cocoa Butter Analogue Synthesis from Camel Hump by Lipase-Catalysed Interesterification in Supercritical CO_2 Using Response Surface Methodology. *Journal of Food Chemistry.* 135, 155-160.

Shieh, C., Akoh, C. C., and Koehler, P. E. (1995). Four-factor Response Surface Optimization of the Enzymatic Modification of Triolein to Structured Lipids. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 72(6), 619-623.

Shridar, R., Lakshminarayana, G., and Kalmal, T. N. B. (1991). Modification of Selected Indian Vegetable Fats Into Cocoa Butter Substitute by Lipase-Catalyzed Ester Interchange. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 68(10), 726-730.

Silva, R. C., Cotting, L. N., Poltronieri, T. P., Balcao, V. M., de Almeida, D. B., Goncalves, L. A. G., Grimaldi, R., Gioielli, L.A. (2009). The Effects of Enzymatic Interesterification on The Physical-Chemical Properties of Blends of Lard and Soybean Oil. *LWT-Food Science and Technology*. 42, 1275-1282.

Simmons, R. (2011, June 21). World Cocoa and CBE Markets. LMC International. Retrieved October 01, 2013. from www.lmc.co.uk

Sonwai, S., Kaphueakngam, P., and Flood, A. (2012). Blending Of Mango Kernel Fat and Palm Oil Mid-Fraction to Obtain Cocoa Butter Equivalent. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*. 10, 1-13.

Soekopitojo, S., Hariyadi, P., Muchtadi, T. R., and Andarwulan, N. (2009). Enzymatic Interesterification of Palm Oil Midfraction Blends for The Production of Cocoa Butter Equivalents. *Asian Journal of Food Agro-Industry.* 2(4), 807 – 816.

Soekopitojo, S. (2011). Interesterifikasi Enzimatik Bahan Baku Berbasis Minyak Sawit untuk Produksi Cocoa Butter Equivalents. Doctor Philosophy, Institut Pertanian Bogor, Bogor.

Strayer, D., Belcher, M., Dawson, T., Delaney, B., Fine, J., Flickinger, B., Friedman, P., Heckel, C., Hughes, J., Kincs, F., Liu, L., McBrayer, T., McCaskill, D., McNeill, G., Nugent, M, Paladini, E., Rosegrant, P., Tiffany, T., Wainaright, B., and Wilken, J. (2006). *Food Fats and Oils*. (9th ed). Washington DC: AOCS Resources Directory.

Talbot, G. (2007). Formulation and Production of Confectionary Fats. *Proceedings of OFI Middle East 2007 Conference and Exhibition 2007*. 20-21 March. Cairo, 1-37.

Torbica, A., Jovanovic, O., and Pajin, B. (2006). The Advantages of Solid Fat Content Determination in Cocoa Butter and Cocoa Butter Equivalents by The Karishamns Method. *European Food Resources Technology*. 222, 385-391.

Timms, R.E. (2003). *Confectionery Fat Handbook*. United Kingdom, Bridgwater: Oily Press.

Undurraga, D., Markovitz, A., and Erazo, S. (2001). Cocoa Butter Equivalent Through Enzymic Interesterification of Palm Oil Midfraction. *Process Biochemistry*. 36, 933-939.

Unsal, M., and Aktas, N. (2003). Fractionation and Characterisation of Edible Sheep Tail Fat. *Meat Science*. 63, 235-239.

Volpenheim, R.A. (1980). *European Patent 0010333*. Retrieved on July 10, 2013, from http://ep.espacenet.com/

Wang, H.X., Wu, H., Ho, C.T. and Weng, X.C. (2006). Cocoa Butter Equivalent from Enzymatic Interesterification of Tea Seed Oil and Fatty Acid Methyl Esters. *Food Chemistry*. 97, 661-665.

Wainwright, B. (2000). Specialty Fats and Oils. In O'Brien, R., Farr, W. E., and Wan, P. J. (Eds). *Introduction to Fats and Oils Technology* (2[nd]ed.) (pp. 503-504). Illinois: American Oil Chemists' Society Press, Champaign.

Whitaker, J. (2001). *Current Protocols in Food Analytical Chemistry*. California: John Wiley and Sons Inc.

Willis, W. M., and Marangoni, A. G. (2002). Enzymatic Interesterification. In Akoh, C.C. and David B. M. (Eds.) *Food Lipids: Chemistry, Nutrition, and*

Biotechnology, Second Edition, Revised, and Expanded (pp. 857 – 893). New York: Marcel Dekker Inc.

Xu, X., Skands, A., Høy, C. E., Mu, H., Balchen, S., and Adler-Nissen, A. (1998). Production of Specific-Structured Lipids by Enzymatic Interesterification: Elucidation of Acyl Migration by Response Surface Design. *Ibid*. 75, 1179–1186.

Xu, X., Mu, H., Skands, A. R. H., Hoy, C. E., and Nissen, A. J. (1999). Parameters Affecting Diacylglicerol Formation During the Production of Specific-Structured Lipids by Lipase-Catalyzed Interesterification. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 76(2), 175-181.

Xu, X. (2000). Production Of Specific-Structured Triacylglycerols By Lipase-Catalyzed Reactions: A Review. *European Journal of Lipid and Science Technology*. 2000, 287-303. Wiley Online Library.

Yamane, T. (1987). Enzyme Technology for the Lipids Industry: An Engineering Overview. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 4(12), 1657-1662.

Yang, T., Fruekilde, M.B., and Xu, X. (2003). Applications of Immobilized *Thermomyces lanuginosa* Lipase in Interesterification. *Journal of American and Oil Chemist' Society*. 80(9), 881-887.

Yang, T., Zhang, H., Mu, H. L., Sinclair, A. J., Xu, X. B., (2004). Diacylglycerols from butterfat: Production by Glycerolysis and Short-Path Distillation and Analysis of Physical Properties. *Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society*. 81(10), 979-987.

Zarringhalami, S., Sahari, M. A., Barzegar, M., and Esfehani, Z. H. (2012). Production of Cocoa Butter Replacer by Dry Fractination, Partial Hydrogenation, Chemical and Enzymatic Interesterification of Tea Seed Oil. *Food and Nutrition Science*. 3, 184-189.

Zaidul, I. S. M., Nik Norulaini, N. A., Mohd Omar, A. K., and Smith Jr., R. L. (2007). Blending of Supercritical Carbon Dioxide (SC-CO$_2$) Extracted Palm Kernel Oil Fractions and Palm Oil to Obtain Cocoa Butter Replacers. *Journal of Food Engineering*. 78, 1397-1409.