THE IMPLEMENTATION OF DESIGN AND BUILD PROCUREMENT APPROACH IN LOCAL CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY

PANG SHEH HAUR

Project report is submitted as a partial requirement for award of the degree of Master of Engineering (Civil - Construction & Management)

> Faculty of Civil Engineering Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

ð

OCTOBER, 2003

ABSTRACT

In our local construction industry, the design and build procurement method had been quite widely used especially on the large and complex project. However, there was little research being conducted on the implementation of this approach in our construction industry. Therefore, this research was aimed to identify the advantages of practicing design and build procurement method. Moreover, the problems/constraints in practicing design and build procurement method will also be studied. Next, the major successes factors in the project practicing design and build procurement method will also be part of this research objective. Finally, this research will also include the study on the effectiveness of the design and build method in shortening the construction time, saving the construction cost and deliver better end product. Survey was conducted through questionnaires distributed among local contractors' firm based in Kuala Lumpur and Selangor state. Upon receiving the feedbacks, SPSS program will be used to analyze it. It was found that the overall performance of design and build approach are in better form. Therefore, this approach should be more widely practiced and not only limited to large and complex projects only.

CONTENTS

DEC	LARATION	ii
DED	ICATION	iii
ACK	NOWLEGDEMENT	iv
ABS	TRACT	v
ABS	TRAK	vi
CON	TENTS	vii
LIST	COF FIGURES	xiii
LIST	COF TABLES	xv
LIST	COF APPENDIXES	xvi

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER ITEM

٢.,

σ,

\$ 1

64

ч.

F)

ن

,

1

1.1	General Information	1
1.2	Problem Background	2
1.3	Research Objectives	3
1.4	Scopes of Study	3
1.5	Importance Of This Research	4

PAGE

CHAPTER II LITERATURE REVIEW: DESIGN AND BUILD IN GENERAL

5

viii

2.1	Tradit	ional Procurement Approach	5
2,1	2.1.1	Strengths Of The Traditional Approach	8
	2.1.1	The Weakness Of The Traditional Approach	9
2.2		n And Build Procurement Approach	11
<i>L</i> . <i>L</i>	U		12
	<i>4.2</i> ,1	Structural Variations Of Design And Build 2.2.1.1 Joint Venture	12
			12
		2.2.1.2 Contractor Led Design And Build	13
		2.2.1.3 Designer Led Design And Build	
		2.2.1.4 Integrated Design And Build Firm	15
		2.2.1.5 Developer Led Design And Build	17
	2.2.2		18
	2.2.3	Strengths Of Design And Build Procurement	
		System	20
	2.2.4	Weakness Of Design And Build Procurement	
		System	24
2.3	Desig	n And Build Project Success Factors	27
	2.3.1	Project Team Commitment	27
	2.3.2	Contractor's Competencies	28
	2.3.3	Client's Competencies	29
	2.3.4	End Users' Needs	29
2.4	Factor	rs Influencing Trends In Design And Build	
	Procu	rement Method	29
	2.4.1	Client's Factors	30
		2.4.1.1 Price Certainty	31
		2.4.1.2 Single Point Of Responsibility	31
		2.4.1.3 One-Stop Shopping Approach	31
		2.4.1.4 Shorter Project Duration Time	32
		2.4.1.5 Reduction In Costs	33
		2.4.1.6 Transfer Of Risks	34
		2.4.1.7 Quality Achievement	35
		2.4.1.8 Better Buildability	35
		-	

η

•

5

0

۰,

	2.4.1.9 Avoidance Of Conflicts And Claims	36
2.4.2	Government Policies	36
	2.4.2.1 Introduction Of Private Finance	
	Initiative (PFI)	36
	2.4.2.2 Cut In Government Expenditure	37
	2.4.2.3 Encouragement Of Partnership	37
2.4.3	Economical Factors	38
	2.4.3.1 The Economic Condition Of The Nation	39
	2.4.3.2 Interest Rate	39
2.4.4	Marketing Factors	40
	2.4.4.1 Service Industry	41
	2.4.4.2 The Unique Characteristics Of The	
	Construction Industry	41
	2.4.4.3 Client-Oriented Business	42
	2.4.4.4 Lack Of Marketing Experts	42
2.4.5	Technological Factors	43
2.4.6	Life-Cycle Cost	43
2.4.7	Conclusion	44

CHAPTER IIILITERATURE REVIEW: ROLES OF INDIVIDUALSIN DESIGN AND BUILD PROJECT46

4

E.

11

3.1	Introd	Introduction	
3.2	Owner's Team		46
	3.2.1	Owner	46
	3.2.2	Owner's Representative	47
	3.2.3	Design Criteria Professional	48
	3.2.4	Construction Manager	50
3.3	Desig	n Builder's Team	51
	3.3.1	Design Professionals As Design And Build	
		Team Members	52
	3.3.2	Constructor As Member Of The Design And	

		Build Team	54
	3.3.3	Design And Build Subcontractor	56
	3.3.4	Trade Subcontractors	57
3.4	Indepe	ndents In The Design And Build Process	57
	3.4.1	Quality Assurance Professionals	57
	3.4.2	Building Officials	59
	3.4.3	Users	59

CHAPTER IV LITERATURE REVIEW: CONTRACTOR SELECTION PROCESS

也

n

<u>_</u>

61

4.1	Desig	n And Build Project In Public Sector	61
4.2	Gener	ral Practices In Contractor Selection	62
	4.2.1	Pre-Qualification	63
	4.2.2	Need Statement (Project Brief)	63
	4.2.3	Evaluation	64
	4.2.4	Supervision	65
4.3	Model	Of Contractor Selection	66

CHAPTER V RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 71

5.1	Introduction	71
5.2	Literature Review	71
5.3	Data Collection	72
5.4	Questionnaires Structures	73
5.5	Data Analysis	74

CHAPTER VI RESULTS ANALYSIS

۴

÷

C

6.1	Respondents Background	76
6.2	Reliability Analysis	80
6.3	Analysis Of The Advantages Of I	Design And Build
	Procurement Method	81
6.4	Analysis On The Problems/Const	raints Faced in
	Design And Build Procurement M	fethod 87
6.5	Analysis On The Design And Bui	ld Project Success
	Factor	92
	6.5.1 Project Team Commitmer	ıt 92
	6.5.2 Contractor's Competencie	s 98
	6.5.3 Client's Competencies	102
	6.5.4 End-Users' Needs	104
6.6	Analysis On The Budget Perform	ance 106
6.7	Analysis On The Schedule Perfor	mance 110
6.8	Analysis On The Quality Perform	ance 115

CHAPTER VII CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

7.1	Introduction	119
7.2	Advantages Of Design And Build Approach	119
7.3	Problems/Constraints In Design And Build Approach	120
7.4	Project Success Factors	121
7.5	Cost, Time And Quality	122
	7.5.1 Budget Performance	122
	7.5.2 Schedule Performance	122
	7.5.3 Quality Performance	123
7.6	Limitation Of Study	123
	7.6.1 Result Unable To Reflect Our Local	
	Construction Industry Thoroughly	124

76

119

	7.6.2	Results Do Not Reflect The Opinions From	
		All The Parties In Design And Build Project	124
	7.6.3	Medium-Sized Group Of Respondents	124
7.7	Recor	nmendation For Future Study	125

APPENDIX

r:

•

n

4)

.,

4

130

.

127

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

1.1 General Information

The design and build system was first introduced in Malaysia in 1983 (Khairuddin Abdul Rashid, 2002). Design and build procurement method is not a new project delivery system, but rather one that has been used for centuries throughout the world. Those who built the projects that are landmarks of ancient civilization used processes essentially similar to modern design and build method (National Society of Professional Engineers, 1995).

The present design-bid-build system or known as traditional system, whereby the design and construction are separated, was borne out of the "spoils system" and lack of widespread technical expertise. Conceptually, traditional system was established to produce facilities to meet the needs of growing population at the lowest cost to the public. Nevertheless, the system ensured that goods and services were purchased on the basis of a low bid. Traditional system functioned on the basis that project plans and specifications, prepared by trained professionals and executed by a properly supervised low bidder would produce the desired product at the lowest cost (NSPE, 1995). There appears to be a trend in Malaysia for some employers to elect for design and build type contracts for their developments. Until recently, the most common forms of contract adopted in Malaysia were based on the traditional arrangements between an employer, his consultants and the contractor. The common forms were those published by the Pertubuhan Akitek Malaysia (Malaysian Architects' Association) and Jabatan Kerja Raya (Public Works Department).

Despite the absence of a local design and build form of contract, local employers have, presumably under the advice of their consultants, had the option of choosing from various forms of contract available. In relation to design and build forms, the FIDIC Orange book appears to be the form that has been most popularly received by employers here (Khairuddin Abdul Rashid, 2002).

1.2 Problem Background

Nowadays, the construction industry is evolving towards a stage whereby cost, time and quality are being stressed and remain the main requirements from the end user. Although the use of traditional method to implement project has been there for many decades, recent years, as projects getting more complex and require fast track which demand greater emphasis on management techniques and engineering skills, the traditional approach to implement those projects were found to be not effective (Bahari Mohd. Ali, 1986)

The practicing of the traditional method had also came under heavy and severe criticism from the academician both locally and overseas as being too slow, requiring too much input from the clients and the implementing agency hence causing a lot of delays. In local government projects, many of the projects conducted suffered delays in delivering the projects on time. The causes of delays were not made known whether it was related to the current practice of traditional method. Design and build procurement method may seems to be suitable replacing the old traditional approach as it is known to be able to deliver projects in a faster way and require less input from the clients. However, there was little research being conducted on the implementation of this approach in our construction industry. Therefore, this research is meant to give an overview of the implementation of such approach in our construction industry.

1.3 Research Objectives

Ç,

The main objectives of this research are as follows:

- 1. To identify the advantages of practicing design and build procurement method.
- 2. To identify the problems/constraints in practicing design and build procurement method.
- 3. To identify the success factors in the project practicing design and build procurement method.
- 4. To study the effectiveness of the design and build method in shortening the construction time, saving the construction cost and deliver better end product.

1.4 Scopes Of Study

This research will be involved the general contractors in Kuala Lumpur and Selangor state only. In other words, the respondents will be the contractors who are registered with the Construction Industry Development Board (CIDB) under Gred 7 or register with Pusat Khidmat Kontraktor under Gred A. Therefore, the analysis of the data collected will solely based on the feedback received from the respective respondents. Lastly, the accuracy of the data will solely depend on the feedback collected through the questionnaires distributed.

1.5 Importance Of This Research

Ċ

Design and build procurement method is not a new agenda in our country nowadays, it is very important to have a study on how well the implementation of the design and build method in our local construction industry. Apart from that, it is also very important to identify the constraints or problems faced by our local construction industry regarding the implementation of design and build procurement method.

Nevertheless, this research would also give an insight on the implementation of design and build projects in our country as well as reflect whether our local construction industry are ready or not, had been successful or not, in implementing the design and build procurement system locally.

More importantly, the outcome of the research can serve as a revision for the government sector especially the Public Work Department which is still practicing the old design bid build procurement system to evolve to a more practical and comprehensive procurement system which will benefits our public mostly

REFERENCE

- A. Ashworth (1996). "Contractual Procedure In The Construction Industry." Longman.
- A.A. Kwakye (1997). "Construction Project Administration In Practice." Longman.
- Assoc. Prof. Ahmad Rosdan Razak (1995). "Design and Build Projects The Malaysian Experiencis." International Congress On Construction, Singapore.
- Assoc. Prof. Low Sui Pheng (2000). "Success Factors For Design-and Build In Civil Engineering Projects: Two Case Study." JURUTERA. 58-64
- Akintoye (1994). "Design And Build: A Survey Of Construction Contractors' View." Construction Management and Economics. 155-163.
- Albert P. C. Chan, Danny C. K. Ho, and C. M. Tan (2001). "Design And Build Project Success Factors: Multivariate Analysis." *Journal of Construction Engineering and Management*. 93-100.
- Anthony D. Songer, Keith R. Molenaar (1997). "Selecting Design-Build: Public and Private Sector Owner Attitutes." ASCE, University Of Colorado.
- Dennis G. Rolstad and Allen Samelson (2000). "Improving Traditional Project Contracting in California." Roger Joseph O'Donnell & Phillips.

Dennis Turner (1986). "Design & Build Contract Practice." The Bath Press, Avon.

Ekambaram Palaneeswaran and Mohan M. Kumaraswamy (2000). "Contractor Selection For Design/Build Projects." *Journal of Construction Engineering and Management*. 331-338.

En. Bahari Mohd Ali. "Kontract Turnkey: Pengalaman Dalam Negeri." IJM, UTM.

- Jeffrey L. Beard, Michael C. Lovlakis SR, Edward C. Wundram (2001). "Design-Build: Planning Through Development." R. R. Donnelley & Sons Company.
- Keith Potts (1995). "Major Construction Works, Contractual & Financial Management." Longman.
- Keith R. Molenaar, Anthony D. Songer, and Mouji Barash (1999). "Public-Sector Design/Build Evolution And Performance." *Journal of Management in Engineering*. 54-62.
- Khairuddin Abdul Rashid (2002). "Construction Procurement In Malaysia." International Islamic University Malaysia.

Mark Bengard (1999). "The Future of Design-Build." Business News Publishing Co.

- Mark C. Friedlander, "A primer On Industrial Design/Build Construction Contracts." Schiff Hardin & Woite.
- Md. Najib Ghafar (1998). "Penyelidikan Pendidikan", Skudai: Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 101-111.

Nasruddin Hj. Faisol, Hamimah Adnan (1999). "Factors Influencing Trends In Design And Build Procurement Method" Universiti Teknologi Mara.

- Ndekugri, L & Turner A (1994). "Building Procurement By Design And Build Approach." Journal of Construction Engineering and Management. 242-256
- P. Chan, N. Herbert, L. K. Quah, P. Worner (1997). "Design and Build Management." Real Estate & Construction Centre.
- Prof. John Andrews and Azlan Raofuddin Hj. Nuruddin (1994). "National Seminar On Contracting In Malaysia." USM.
- Richard F. Moore. "Response to Change-The Development of Non-Traditional Forms Of Contracting."
- Shawn S.N. Chong (2002). "The Relationship Between Procurement System & The Economic Use Of Resources" JURUTERA. 25-27.
- Stanley L. Sclore (2001) "Notes on Likert Scale", London: Hutchinson & Co. Publishers Ltd.
- William Hughes (1992). "An Analysis Of The JCT Design & Build Contract." The Chartered Institute Of Building. 1-6