

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF ELECTRICAL DISCHARGE MACHINE  
ON TITANIUM ALLOY USING COPPER IMPREGNATED  
GRAPHITE ELECTRODE

MOHD HALIMUDIN BIN MOHD ISA @ HAMID

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the  
requirements for the award of the degree of  
Master of Engineering (Mechanical - Advance Manufacturing Technology)

Faculty of Mechanical Engineering  
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

MAY 2010

First of all, all the praises and thanks be to Allah S.W.T for His Love,

This thesis is dedicated to my family,

*To my beloved parent,*

Maimunah Hj Abdullah,

*My supportive wife,*

Amizah Abdul

*My wonderful brothers and sisters,*

Hamnah Mohd Isa, Mohd Helmi Mohd Isa, Huda Mohd Isa

Norhana Mohd Isa

And last but not least to all my relatives and my close friends

Thank you very much for your unstinting help and encouragement

May Allah bless all people that I love and it's my honor to share this happiness with  
my love ones.

Sorry if I forgot to mention any name.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank Allah Almighty for blessing me and giving me strength to accomplish this thesis. A special thanks and deep gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Dr. Safian Sharif who greatly helped in guiding and assisting me in every way throughout this entire project.

Many thank to all of the technicians and staff from KKTM Balik Pulau especially Mr Faiezem Ibrahim, Mr Asmar Suid, Mr. Ridwan Ramli, person in charge in Metrology Laboratory, Mr. Ashamudin Technician in Material Failure Testing and Mr. Mohzani lecturer from Department of Mechanical Engineering, USM and other technical staff for their cooperation and assistance me in the various laboratory tasks.

Lastly, I would also like to express my special thanks to my wife and my family members for their trust in me and continuously supporting me throughout this project. Less but not least, I would like to thank those who have contributed directly or indirectly towards the success of this study.

## ABSTRACT

Electrical discharge machining (EDM) which is very prominent amongst the non conventional machining methods is expected to be used quite extensively in machining titanium alloys due to the favorable features and advantages that it offers. This thesis presents the EDMing of titanium alloy (Ti-6246) using copper impregnated graphite electrode with diameter of 8 mm. The main purpose of this study was to investigate the influenced of various parameters involved in EDM on the machining characteristics, namely, material removal rate (MRR), electrode wear ratio (EWR), surface roughness (Ra) and overcut.

In this investigation, the machining trials were performed using a Sodick linear motor EDM sinker series AM3L. The experimental plan for the processes were conducted according to the design of experimental (DOE) and the results were statistically evaluated using analysis of variance (ANOVA). Results showed that current was the most significant parameter that influenced the machining responses on EDM of Ti-6246.

Confirmation tests were also conducted for the selected conditions for each machining characteristics in order to verify and compare the results from the theoretical prediction using Design Expert software and experimental confirmation tests. Overall, the results from the confirmation tests showed that the percentage of performance was acceptable due to all results obtained were within the allowable values which was less than 15% of marginal error.

## ABSTRAK

Proses pemesinan nyahcas elektrik (EDM) yang agak dominan di antara proses pemesinan bukan konvensional dijangkakan akan bertambah meluas penggunaannya disebabkan sifat-sifat dan kelebihan yang dihasilkan keatas bendakerja. Kajian yang dijalankan ini adalah mengenai pemesinan EDM *sinker* terhadap bahan aloi titanium (Ti-6246) dengan menggunakan *copper impregnated graphites* yang berdiameter 8 mm sebagai elektrod. Tujuan utama kajian ini adalah untuk mengkaji kesan beberapa parameter yang terlibat dalam EDM proses terhadap kriteria pemesinan seperti kadar pembuangan bahan (MRR), nisbah kehausan elektrod (EWR), kekasaran permukaan (Ra) dan '*overcut*'.

Dalam kajian ini, pemesinan yang dijalankan ke atas titanium dilakukan menggunakan *Sodick linear motor EDM series AM3L*. Ujian pemesinan untuk kedua-dua proses telah dinilai secara statistik menggunakan analisa variasi (ANOVA). Keputusan menunjukkan arus elektrik merupakan parameter yang paling signifikan yang mempengaruhi tindak balas pemesinan EDM ke atas Ti-6246.

Ujikaji pengesahan juga telah dijalankan bagi tujuan pengesahan dan perbandingan keputusan di antara nilai ramalan teori menggunakan perisian *Design Expert* dengan nilai yang diperolehi dari ujikaji. Secara keseluruhan, keputusan pengesahan ujikaji menunjukkan bahawa kesemua peratusan ralat perbezaan yang diperolehi berada di dalam lingkungan nilai yang dibenarkan iaitu peratus ralat kurang daripada 15%.

## CONTENTS

CHAPTER	TITLE	PAGE
	<b>DECLARATION</b>	ii
	<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</b>	iv
	<b>ABSTRACT</b>	v
	<b>ABSTRAK</b>	vi
	<b>CONTENTS</b>	vii
	<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	x
	<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xii
	<b>NOMENCLATURE</b>	xiv
	<b>LIST OF APPENDICES</b>	xv
<b>1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	
	1.1 Overview	1
	1.2 Background of Research	2
	1.3 Statement of the research problem	4
	1.4 Research Question	4
	1.5 Objectives	4
	1.6 Scope of study	5
<b>2</b>	<b>LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	
	2.1 Introduction	6
	2.2 Electric Discharge Machining (EDM)	7
	2.2.1 Principle EDM Spark Erosion	8
	2.2.2 Machining Parameter	10

2.2.3	Electrode	10
2.2.3.1	Key Factors of Electrode Material Selection	11
2.2.3.2	Material Removal Rate (MRR)	11
2.2.3.3	Electrode Wear Rate (EWR)	11
2.2.3.4	Surface Roughness (SR)	12
2.2.3.5	Machinability	12
2.2.3.6	Material Cost	13
2.2.3.7	Graphite Electrode	13
2.2.4	Flushing	14
2.2.5	Dielectric Fluid	17
2.3	Machining Characteristics	17
2.3.1	Material Removal Rate	17
2.3.2	Electrode Wear Rate, EWR	18
2.3.3	Surface Roughness, SR	19
2.4	Titanium Alloys and Their Machinability	20
2.4.1	Introduction	20
2.4.2	Classification of Titanium Alloys	22
2.4.2.1	Commercially pure (CP) titanium (unalloyed)	23
2.4.2.2	Alpha and near-alpha alloys	23
2.4.2.3	Alpha-beta Alloys	24
2.4.2.4	Beta alloys	24
2.4.3	EDM of Titanium Alloys	25
2.4.3.1	Machining Titanium Alloys with EDM	25
2.5	Design of Experiment (DOE)	26
2.5.1	Two-level Fractional Factorial Design	27
2.5.2	Response Surface Methodology (RSM)	28
2.5.3	Test of Statistical Significance	28
<b>3</b>	<b>RESEARCH DESIGN</b>	
3.1	Introduction	30
3.2	Research Design Variables	30
3.2.1	Response Parameters	31
3.2.2	Machining Parameters	31
3.2.3	Workpiece Material	32

3.2.4	Electrode Material	33
3.2.5	Machine and Equipment	34
3.3	Analysis	39
3.3.1	Statistical Analysis	39
3.3.2	Metal Removal Rate (MRR) Measurement	40
3.3.3	Electrode Wear Rate (EWR) Measurement	41
3.3.4	Surface Roughness Measurement	42
3.3.5	Measurement of Hole Diameter	42
3.3.6	Experimental Design	43
<b>4</b>	<b>RESULT AND ANALYSIS</b>	
4.1	Introduction	46
4.2	Experimental Results	47
4.3	Result Analysis	48
4.3.1	Analysis Results for Material Removal Rate, MRR	49
4.3.2	Analysis Results for Electrode Wear Rate, EWR	56
4.3.3	Analysis Results for Surface Roughness, SR	61
4.3.4	Analysis Results for Overcut	64
4.3.5	Analysis with Central Composite design	70
<b>5</b>	<b>DISCUSSION</b>	
5.1	Introduction	86
5.2	Material removal rate, MRR	87
5.3	Electrode wear rate EWR	87
5.4	Surface roughness, SR	88
5.5	Overcut	89
5.6	White layer	89
<b>6</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS</b>	
6.1	Introduction	91
6.2	Conclusion	91
	<b>REFERENCES</b>	93
	<b>APPENDICES</b>	97



## LIST OF TABLES

<b>TABLE</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
2.1	Physical and mechanical properties of elemental titanium	21
2.2	Some commercial and semicommercial grades and alloy titanium	22
3.1	Machining parameters	31
3.2	The composition of Ti-6246	32
3.3	Mechanical Properties of Ti-6246	33
3.4	Typical Value for copper impregnated graphite	34
3.5	Factor and level for EDM of Ti-6246	43
3.6	Two level full Factorial experiment with four factor and four center point	44
3.7	Experimental plan for EDM of Ti-6246	45
4.1	Experimental results for EDM of Ti-6246	47
4.2	ANOVA table for MRR in EDM process	51
4.3	ANOVA table for EWR in EDM process	57
4.4	ANOVA table for SR in EDM process	61
4.5	ANOVA table for Overcut in EDM process	65
4.6	Summary of significant factors in EDM experiments	70
4.7	Experimental plan for EDM of Ti-6246 (CCD)	71
4.8	Response results for EDM of Ti-6246 (CCD)	72
4.9	ANOVA table for response surface quadratic model for MRR in EDM of Ti-6246	73
4.10	ANOVA table after transformation for MRR in EDM of Ti-6246	74
4.11	Final ANOVA for EWR in EDM of Ti-6246	77
4.12	Final ANOVA for SR in EDM of Ti-6246	79
4.13	Final ANOVA for overcut in EDM of Ti-6246	81

4.14	An example of output from the point prediction tool EDM of Ti-6246	83
4.15	Analysis of confirmation experiments for MRR in EDM process	84
4.16	Analysis of confirmation experiments for EWR in EDM process	84
4.17	Analysis of confirmation experiments for SR in EDM process	84
4.19	Analysis of confirmation experiments for Overcut in EDM process	84

## LIST OF FIGURES

<b>FIGURE</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
2.1	Classification of EDM processes	7
2.2	Types of EDM processes	8
2.3	Spark gap	8
2.4	Phase of electrical discharges	9
2.5	Ignition of the first discharge	15
2.6	The particles created	16
2.7	The additional particle density	16
3.1	Sodick AM3L	35
3.2	Mitutoyo Formtracer CS-5000 surface roughness tester	35
3.3	Zeiss – Coordinate Measuring Machine (CMM)	36
3.4	Precisa Balance	36
3.5	Buehler automatic mounting machine	37
3.6	Grinder and Polisher	38
3.7	Optical microscope	38
3.8	Flowchart outlining the analysis steps undertaken	40
4.1	Pareto Chart for significant effect choosed (MRR)	49
4.2	Normal probability plots of residuals for MRR in EDM process	52
4.3	Residual vs predicted response for MRR in EDM process	52
4.4	Residual vs run number response for MRR in EDM process	53
4.5	Interaction between Peak Current (A) and Pulse on time (C)	54
4.6	Interaction between Peak Current (A) and Pulse on time (D)	54
4.7	Interaction between Pulse on time (C) and Pulse off time (D)	55
4.8	Perturbation plot for MRR in EDM process	56

4.9	Normal probability plots of residuals for EWR in EDM process	58
4.10	Residual vs predicted response for EWR in EDM process	58
4.11	Residual vs run number response for EWR in EDM process	59
4.12	Interaction between Peak Current (A) and Servo Voltage (B)	60
4.13	Interaction between Peak Current (A) and Pulse Off Time (D)	60
4.14	Normal probability plots of residuals for SR in EDM process	62
4.15	Residual vs predicted response for SR in EDM process	63
4.16	Residual vs run number response for SR in EDM process	63
4.17	Interaction between Peak Current (A) and Pulse On Time (C)	64
4.18	Normal probability plots of residuals for overcut in EDM process	66
4.19	Residual vs predicted response for overcut in EDM process	67
4.20	Residual vs run number response for Overcut in EDM process	67
4.21	Interaction between Peak Current (A) and Pulse On Time (C)	68
4.22	Interaction between Peak Current (A) and Pulse On Time (D)	69
4.23	Interaction between and Pulse On Time (C) and Pulse Off Time (D)	69
4.24	Normal probability plots of residuals for MRR in EDM process (CCD)	75
4.25	Residual vs predicted response for EWR in EDM process (CCD)	76
4.26	3D response surface for MRR in EDM process (CD) interaction	76
4.27	3D response surface for MRR in EDM process (AD) interaction	77
4.28	One factor plot for EWR in PMD-EDM process	78
4.29	One factor plot for Overcut in PMD-EDM process	80
4.30	Pulse off time (D) plot for Overcut in PMD-EDM process	80
4.31	3D response surface for Overcut in EDM process (CD) interaction	82
4.32	3D response surface for Overcut in EDM process (AD) interaction	82
5.1	White layer with lower pulse on current	90
5.2	White layer with higher pulse on time	90

**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND SYMBOLS**

ANOVA	-	Analysis of variance
CCD	-	Central composite design
CMM	-	Coordinate measuring machine
EDM	-	Electro discharge machining
EWR	-	Electrode wear rate
EWV	-	Weight of electrode used
MRR	-	Material/metal removal rate
RSM	-	Response surface methodology
SR	-	Surface Roughness
T <sub>m</sub>	-	Machining times
W <sub>a</sub>	-	Weight of workpiece after machining
W <sub>b</sub>	-	Weight of workpiece before machining
WRW	-	Weight of workpiece used
x <sub>1</sub> ,x <sub>2</sub> , x <sub>3</sub> ,...,x <sub>k</sub>	-	Input variables
$\alpha$	-	Alpha phase
$\beta$	-	Beta phase

## LIST OF APPENDICES

<b>APPENDIX</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
A-1	Workpiece preparation plan	97
A-2	Actual workpiece preparation	97
A-3	Electrode preparation	98
A-4	Electrode and Workpiece for experiment	98
B-1	Program For hole making on EDM die sinking (AM3L)	99
C-1	Experimental results for EDM of Ti-6246 (two level full factorial)	100
C-2	Experimental results for EDM of Ti-6246 (CCD)	101
D-1	Unmodified ANOVA table for MRR in EDM process	102
D-2	Box Cox Plot for MRR in EDM process	103
E-1	Ra reading for sample run 18	104
F-1	White layer for low and high MRR	105
F-1	White layer for low and high Ra	105
F-1	White layer for low and high Overcut	106
F-1	White layer for low EWR	106

## **CHAPTER 1**

### **INTRODUCTION**

#### **1.1 Overview**

The use of light, thin and compact mechanical elements has recently become a global trend. The search for new, lightweight material with greater strength and toughness has led to the development of new generation of materials such as titanium and nickel alloys, although their properties may create major challenges during machining operations. Having greater hardness and reinforcement strength, these materials are difficult to machine by the traditional methods. Although these materials can be machined conventionally, sub surface damages such as metallurgical alterations, work hardening, delimitation and microcracks and others can occur under certain circumstances which cause a detrimental effect on the performance of the machined component. Since the cost of using conventional machining is generally prohibitive, non-conventional machining such as electric discharge machining (EDM) and laser machining probably amongst the ideal technique in dealing with these materials.

Most titanium alloys and component design characteristics make them expensive to be machined and historically, titanium has been perceived as a material that is difficult to machine (Ezugwu, E.O and Wang, Z.M. 1997). Due to titanium's

growing acceptance in many industries, along with the experience gained by progressive fabricators, a broad base of titanium machining knowledge is now exist. It was reported that commercially pure grades of titanium [ASTM B, Grades 1, 2, 3, 4] (ASM International, 1988) can be machined much easier than aircraft alloys.

Although titanium alloys is tough it can experienced sub-surface damaged during machining operations. Damage appears in the form of microcracks, built up edge, plastic deformation, heat affected zones and tensile residual stresses (Sharif, 1999; and Hong *et al.*, 2001). In service, these can lead to degraded fatigue strength and stress concentration.

Non-traditional machining of metal removal such as EDM expected to be used extensively years to come, because it's favorable results. It is particularly useful for rapid removal of metal of free form surface or complex shaped parts, thin sections, and from large areas down to shallow depths. This process has less damaging effect on the mechanical properties of the metal (Rival, 2005).

## **1.2 Background of Research**

EDM is a non-traditional concept of machining which has been widely used to produce dies and molds. It is also used for finishing parts for aerospace and automotive industry and surgical components. This technique has been developed in the late 1940s (Norliana Mohd Abbas *et al.*, 2006).where the process is based on removing material from a part by means of a series of repeated electrical discharges between tool called the electrode and the work piece in the presence of a dielectric fluid (Norliana Mohd Abbas *et al.*, 2006).

This process is finding an increasing demand owing to its ability to produce geometrical complex shapes as well as its ability to machine hard materials that are extremely difficult to machine when using conventional process. EDM has proved its



capability especially in the machining of super tough, hard and electrically conductive materials such as the new space age alloys (Rival, 2005). The process variables include not only the electrical but also non-electrical parameters, which have received quite a substantial amount of research interest.

Optimum selection of process parameters is very much essential, as this is a costly process to increase production rate considerably by reducing the machining time. Several researchers carried out various investigations for improving the process performance. As EDM is a very complex and stochastic process, it is very difficult to determine optimal parameters for best machining performance, i.e., productivity and accuracy (T. A. El-Taweel, 2009). Material removal rate, tool wear, surface finish and also overcut are most important output parameters, which influence the cutting performance. But these performance parameters are conflicting in nature. The higher the MRR, the better, whereas the lower the tool wear, the better. In a single objective optimization, there exists only one solution. But in the case of multiple objectives, there may not exist one solution, which is the best with respect to all objectives. In EDM process, it is difficult to find a single optimal combination of process parameters for the performances parameters, as the process parameters influence them differently. Hence, there is a need for a multi-objective optimization method to arrive at the solutions to this problem.

The published literature indicates that few studies have been reported for the optimization of process parameters in EDM. Therefore, this study is aims at investigating the best performance of various input process parameters in EDM die-sinking process of Ti-6246. Further, no technology tables or charts are available for EDM of titanium alloy (Ti-6246) using copper graphite electrode. Therefore, it is imperative to develop a suitable technology guideline for appropriate machining of Ti-6246. Electrodes with copper graphite, peak current, servo voltage, pulse on time and pulse off time are considered as input EDM machining parameters. The process performance such as material removal rate (MRR), surface roughness (SR), overcut and electrode wear rate (EWR) were evaluated.

### **1.3 Statement of the research problem**

How does a new developed electrode performed when EDM alpha beta titanium alloy Ti-6246 with respect to material removal, electrode wear, dimensional hole accuracy and surface finish.

### **1.4 Research Question**

- a. What are the machining parameters that influence the EDMing of Ti-6246 using copper impregnated graphite electrode.
- b. What are the significant parameters that influence to the response during EDM of Ti-6246.
- c. What correlations exist among the parameters and machining responses and also how to quantify.
- d. What mathematical model is suitable to represent the performance evaluation of EDMing Ti-6246.

### **1.5 Objectives**

The objectives of the study are:

- a) To evaluate the performance of copper Impregnated graphite electrode when Electro-Discharge Machining Ti-6246 with respect to various machining responses.

- b) To determine the significant parameters that influences the machining responses during Electro-Discharge Machining of Ti-6246.
- c) To establish mathematical model for the MRR, EWR and surface finish during EDM of Ti-6246 using DOE approach.

## **1.6 Scope of study**

- a) Machining responses to be investigated are material removal rate (MRR), electrode wear rate (EWR), surface roughness (SR) and overcut.
- b) Electro-Discharge Machining (Die sinking) AM3L SODICK will be employed.
- c) Alpha-beta alloy, Ti 6Al 2Sn 4Zr 6Mo (Ti-6246) will be selected as workpiece material.
- d) Copper impregnated graphite will be used as the EDM electrode.
- e) Kerosene will be used as the dielectric fluid.