

DEVELOPMENT AND MICROBIAL CHARACTERIZATION OF AEROBIC  
GRANULATION USING PALM OIL MILL EFFLUENT (POME)

NORHAYATI ABDULLAH

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the  
requirements for the award of the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy (Bioscience)

Faculty of Biosciences and Bioengineering  
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

JUNE 2012

*...to my lovely sons Adam and Harris*  
*husband Dr. Muhamad Ali Muhammad Yuzir*  
*and our future newborn*  
*with lots of love and shiny sparkles...*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

*Alhamdulillah*, I am thankful to Allah S.W.T., the Almighty, the Most Merciful, for His blessings and guidance throughout my PhD journey.

A world of thanks to my supervisor Dato' Professor Zaini Ujang, for I am indebted to his continuous support and motivation, endless constructive comments and suggestions. It was such an honor to be working under the supervision of the UTM Vice Chancellor himself. I couldn't agree more with Professor Zaini that PhD is a beautiful journey indeed. For all the exciting opportunities, publications and novel findings as well as improvements in technical writings, indeed... *a good teacher educates, a great teacher inspires*.

My heartfelt appreciation to my co-supervisor, Dr. Adibah Yahya, whose motivation and inspiration has enabled me to develop an understanding of the molecular and microbial subjects. Thank you for being there when I mostly needed an overnight advice regarding the phenolic compounds, or whenever I am lost for words to describe the microbes. Your endless support and guidance were priceless! My gratitude and thanks to my external supervisor, Professor Thomas Curtis at Newcastle University, United Kingdom. Thank you for having me in your microbiology laboratory for DGGE and FISH experiments. Thank you for introducing me to the excitements of software and statistical analyses! I couldn't be more excited with the fractal theory and similarity indices. For all the knowledge, meetings, 13 hours flight to UTM and back, you are simply the best!

Special thanks to the Department of Industrial Biotechnology and laboratory technicians at Faculty of Biosciences and Bioengineering, UTM especially Ms. Wan Aznida and Puan Fatimah, for their help and support. I would like to thank the Human Resource Department of UTM for their smooth organization in making my PhD internship at Newcastle University a success. To all my friends at C08 and IPASA UTM, thank you for your motivation, kindness, help and support throughout.

I would also like to thank special people at Cassie Building, Newcastle University namely Mrs Fiona Read, for her help and support during FISH and DGGE experiments. Thank you to Dr. Russell Davenport for his expert advice and guidance on molecular experiments. To Ms. Micol Belluci for her endless help and support on my FISH experiments. Thank you to Dr. Trevor Booth at the School of Medical Sciences, Newcastle University for his help with viewing my FISH slides and aerobic granular samples on the Confocal Laser Scanning Microscope (CLSM). To my postgraduate friends, thank you for your kindness and friendship during my stay in the postgraduate suite (PGR) at Cassie Building.

To my parents Abdullah Sitam and Siti Hajal Haron, this thesis is for both of you. Thank you for your endless prayers, motivation and support. To all my family, thank you for your support and understanding.

To my husband Dr. Muhamad Ali Muhammad Yuzir and my sons Adam Muhamad Ali & Harris Muhamad Ali... this thesis is for you.

## ABSTRACT

Palm oil is widely used for food and non-food manufacturing industries and as a biofuel. The production of palm oil generates a large amount of solid and liquid wastes in the form of empty fruit bunch (EFB) and palm oil mill effluent (POME), respectively. As POME contributes to a high pollution process waste, the need to find an efficient and practical approach to preserve the environment is essential. Novel aerobic granular sludge is a compact consortium of self-immobilized bacteria with high rate biological wastewater treatability. This study is aimed at investigating aerobic granular sludge formation in lab-scale sequencing batch reactor (SBR) using POME as substrate. The efficiency of aerobic granular sludge developed for the treatment of POME in corresponds to the structure of bacterial population is monitored. Aerobic granular sludge was developed at volumetric exchange rate (VER) of 50% and cycle duration of 3 hours at flow rate of 3 Lm<sup>-1</sup> in reactors R1, R2 and R3 operated at OLR of 1.5, 2.5 and 3.5 kgCOD m<sup>-3</sup>d<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. Shock load conditions were introduced by increasing the OLR in R2 from 2.5 to 19 kgCOD m<sup>-3</sup>d<sup>-1</sup>. Aerobic granular sludge was successfully formed at an OLR of 2.5 and 3.5 kgCOD m<sup>-3</sup>d<sup>-1</sup>, respectively while bioflocs remained dominant in R1. Under shock loading rate, aerobic granular sludge was partially disintegrated due to mass transfer limitation within the granule. The average sizes of granules were between 1.0 mm to 4.0 mm. Upon steady state, COD removal efficiency of greater than 80% was recorded for all reactors. Polymerase chain reaction-denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis (PCR-DGGE) and fluorescence *in situ* hybridisation (FISH) techniques were used to show that the bacterial population changes during aerobic granular sludge formation at different OLRs. The average Raup and Crick similarity indices obtained during the acclimation/granulation and the maturation phases were 0.95 ± 0.02 and 0.72 ± 0.06, respectively. Mature granules maintained good settling property and dominant granular morphology as evidenced by low SVI of 19.9 mL g<sup>-1</sup> SS at 3.5 kgCOD m<sup>-3</sup>d<sup>-1</sup>. Visible bands from the DGGE profiles indicated the shift of bacterial population during the aerobic granulation process. *Comamonadaceae* sp., *Leadbetterella* sp. and *Runella* sp. are dominant bacteria that consistently present throughout the granulation process. Distribution of AOB in mature granule was confirmed by FISH technique thus contributing to efficient removal of ammonia in POME of > 80%. Despite the different OLRs, aerobic granular sludge formation was successfully achieved for the treatment of high strength wastewater such as POME.

## ABSTRAK

Minyak sawit digunakan secara meluas di dalam industri pembuatan bahan makanan dan bahan bukan makanan dan juga sebagai bio-bahan api. Penghasilan minyak sawit menghasilkan sejumlah besar sisa pejal dan cecair di dalam bentuk tandan kelapa sawit kosong (EFB) dan air sisa minyak sawit atau ringkasnya *palm oil mill effluent* (POME). Memandangkan POME menyumbang kepada sisa cemar pemprosesan yang tinggi, keperluan untuk mendapatkan pendekatan olahan yang praktikal untuk melindungi alam sekitar adalah penting. Butiran enapcemar aerobik merupakan konsortium yang padat dengan bakteria yang mempunyai kadar olahan airsisa biologi yang tinggi. Kajian ini menjurus kepada pembentukan butiran enapcemar aerobik dengan menggunakan POME sebagai substrat di dalam *sequencing batch reactor* (SBR). Keberkesanan butiran enapcemar aerobik yang terbentuk untuk olahan POME bersesuaian dengan struktur populasi bakteria telah di pantau. Butiran enapcemar aerobik terbentuk pada nisbah pertukaran volumetrik (VER) sebanyak 50% dan kitaran selama 3 jam dan kadar alir sebanyak  $3 \text{ Lm}^{-1}$  di dalam tiga reaktor iaitu R1, R2 dan R3 yang beroperasi pada kadar suapan organik sebanyak 1.5, 2.5 dan  $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ . Keadaan beban kejutan dikenakan secara meningkatkan kadar suapan organik di dalam R2 daripada 2.5 ke  $19 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ . Butiran enapcemar aerobik berjaya dibentuk pada kadar suapan organik sebanyak 2.5 dan  $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ , walaubagaimanapun bioflok kekal mendominasi R1. Pada kadar masukan tinggi, butiran enapcemar aerobik berintegrasi disebabkan had pemindahan jisim di dalam butiran. Saiz purata butiran adalah di antara 1.0 mm hingga 4.0 mm. Pada paras stabil, permintaan oksigen biokimia (COD) adalah melebihi 80% bagi kesemua reaktor walaupun pada kadar masukan yang berbeza. Teknik molekular piawai seperti *polymerase chain reaction-denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis* (PCR-DGGE) dan *fluorescence in situ hybridisation* (FISH) telah digunakan bagi menyelidiki struktur microbial butiran enapcemar aerobik. Purata kebersamaan *Raup dan Crick* yang didapati semasa proses aklimasi/pembutiran dan pematangan butiran enapcemar aerobik adalah  $0.95 \pm 0.02$  dan  $0.72 \pm 0.06$ . Butiran yang matang mempunyai kemampuan enapcemar dan morfologi butiran yang baik berdasarkan paras SVI  $19.9 \text{ mL g}^{-1} \text{ SS}$  pada kadar masukan  $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ . Profil DGGE menunjukkan struktur microbial berubah secara signifikan semasa proses pembutiran. *Comamonadaceae* sp., *Leadbetterella* sp. dan *Runella* sp. telah diperolehi sepanjang proses pembutiran. Pembahagian spatial AOB di dalam butiran enapcemar aerobik juga terbukti melalui FISH yang menyumbang kepada penyingkiran kandungan ammonia di dalam POME yang melebihi 80%. Walaupun pada kadar masukan berbeza, butiran enapcemar aerobik telah berjaya dibentuk untuk perawatan air sisa berkadaran tinggi seperti POME.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	TITLE	PAGE
	DECLARATION	ii
	DEDICATION	iii
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
	ABSTRACT	vi
	ABSTRAK	vii
	TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
	LIST OF TABLES	xiii
	LIST OF FIGURES	xvi
	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xxvi
	LIST OF SYMBOLS	xxix
	LIST OF APPENDICES	xxxi
<b>1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
	1.1 Background of Research	1
	1.2 Objectives of the Study	4
	1.3 Scope of the Study	5
	1.4 Significance of the Study	6
	1.5 Thesis Organization	8
<b>2</b>	<b>LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	<b>9</b>
	2.1 Introduction	9
	2.2 Palm Oil	10

2.3	POME (Palm Oil Mill Effluent)	19
2.4	POME Management	22
	2.4.1 Pond System	23
	2.4.2 Anaerobic Digestion of POME	24
	2.4.3 Aerobic Treatment of POME	29
2.5	Granulation Technology	32
	2.5.1 Sequencing Batch Reactor	34
	2.5.2 Definition of Aerobic Granulation	39
	2.5.3 Factors Affecting the Formation of Aerobic Granular sludge	41
	2.5.3.1 Influence of Feast and Famine Regimes	42
	2.5.3.2 Aggregate Selection by Settling Times	43
	2.5.3.3 Hydrodynamic Shear Force	45
	2.5.3.4 Substrate Composition	46
	2.5.3.5 Organic Loading Rate	48
	2.5.3.6 Aerobic Starvation	49
	2.5.3.7 Dissolved Oxygen (DO)	50
	2.5.3.8 Reactor Configurations	51
	2.5.4 Characteristics of Aerobic Granular Sludge	52
	2.5.4.1 Morphology	52
	2.5.4.2 Settleability	54
	2.5.4.3 Density and Strength	55
	2.5.4.4 Fractal Dimension	57
	2.5.4.5 Microbial Structure	58
	2.5.4.6 Microbial Diversity	59
	2.5.5 Applications of Aerobic Granulation Technology	62
	2.5.5.1 Biological Treatment of Wastewater	62



	2.5.5.2 Nitrogen and Phosphorus Removal	65
<b>3</b>	<b>METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>68</b>
3.1	Introduction	68
	3.1.1 Research Design and Procedure	69
	3.1.2 The Framework and Outline of Study	70
3.2	Experimental Setup	74
3.3	Raw POME and Seed Sludge Sampling	77
3.4	Reactor Maintenance	80
3.5	General Analytical Procedures	81
3.6	Molecular Analyses	83
	3.6.1 DNA Extraction	83
	3.6.2 Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR)	84
	3.6.3 Gel Electrophoresis	85
	3.6.4 Denaturing Gradient Gel Electrophoresis (DGGE)	87
	3.6.5 Basic Local Alignment Search Tool – nucleotide (BLASTn) and Sequencing	88
	3.6.6 Multivariate Statistical Analysis of DGGE Gel	89
3.7	Fluorescence <i>in situ</i> Hybridisation Technique (FISH)	91
	3.7.1 Sampling and Fixation	91
	3.7.2 Microscopes Slide	92
	3.7.3 FISH on Slides Method	93
	3.7.4 Microscopy and AOB Detection	94
3.8	Fractal Dimension Analysis	95
3.9	Morphology Characterisation of Aerobic Granular Sludge Cultivated Using POME	98
	3.9.1 Microscopic Examination using PAX-IT <sup>®</sup>	99
	3.9.2 Field Emission Scanning Electron Microscopy Analysis (FESEM)	99

	3.10 Summary	99
<b>4</b>	<b>FORMATION OF AEROBIC GRANULAR SLUDGE WITH POME</b>	<b>100</b>
	4.1 Introduction	100
	4.2 Preliminary Experimental Results	101
	4.3 Dynamics of SBR	111
	4.4 Development of Aerobic Granular Sludge	114
	4.5 Biomass Profile and Settling Properties	126
	4.6 Reactor Performance and Removal Efficiencies	129
	4.7 Summary	133
<b>5</b>	<b>EFFECT OF VOLUMETRIC ORGANIC LOADING ON AEROBIC GRANULATION</b>	<b>134</b>
	5.1 Introduction	134
	5.2 Formation of Aerobic Granular Sludge using POME at Different OLR	136
	5.3 Size and Fractal Dimension of Aerobic Granular Sludge	144
	5.4 Organic Shock Loading Condition	150
	5.5 Aerobic Granular Sludge for POME Treatment	152
	5.6 Summary	159
<b>6</b>	<b>MICROBIAL CHARACTERIZATION OF AEROBIC GRANULAR SLUDGE</b>	<b>160</b>
	6.1 Introduction	160
	6.2 Identification	162
	6.2.1 PCR Amplification of 16S rRNA Gene	162
	6.2.2 PCR Products Analyzed by Denaturing Gradient Gel Electrophoresis (DGGE)	166
	6.2.3 AOB Community in Aerobic Granular Sludge Cultivated using POME	172

	6.2.4 The Distribution of AOB in Granule by FISH	178
6.3	Microbial Population Dynamics of Aerobic Granular Sludge	180
	6.3.1 Similarity Index	188
6.4	Summary	190
<b>7</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>191</b>
7.1	Conclusions	191
7.2	Recommendations	193
	<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>195</b>

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>TABLE NO.</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
2.1	Six different types of palm oil biomass (Source: Agensi Inovasi Malaysia, 2011)	18
2.2	Characteristics of POME and ASM estimated model parameters	20
2.3	The performance of various experimental studies for POME treatment	28
2.4	Examples of POME effluent qualities from anaerobic treatment studies	29
2.5	Description of the operational steps for the sequencing batch reactor (Adapted from Metcalf and Eddy, 2003)	36
2.6	The governing factors and characteristics of aerobic granular sludge for various studies on aerobic granulation for wastewater treatments	61
2.7	Aerobic granular sludge studies in industrial wastewater	64

3.1	Characteristics of POME	78
3.2	Organic loading rates for feed preparation	79
3.3	Laboratory experiment conditions for SBR reactors	79
3.4	Measurements for reactor monitoring, determination of aerobic granular sludge morphologies and reactor performance	81
3.5	List of all the primers used for the PCR reaction, classified according to the oligonucleotide probe database (Alm <i>et al.</i> , 1996)	85
3.6	Hybridization buffer (Manz <i>et al.</i> , 1992)	94
3.7	Washing buffer (Amann <i>et al.</i> , 1990)	94
4.1	Physical characteristics of POME seeding sludge at day-0	102
4.2	Colony characterization of pure isolates from POME seed sludge	102
4.3	Properties of selected identified bacteria in POME seed sludge	109
5.1	Characteristics of aerobic granular sludge /bioflocs at different organic loading rates	146
5.2	Aerobic granulation process for the treatment of industrial wastewater	158

6.1	Species identification of selected DGGE bands from the seed sludge and aerobic granular sludge cultivated at different OLR	168
6.2	Species identification of selected DGGE bands from the seed sludge and aerobic granular sludge cultivated using POME	174
6.3	Properties of identified bacteria in aerobic granular sludge cultivated using POME	176
6.4	Dice coefficients ( $C_s$ ) comparing the similarities of PCR–DGGE fingerprints from three reactors operated at different OLR (S: seed sludge, R1, R2 and R3: reactors operated at OLRs 1.5, 2.5 and 3.5 kgCOD m <sup>-3</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> , respectively, numbers in bracket indicates sampling time in days)	185
6.5	Dominancy of bacterial V3 region analyses based on Figures 6.3 and 6.5, respectively	187

## LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
2.1	Origin of palm oil. (a) Oil palm trees; (b) Oil palm fruit (Source: <a href="http://palmoil.hubpages.com/hub/palmoil">http://palmoil.hubpages.com/hub/palmoil</a> ; Retrieved on 3 <sup>rd</sup> January 2012)	11
2.2	Examples of palm oil's various usage (Source: <a href="http://www.forbes.com/2009/09/18/palm-oil-marketing-cmo-network-palmoil.html">http://www.forbes.com/2009/09/18/palm-oil-marketing-cmo-network-palmoil.html</a> ; Retrieved on 3 <sup>rd</sup> January 2012)	13
2.3	Process involved in milling of oil palm (Source: Rupani <i>et al.</i> , 2010)	14
2.4	Average composition of FFB (% in dry weight ) (Adapted from: Dany and Eliyan, 2010)	15
2.5	Illustration of crude palm oil milling process at common palm oil mills in Malaysia (Source: <a href="http://plotspalmoil.com/plantations.htm">http://plotspalmoil.com/plantations.htm</a> ; retrieved on 13 <sup>th</sup> March 2012)	16
2.6	The SBR used in the present study for cultivation of aerobic granular sludge using POME	37

2.7	Typical operating sequence for a sequencing batch reactor (Adapted from Metcalf and Eddy, 2003)	38
2.8	Mechanism of aerobic granular sludge formation (Adapted from Beun <i>et al.</i> , 1999)	39
2.9	Photographs of bioflocs and aerobic granular sludge cultivated at different superficial velocity. (a) Bioflocs cultivated at a superficial air upflow velocity of $0.008 \text{ ms}^{-1}$ ; and (b) aerobic granular sludge formed at a superficial air upflow velocity of $0.025 \text{ ms}^{-1}$ (Liu and Tay, 2002)	45
2.10	Micro-photographs of aerobic granular sludge developed using different types of wastewater as substrates. (a) Aerobic granules developed using POME (Abdullah <i>et al.</i> , 2011); (b) Aerobic granules developed using brewery wastewater (Wang <i>et al.</i> , 2007) and (c) Aerobic granules developed using dairy wastewater (Arrojo <i>et al.</i> , 2004)	47
2.11	FESEM image revealed that AGS <sub>p</sub> encompasses smooth and even surface morphology (Dahalan, 2011)	53
2.12	FESEM image revealed that AGS featured an uneven surface and outer morphology (Dahalan, 2011)	54
2.13	Schematic presentation of simultaneous nitrification- denitrification in aerobic granule (Adapted from: Li <i>et al.</i> , 2008)	65
2.13	Conceptual aerobic granular structure indicating various functional zones variation. (Source: Gao <i>et al.</i> , 2011)	66
3.1	Operational study frameworks for aerobic granular sludge formation using POME	71



3.2	Overall study outline	73
3.3	Schematic diagram of operational reactor setup	75
3.4	The SBRs used for aerobic granular sludge development using POME	76
3.5	Imaginary illustration of actual POME ponding system representing raw POME and seed sludge sampling points	77
3.6	Microbial community analysis protocols	84
3.7	Photographs showing PCR products analysis by gel electrophoresis	87
3.8	Exhibit showing an electrophoresis of PCR amplified products on DGGE D-Gene System with marker dyes to indicate when to stop a DGGE run	89
3.9	Sample of a dendrogram showing Raup and Crick similarity indices using the UPGMA cluster analysis method	90
3.10	Photograph of a confocal laser scanning microscope (Axio Vision Version 4.8.1, Germany) used to analyse FISH slides and detect AOB community in aerobic granular sludge samples cultivated using POME	97
3.11	Photograph of the CLSM (Axio Vision Version 4.8.1, Germany) equipped with an Axio Imager Z-2 (Carl Zeiss, Germany) camera used to obtain image analysis of aerobic granular sludge samples	96

3.12	Comparison between; (a) The actual microscopic image of a granule and (b) The binary image of the same granule generated using ImageJ Software (Collins, 2007)	97
4.1	Micrograph of Strain 1 showing moist, slightly raised elevation of irregular colonies with a distinctively glistening surface in milky white pigmentation	103
4.2	Colony morphology of Strain 2 showing dry, flat elevation of round and irregular colonies with glistening surface in light pink. Bacterial filaments were also observed in this sample	104
4.3	Micrograph of Strain 3 showing dry, flat and irregular colonies with smooth surface	104
4.4	Micrograph of Strain 4 indicating a flat elevation and smooth surface in white colour with wrinkled edges colony morphology	105
4.5	Micrograph of Strain 5 indicating a flat elevation and smooth surface in white colour with wrinkled edges colony morphology	105
4.6	Micrograph of Strain 6 showing an irregular shaped colony morphology with glistening surface in milky white colour	106
4.7	Micrograph of gram-positive bacteria from random isolate in POME seeding sludge indicating gram-positive rods (Light microscopy magnification: 1000x)	107

4.8	Micrograph of gram-negative bacteria from Strain 6 in POME seeding sludge indicating gram-negative rods (Light microscopy magnification: 1000x)	108
4.9	SBR bubble column used for the development of aerobic granular sludge using POME	112
4.10	Dynamic process conditions of the SBR used in the present study	113
4.11	Microscopic observation of aerobic granular sludge morphology. Photos were taken using light microscope (Magnification: <200 $\mu\text{m}$ ). (a) Seed sludge exhibited non-clear boundary at day-0 (b) Small brown granules with an average diameter of 1.0 mm sampled at day-20 (c) Aerobic granular sludge with diameters of between 2.0 to 4.0 mm sampled at day-60. (d) Mature aerobic granular sludge at day-60 exhibited a spherical shape with a clear outline boundary	115
4.12	(a) SEM analyses of the sludge used as an inoculum indicated a typical flocculent activated sludge with a comparatively feathery structure surrounded by fluffy edges in which the boundaries of individual particles were generally uneven and unclear, and (b) The surface of a mature aerobic granular sludge with dense microbial composition	116
4.13	The morphology of fresh POME seeding sludge using PAX-IT <sup>®</sup>	117

4.14	SEM examinations of mature aerobic granular sludge. (a) The morphology of a mature granule at day-60 of operation; (b) Surface of mature granule	118
4.15	Different layers accommodating the surface of an aerobic granular sludge for simultaneous nitrification-denitrification process	120
4.16	Scanning electron micrograph of aerobic granular sludge developed using POME indicating clusters of cocci on granule surface (Magnification: 25,000x)	121
4.17	Aerobic granular sludge developed using POME also showing domination of rod-shaped bacteria (size ~ 300 – 500 nm) that are tightly linked and embedded via EPS (Magnification: 5,000x)	122
4.18	The surface of the granule is layered with some glue-like substances (Magnification: 500x)	124
4.19	Cavities found on aerobic granular sludge developed using POME resembling a channel-like structure (Magnification: 10,000x)	125
4.20	Cavities are likely filled with EPS substances which acts as cohesive material maintaining the bounds between bacterial cells and colonies (Magnification: 5,000k)	126
4.21	The steady increase in biomass concentrations in SBR used in the present study (○) MLSS concentration; (●) MLVSS concentration.	127

4.22	The trends of the concentration of reactor MLSS in the reactor and the SVI values of the aerobic granules (○) MLSS concentration; (▲) SVI	129
4.23	Profile of COD removal performances of the SBR system. (Δ) Percentage removal; (○) Effluent; (●) Influent	130
4.24	Profile of ammonia removal performances of the SBR system. (Δ) Percentage removal; (○) Effluent; (●) Influent	131
4.25	Profile of colour removal performances of the SBR system. (Δ) Percentage removal; (○) Effluent; (●) Influent	132
5.1	The change of biomass concentration in SBR at different OLRs, respectively. (●) 2.5 kgCOD m <sup>-3</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ; (○) 3.5 kgCOD m <sup>-3</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ; (▲) 1.5 kgCOD m <sup>-3</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>	137
5.2	Evolution of aerobic granular sludge morphology in R2; (a) seed sludge obtained from POME facultative pond; (b) after day-10; (c) after day-17 and (d) mature granules after day-60 of SBR operation. (Scale bar represents 1 mm)	138
5.3	The MLVSS concentrations in SBRs at different OLR respectively. (●) 2.5 kgCOD m <sup>-3</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ; (○) 3.5 kgCOD m <sup>-3</sup> d <sup>-1</sup> ; (▲) 1.5 kgCOD m <sup>-3</sup> d <sup>-1</sup>	140
5.4	Aerobic granular sludge developed using POME dominating reactor content at the end of experiments	141

5.5	Microscopic photographs of the seed sludge and mature granules in the SBRs; (a) activated seed sludge on day-0; (b) bioparticles in R1; (c) aerobic granular sludge in R2 and (d) aerobic granular sludge in R3 after day-60 of experiment	142
5.6	SEM examination of a mature aerobic granular sludge featuring a porous structural morphology	147
5.7	Fractal dimension vs size profile for aerobic granular sludge indicating an almost linear relationship between fractal dimension and equivalent diameter of less than 700 $\mu\text{m}$	148
5.8	SVI vs size of aerobic granular sludge profile indicating good and positive association of two important parameters of granules	149
5.9	(a) Micrograph of aerobic granular sludge cultivated on day-60 at OLR $2.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ as compared to (b) disintegration of granule at OLR $19 \text{ kgCODm}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$	151
5.10	Profile of COD removal efficiencies in reactors (●) $2.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ; (○) $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ; (▲) $1.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$	153
5.11	Profile of COD removal efficiencies in R2 during shock load conditions at $19 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$	154
5.12	Profile of ammonia and color removal efficiencies in reactors R2 and R3, respectively. Ammonia removals at (●) $2.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ; (○) $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ; Color removals at (▲) $2.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ (Δ) $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$	156

6.1	PCR products of aerobic granular sludge cultivated using POME	164
6.2	PCR products of aerobic granular sludge cultivated using POME	165
6.3	DGGE profiles of the bacterial communities in the three SBRs namely R1 (OLR $1.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ), R2 (OLR $2.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ) and R3 (OLR $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ) during the aerobic granulation process. The band references are tabulated in Table 6.1. (MG: <i>Mature Granule</i> ; <i>a, b, c, d, e</i> indicates operation at day - 17, 21, 31, 35 and 41, respectively)	167
6.4	Scanning electron micrograph of cocci-colonies possibly <i>Trichococcus</i> sp. found on mature aerobic granular sludge surface (Magnification: 1000x)	174
6.5	DGGE profiles of the AOB communities in the three SBRs namely R1, R2 and R3 for mature aerobic granular sludge cultivated at day-60. The band references are tabulated in Table 6.2. (OLR is in $\text{kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ ). Species identification of selected bands is also tabulated in Table 6.2	173
6.6	The distribution of AOB in aerobic granular sludge after in situ hybridization with a Cy3-labelled probe NSO1225. (a) AOB colonies in aerobic granule developed at OLR $2.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ and (b) AOB colonies in aerobic granule developed at OLR $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$	178

- 6.7 Dendrogram showing Raup-Crick similarity between microbial communities collected from the various state of aerobic granular sludge formation using POME (MG: *Mature Granule*; *a, b, c, d, e* indicates operation at day- 17, 21, 31, 35 and 41, respectively) 180
- 6.8 Dendrogram generated using BioNumerics® software indicating similar cluster observation based on DGGE profiles of aerobic granular sludge samples (MG: *Mature Granule*; *a, b, c, d, e* indicates operation at day- 17, 21, 31, 35 and 41, respectively) 181
- 6.9 Raup and Crick similarity index calculated from the DGGE profiles. The labelled data points refer to (a) Pure seed sludge originated from POME; (b) Bioflocs obtained at OLR 1.5 kgCOD m<sup>-3</sup>d<sup>-1</sup>; (c) Mature granules obtained at OLR 3.5 kgCOD m<sup>-3</sup>d<sup>-1</sup>; (d) Mature granules obtained at OLR 2.5kgCOD m<sup>-3</sup>d<sup>-1</sup> 189



## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AGS	-	Aerobic granular sludge
AGS <sub>p</sub>	-	Photosynthetic aerobic granular sludge
AIM	-	Agensi Inovasi Malaysia
AN	-	Ammoniacal nitrogen
AOB	-	Ammonia oxidizing bacteria
APHA	-	American Public Health Association
BAS	-	Biofilm airlift suspension
BLAST <sub>n</sub>	-	Basic Local Alignment Search Tool - nucleotide
BOD	-	Biochemical oxygen demand
CDM	-	Clean development mechanism
CER	-	Certified emission reduction
CLSM	-	Confocal laser scanning microscopy
COD	-	Chemical oxygen demand
CSTR	-	Continuous stirred tank reactor
DGGE	-	Denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis
DNA	-	Deoxyribonucleic acid
DO	-	Dissolved oxygen
DOE	-	Department of Environment
EBPR	-	Enhanced biological phosphorus removal
EDM	-	Euclidean distance map
EDTA	-	Ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid
EPS	-	Extracellular polymeric substances
EQA	-	Environmental Quality Act
FA	-	Formamide

FFB	-	Fresh fruit bunches
FISH	-	Fluorescence <i>in situ</i> Hybridization
HB	-	Hybridisation buffer
HRT	-	Hydraulic retention time
MLSS	-	Mixed liquor suspended solid
MLVSS	-	Mixed liquor volatile suspended solid
MPOB	-	Malaysian Palm Oil Board
NMDS	-	Non metric multidimensional scaling
OLR	-	Organic loading rate
PAO	-	Polyphosphate-accumulating bacteria
PBS	-	Phosphate buffered saline
PCR	-	Polymerase chain reaction
PFA	-	Paraformaldehyde
POME	-	Palm oil mill effluent
PORE	-	Palm oil refinery effluent
RNA	-	Ribonucleic acid
SBAR	-	Sequencing batch airlift reactor
SBR	-	Sequencing batch reactor
SDS	-	Sodium dodecyl sulphate
SEM	-	Scanning electron microscopy
SRT	-	Sludge retention time
SS	-	Suspended solid
SVI	-	Sludge volume index
TAE	-	Tris-acetate-EDTA
TEMED	-	Tetramethylethylenediamine
TN	-	Total nitrogen
TSS	-	Total suspended solid
UASB	-	Up-flow anaerobic sludge blanket
UASFF	-	Up-flow anaerobic sludge fixed-film
UFF	-	Up-flow fixed film
UPGMA	-	Unweighted pair group method with Arithmetic Mean
UTM	-	Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

UV	-	Ultraviolet
VER	-	Volumetric exchange rate
WB	-	Washing buffer
16s rRNA	-	16 Sequencing Ribosomal Ribonucleic Acid

## LIST OF SYMBOLS

$b(S)$	-	gray-levels distribution
$\text{Ca}^{2+}$	-	calcium
$\text{CaCO}_3$	-	calcium carbonate
$\text{CO}_2$	-	carbon dioxide ( $\text{mgL}^{-1}$ or $\text{mmolL}^{-1}$ )
$\text{COD}_{\text{feed}}$	-	substrate strength in terms of COD concentration ( $\text{mgL}^{-1}$ )
CTO654r	-	reverse AOB specific primer
CTO189f	-	forward AOB specific primer
ddH <sub>2</sub> O	-	double sterile water
$D_f$	-	fractal dimension
H/D	-	column height to diameter ratio (mm)
$\text{K}_2\text{HPO}_4$	-	dipotassium phosphate
$\text{Mg}^{2+}$	-	magnesium
$\text{MgCl}_2$	-	magnesium chloride
$M_w$	-	molecular weight
N	-	nitrogen ( $\text{mgL}^{-1}$ )
NaCl	-	sodium chloride (mL)
NaOH	-	sodium hydroxide
$\text{NH}_4\text{Cl}$	-	ammonium chloride
$\text{NH}_4\text{-N}$	-	ammonia
P	-	phosphorus ( $\text{mgL}^{-1}$ )
$\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$	-	phosphate
P/COD	-	phosphorus to chemical oxygen demand ratio
$P(S)$	-	perimeter
Q	-	substrate flow rate ( $\text{Ld}^{-1}$ )

$SS_0$	-	total amount of granular sludge
$SS_t$	-	amount of sludge solids in supernatant after $t$ min
$T$	-	temperature ( $^{\circ}\text{C}$ )
Tris-HCL	-	tris-sodium hydrochloride
$V_r$	-	reverse PCR primer
$V_f$	-	forward PCR primer
$V_r$	-	working volume of reactor ( $L$ )
$V_{\text{pome}}$	-	volume of POME (mL)
$V_{\text{tapwater}}$	-	volume of tap water (mL)
$V_s$	-	settling velocity of a particle
$\xi$	-	integrity coefficient
$d_p$	-	diameter of a particle
$\mu$	-	viscosity of a solution
$\rho_p$	-	density of a particle
$\rho$	-	density of a solution

**LIST OF APPENDICES**

<b>APPENDIX</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
A	List of proceedings and publications	226

## **CHAPTER 1**

### **INTRODUCTION**

#### **1.1 Background of Research**

Oil palm is the most important agro-based crop of Malaysia. Malaysia's palm oil plantations are spread out across both Peninsular and East Malaysia. The total acreage under cultivation grew from 3.38 hectares in 2008 to 4.85 million hectares in 2010 (MPOB, 2011). Palm oil is widely used for food and non-food manufacturing industries and as a biofuel. However, the production of palm oil generates a large amount of solid and liquid wastes in the form of empty fruit bunch (EFB) and palm oil mill effluent (POME), respectively. Malaysia's palm oil industry produced almost 80 million dry tonnes of solid biomass per annum (Agensi Inovasi Malaysia, 2011). This volume is projected to increase to 85 – 110 million dry tonnes by 2020. Similarly, POME volumes are expected to increase from 60 million tonnes today to 70 – 110 million tonnes by 2020. In the year 2008 at least 44 million tonnes of POME was generated in Malaysia and the number is expected to increase in subsequent year (Wu *et al.*, 2010).

Direct discharge of POME into the environment is legally prohibited due to the high chemical oxygen demand (COD) and biological oxygen demand (BOD<sub>5</sub>) concentrations of up to 50,000 mgL<sup>-1</sup> and 25,000 mgL<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. Furthermore the Department of Environment (DOE) Malaysia has enacted the effluent discharge standards which requires POME to be treated prior to discharging into the receiving watercourses. The untreated POME is to comply with legislation limits of BOD<sub>5</sub> of 20 mgL<sup>-1</sup> for Standard A as outlined in the Fifth Schedule Paragraph 11(1) (a) Environmental Quality (Industrial Effluents) Regulations 2009 (Federal Subsidiary Legislation, 1974). The new regulations also outlined the effluent discharge standard to comply with color discharge of 100 ADML. Therefore, color removal is fast becoming an important research parameter related to industrial wastewater treatments. Additionally, in recent years, the significance of technological improvements in handling of residues from palm oil production compared to conventional practices are also being increasingly addressed through application of life cycle assessment (LCA) tools (Hansen *et al.*, 2012).

Conventional ponding systems have been the most popular method used for more than 85% of the palm oil mills in Malaysia in 1980s (Ma *et al.*, 1993). However, the introduction of a more compact, mechanical and efficient system has been widespread since 2008 following the implementation of the new effluent discharge standard of BOD<sub>5</sub> of 20 mgL<sup>-1</sup> as described above. Novel POME treatment methods have since been proposed including anaerobic treatment technologies and high-rate anaerobic digesters (Poh and Chong, 2009; Damayanti *et al.*, 2009; Ujang and Buckley, 2002).

Activated sludge reactor is generally the most common alternative for aerobic system as post-treatment following anaerobic digestions to overcome the area limitation of conventional pond systems. There are several positive outlooks towards the implementation of activated sludge processes in Malaysia particularly its compatibility and technical availability to convert from ponds to activated sludge. The activated sludge reactors are also relatively simple to handle or operate. With the knowledge and skills available in Malaysia, particularly in sewage and industrial



wastewater, thus activated sludge became an indigenous technology in Malaysia. Vijayaraghavan *et al.* (2007) investigated the treatment of POME using aerobic oxidation which indicates the effectiveness of aerobic oxidation for diluted POME having corresponding COD of  $3925 \text{ mgL}^{-1}$ , based on an activated sludge process. Chan *et al.* (2010) further investigated the aerobic treatment of anaerobically digested POME by using a lab-scale sequencing batch reactor (SBR) and found a maximum of COD (95-96%) and BOD (97-98%) removal efficiencies were achieved at optimum OLR and MLVSS concentration ranging from 1.8 to  $4.2 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$  and 22,000 to  $25,000 \text{ mgL}^{-1}$ , respectively. However, the present knowledge and expertise in activated sludge process is limited to disperse sludge configurations. Recent development of this technology has been forming a more compact formation of activated sludge which is termed as granulation.

Granulation was first achieved for methanogenic sludge in upflow anaerobic sludge blanket (UASB) reactors (Lettinga *et al.*, 1980). Although granulation technology has been applied and investigated in the anaerobic treatment of wastewater over the past decades, aerobic granulation is still a relatively new technology. Aerobic granulation technology has been widely used in various formulations (Arrojo *et al.*, 2004; Wang *et al.*, 2007a; Kishida *et al.*, 2009). Most studies on aerobic granulation were developed in SBR systems (Morgenroth *et al.*, 1997; Beun *et al.*, 1999; Qin *et al.*, 2004; Schwarzenbeck *et al.*, 2005; Wang *et al.*, 2007). Research on aerobic granulation has mainly focused on the mechanism of granule formation using synthetic wastes (Morgenroth *et al.*, 1997; Tay *et al.*, 2001a; Tsuneda *et al.*, 2003; de Kreuk and van Loosdrecht, 2006).

For bacteria to form aerobic granules, the contributions of physical, chemical and biological conditions to the granulation process should be collectively considered. A number of factors such as the type of substrate, the loading rate, aeration intensity, and the hydraulic retention time have been previously reported to have influence on the sludge granulation process (Liu and Tay, 2002; Liu and Tay, 2004). However, several other issues regarding aerobic granulation in real

wastewater such as the mechanism, crucial operating factors and evolution of the microbial community remain to be addressed.

## **1.2 Objectives of the Study**

Granules are known as a collection of self-immobilized cells into a spherical form or shape. Aerobic granules are generally acknowledged to have a wide range of beneficial properties when compared to conventional activated sludge flocs i.e. strong structure, good settling property, ability to withstand high organic loading rate. Despite numerous literatures dealing with the development of aerobic granular sludge formation, most of these studies were reported on the microbial aggregation using mainly synthetic wastewater as influent. To date, very little studies reported on the development of aerobic granular sludge formation using industrial wastewater which essentially led to several questions about the formation of aerobic granular sludge using POME.

The present study is regarded as the first study dedicated to the development of aerobic granular sludge with special emphasis on utilization of POME as substrates. The main objectives of this study were to investigate the development and microbial characterizations of aerobic granular sludge using POME. Additionally, this study aimed to provide a solid recommendation towards the implementation of aerobic granulation for sustainable and efficient industrial wastewater treatment technologies.

The specific objectives of the experimental study are as follows:

- i. To develop aerobic granular sludge using POME. This will be the first study on aerobic granulation utilizing POME as the main substrate;

- ii. To determine the physical and microbial characteristics of aerobic granular sludge developed using POME from the perspective of standard experimental tools i.e. fractal dimension and molecular investigations including FISH and DGGE;
- iii. To analyze the diversity and evolutionary shift of bacterial population in POME seed sludge during aerobic granulation process. The role of selected bacterial species in the formation of mature granules is proposed;
- iv. To investigate the potential application of aerobic granulation technology as an alternative and/or post treatment options for POME.

### 1.3 Scope of the Study

The present study focused on the development and microbial characterization of aerobic granular sludge using POME. In general, POME is a liquid by-product from sterilization and milling process of fresh fruit bunch (FFB) and accumulates as a liquid waste at the mills. The granulation process was reported in terms of the morphology and settling ability of the cultivated aerobic granular sludge in POME. Reactor performances were observed based on the COD, ammonia and color removal efficiencies during granulation and maturation phases of the granules. The effects of organic loading rate on the aerobic granular sludge formation were investigated by providing different volumetric organic loading of POME ranging from  $1.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$  to  $3.5 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$ . A shock load condition was tested for reactor performance by sudden increase of OLR from 2.5 to  $19 \text{ kgCOD m}^{-3}\text{d}^{-1}$  upon mature granule formation. The investigations also included laboratory tests on the evolution of bacterial population and characterization of bacterial community by using novel molecular techniques including FISH and DGGE which was conducted at Newcastle University, England. The correlation

between the bacterial community structure and aerobic granulation was validated using multivariate statistical analysis.

#### **1.4 Significance of the Study**

As available space for existing palm oil treatment plant is often limited, more compact treatment systems have been developed to avoid large footprints such as membrane bioreactors (Ujang and Anderson, 1996; Ujang and Anderson, 2000; Ujang *et al.* 2007), biofilm systems (Hall, 1987; Gebara, 1999; Kargi and Eker, 2003; Mohan *et al.*, 2007; Mohan *et al.*, 2008; Lai *et al.*, 2009) and aerobic granular sludge technology (Beun *et al.*, 2000; Tay *et al.*, 2004; de Kreuk and van Loosdrecht, 2006; Anuar *et al.*, 2007; Sunil *et al.*, 2008). Several significant issues are identified to give benefits to this study as follows:

- i. POME is a highly polluted source of wastewater to water body. An efficient and practical approach for POME treatment is essential to fulfil the requirements for zero discharge and cleaner production as outlined in the National Biomass Strategy Report 2020 (Agensi Inovasi Malaysia, 2011).
- ii. As palm oil represents the second largest export of Malaysia, the large amount of palm oil residues resulting from the harvest particularly POME must be managed in a manner that also addresses environmental concerns related to the current POME treatment methods. Aerobic granulation is therefore proposed as an alternative and/or post-treatment method for sustainable and efficient POME treatment strategy.

- iii. Aerobic granular sludge is widely known to have several beneficial engineering properties i.e. strong and dense microstructure, ability to withstand high organic loading rates, stable and compact shape making it an increasingly popular choice for recent wastewater treatment methods over the conventional activated sludge methods. This study is regarded as the first study constituting aerobic granular sludge development using POME activated sludge as seeding and raw POME as the main substrate.
- iv. Since aerobic granular sludge has been extensively developed using SBR, similar technical approach is used for developing aerobic granular sludge using POME. Several modifications were made to tailor the mechanical acquisition of reactors applicable for POME treatment. From Malaysian perspective as the second largest producer of palm oil in the world, aerobic granular sludge is a promising technology for dealing with the continuous production of liquid wastes at the mills due to its space saving and compactness of reactor specification.
- v. This study brings forward an additional concept of cleaner production in activated sludge system by promoting adaptation of aerobic granulation for better effluent quality in POME treatments. By using the SBR, intermittent feast-famine operation will provide the most suitable environment for the growth of microorganisms promoting aerobic granular sludge formation.
- vi. The molecular investigations of aerobic granular sludge provides basic understanding in the microbial evolution of the granules developed using POME to further strengthen aerobic granulation technique specifically designed for efficient and sustainable POME treatments.

## 1.5 Thesis Organization

This thesis is organized into seven chapters. **Chapter 2** provides an overview of relevant literature and covers basic principles of characteristics and treatment of POME, granulation technology in comparison to a conventional activated sludge system and aerobic granulation technology. The granulation process in SBR reactors is also described. This chapter gives the characteristics and properties of aerobic granular sludge and the relation to its chemical, physico-chemical, biological properties, and various applications. Several parameters governing aerobic granular sludge formation were briefly explained. The sequencing batch reactor (SBR) technology was used in order to achieve successful aerobic granular sludge formation.

**Chapter 3** describes the laboratory equipments and general experimental procedures including wastewater feed, nutrients and sludge used in the present study. The reactor start-up procedures, operational conditions and molecular analyses used in the present study are also described in this chapter.

**Chapters 4, 5 and 6** present the results and discussions of this study. The results are divided into three main chapters; (a) the development of aerobic granular sludge using POME; (b) the effects of organic loading rates on aerobic granulation and (c) bacterial community and structure analyses of aerobic granular sludge developed using POME.

The conclusions from this research are given in **Chapter 7**, stating specific achievement, problems and recommendations. General conclusions are also drawn from the experiences gained during this study, the wider implications of the results and some recommendations for future work.

## REFERENCES

- Abdullah, N., Ujang, Z. and Yahya, A. (2011). Aerobic granular sludge formation for high strength agro-based wastewater treatment. *Bioresource Technology*. 102, 6778-6781.
- Abraham, J.M. and Simon, G.L. (2007). Comamonas testosterone bacteremia: A case report and review of the literature. *Infectious Diseases in Clinical Practice*. 15, 272-273.
- Adav, S.S., Yuen, M.Y., Lee, D.J. and Ren, N.Q. (2008). Degradation of phenol by Acinetobacter strain isolated from aerobic granules. *Chemosphere*. 67, 1566-1572.
- Adav, S.S., Lee, D.J. and Lai, J.Y. (2009). Aerobic granulation in sequencing batch reactors at different settling times. *Bioresource Technology*. 100, 5359-5361.
- Adav, S.S., Lee, D.J. and Lai, J.Y. (2010). Microbial community of acetate utilizing denitrifiers in aerobic granules. *Environmental Biotechnology*. 85, 753-762.
- Agamuthu, P. and Tan, E.L. (1985). Digestion of dried palm oil mill effluent by Cellulomonas species. *Microbiology Letters*. 30, 109-113.
- Agensi Inovasi Malaysia (2011). National Biomass Strategy 2020: New wealth creation for Malaysia's palm oil industry.

- Ahmad A.L., Ismail, S and Bhatia, S. (2003). Water recycling from palm oil mill effluent. *Desalination*. 157, 87-95.
- Ahmad A.L., Ismail, S and Bhatia, S. (2005). Membrane Treatment for Palm Oil Mill Effluent: Effect of Transmembrane Pressure and Crossflow Velocity. *Desalination*. 179, 245-255.
- Ahmad, A.L., Chong, M.F. and Bhatia, S. (2009). A Comparative Study on the Membrane Based Palm Oil Mill Effluent (POME) Treatment Plant. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*. 171, 166-174.
- Ahn, Y.H. and Kim, H.C. (2004). Nutrient removal and microbial granulation in an anaerobic process treating inorganic and organic nitrogenous wastewater. *Water, Science and Technology*. 50, 207-215.
- Alves, M., Cavaleiro, A.J., Ferreira, E.C., Amaral, A.L., Mota, M., da Motta, M., Vivier, H. and Pons, M.N. (2000). Characterisation by image analysis of anaerobic sludge under shock conditions. *Water, Science and Technology*. 41, 207-214.
- Amann, R.I., Krumholz, L. and Stahl, D.A. (1990). Fluorescent-oligonucleotide probing of whole cells for determinative, phylogenetic, and environmental studies in microbiology. *Journal Bacteriology*. 172, 762-770.
- APHA, (2005). *Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater*. American Public Health Association. Washington, DC.
- Arrojo, B., Mosquera-Corral, A., Garrido, J.M. and Mendez, R. (2004). Aerobic Granulation with Industrial Wastewater in Sequencing Batch Reactors. *Water Research*. 38 (14-15), 3389-3399.



- Bachman, A., Beard, V.L. and McCarty, P.L. (1985). Performance characteristics of the anaerobic baffled reactor. *Water Research*. 19, 99-106.
- Baharaddin, A.S., Wakisaka, M., Shirai, Y., Abd-Aziz, S., Rahman, A.A., and Hassan, M.A. (2009). Co-composting of Empty Fruit Bunches and Partially Treated Palm Oil Mill Effluents in Pilot Scale. *International Journal Agriculture Research*. 4, 69-78.
- Barker, T.W. and Worgan, J.T. (1981). The utilization of palm oil processing effluents as substrates for microbial protein production by the fungus *Aspegillusoryzae*. *European Journal of Applied Microbiology Biotechnonology*. 11, 234-240.
- Barbusiński K. and Kościelniak. (1995). Influence of substrate loading intensity on floc size in activated sludge process. *Water Research*. 29(7), 1703-1710.
- Basiron, Y., Jalani, B.S. and Chan, K.W. (2000). *Advances in oil palm research*. Malaysian Palm Oil Board, Ministry of Primary Industries, Malaysia.
- Bassin, J.P., Winkler, M.K.H., Kleerebezem, R., Dezotti, M. and van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. (2012). Improved phosphate removal by selective sludge discharge in aerobic granular sludge reactors. *Accepted in Biotechnology and Bioengineering*.
- Bathe, S., de Kreuk, M., McSwain, B. and Schwarzenbeck, N. (2005). *Aerobic Granular Sludge*. IWA Publishing, London.
- Batstone, D.J. and Keller, J. (2001). Variation of Bulk Properties of Anaerobic Granules With Wastewater Type. *Water Research*. 35(7), 1723-1729.
- Bellouti, M., Alves, M.M., Novais, J.M. and Mota, M. (1997). Flocs vs granules: Differentiation by fractal dimension. *Water Research*. 31, 1227-1231.

- Belluci, M. and Curtis, T.P. (2011). *Ammonia-oxidizing Bacteria in Wastewater*. In: Methods in Enzymology. Volume 496, Research on Nitrification and Related Processes, Part B. Edited by Martin, G. Klotz and Lisa, Y. Stein.
- Benson, D.A., Karsch-Mizrachi, I., Lipman, D.J., Ostell, J. and Wheeler, D.L. (2008). GenBank. *Nucleic Acids Research*. 36, 25-30.
- Bergey, D.H. and Holt, J.G. (2000). *Bergey's Manual of Determinative Bacteriology*, 9<sup>th</sup> Edition. USA: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Beun, J.J., Hendriks, A., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Morgenroth, E., Wilderer, P.A. and Heijnen, J.J. (1999). Aerobic Granulation in a Sequencing Batch Reactor. *Water Research*. 33(10), 2283-2290.
- Beun, J.J., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M and Heijnen, J.J. (2000). Aerobic Granulation. *Water Science Technology*. 41, 41-48.
- Beun, J.J., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M and Heijnen, J.J. (2001). N-Removal in a Granular Sludge Sequencing Batch Airlift Reactor. *Biotechnology and Bioengineering*. 75, 82-92.
- Beun, J.J., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. and Heijnen, J.J. (2002). Aerobic Granulation in a Sequencing Batch Airlift Reactor. *Water Research*. 36, 702-712.
- Bin, Z., Min, J., Zhigang, Q., Huina, L., Jingfeng, W. and Junwen, L. (2011). Microbial Population Dynamics During Sludge Granulation in An Anaerobic-Aerobic Biological Phosphorus Removal System. *Bioresource Technology*. 102, 2474-2480.
- Borja, R. and Banks, C.J. (1994a). Anaerobic digestion of palm oil mill effluent using an up-flow anaerobic sludge blanket reactor. *Biomass and Bioenergy*. 6, 381-389.

- Borja, R. and Banks, C.J. (1994b). Treatment of palm oil mill effluent by upflow anaerobic filtration. *Journal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology*. 61, 103-109.
- Borja, R. and Banks, C.J. (1994c). Comparison of an Anaerobic Filter and an Anaerobic Fluidized Bed Reactor Treating Palm Oil Mill Effluent. *Process Biochemistry*. 30, 511-521.
- Borja, R. and Banks, C.J. (1995a). Response of an anaerobic fluidized bed reactor treating ice-cream wastewater to organic, hydraulic, temperature and pH shocks. *Journal of Biotechnology*. 39, 251-259.
- Borja, R., Alba, J. and Banks, C.J. (1996). Anaerobic digestion of wash waters derived from the purification of virgin olive oil using a hybrid reactor combining a filter and a sludge blanket. *Process Biochemistry*. 31, 219-224.
- Bossier, P. and Verstraete, W. (1996). Triggers for microbial aggregation in activated sludge. *Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology*. 45, 1-6.
- Cassidy, D.P. and Belia, E. (2005). Nitrogen and phosphorus removal from an abattoir wastewater in a SBR with aerobic granular sludge. *Water Research*. 39, 4817-4823.
- Chan, Y.J., Chong, M.F., Law, C.L. and Hassell, D.G. (2009). A review on anaerobic-aerobic treatment of industrial and municipal wastewater. *Chemical Engineering Journal*. 155, 1-18.
- Chan, Y.J., Chong, M.F. and Law, C.L. (2010). Biological Treatment of Anaerobically Digested Palm Oil Mill Effluent (POME) Using a Lab-Scale Sequencing Batch Reactor (SBR). *Journal of Environmental Management*. 91, 1738-1746.

- Chavalparit, O. (2006). Clean Technology for the Crude Palm Oil Industry in Thailand. PhD Thesis: Wageningen University. ISBN 90-8504-446-4.
- Chiesa, S.C., Irvive, R.L. and Manning, J.F. (1985). Feast/famine growth environments and activated sludge population selection. *Biotechnology and Bioengineering*. 27, 562-568.
- Chin, K.K., Lee, S.W. and Mohammad, H.H. (1996). A study of palm oil mill effluent treatment using a pond system. *Water Science Technology*. 34, 119-123.
- Chin, K.K., Ng, W.J. and Ma, A.N. (1987). Palm oil refinery effluent treatment by sequencing batch reactors. *Biological Wastes*. 20, 101-109.
- Collins, T.J. (2007). ImageJ for microscopy. *BioTechniques*. 43, S25-S30.
- Curtis, T.P. and Craine, N.G. (1998). The comparison of the diversity of activated sludge plants. *Water Science and Technology* 37, 71–78.
- Dahalan, F.A. (2011). *Development of Photosynthetic Aerobic Granular Sludge*. Ph.D. Dissertation. Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Johor Bahru. Malaysia.
- Damayanti, A., Ujang, Z., Salim, M.R., Olsson, G. and Sulaiman, A.Z. (2010). Respirometric analysis of activated sludge models from palm oil mill effluent. *Bioresource Technology*. 101, 144-149.
- Damayanti, A., Ujang, Z. and Salim, M.R. (2011). The influenced of PAC, zeolite, and *Moringa oleifera* as biofouling reducer (BFR) on hybrid membrane bioreactor of palm oil mill effluent (POME). *Bioresource Technology*. 102, 4341-4346.

- da Motta, M., Pons, M-N., Roche, N. and Vivier, H. (2001). Characterisation of activated sludge by automated image analysis. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 9, 165-173.
- Dangcong, P., Bernet, N., Delgenes, J.P. and Moletta, R. (1999). Aerobic granular sludge – A case report. *Water Research*. 33, 890-893.
- Dany, V. and Eliyan, C. (2010). Wastewater Treatment Practices: A Case Study on Large Scale Cassava, Palm Oil, and Ethanol Factories in Cambodia (Source: [www.rupp.edu.kh/.../Report\\_on\\_Agro\\_processing\\_factory\\_final.pdf](http://www.rupp.edu.kh/.../Report_on_Agro_processing_factory_final.pdf). Retrieved on 9th January 2012)
- Davenport, R.J. and Curtis, T.P. (2002). Are filamentous mycolata important if foaming? *Water, Science and Technology*. 46, 529-533.
- Davenport, R.J. (2011). Molecular Microbial Ecology. Environmental Engineering Laboratory Manual. Newcastle University. (Unpublished).
- De Beer, D., Heuvel, J.C. and Van den Ottengraf, S.P.P. (1993). Microelectrode measurements of the activity distribution in nitrifying bacterial aggregates. *Appl. Env. Microbiol.* 59 (2), 573-579.
- de Bruin, L.M.M., de Kreuk, M.K., van der Roest, H.F.R., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. and Uijterlinde, C. (2004). Aerobic Granular Sludge Technology, Alternative for Activated Sludge Technology? *Water Science and Technology*. 49 (11-12), 1-9.
- de Kreuk, M.K., McSwain, B.S., Bathe, S., Tay, S.T.L., Schwarzenbeck, N. and Wilderer, P.A. (2005a). Discussion outcomes. Ede. In: Aerobic Granular Sludge. Water and Environmental Management Series. IWA Publishing. Munich. 165-169.

- de Kreuk, M.K., Heijnen, J.J. and van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. (2005b) Simultaneous COD, Nitrogen and Phosphate removal by Aerobic Granular Sludge. *Biotechnology Bioengineering*. 90(6), 761-769.
- de Kreuk, M.K., Pronk, M. and van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., (2005c). Formation of Aerobic Granules and Conversion Processes in an Aerobic Granular Sludge Reactor at Moderate and Low Temperatures. *Water Research*. 39, 4476-4484.
- de Kreuk, M.K. and van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. (2006). Formation of Aerobic Granules with Domestic Sewage. *Journal of Environmental Engineering*. 132, 694-697.
- De Lucas, A., Rodriguez, L., Villaseñor, J., Fernandez, F.J., 2007. Influence of industrial discharges on the performance and population of a biological nutrient removal process. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 34, 51–61.
- Dignac, M.-F., Urbain, V., Rybacki, D., Bruchet, A., Shidaro, D. and Scribe, P. (1998). Chemical description of extracellular polymers: implication on activated sludge floc structure. *Water Science and Technology*. 38, 45–53.
- Ding, B., Schmeling, S. and Fuchs, G. (2008). Anaerobic metabolism of catechol by the denitrifying bacterium *Thauera aromatica* – A result of promiscuous enzymes and regulators? *Journal of Bacteriology*. 190, 1620-1630.
- Doronina, N.V., Trotsenko, Y.A., Kolganova, T.V., Tourova, T.P. and Salkinoja-Salonen, M.S. (2004). *Methylobacillus pratensis* sp. Nov., a novel non-pigmented, aerobic, obligately methylotrophic bacterium isolated from meadow grass. *International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology*. 54, 1453-1457.
- Eichner, C.A., Erb, R.W., Timmis, K.N. and Wagner-Dobler, I. (1999). Thermal gradient gel electrophoresis analysis of bioprotection. *Applied Environment Microbiology*. 65, 102-109.

- El-Mamouni, R., Guiot, S.R., Leduc, R. and Costerton, J.W. (1995). Characterization of different microbial nuclei as potential precursors of anaerobic granulation. *Journal of Biotechnology*. 39, 239-249.
- Erguder, T.H. and Demirer, G.N. (2005). Investigation of a mixture of suspended anaerobic and aerobic cultures under alternating anaerobic/microaerobic/aerobic conditions. *Process Biochemistry*. 40, 3732-3741.
- Fang, C., O-Thong, S., Boe, K. and Angelidaki, I. (2011). Comparison of UASB and EGSB reactors performance, for treatment of raw and deoiled palm oil mill effluent (POME). *Journal of Hazardous Materials*. 189, 229-234.
- Federal Subsidiary Legislation-Environmental Quality Act 1974. [ACT 127] Environmental Quality (Sewage and Industrial Effluents) Regulation 1979. [Online] (Available: <http://www.doe.gov.my>)
- Feng, W., Si-Qing, X., Yi, L., Xue-song, C. and Jun, Z. (2007). Community analysis of ammonia and nitrite oxidizers in start-up of aerobic granular sludge reactor. *Journal of Environmental Sciences*. 19, 996-1002.
- Figuerola, M., Mosquera-Corral, A., Campos, J.L. and Mendez, R. (2008). Treatment of saline wastewater in SBR aerobic granular reactors. *Water, Science and Technology*. 58, 479-485.
- Gao, D., Liu, L., Liang, H. and Wu, W-M. (2011). Comparison of four enhancement strategies for aerobic granulation in sequencing batch reactors. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*. 186, 320-327.
- Gebara, F. (1999). Activated sludge biofilm wastewater treatment system. *Water Research*. (33) 1, 230-238.

- Ghangrekar, M.M., Asolekar, S.R., Ranganathan, K.R. and Joshi, S.G. (1996). Experience with UASB reactor start-up under different operating conditions. *Water, Science and Technology*. 34, 421-428.
- Ghangrekar, M.M., Asolekar, S.R. and Joshi, S.G., (2005). Characteristics of sludge developed under different loading conditions during UASB reactor start-up and granulation. *Water Research*. 39, 1123-1133.
- Gilda, C., Lemos, P.C., Oehmen, A. and Reis, M.A.M. (2007). Denitrifying phosphorus removal: Linking the process performance with the microbial community structure. *Water Research*. 41, 4383-4396.
- Ginige, M.P., Jurg, K., and Blackall, L.L. (2005) Investigation of an acetate-fed denitrifying microbial community by stable isotope probing, fullcycle rRNA analysis, and fluorescent *in situ* hybridization microautoradiography. *Applied Environmental Microbiology*. 71, 8683–8691.
- Goodwin, J.A.S., Wase, D.A.J. and Forster, C.F. (1992). Pre-granulated Seeds for UASB Reactors: How Necessary Are They? *Bioresource Technology*. 41, 71-79.
- Habib, M.A.B., Yusoff, F.M., Phang, S.M., Ang, K.J. and Mohamed, S. (1997). Nutritional values of chironomid larvae grown in palm oil mill effluent and algae culture. *Aquaculture*. 158, 95-105.
- Hall, E.R. (1987). [Biofilm reactors in anaerobic wastewater treatment](#). *Biotechnology Advances*. 5, 1987, 257-269.
- Hammer, Ø., Harper, D.A.T., and Ryan, P.D. (2001). PAST: Paleontological Statistics Software Package for Education and Data Analysis. *Palaeontologia Electronica* 4(1): 9pp. (Retrieved at: [http://palaeo-electronica.org/2001\\_1/past/issue1\\_01.htm](http://palaeo-electronica.org/2001_1/past/issue1_01.htm)).



- Heijnen, J.J. and van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. (1998). Method for acquiring grain-shaped growth of a microorganism in a reactor. In: Bathe, S., de Kreuk, M., McSwain, B. and Schwarzenbeck, N. (2005). *Aerobic Granular Sludge*. IWA Publishing, London.
- Heylen, K., Vanparys B., Peirsegaale, F. and Lebbe, L. and De Vos., P. (2007). *Stenotrophomonas terrae* sp. nov. and *Stenotrophomonas humi* sp. nov., two nitrate-reducing bacteria isolated from soil. *International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology*. (57), 2056–2061.
- Ho, C.C. and Tan, Y.K. (1988). The treatment of anaerobically digested palm oil mill effluent by pressurized activated sludge. *J ChemTechnolBiotechnol*. 41, 75-84.
- Ho, K-L., Chen, Y-Y., Lin, B. and Lee, D-J. (2010). Degrading high-strength phenol using aerobic granular sludge. *Applied Microbiology Biotechnology*. 85, 2009-2015.
- Hojjat, M., Mustapha, S. and MohdSalleh, M.A. (2009). Optimization of POME anaerobic pond. *European Journal of Scientific Research*. 4, 455-459.
- Hu, L., Wang, J., Wen, X. and Qian, Y. (2005). The formation and characteristics of aerobic granules in sequencing batch reactor (SBR) by seeding anaerobic granules. *Process Biochemistry*. 40, 5-11.
- Hussain, Z., Zainal, Z.A. and Abdullah, M.Z. (2003). Analysis of biomass-residue-based cogeneration system in palm oil mills. *Biomass Bioenergy*. 24, 117-124.
- Igwe, J.C. and Enyegbado, C.C. (2007). A review of palm oil mill effluent (POME) water treatment. *Global Journal of Environmental Research*. 1, 54-62.

- Inizan, M., Freval, A., Cigana, J. and Meinhold, J. (2005). Aerobic Granulation in a Sequencing Batch Reactor (SBR) for Industrial Wastewater Treatment. *Water Science and Technology*. 52 (10-11), 335-343.
- Irvine, R.L. and Davis, W.B.(1971). Use of sequencing batch reactor for wastewater treatment. In: Wilderer, P.A., Irvine, R.L. and Goronszy, M.C. (2001). Sequencing Batch Reactor Scientific and Technical Report No. 10. IWA Publishing, London.
- Ishii, S., Koki, J., Unno, H. and K., 2004. Two morphological types of cell appendages on a strongly adhesive bacterium, *Acinetobacter* sp. strain Tol 5. *Applied Environmental Microbiology*. 70, 5026–5029.
- Ivanov, V., Tay, J.H., Liu, Q.S., Wang, X.H., Wang, Z.W., Maszenan, B.A.M., Yi, S., Zhuang, W.Q., Liu, Y.Q., Pan, S. and Tay, T. (2005). Microstructural optimization of wastewater treatment by aerobic granular sludge. In: Bathe, S., de Kreuk, M., McSwain, B. and Schwarzenbeck, N. (2005). Aerobic Granular Sludge. IWA Publishing, London.
- Jang, A., Yoon, Y.H., Kim, I.S., Kim, K.S. and Bishop, P.L. (2003). Characterization and evaluation of aerobic granules in sequencing batch reactor. *Journal of Biotechnology*. 105, 71-82.
- Jenkins, D., Richard, M.G. and Daigger, C.T. (1993). *Manual on the Causes and Control of Activated Sludge Bulking and Foaming, 2nd Edition*. Chelsea, Michigan: Lewis Publishers.
- Jiang, H.L., Tay, J.H. and Tay, S.L. (2002). Aggregation of immobilized activated sludge cells into aerobically grown microbial granules for the aerobic biodegradation of phenol. *Letters of Applied Microbiology*. 35, 439-445.

- Jiang, H.L., Tay, J.H., Maszenan, A.M. and Tay, S.T.L. (2004). Bacterial diversity and function of aerobic granules engineered in a sequencing batch reactor for phenol degradation. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*. 70(11), 6767-6775.
- Johnson, C.P., Li, X. and Logan, B.E. (1996). Settling velocities of fractal aggregates. *Environmental Science Technology*. 30, 1911-1918.
- Juang, Y.C., Aday, S.S., Lee, D.J. and Lai, J.Y. (2010). Influence of internal biofilm growth on residual permeability loss in aerobic granular membrane bioreactors. *Environmental Science Technology*. 44, 1267-1273.
- Kargi, F. and Eker, S. (2003). Performance of rotating perforated tubes biofilm reactor in biological wastewater treatment. *Enzyme and Microbial Technology*. (32) 3, 464-471.
- Khalid, A.R. and Wan Mustafa, W.A. (1992). External benefits of environmental regulations: resource recovery and the utilization of effluents. *Environmentalist*. 12, 277-285.
- Kim, I.S., Kim, S-M. and Jang, A. (2008). Characterization of aerobic granules by microbial density at different COD loading rates. *Bioresource Technology*. 99, 18-25.
- Kishida, N., Tsuneda, J., Kim, J.H. and Sudo, R. (2009). Simultaneous nitrogen and phosphorus removal from high-strength industrial wastewater using aerobic granular sludge. *Journal of Environmental Engineering*. 135, 153-158.
- Kossaric, N., Blaszczyk, R., Orphan, L. and Valladares, J. (1990). The characteristics of granules from upflow anaerobic sludge blanket reactors. *Water Research*. 24, 1473-1477.

- Kwok, W.K., Picioreanu, C., Ong, S.L., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Ng, W.J. and Heijnen, J.J. (1998). Influence of Biomass Production and Detachment Forces on Biofilm Structures in a Biofilm Airlift Suspension Reactor. *Biotechnology Bioengineering*. 58, 58, 400-407.
- Lai, P., Zhao, H.Z., Zeng, M. and Ni, J.R. (2009). Study on treatment of coking wastewater by biofilm reactors combined with zero-valent iron process. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*. (162) 2-3, 1423-1429.
- Lam, M.K. and Lee, K.T., 2011. Renewable and sustainable bioenergies production from palm oil mill effluent (POME): Win-win strategies toward better environmental protection. *Biotechnology Advances*. 29, 124-141.
- Lettinga, G., van Velsen A.F.M., Hosma, S.W., de Zeeuw, W. and Klapwijk, A. (1980). Use of upflow sludge blanket (USB) reactor concept for biological wastewater treatment, especially for anaerobic treatment. *Biotechnology Bioengineering*. 22, 699-734.
- Lettinga, G., Pol, L.W.H., Koster, I.W., Wiegant, W.M., Dezeeuw, W.J., Rinzema, A., Grin, P.C., Roersma, R.E. and Hobma, S.W. (1984). High-rate anaerobic wastewater treatment using the UASB reactor under a wide range of temperature conditions. *Biotechnology and Genetic Engineering Reviews*. 2, 253-284.
- Lettinga, G., Deman, A. and Vanderlast, A.R.M. (1993). Anaerobic treatment of domestic sewage and wastewater. *Water, Science and Technology*. 27, 67-73.
- Lettinga, G., Field, J., van Lier, J., Zeeman, G. and Hulshoff Pol, L.W. (1997). Advanced anaerobic wastewater treatment in the near future. *Water, Science and Technology*. 35, 5-12.

- Li, D.H. and Ganczarczyk, J. (1989). Fractal geometry of particle aggregates generated in water and wastewater treatment processes. *Environmental Science Technology*. 23, 1385-1389.
- Li, X.Y. and Yuan, Y. (2002). Settling velocities and permeabilities of microbial aggregates. *Water Research*. 36, 3110-3120.
- Li, Y. and Liu, Y. (2005). Diffusion of substrate and oxygen in aerobic granule. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 27, 45-52.
- Li, J., Chen, Y., Li, J., Zhang, D., Wang, S., Wang, L., Jiang, D., Sun, F. and Zhang, Q. (2006). Morphological and structural characteristics of aerobic granulation. *Journal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology*. 81, 823-830.
- Li, X., Li, Y., Liu, H., Hua, Z., Du, G. and Chen, J. (2007). Characteristics of aerobic biogranules from membrane bioreactor system. *Journal of Membrane Science*. 287, 294-299.
- Li, Y., Liu, Y., Shen, L. and Chen, F. (2008). DO diffusion profile in aerobic granule and its microbiological implications. *Enzyme and Microbial Technology*. 43, 349-354.
- Li, A.J., Zhang, T. and Li, X.Y. (2010). Fate of aerobic bacterial granules with fungal contamination under different organic loading conditions. *Chemosphere*. 78, 500-509.
- Limkhuansuwan, V. and Chaiprasert, P. (2010). Decolourization of Molasses Melanoidins and Palm Oil Mill Effluent Phenolic Compounds by Fermentative Lactic Acid Bacteria. *Journal of Environmental Sciences*. 22, 1209-1217.

- Lin, Y.M., Liu, Y. and Tay, J.H. (2003). Development and characteristics of phosphorus accumulating microbial granules in sequencing batch reactors. *Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology*. 62, 430-435.
- Linlin, H., Jianlong, W., Xianghua, W. and Yi, Q. (2005). The formation and characteristics of aerobic granules in sequencing batch reactor (SBR) by seeding anaerobic granules. *Process Biochemistry*. 40, 5-11.
- Liu, H., Fang, H.H.P. (2002). Extraction of extracellular polymeric substances (EPS) of sludges. *Journal Biotechnology*. 95,249–256.
- Liu, Y. and Tay, J.H. (2002). The essential role of hydrodynamic shear force in the formation of biofilm and granular sludge. *Water Research*. 36, 1653-1665.
- Liu, Y., Xu, H.L., Yang, S.F. and Tay, J.H. (2003a). Mechanisms and models for anaerobic granulation in upflow anaerobic sludge blanket reactor. *Water Research*. 37, 661-673.
- Liu, Q.S., Tay, J.H. and Liu, Y. (2003b). Substrate concentration-independent aerobic granulation in sequential aerobic sludge blanket reactor. *Environmental Technology*. 24, 1235-1243.
- Liu, Y.Q., Liu, Y. And Tay, J.H., 2004. The effects of extracellular polymeric substances on the formation and stability of biogranules. *Applied Microbiology Biotechnology*. 65, 143-148.
- Liu, Y. and Tay, J.H. (2004). State of the Art of Biogranulation Technology for Wastewater Treatment. *Biotechnology Advances*. 22 (7), 533-563.

- Liu, Y., Wang, Z.W., Qin, L., Liu, Y.Q. and Tay, J.H. (2005). Selection pressure-driven aerobic granulation in a sequencing batch reactor. *Applied Microbiology Technology*. 67, 26-32.
- Liu, Y.Q. and Tay, J.H. (2007). Characteristics and stability of aerobic granules cultivated with different starvation time. *Applied Microbiology Biotechnology*. 75, 205-210.
- Liu., Y.Q. and Tay, J.H. (2008). Influence of Starvation Time on Formation and Stability of Aerobic Granules in Sequencing Batch Reactors. *Bioresource Technology*. 99, 980-985.
- Liu, H., Guangwei, Li., Xiufen, Li. and Jian, C. (2008). Molecular characterization of bacterial community in aerobic granular sludge stressed by pentachlorophenol. *Journal of Environmental Sciences*. 20, 1243-1249.
- Liu, Y.Q., Moy, B., Kong, Y.H. and Tay, J.H. (2010). Formation, physical characteristics and microbial community structure of aerobic granules in a pilot-scale sequencing batch reactor for real wastewater treatment. *Enzyme and Microbial Technology*. 46, 520-525.
- Liu, L., Sheng, G.P., Li, W.W., Tong, Z.H., Zeng, R.J., Liu, J.X., Xie, J., Peng, S.C. and Yu, H.Q. (2011). Cultivation of aerobic granular sludge with a mixed wastewater rich in toxic organics. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 57, 7-12.
- Lopes, S.I.C., Capela, M.I., Dar, S.A., Muyzer, G. and Lens, P.N.L. (2008). Sulfate reduction at pH 4 during the thermophilic (55°C) acidification. *Biotechnology Process*. 24, 1278-1289.

- Lopez, H., Puig, S., Ganique, R. Ruscalleda, M., Balaguer, M.D. and Colprim, J. (2008). Start-up and enrichment of a granular anammox SBR to treat high nitrogen load wastewaters. *Journal Chemical Technology Biotechnology*. 83, 233-241.
- Ma, A.N. and Ong, A.S.H. (1988). Treatment of Palm Oil Sterilizer Condensate by Anaerobic Process. *Biological Wastes*. 23, 85-97.
- Ma, A.N., Cheah, S.C. and Chow, M.C. (1993). Current status of palm oil processing wastes management. *Waste Management of Malaysia*. 111-136.
- Madigan, M.T. and Martinko, J.M. (2006). *Brock Biology of Microorganisms*. Eleventh Edition. Pearson Education, Upper Saddle River, New Jersey.
- Malaysian Palm Oil Board (MPOB) (2011). Palm Oil Update – for the Latest Information on Palm Oil. Ministry of Plantation Industries and Commodities Malaysia.
- Malaysian Palm Oil Board (MPOB) (2008). Palm Oil Update – for the Latest Information on Palm Oil. Ministry of Plantation Industries and Commodities Malaysia.
- Mandelbrot, B.B. (2006). Fractal analysis and synthesis of fracture surface roughness and related forms of complexity and disorder. *International Journal of Fracture*. 138, 13-17.
- Massé, D.I. and Masse, L. (2001). The Effect of Temperature on Slaughterhouse Wastewater Treatment in Anaerobic Sequencing Batch Reactors. *Bioresource Technology*. 76, 91-98.



- Maszenan, A.M., Jiang, H.L., Tay, J.H., Schumann, P., Kroppenstedt, R.M. and Tay, S.T.L. (2007). *Granulicoccusphenolivorans* gen. nov., sp. nov., a Gram-positive, phenol-degrading coccus isolated from phenol-degrading aerobic granules. *International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology*. 57, 730-737.
- McSwain, B.S., Irvine, R.L. and Wilderer, P.A., (2004). The influence of settling time on the formation of aerobic granules. *Water, Science and Technology*. 50(10), 195-202.
- McSwain, B.S., Irvine, R.L. and Hausner, M. (2005). Composition and distribution of extracellular polymeric substances in aerobic flocs and granular sludge. *Applied Environmental Microbiology*. 71, 1051-1057.
- McSwain, B.S. and Irvine, R.L. (2008). Dissolved oxygen as a key parameter to aerobic granulation. *Water, Science and Technology*. 58, 781-787.
- Md Din, M. F. (2007). *Polyhydroxybutyrate Production from Palm Oil Mill Effluent Using Mixed Microbial Culture*. Ph.D. Dissertation. Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Johor Bahru. Malaysia.
- Menon, R., 2002. Carbon credits and clean development mechanism. *Palm Oil Engineering Bulletin*. 65, 11–14.
- Metcalf and Eddy. (2003). *Wastewater Engineering: Treatment and Reuse*. (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed.). New York: McGraw Hill.
- Meyer, R.L., Zeng, R.J., Giugliano, V. and Blackall, L.L. (2005). Challenges for simultaneous nitrification, denitrification and phosphorus removal in microbial aggregates: mass transfer limitation and nitrous oxide production. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology*. 52, 329-338.

- Milner, M.G., Curtis, T.P. and Davenport, R.J. (2008). Presence and activity of ammonia-oxidising bacteria detected amongst the overall bacterial diversity along a physic-chemical gradient of a nitrifying wastewater treatment plant. *Water Research*. 42, 2863-2872.
- Mohammad, A.W., Yeong, W.T., Md Jahim, J. and Anuar, N. (2008). Palm oil mill effluent (POME) treatment and bioresource recovery using ultrafiltration membrane: effect of pressure on membrane fouling. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 35, 309-317.
- Mohan, S.V., Chandrasekhara, N.R. and Sarma, P.N. (2007). Composite chemical wastewater treatment by biofilm configured periodic discontinuous batch process operated in anaerobic metabolic function. *Enzyme and Microbial Technology*. (40) 5, 1398-1406.
- Mohan, S.V., Mohanakrishna, G. Raanaiah, S.V. and Sarma, P.N. (2008). Simultaneous biohydrogen production and wastewater treatment in biofilm configured anaerobic periodic discontinuous batch reactor using distillery wastewater. *International Journal of Hydrogen Energy*. (33) 2, 550-558.
- Morales, N., Figueroa, M., Mosquera-Corral, A., Campos, J.L. and Mendez, R. (2012). Aerobic granular-type biomass development in a continuous stirred tank reactor. *Separation and Purification Technology*. 89, 199-205.
- Morgenroth, E., Sherden, T., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Heijnen, J.J. and Wilderer, P.A., (1997). Aerobic Granular Sludge in A Sequencing Batch Reactor. *Water Research*. 31, 3191-3194.
- Mosquera-Corral, A., de Kreuk, M.K., Heijnen, J.J. and van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. (2005). Effects of Oxygen Concentration on N-removal in an Aerobic Granular Sludge Reactor. *Water Research*. 39, 2676-2686.

- Moy, B.Y.P., Tay, J.H., Toh, S.K. and Tay, S.T.L. (2002). High organic loading influences the physical characteristics of aerobic sludge granules. *Letters in Applied Microbiology*. 34, 407-412.
- Mu, Y. and Yu, H-Q. (2006). Rheological and fractal characteristics of granular sludge in an upflow anaerobic reactor. *Water Research*. 40, 3596-3602.
- Muda, K., Aris, A., Salim, M.R., Ibrahim, Z., Yahya, A., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Ahmad, A., Nawahwi, M.Z.. (2010). Development of Granular Sludge for Textile Wastewater Treatment. *Water Research*. 55, 4341-4350.
- Najafpour, G.D., Zinatizadeh, A.A.L., Mohamed, A.R., Hasnain Isa, M., Nasrollahzadeh, H. (2006). High-rate anaerobic digestion of palm oil mill effluent in an upflow anaerobic sludge-fixed film bioreactor. *Process Biochemistry*. 41, 370-379.
- Nicolella, C., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. and Heijnen, J.J. (2000). Wastewater treatment with particulate biofilm reactors. *Journal of Biotechnology*. 80, 1-33.
- Nor-Anuar, A., Ujang, Z., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. and de Kreuk, M. (2007). Settling behaviour of aerobic granular sludge. *Water Science Technology*. 56, 55-63.
- Nor-Anuar, A. (2008). *Development of Aerobic Granular Sludge Technology for Domestic Wastewater Treatment in Hot Climates*. Ph.D. Dissertation. Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Johor Bahru. Malaysia.
- Obaja, D., Mace, S., Costa, J., Sans, C. and Mata-Alvarez, J. (2003). Nitrification, Denitrification and Biological Phosphorus Removal in Piggery Wastewater Using a Sequencing Batch Reactor. *Bioresource Technology*. 87, 103-111.

- Olsson, G. and Newell, B. (1999). *Wastewater Treatment Systems: Modelling, Diagnosis and Control*. IWA Publishing. London.
- Parker, D.S., Kaufman, W.J. and Jenkins, T. (1971). Physical conditioning of activated sludge floc. *Journal Water Pollution Control Federation*. 43(9), 1817-1833.
- Pholchan, M.K., de C Baptista, J., Davenport, R.J. and Curtis, T.P. 2010. Systematic study of the effect of operating variables on reactor performance and microbial diversity in laboratory-scale activated sludge reactors. *Water Research*. 44, 1341-1352.
- Picioreanu, C., Van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. and Heijnen, J.J. (1998). Mathematical modeling of biofilm structure with a hybrid differential–discrete cellular automaton approach. *Biotechnology Bioengineering*. 58, 101–116.
- Poh, P.E. and Chong, M.F. (2009). Development of anaerobic digestion methods for palm oil mill effluent (POME) treatment. *Bioresource Technology*. 100, 1-9.
- Qin, L., Liu, Y. and Tay, J.H. (2004). Effect of Settling Time on Aerobic Granulation in Sequencing Batch Reactor. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 21 (1), 47-52.
- Raup, D. and Crick, R.E. (1979). Measurement of faunal similarity in paleontology. *Journal of Paleontology*. 53, 1213-1227.
- Rupani, P.F., Singh, R.P., Ibrahim, M.H. and Esa, N. (2010). Review of current palm oil mill effluent (POME) treatment methods: Vermicomposting as a sustainable practice. *World Applied Sciences Journal*. 10, 1190-1201.
- Ryu, S.H., Nguyen, T.T., Park, W., Kim, C.J. and Jeon, C.O. (2006). *Runella limosa* sp. Nov., isolated from activated sludge. *International Journal of Systematic Evolution Microbiology*. 56, 2757-2760.

- Sallis, P.J. and Uyanik, S. (2003). Granule development in a split-feed anaerobic baffled reactor. *Bioresource Technology*. 89, 255-265.
- Salmiati, Ujang, Z., Salim, M.R., Md Din, M.F. and Ahmad, M.A. (2007). Intracellular Biopolymer Production Using Mixed Microbial Cultures from Fermented POME. *Water Science Technology*. 56, 179-185.
- Sanz, J.L. and Kochling, T. (2007). Molecular biology techniques used in wastewater treatment: An overview. *Process Biochemistry*. 42, 119-133.
- Schwarzenbeck, N., Borges, J.M. and Wilderer, P.A. Treatment of dairy effluents in an aerobic granular sludge sequencing batch reactor. (2005). *Environmental Biotechnology*. 66, 711-718.
- Shaw, C.B., Carliell, C.M. and Wheatley, A.D. (2002). Anaerobic/Aerobic Treatment of Coloured Textile Effluents Using Sequencing Batch Reactors. *Water Research*. 36, 1993-2001.
- Sheng, G.P. and Yu, H.Q. (2006). Characterization of extracellular polymeric substances of aerobic and anaerobic sludge using three-dimensional excitation and emission matrix fluorescence spectroscopy. *Water Research*. 40, 1233-1239.
- Shi, X.Y., Yu, H.Q., Sun, Y.J. and Huang, X. (2009). Characteristics of aerobic granules rich in autotrophic ammonium-oxidizing bacteria in a sequencing batch reactor. *Chemical Engineering Journal*. 147, 102-109.
- Shin, H.S., Lim, K.H. and Park, H.S. (1992). Effect of shear stress on granulation in oxygen aerobic upflow sludge bed reactors. *Water, Science and Technology*. 26, 601-605.

- Sirianuntapiboon, S. and Srisornsak, O. (2007). Removal of  $Pb^{2+}$  and  $Ni^{2+}$  by bio-sludge in sequencing batch reactor (SBR) and granular activated carbon-SBR (GAC-SBR) systems. *Bioresource Technology*. 98, 2749-2757.
- Seghezzo, L., Zeeman, G., van Lier, J.B., Hamelers, H.V.M. and Lettinga, G. (1998). A review: The anaerobic treatment of sewage in UASB and EGSB reactors. *Bioresource Technology*. 65, 175-190.
- Song, Z., Pan, Y., Zhang, K., Ren, N. and Wang, A. (2010). Effect of seed sludge on characteristics and microbial community of aerobic granular sludge. *Journal of Environmental Sciences*. 22, 1312-1318.
- Stamper, D.M., Walch, M. and Jacobs, R.N. (2003). Bacterial population changes in a membrane bioreactor for graywater treatment monitored by denaturing gradient gel electrophoretic analysis of 16S rRNA gene fragments. *Applied Environmental Microbiology*. 69, 852-860.
- Su, K.Z. and Yu, H.Q., 2005. Formation and characterization of aerobic granules in a sequencing batch reactor treating soybean-processing wastewater. *Environmental Science Technology*. 39, 711-718.
- Sulaiman, F., Abdullah, N., Gerhauser, H. and Shariff, A. (2011). An outlook of Malaysian energy, oil palm industry and its utilization of wastes as useful resources. *Biomass and Bioenergy*. 35, 3775-3786.
- Sunil, S.A., Lee, D.J., Show, K.Y. and Tay, J.H. (2008). Aerobic Granular Sludge: Recent Advances. *Biotechnology Advances*. 26, 411-423.
- Tay, J.H., Liu, Q.S. and Liu, Y. (2001a). The Effects of Shear Force on the Formation, Structure and Metabolism of Aerobic Granules. *Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology*. 57 (1-2), 227-233.

- Tay, J.H., Liu, Q.S. and Liu, Y. (2001b). Microscopic observation of aerobic granulation in sequential aerobic sludge blanket reactor. *Journal of Applied Microbiology*. 91, 168-175.
- Tay, J.H., Liu, Q.S. and Liu, Y. (2001c). Microscopic observation of aerobic granulation in sequential aerobic sludge blanket reactor. *Journal of Applied Microbiology*. 91, 168-175.
- Tay, J.H., Ivanov, V., Pan, S. and Tay, S.T.L. (2002). Specific layers in aerobically grown microbial granules. *Letters in Applied Microbiology*. 34, 254–257.
- Tay, J.H., Yang, S.F. and Liu, Y. (2002a). Hydraulic Selection Pressure-Induced Nitrifying Granulation in Sequencing Batch Reactor. *Applied Microbiology Biotechnology*. 9, 332-337.
- Tay, S.T.L., Ivanov, V., Yi, S., Zhuang, W.Q. and Tay, J.H. (2002b). Presence of anaerobic Bacteroides in aerobically grown microbial granules. *Microbial Ecology*. 44, 278-285.
- Tay, J.H., Pan, S., He, Y. and Tay, S.T.L., (2004). Effect of organic loading rate on aerobic granulation II: Characteristics of aerobic granules. *Journal of Environmental Engineering*. 130(10), 1102-1109.
- Thanh, B.X., Visvanathan, C. and Aim, R.B. (2009). Characterization of aerobic granular sludge at various organic loading rates. *Process Biochemistry*. 44, 242-245.
- Tijhuis, L., Van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. and Heijnen, J.J. (1994). Formation and growth of heterotrophic aerobic biofilms on small suspended particles in airlift reactors. *Biotechnology Bioengineering*. 44, 595-608.

- Toh, S.K., Tay, J.H., Moy, B.Y.P., Ivanov, V. and Tay, S.T.L. (2003). Size-effect on the physical characteristics of the aerobic granule in SBR. *Applied Microbiology Biotechnology*. 60, 687-695.
- Torkian, A., Egbali, A. and Hashemian, S.J. (2003). The effect of organic loading rate on the performance of UASB reactor treating slaughterhouse effluent. *Resource, Conservation and Recycling*. 40, 1-11.
- Tortora, G.J., Funke, B.R. and Case, C.L. (2007). *Microbiology: An Introduction*. Pearson Education, CA. ISBN 0321396022.
- Tsuneda, S., Nagano, T., Hoshino, T., Ejiri, Y., Noda, N. and Hirata, A. (2003). Characterization of nitrifying granules produced in an aerobic upflow fluidized bed reactor. *Water Research*. 37, 4965-4973.
- Tsuneda, S., Ejiri, Y., Nagano, T. and Hirata, A. Formation mechanism of nitrifying granules observed in an aerobic upflow fluidized bed (AUFB) reactor. (2004). *Water Science and Technology*. 49, 27-34.
- Tsuneda, S., Ogiwara, M., Ejiri, Y. and Hirata, A. (2006). High-rate Nitrification using Aerobic Granular Sludge. *Water Science and Technology*. 53 (3), 147-154.
- Tyagi, R.D., Du, Y.G. and Bhamidimar, R. (1996). Dynamic behavior of the activated sludge microorganisms. *Water Science Technology*. 30, 1605-1616.
- Ujang, Z. and Anderson, G.K. (1996). Application of low-pressure reverse osmosis membrane for  $Zn^{2+}$  and  $Cu^{2+}$  removal from wastewater. *Water Science and Technology*. 34, 247-253.



- Ujang, Z. and Anderson, G.K. (2000). Effect of the operating parameters on the separation of metal chelates using low-pressure reverse osmosis membrane. *Water Science and Technology*. 41, 135-142.
- Ujang, Z. and Henze, M. (2006). *Municipal Wastewater Management in Developing Countries: Principles and Engineering*. IWA Publishing. ISBN: 1843390302.
- Ujang, Z., Ng, K.S., Hamzah, T.H.T., Roger, P., Ismail, M. R., Shahabudin, S.M. and Abdul Hamid, M.H. (2007). Application of immersed MF (IMF) followed by reverse osmosis membrane for wastewater reclamation: The case of Malaysia. *Water Science and Technology*. 56, 103-108.
- Ujang, Z., Salmiati and Salim, M.R. (2010). Microbial Biopolymerization Production from Palm Oil Mill Effluent (POME). In: Elnashar, M. (2010). *Biopolymers*. Sciyo Publishing. ISBN 978-953-307-109-1.
- Van Benthum, W.A.J., Garrido-Fernandez, J.M., Tijhuis, L., Van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. and Heijnen, J.J. (1996). Formation and detachment of biofilms and granules in a nitrifying biofilm airlift suspension reactor. *Biotechnology Programme*. 12 (6), 764-772.
- Vanderhaegen, B., Ysebaert, E. and Favere, K. (1992). Acidogenesis in relation to in-reactor granule yield. *Water Science and Technology*. 25, 21-30.
- Van der Star, W.R.L., Abma, W.R., Blommers, D., Mulder, J-W., Tokutomi, T., Strous, M., Picioreanu, C. and van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. (2007). Startup of reactors for anoxic ammonium oxidation: Experiences from the first full-scale anammox reactor in Rotterdam. *Water Research*. 41, 4149-4163.
- Van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Eikelboom, D., Gjaltema, A., Mulder, A., Tijhuis, L. and Heijnen, J.J. (1995). Biofilm Structures. *Water Science and Technology*. 32, 35-43.

- Venkata-Mohan, S. and Kartikheyen, J., 1997. Removal of Lignin and Tannin Colour From Aqueous Solution by Adsorption Onto Activated Charcoal. *Environmental Pollution*. 97, 183-187.
- Vijayaraghavan, K., Ahmad, D. and Abdul Aziz, M.E. (2007). Aerobic treatment of palm oil mill effluent. *Journal of Environmental Management*. 82, 24-31.
- Villasenor, J.C., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Picioreanu, C. and Heijnen, J.J. (2000). Influence of different substrates on the formation of biofilms in a biofilm airlift suspension reactor. *Water Science Technology*. 41, 323–330.
- Wagner, M., Horn, M. and Daims, H. (2003) Fluorescence *in situ* hybridisation for the identification and characterisation of prokaryotes. *Current Opinion Microbiology*. 6, 302–309.
- Wang, Q., Du, G. and Chen, J. (2004). Aerobic granular sludge cultivated under the selective pressure as driving force. *Process Biochemistry*. 39, 557-563.
- Wang, Z., Liu, L., Yao, J. and Cai, W. (2005). Effects of extracellular polymeric substances on aerobic granulation in sequencing batch reactors. *Chemosphere*. 63, 1728-1735.
- Wang, W., Jung., Y.J., Kiso, Y., Yamada, T. and Min, K.S. (2006). Excess sludge reduction performance of an aerobic SBR process equipped with a submerged mesh filter unit. *Process Biochemistry*. 4 (41), 745-751.
- Wang, S.G., Liu, X.W., Gong, W.X., Gao, B.Y., Zhang, D.H. and Yu, H.Q. (2007a). Aerobic granulation with brewery wastewater in a sequencing batch reactor. *Bioresource Technology*. 98, 2142-2147.

- Wang ZW, Liu Y, Tay JH. (2007b). Biodegradability of extracellular polymeric substances produced by aerobic granules. *Applied Microbiology Biotechnology*. 74: 462–466.
- Wang, J., Wang, X., Zhao, Z. and Li, J. (2008). Organics and nitrogen removal and sludge stability in aerobic granular sludge membrane bioreactor. *Environmental Biotechnology*. 79, 679–685.
- Wang, S.G., Gai, L.H., Zhao, L.J., Fan, M.H., Gong, W.X., Gao, B.Y. and Ma, Y. (2009). Aerobic Granules for Low-strength Wastewater Treatment: Formation, Structure and Microbial Community. *Journal of Chemical Technology Biotechnology*. 84, 1015-1020.
- Weber, S.D., Ludwig, W., Schleifer, K.H. and Fried, J. (2007). Microbial Composition and Structure of Aerobic Granular Sewage Biofilms. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*. 73 (19), 6233-6240.
- Weissbrodt, D., Lochmatter, S., Nue, T.R. and Holliger, C. (2011). *Significance of Rhodocyclaceae for the formation of aerobic granular sludge biofilms and nutrient removal from wastewater*. IWA Biofilm Conference 2011 – Processes in Biofilms, 106-107.
- Whiteley, A.S. and Bailey, M.J. (2000). Bacterial community structure and physiological state within an industrial phenol bioremediation system. *Applied Environment Microbiology*. 66, 2400-2407.
- Wilderer, P.A., Irvine, R.L. and Goronszy, M.C. (2001). *Sequencing Batch Reactor Technology*. Colchester, UK: IWA Publishing.

- Wu, T.Y., Mohammad, A.W., Jahim, J.M. and Anuar, N. (2009). A holistic approach to managing palm oil mill effluent (POME): Biotechnological advance to sustainable reuse of POME. *Biotechnology Advances*. 27, 40-52.
- Wu, T.Y., Mohammad, A.W., Mj Jahim, J. and Anuar, N. (2010). Pollution control technologies for the treatment of palm oil mill effluent (POME) through end-pipe processes. *Journal of Environmental Management*. 91, 1467-1490.
- Xiao, F., Yang, S.F. and Li, X.Y. (2008). Physical and hydrodynamic properties of aerobic granules produced in sequencing batch reactors. *Separation and Purification Technology*. 63, 634-641.
- Yacob, S., Hassan, M.A., Shirai, Y., Wakisaka, M., Subash, S., (2006a). Baseline study of methane emission from anaerobic ponds of palm oil mill effluent treatment. *Science of the Total Environment*. 366, 187–196.
- Yacob, S., Shirai, Y., Hassan, M.A., Wakisaka, M. and Subash, S. (2006b). Start-up Operation of Semi-commercial Closed Anaerobic Digester for Palm Oil Mill Effluent Treatment. *Process Biochemistry*. 41, 962-964.
- Yang, S.F., Liu, Y. and Tay, J.H. (2003). A novel granular sludge sequencing batch reactor for removal of organic and nitrogen from wastewater. *Journal Biotechnology*. 106, 77-86.
- Yang, S.F., Tay, J.H. and Liu, Y. (2004). Inhibition of free ammonia to the formation of aerobic granules. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 17, 41-48.
- Yeoh, B.G. (2004). A Technical and Economic Analysis of Heat and Power Generation from Biomethanation of Palm Oil Mill Effluent. *Electricity Supply Industry in Transition: Issues and Prospect for Asia*. 20-63.

- Yuniarto, A., Ujang, Z. and Zainon Noor, Z. (2008). Performance of bio-fouling reducers in aerobic submerged membrane bioreactor for palm oil mill effluent treatment. *Jurnal Teknologi UTM*. 49, 555-566.
- Zahrim, A.Y., Rachel, F.M., Menaka, S., Su, S.Y., Melvin, F. And Chan, E.S., (2009). Decolourisation of anaerobic palm oil mill effluent via activated sludge-granular activated carbon. *World Applied Sciences Journal*. 5, 126-129.
- Zhang, B., Min, J., Zhigang, Q., Huina, L., Jingfeng, W. and Junwen, L. (2011). Microbial population dynamics during sludge granulation in an anerobic-aerobic biological phosphorus removal system. *Bioresource Technology*. 102, 2474-2480.
- Zheng, Y-M., Yu, H-Q. and Sheng, G-P. (2005). Physical and chemical characteristics of granular activated sludge from a sequencing batch airlift reactor. *Process Biochemistry*. 40, 645-650.
- Zheng, Y.M., Yu, H.Q., Liu, S.J. and Liu, X.Z. (2006). Formation and instability of aerobic granules under high organic loading conditions. *Chemosphere*. 63, 1791-1800.
- Zhou, Y., Pijuan, M. and Yuan, Z. (2008). Development of a 2-sludge, 3-stage system for nitrogen and phosphorous removal from nutrient-rich wastewater using granular sludge and biofilms. *Water Research*. 42, 3207-3217.
- Zhu, J. and Wilderer, P.A. (2003). Effect of Extended Idle Conditions on Structure and Activity of Granular Activated Sludge. *Water Research*. 37, 2013-2018.
- Zinatizadeh, A.A.L., Mohamed, A.R., Mashitah, M.D., Abdullah, A.Z. and Isa, M.H. (2007). Optimization of Pre-Treated Palm Oil Mill Effluent Digestion in an Up-Flow Anaerobic Sludge Fixed Film Bioreactor: A Comparative Study. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*. 35, 226-237.