Arab World English Journal

INTERNATIONAL PEER REVIEWED JOURNAL ISSN: 2229-9327

Teaching Anxiety in Foreign Language Classroom: A Review of Literature

Hameed Gannoun
Language Academy, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia Skudai Johor, Malaysia
English Language Department, Faculty of Arts, Sebha University, Sabha, Libya
Corresponding Author: hagannoun@gmail.com

Farhana Diana Deris
Language Academy, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai Johor, Malaysia

Abstract
Foreign language teaching anxiety is a complex phenomenon recently receiving increasing attention. Negative emotions, such as anxiety, may significantly impact a teacher's professional practices, identity, and student's ability to learn a foreign language. Recognizing such feelings is crucial for language teachers, learners, and researchers to improve language education quality and promote successful learning outcomes. Therefore, this narrative research review examines the causes, effects, and possible interventions for anxiety about foreign language teaching. This review aims to explore the current state of research on the topic, identify gaps in the literature, and suggest future research directions. This review provides a narrative synthesis of the literature on FLTA through a systematic, comprehensive search on teaching anxiety among foreign language teachers. The study highlights that students and EFL teachers are prone to anxiety during the language teaching-learning process. When EFL teachers try to alleviate their students' anxiety, they may experience anxiety that can negatively impact their teaching behavior. The literature on teacher foreign language anxiety (TFLA) is sparse compared with EFL learners' studies. Researchers have yet to explore the unique psychology of EFL teachers. Hence, the consequences of such an experience are highly questionable. Therefore, it is essential to address EFL teacher anxiety before evaluating how teachers can alleviate student anxiety.
Keywords: Foreign Language Anxiety, Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety, EFL teachers, Narrative Review

Introduction

Language learning and teaching are complex processes involving linguistic but also social and psychological factors. Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) is the discomfort or apprehension that students experience from learning and using a foreign language. This anxiety can affect a student's language learning abilities. In addition, it can also affect teachers and significantly affect the effectiveness of their foreign language teaching. By understanding the causes and effects of Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety (FLTA), educators can develop strategies to help teachers manage and overcome their anxiety, ultimately leading to better student language learning outcomes. This narrative review article aims to present various definitions of anxiety, discuss its fundamental aspects from philosophical and psychological viewpoints, and summarise prior research on anxiety in language learning. In particular, this review aims to map the literature research on FLTA and provide an opportunity to identify its significant factors and implication on the language teaching-learning process.

Literature Review

Researchers have recognized over several decades that emotional experience is integral to mental processing and behavioral performance, with important implications for foreign language learning and teaching (Mercer, 2018). According to Krashen (1982), Foreign language learning (FLL) is well known to be affected by emotional factors such as FLA that may challenge learners to progress in learning a foreign or a second language. FLA is the unease, nervousness, or fear that language learners experience when studying a foreign or second language in a classroom setting (Horwitz, Horwitz & Cope, 1986; Krashen, 1982; Moskowitz & Dewaele, 2021; Pipuš, 2021). FLA is a common experience among language learners due to several factors, such as fear of making mistakes, fear of negative evaluation, and worrying about not understanding or being understood by others (Balkaya, Arabacioğlu & Çakir, 2020; Horwitz, 2001; Kobul & Saraçoğlu, 2020). It can impair performance and language learning outcomes (Horwitz et al., 1986) and, conversely, lead to worry, despair, low self-confidence, lack of self-esteem, and difficulty retaining new information (Pipu, 2021; Toyama & Yamazaki, 2022). Further, several cohort studies indicated that EFL teachers are still considered learners and susceptible to foreign language teaching anxiety (FLTA) (Horwitz, 1996; Ghanizadeh, Goldast & Ghonsooly, 2020; Gregersen & Horwitz, 2002). FLTA is a type of performance anxiety triggered by various factors, such as perceived language proficiency, self-doubt, cultural differences, classroom dynamics, fear of making mistakes, and inability to convey information effectively to learners (Horwitz, 1996; Kobul & Saraçoğlu, 2020; Rivers, 2022). Studies have shown that high anxiety levels can ultimately affect the quality of teaching and learning in the classroom. For instance, FLTA can significantly impact a teacher's work enjoyment, well-being, ability to plan and deliver lessons effectively, and overall job satisfaction (Fraschini & Park, 2021; 2022).

By advancing our understanding of FLTA, researchers, educators, and practitioners can gain insight into improving effective interventions and strategies for promoting teacher well-being and quality of teaching and learning outcomes. Given the complex nature of FLA compared to many other disciplines, studies ultimately showed that anxiety among EFL teachers is either significantly based on the rationale that they are indeed non-native EFL users or they suffer from anxiety due to the generic teaching profession (Aydın & Uştuk, 2020). Besides, language is the goal and the medium of instruction (Aydin, 2016). Contrary to the extensive studies of EFL learners, researchers have not thoroughly explored the unique psychology of EFL teachers (Kobul

& Saraolu, 2020). Reviewing the literature shows a shortage of systematic narrative reviews about FLTA. Therefore, this study aims to expand our knowledge by reviewing the current literature about FLTA by following proposed guidelines (e.g., Byrne, 2016; Ferrari, 2015; Green, Johnson & Adams, 2006; Harvey, Williams, Hernandez-Morgan, Fischer & Neelankavil, 2022) to identifying its causes and effects, and knowledge gaps for further research.

Method

This narrative review seeks to answer the question, 'What is foreign language teaching anxiety as a concept entails, and what is its significance in the language teaching process?' This review aims to provide a narrative synthesis of the literature on FLTA. According to Green et al. (2006), narrative reviews are comprehensive narrative syntheses of published information. They provide a broad view of an issue by synthesizing the literature and encouraging discussions without targeted questions or assumptions.

The narrative literature review may save researchers time by condensing much information to a few pages and assist decision-makers in identifying, evaluating, revising, and avoiding research pitfalls. It may assist in verifying assumptions and provide insight into previous research processes (Green et al., 2006). Although the literature review procedure is usually less systematic, this review followed Byrne (2016), Ferrari (2015), Green et al. (2006), Harvey et al. (2022), and the PRISMA statement as a guideline throughout the review process. Therefore, this paper may be considered a systematic narrative overview (Green et al., 2006). The subsequent sections describe a detailed description of systematic data collection and analysis procedures.

Search and Selection Strategy

The search strategy was initially implemented on September 2021 and included several steps. First, the purpose of this review was initially informed by a preliminary literature search of already published studies within the area of interest. (Byrne, 2016; Green et al., 2006; Harvey et al., 2022). This narrative review includes full-text publications that explain the FLA published in English until July 2022. Second, specific search terms (such as foreign language anxiety, foreign language learning anxiety, and foreign language teaching anxiety) were selected and used on three electronic databases (WoS, Scopus and Google Scholar). In addition, a snowball search for relevant articles was conducted through websites such as Connected Papers, Open Knowledge Maps, and Inciteful.

The process of review consisted of several screenings. Following the systematic search, published articles were first selected based on their titles and abstracts imported into Mendeley, where duplicates were removed. Then the remaining papers were reviewed critically to determine whether they met the review's stated objective based on the following criteria: main findings, limitations, quality and interpretation of the results, and the conclusion's impact in the field (Ferrari, 2015). As a result, all publications proceeded through the synthesis process (423 publications) were published between 1967 and 2022, including books, book sections, reviews, and research articles.

Synthesis

The authors reviewed and thoroughly annotated every publication in the final sample, considering its background, methods, and overall conclusions. The data was collected and then tabulated. Synthesized themes were then developed from the data found in the literature review

(Green et al., 2006). Then, each article's content was summarised and organized into topic-specific tables. The sample categorization was double-checked several times to ensure the accuracy of the results. Once the synthesis process was accomplished, this narrative review reports the major emerging themes and research trends with selective citations deemed relevant under each theme.

Discussion

This paper provides an overview of FLTA identified in the published literature. The search aims to be comprehensive rather than assess available resources' methodological quality. Based on the synthesis results, the FLTA can be characterized by three major themes: anxiety, foreign language anxiety, and anxiety associated with teaching a foreign language.

Anxiety in the literature

Emotions are crucial and play a big part in human life regardless of age, gender, religion, or nationality (Wollheim, 1999). Anxiety is a common emotion that arises when a person feels threatened and incapable of adapting to a given context (Horwitz et al., 1986). Previous studies have been concerned with different aspects of anxiety and have come up with various interpretations. For example, Scovel (1978) defines anxiety as "a state of apprehension, a vague fear" that emerges in response to a particular situation (p. 134). Anxiety is the state of being prepared or ready to react to harmful conditions (Barlow, 2004). Anxiety is a normal response to potential threats since it is a productive alarm system (Winton, Clark & Edelmann, 1995). This alarm allows us to react to and deal with prospective threats. Anxiety is also fleeting, indicating that it lasts briefly until the threat fades or becomes bearable (Bishop, 2002). Rapee and Heimberg (1997) state that anxiety results from three systems working closely together. First, the cognitive processing system associates with the thoughts that arise when something is unusual or flawed. Second, the physiological system relates to the physical changes that often evolve due to anxiety, such as rapid heartbeat or difficulty breathing. Finally, the behavioral system is responsible for the typical tendency to leave or avoid situations.

Social researchers concur that anxiety is categorized into three main subcategories: trait anxiety, state anxiety, and situation-specific anxiety. Scovel (1978) defines trait anxiety as a persistent anxiety tendency. In other words, those with significant trait anxiety are predicted to feel anxious at each moment (Spielberger, Jacobs, Russell & Crane, 1983). State anxiety, as the term implies, is an emotion that arises mainly in the short term. It is a temporary change in an emotional state that results from external stimuli, resulting in instant irritation of the emotions (MacIntyre & Gardner, 1991). Situation-specific anxiety is based on the principle that some situations are more likely to trigger anxiety than others (Horwitz, 2016; MacIntyre & Gardner, 1991).

Furthermore, Anxiety research distinguishes between facilitating and debilitating anxiety in education. To provide an example, Scovel (1978) states that facilitating anxiety encourages learners to fight new activities in the classroom, whereas debilitating anxiety impedes learning and encourages avoidance behavior. According to Horwitz (1996), the anxiety experienced by foreign language learners differs from other anxieties in any discipline. Therefore, understanding the anxiety triggers may assist in understanding learners' and teachers' hesitation to interact in English.

Foreign Language Anxiety

Research on the effects of anxiety on Foreign Language Learning (FLL) was conducted using the state-trait anxiety paradigm in the 1970s, yielding contradictory findings (Gerencheal &

Mishra, 2019). According to Horwitz et al. (1986), FLA significantly differs from state and trait anxiety because it appears primarily in FLL classrooms (see Figure one). Horwitz and her colleagues defined FLA as "a distinct complex of self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings, and behaviors related to classroom language learning arising from the uniqueness of the language learning experience" (p. 128). They contend that FLA is situation-specific anxiety responsible for unpleasant emotions towards the language, which differs from other academic anxieties because it necessitates more self-concept and self-expression (Horwitz et al., 1986). MacIntyre and Gardner (1989) devised an experiment using nine anxiety scales to demonstrate the validity of Horwitz and her colleagues' classifications, concluding that language anxiety significantly correlates with a proficiency level in a foreign language FL, while general anxiety is not. The same goes for Chen and Chang (2004), who indicated that FLA is distinct from other forms of anxiety.


```
                    ┌──────────────────────────┐           ┌──────────────────────────┐
               ┌────│  Situation- specific     │───────────│ Foreign Language Anxiety │
┌──────────┐   │    │        anxiety           │           │           FLA            │
│  Anxiety │───┤    └──────────────────────────┘           └──────────────────────────┘
└──────────┘   │    ┌──────────────────────────┐
               ├────│      State Anxiety        │
               │    └──────────────────────────┘
               │    ┌──────────────────────────┐
               └────│      Trait Anxiety        │
                    └──────────────────────────┘
```

Figure 1. Classification of FLA (Adapted from Horwitz et al., 1986)

Theoretically, FLA is essential in interpreting the process of FLL (Horwitz, 2001). Among the most influential theories in second language acquisition is Krashen's (1982) Affective Filter Hypothesis. This theory emphasizes how emotional variables such as motivation, self-confidence, and anxiety can affect students by interrupting information from the brain's language acquisition system. Once the emotional filter is active, learners may feel anxious, stressed, and lose self, which is detrimental to their success (Krashen, 1982). According to the literature, learning a foreign language can provoke a distinct form of anxiety which could be worsened due to the situational characteristics of FLL.

Causes and Effects of FLA

Other studies suggest possible origins of language anxiety by considering three perspectives: the learner, the teacher, and the teaching methods. For instance, Young (1991) identified six general causes of anxiety, including (a) intrapersonal and interpersonal fears, (b) student attitudes toward language learning, (c) teacher attitudes toward teaching the language, (d) interactions between teachers and students, (e) instructional practices, and (f) language test. According to Horwitz et al. (1986), the three most common causes of FLA are communication apprehension, fear of negative evaluation, and test anxiety. Communication anxiety refers to the fear or nervousness one experiences when interacting with others in a language they are trying to learn. On the other hand, fear of negative evaluation occurs when individuals are anxious about making mistakes and being corrected frequently. Test anxiety is associated with performance and triggered by fear of failing.

Besides, Sparks and Ganschow (1991) introduced the Linguistic Coding Deficit Hypothesis, which has led to a debate over whether language anxiety is crucial in causing poor language achievement. This hypothesis indicates that deficiencies in the first language may

interfere with FL abilities and become the primary source of poor achievement in FLL. In response to the LDCH, Horwitz (2000) claims this hypothesis emphasizes cognitive ability and overlooks the substantial differences between first- and second-language development. According to Bailey, Daley & Onwuegbuzie (1999), anxiety is not solely the result of a deficiency in the first language. Still, it is a fundamental emotional condition that can impair the cognitive functioning of language learners. MacIntyre (1995) also argues that the leading causes of language anxiety are the social and communicative components of learning a new language. Accelerating language learning requires understanding the contextual factors and effects that contribute to language anxiety.

It is clear from the extensive evidence in the literature that FLA can be outlined in five significant impacts: academic, social, cognitive, affective, and psychological. Academically, high FLA levels can impair performance and achievement in FL learning (Horwitz et al., 1986; Horwitz, 2001; Mercer, 2018; Williams & Andrade, 2008). Students with high anxiety levels are less likely to interact socially (Rapee & Heimberg, 1997). Cognitively, FLA impedes the cognitive processing system of a learner from receiving and processing new information correctly (Krashen, 1982; MacIntyre & Gardner, 1989). Considering FLA's affective impact, anxiety often manifests through worrying, fear, despair, and a general lack of self-esteem (Pipuš, 2021) and is inversely associated with students' attitudes and motivation to learn an FL (Liu & Huang, 2011). Last, psychologists like Rapee and Heimberg (1997) state that high anxiety levels can negatively affect the body's physiological state, including sweating, trembling, irregular heartbeats, blushing, and tense muscles.

Students and teachers are susceptible to anxiety during the EFL teaching-learning process. Since the field of language education has prominently focused on reducing anxiety among EFL learners, the possibility that even EFL teachers are susceptible to FLA seems to be disregarded (Horwitz, 1996). Therefore, addressing EFL teachers' anxiety is critical before evaluating how teachers can ease student anxiety.

Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety
As with all novice EFL teachers, it is reasonable to assume that most teachers are no exception to going through critical moments of anxiety (Kim, Sung-Yeon & Joo-hae, 2004). As stated by Horwitz (1996), while EFL teachers are required to alleviate their students' anxiety levels, they may experience anxiety that may adversely impact their teaching behavior. Any novice EFL teacher, either native or non-native, would experience some degree of anxiety. According to Greis (1984), non-native trainees at ESOL typically suffer considerable anxiety compared to native speakers due to their perception that they cannot acquire the language at the same level as native speakers. Therefore, they assume their students may prefer a native speaker as their EFL teacher. Horwitz (1996) stated:

"Even though language teachers are supposed to be high-level speakers of their target language, language learning is never complete. Most non-native language teachers are likely uncomfortable speaking their target language. When feelings of inadequacy in the target language are frequent and unrelated to a real competence assessment, they parallel the anxiety reactions in inexperienced language learners..." (Horwitz, 1996, p. 365).

Horwitz (1996) noted that although the quality of language teaching is affected by such fears, it would significantly affect teachers' mentality and sense of satisfaction. Mercer (2018) reiterated Horwitz's point, claiming that a lack of language skills and low self-efficacy could trigger FLA in EFL teachers. EFL teachers are traditionally viewed as part of the learning context,

not independent actors (Mercer, 2018). As a result, the discipline needs to gain a deep understanding of EFL teachers' role in FLL to enhance the efficiency and dynamism of EFL classrooms.

The Significance of Teacher Psychology

In contrast to the extensive studies of EFL learners, researchers have not thoroughly explored the unique psychology of EFL teachers (Kobul & Saraçoğlu, 2020). First, it is crucial to understand why literature places such a high value on learners. The ultimate goal of the education system is to help students reach their full potential in the classroom. Teachers are hired, and educational institutions are established because of the students (Hattie, 2008). It is reasonable that this discipline seeks to understand the psychology of individuals who are supposed to be the primary beneficiaries of educational systems (Mercer, 2018). In addition, the learner-centred movement is a recent trend in language teaching that may have deepened the dominance of attention to learners (Mercer, Oberdorfer & Saleem, 2016). An unintended effect of this movement also appears that scholars have underestimated what Hattie (2008) highlights as the second most crucial element of variation: teachers' beliefs and practices. Focusing less on EFL teachers seems to have underestimated teachers as people with interests, goals, and personalities (Mercer, 2018).

However, understanding the psychology of EFL teachers is vital for two main reasons. First, EFL teachers are considered critical actors in the educational process (Holmes, 2005). Mercer et al. (2016) argue that EFL teachers with high levels of satisfaction and self-efficacy can deliver innovative and practical lessons much better. Due to the complexity of their instruction increases, EFL teachers face stressors such as technological literacy, institutional commitments, student behaviour, job insecurity, low language proficiency, and language anxiety (Mercer, 2018). Horwitz (1996) claims that EFL teachers should be ready to communicate in the language in front of their students at all times, unlike math or history instructors who can prepare the necessary materials for a specific lesson. With these considerations in mind, it seems imperative to find ways to support EFL teachers so they can survive and thrive in their careers.

The second reason is that teacher psychology profoundly influences learner psychology (Mercer, 2018). The contagion process connects the psychology of teachers and students and affects the teaching-learning process (Moskowitz & Dewaele, 2021). More specifically, students' perceptions of their EFL teachers' psychological state determine their attitudes toward the teacher and alter their emotions. Another thing to consider is the two-way interaction between teacher and student, meaning that the latter is not just a passive observer of the former's behavior and vice versa (Mercer, 2018). The impact of EFL teachers on student achievement and well-being extends beyond their content and delivery methods. Put differently, the psychology of EFL teachers can affect students psychologically, individually and collectively, increasing the need for measurements to reduce uncertainties in EFL teachers.

Measuring Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety

Both qualitative and quantitative methodologies are used to evaluate foreign language anxiety to ensure validity and reliability. Qualitative research techniques include diaries and interviews. Interviews and diaries can be tailored to gather specific information, which can help researchers gain insight into participants' emotions. Using many data sources allows triangulation, increasing study validity and cross-checking findings (Creswell, 1999). For quantitative methods, scales are utilized. Before the turn of the millennium, the lack of an adequate measurement

hampered research on FLA for a long time (Kobul & Saraçoğlu, 2020). Horwitz et al. proposed a significant measure, the Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS), considered one of the major initiatives in the field. The FLCAS is a self-report tool with 33 questions designed to explore aspects of FLA among EFL learners. Their work pioneered and established a new research instrument on a 5-point Likert acknowledged by linguists such as MacIntyre and Gardner (1991) and widely utilized for assessing FLA among learners and teachers (Toyama & Yamazaki, 2022). Like vein, several other initiatives evolved in the literature to measure FLA. For instance, Kim (2000) developed the Foreign Language Listening Anxiety Scale (FLLAS), consisting of 33 items on a 5 Likert scale. Similarly, Second Language Speaking Anxiety Scale (SLSAS) was established by Woodrow (2006) and contained 12 items with a Likert scale from 1–5 to measure communication anxiety within and outside of the classroom.

Further, Horwitz (1996) contributed to the literature by developing the Teacher Foreign Language Anxiety Scale TFLAS to explore the anxiety experienced by EFL teachers and its influence on FL classrooms. A total of 18 items were rated on a Likert scale of 1–5 to stimulate respondents' FLA. The influential work of Horwitz gave rise to a renewed interest in using new scales measuring FLTA among EFL teachers apart from the standpoint of learning EFL (Aydin & Ustuk, 2020). Accordingly, TFLAS has been utilized in a wide range of previous investigations (e,g. Dişli, 2020; Kunt & Tüm, 2010; Liu & Wu, 2021), and it has been established that several EFL teachers exhibit FLTA.

As a result of their study, El-Okda and Al-Humaidi (2003) developed the Foreign Language Student Teaching Anxiety Scale to assess EFL teachers' anxiety levels. The scale contains 34 items categorized into six dimensions: interactions with students, peers, fellow teachers, supervisors, lesson planning, and classroom management. In like manner, İpek (2006) created an instrument called Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety Scale measuring the FLTA. The study produced a five-point Likert scale encompassing 26 items distributed across five categories: anxiety regarding teaching a specific FL skill, apprehension about FL performance, fear of making mistakes, comparison to other teachers, and use of the native language. Likewise, Aydin and Ustuk (2020) established Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety Scale (FLTAS) to measure anxiety levels among EFL teachers. The instrument includes 27 items with a Likert-scale (1=rarely to 5= always) that underpins five significant factors associated with FLA from two perspectives: language users and teachers, such as teaching inexperience, self-perception of language proficiency, fear of negative evaluation, lack of student interest, and difficulties with time management.

Equally important, research attention in physiological data monitoring and analysis gradually turns to technological advances to assess FLTA. According to Rivers (2022), FLA researchers are urged to broaden the existing methodological repertoire beyond experiencing self-report measurements and incorporate data collection and analysis technology combining high-integrity measures like Heart Rate Variability (HRV) and Electro-Dermal Activity (EDA). An advantage of this approach is that it can help researchers record autonomic nervous system arousal during real interaction contexts under different contexts (Rivers, 2022).

Anxiety Provoking Factors

Despite recent research acknowledging FLTA, there seems to be a lack of comprehensive studies to recognize all perspectives of FLTA compared to the FLA that students experience (Aydın & Uştuk, 2020). The anxiety experienced by EFL teachers may merely be a continuation of how they felt as EFL learners (Horwitz, 1996), as considerable research has shown that many EFL learners suffer from FLA. Consequently, EFL teachers can still endure FLA based on their

experiences as EFL learners (Horwitz, 2001). Additionally, as pre-service EFL teachers reach the end of their teaching training program, they may get frustrated by emotions of ineptitude and anxiety about utilizing the language (Tum, 2015). They would begin to doubt whether their language abilities will be adequate to meet the demands of their future EFL classroom (Horwitz, 1996). Recent evidence provided by Balkaya et al. (2020) illustrated that pre-service EFL teachers did not perceive themselves as sufficiently proficient due to a lack of confidence and fear of language mistakes. Perhaps those anxious EFL teachers who may have been in EFL classrooms where impeccable pronunciation and grammar were heavily emphasized will tend to adopt a purely linguistic approach to their teaching (Horwitz, 1996).

As well-documented by a large and growing body of scientific research, culture profoundly influences human cognition, and it is essential to highlight this distinction explicitly (Kobul & Saraçoğlu, 2020). Numerous academic studies have shown the ideological differences between Eastern and Western cultures in light of what Hofstede (1984) called collectivist and individualist societies. In other words, although communicative language teaching is widely recognized, it is commonly regarded as a Western innovation that doubtfully seems to be a cure in contexts influenced by eastern cultural traditions (Kobul & Saraçoğlu, 2020). As a natural consequence of their difficulties speaking out, collectivist EFL users are more likely than individualistic speakers to suffer shyness, embarrassment, and anxiety in EFL classrooms (Toyama & Yamazaki, 2022).

Another critical point is that the responsibilities of EFL teachers typically ascribed by the culture may contribute to FLTA. The common belief may persuade EFL teachers that they are accepted as fluent language speakers and feel stressed about how others perceive them (Tüm, 2019). In Libyan culture, for example, EFL teachers in Libya are often seen as the sources of information. Their primary responsibility is to pass on what they have learned to the next generation (Orafi, 2008). As a result, most teachers are more concerned with expanding their understanding of the subject matter than improving their teaching approaches. This means that culture significantly impacts human cognition, and what inspires anxiety in one culture may not be so in another, and vice versa (Kobul & Saraçoğlu, 2020).

Language teaching is a challenging profession in which EFL teachers may be required to cope regularly with various complex challenges. Several studies suggest that language teachers strive to balance their professional and personal lives properly. Teachers with heavy workloads need help to accomplish duties and commitments in their personal and professional lives (Fraschini & Park, 2022). Teachers want to combine family and teaching responsibilities; nonetheless, lengthy working hours prohibit them from achieving their objectives (Fraschini & Park, 2021). However, insecurity and self-doubt may readily lead to persistent language anxiety if they are regularly repeated (Tum, 2015). Consequently, this leads to dissatisfaction with natural language development and excessive expectations of being excellent language teachers (Gregersen & Horwitz, 2002). Therefore, it would be naive to assume that teachers could handle any emotions of ineptitude or anxiety they might experience in the EFL classroom if they were just granted teaching credentials (Tum, 2015).

The Significant Impact of Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety

Even though several investigations have revealed varying degrees of FLA among pre-service and in-service EFL teachers (Alrashidi, 2022; Ghanizadeh et al., 2020; Liu, Yan & Fu, 2022; Yangın Ekşi & Yılmaz Yakışık, 2016), it has not been extensively investigated if this feeling of language anxiety would alter their teaching practices in EFL classes. In a systematic research

review, Vorobel (2022) reviewed 197 research articles about distance foreign language teaching and found that modes of course delivery received the most attention, while only two studies investigated teachers' psychology, such as anxiety.

Nevertheless, evidence suggests that FLTA affects the EFL teaching-learning process. First, Horwitz (1996) stated that FLTA could minimize the amount and quality of information learners receive from teachers. However, the evidence suggests that FLA negatively affects instructors' efficiency in EFL classes. Tang (2007) indicated that inadequate language proficiency might negatively affect teachers' confidence in teaching, pedagogical decisions and classroom performance, and students' language communication skills. Considering this, teachers who experience anxiety may intentionally reduce their language use in class and avoid participating in language-focused activities that may expose their EFL deficiencies (Tum, 2015).

Second, Horwitz (1996) presumed that teachers' anxiety could be transferred unintentionally to students. According to the contagion process, learners' psychological conditions can be amended by their teacher's emotions (Moskowitz & Dewaele, 2021). As a result, EFL teachers' psychology may affect students individually and collectively, which signifies that the latter is not only a passive observer of the former's behaviours but vice versa (Mercer, 2018).

Finally, regular experiences of FLTA among EFL teachers would inevitably decrease their work enjoyment and negatively impact their well-being (Horwitz, 1996). Therefore, significant levels of FLTA may be detrimental to the efficacy of the FLL process. Horwitz recommended that by considering all these repercussions, efforts should be made to help EFL teachers' feelings about FLTA before beginning their careers.

Conclusion

This narrative review characterized and described the nature of Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety (FLTA) in the published literature. Examining the relevant literature regarding Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) demonstrates that anxiety poses a difficulty in learning and teaching. Although several investigations reveal that foreign language anxiety negatively affects the foreign language learning process, there is currently no solid evidence about the causes and effects of teaching anxiety in a formal educational setting. The literature on foreign language teaching anxiety is sparse; thus, the consequences of such an experience are highly questionable. A thorough understanding of the causes of foreign language anxiety would help to find ways to reduce this problem. In other words, how FLTA affects many parts of the instructional process, and how this affects teachers and students should be considered in multiple educational settings. When these impacts are considered collectively, it becomes evident that FLTA warrants further investigation.

Implications

In principle, the insights gained from this review can give rise to scholars, researchers and language teachers to recognize the dynamics behind anxiety feelings and their relationship with language teaching and learning. In addition, this review may assist teacher educators and policymakers in EFL contexts in conceptualizing the nature of anxiety among EFL teachers to design effective syllabus training programs that are contextually appropriate. Thus, EFL teachers can benefit from more productive and healthy practicum experiences.

Strengths and Limitations

This narrative review used rigorous and transparent methods guided by Green et al. (2006), Byrne (2016), Harvey et al. (2022), and the PRISMA statement as a synthesis and narrative protocol. The authors reviewed each citation and article and revised it before implementation. The search strategy included three electronic bibliographic databases and the snowball technique of relevant data in three search engines to ensure a broad literature search. In addition, using a bibliographic manager (Mendeley) confirmed that all citations and articles were adequately accounted for during the process.

Although efforts have been made to be as comprehensive as possible, this narrative overview has not identified all relevant information in the published literature. Our search algorithm primarily employed English terms commonly utilized for foreign language teaching anxiety (FLTA), and it is conceivable that other terminologies may exist as well. Furthermore, the overall search strategy may have been biased toward databases and overlooked some relevant studies as Web searches were screened for inclusion in this review. However, we encountered some challenges during the citation selection processes reported in this review due to writing space constraints. Therefore, further studies in this field are suggested to examine a specific aspect of such emotion, such as the causes or the effects of FLA, to include more in-depth information. On another remark, the characterization and interpretation of the included reviews were also subject to reviewers' bias.

About the Author

Hameed Gannoun has MA in English Language Teaching and is pursuing his Ph.D. at Language Academy, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia. He is also a research assistant at Sebha University. His research interests include but are not limited to challenges of English language teaching and learning and teacher education. ORCiD ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3318-2448

Dr Farhana Diana Deris is a Senior Lecturer at the Universiti Teknologi Malaysia. She currently holds the portfolio as Manager of International Alliances at the office of UTM International. Her research interests include technology-enhanced teaching and learning to engage 21st-century English language learners. ORCiD ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0319-9938

References

Alrashidi, O. (2022). Sources of Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety Among Saudi Pre-service English Teachers: A Qualitative Inquiry. *SAGE Open*, *12*(3), 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440221119486

Aydin, S. (2016). Qualitative research on foreign language teaching anxiety. *Qualitative Report*, *21*(4), 629–642. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2016.2232

Aydin, S., & Ustuk, O. (2020). The foreign language teaching anxiety scale: Preliminary tests of validity and reliability. *Journal of Language and Education*, *6*(2), 44–55. https://doi.org/10.17323/JLE.2020.10083

Bailey, P., Daley, C. E., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (1999). Foreign language anxiety and learning style. *Foreign Language Annals*, *32*(1), 63–76. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1944-9720.1999.tb02376.x

Balkaya, Ş., Arabacioğlu, B., & Çakir, M. (2020). Students' Foreign-Language Classroom Anxiety at the Department of German Language Teaching Program. *Alman Dili ve*

Edebiyatı Dergisi - Studien Zur Deutschen Sprache Und Literatur, *2020*(44), 111–134. https://doi.org/10.26650/sdsl2020-0019

Barlow, D. H. (2004). *Anxiety and its disorders: The nature and treatment of anxiety and panic*. New York, Guilford press.

Bishop, S. R. (2002). What do we really know about mindfulness-based stress reduction? *Psychosomatic Medicine*, *64*(1), 71–83.

Byrne, J. A. (2016). Improving the peer review of narrative literature reviews. *Research Integrity and Peer Review*, *1*(1), 10–13. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41073-016-0019-2

Chen, T.-Y., & Chang, G. B. Y. (2004). The Relationship between Foreign Language Anxiety and Learning Difficulties. Foreign Language Annals, 37(2), 279–289. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1944-9720.2004.tb02200.x

Creswell, J. W. (1999). Mixed-method research: Introduction and application. *In Handbook of educational policy* (pp. 455-472). Academic press. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-012174698-8/50045-X

Dişli, A. (2020). *a Mixed Approach Towards Efl Teachers' Teaching Anxiety* [Çağ University]. http://repositorio.unan.edu.ni/2986/1/5624.pdf

El-Okda, M., & Al-Humaidi, S. (2003). Language teaching anxiety and self-efficacy beliefs of pre-service teachers of English. *3rd National Conference of ELT in SQU, Oman*.

Ferrari, R. (2015). Writing narrative style literature reviews. *Medical Writing*, *24*(4), 230–235. https://doi.org/10.1179/2047480615z.000000000329

Fraschini, N., & Park, H. (2021). Anxiety in language teachers: Exploring the variety of perceptions with Q methodology. *Foreign Language Annals*, *54*(2), 341–364. https://doi.org/10.1111/flan.12527

Fraschini, N., & Park, H. (2022). A Q methodology study to explore Korean as a second language undergraduate student-teacher anxiety. *International Journal of Educational Research Open*, *3,* 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedro.2022.100132

Gerencheal, B., & Mishra, D. (2019). Foreign Language Anxiety among Ethiopian University EFL Students. *Online Submission*, *pp. 8*, 43–48. Retrieved from https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED596148.pdf

Ghanizadeh, A., Goldast, G., & Ghonsooly, B. (2020). Designing and Validating the Sources of the EFL Teacher Apprehension Scale (STAS). *Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, *29*(6), 495–508. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-020-00501-5

Green, B. N., Johnson, C. D., & Adams, A. (2006). Writing narrative literature reviews for peer-reviewed journals: secrets of the trade. *Journal of Chiropractic Medicine*, *5*(3), 101–117. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0899-3467(07)60142-6

Gregersen, T., & Horwitz, E. K. (2002). Language Learning and Perfectionism: Anxious and Non-Anxious Language Learners' Reactions to Their Own Oral Performance. *The Modern Language Journal*, *86*(4), 562–570. https://doi.org/10.1111/1540-4781.00161

Greis, N. (1984). Toward a better preparation of the non-native ESOL teacher. *On TESOL*, *84*, 317–324.

Harvey, R., Williams, T. M., Hernandez-Morgan, M., Fischer, M. A., & Neelankavil, J. (2022). Peer Review Guidance for Evaluating the Narrative Review: Lessons Applied From the Systematic Review. *Journal of Cardiothoracic and Vascular Anesthesia*, *36*(3), 735–738. https://doi.org/10.1053/j.jvca.2021.11.020

Hattie, J. (2008). Visible learning: A synthesis of over 800 meta-analyses relating to

achievement. In *Visible Learning: A Synthesis of Over 800 Meta-Analyses Relating to Achievement*. New York, Routledge https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203887332

Hofstede, G. (1984). *Culture's consequences: International differences in work-related values* (Vol. 5). Beverly Hills, CA; Sage.

Holmes, E. (2005). *Teacher Well-Being: Looking after Yourself and Your Career in the Classroom*. London: Taylor & Francis. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203465400

Horwitz, E. (2001). Language anxiety and achievement. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, *21*(2001), 112–126. https://doi.org/10.1017/s0267190501000071

Horwitz, E. K. (1996). Even teachers get the blues: recognizing and alleviating language teachers' feelings of foreign language anxiety. *Foreign Language Annals*, *29*(3), 365–372. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1944-9720.1996.tb01248.x

Horwitz, E. K. (2000). It Ain't Over 'til It is Over: On Foreign Language Anxiety, First Language Deficits, and the Confounding of Variables. *The Modern Language Journal*, *84*(2), 256–259. https://doi.org/10.1111/0026-7902.00067

Horwitz, E. K. (2016). Reflections on Horwitz (1986), "Preliminary Evidence for the Validity and Reliability of a Foreign Language Anxiety Scale." *TESOL Quarterly*, *50*(4), 932–935. https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.295

Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M. B., & Cope, J. (1986). Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*, *70*(2), 125–132. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.1986.tb05256.x

İpek, H. (2006). *Foreign language teaching anxiety* [Anadolu University]. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003019497-10

Kim, J. (2000). *Foreign language listening anxiety: A study of Korean students learning English*. The University of Texas at Austin. Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/openview/c4688d2bbd2299b53984998e8b2d4771/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=187

Kim, S.-Y., Sung-Yeon, K., & Joo-hae, K. (2004). When the Learner Becomes a Teacher: Foreign Language Anxiety as an Occupational Hazard. *English Teaching*, *59*(1), 165–185. http://journal.kate.or.kr/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/kate_59_1_9.pdf

Kobul, M. K., & Saraçoğlu, İ. N. (2020). Foreign Language Teaching Anxiety of Non-Native Pre-Service and In-Service EFL Teachers. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, *9*(3), 350-365. https://doi.org/10.7596/taksad.v9i3.2143

Krashen, S. (1982). *Principles and practice in second language acquisition*. University of Southern California, Pergamon Press Inc.

Kunt, N., & Tüm, D. Ö. (2010). Non-native student teachers' feelings of foreign language anxiety. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *2*(2), 4672–4676. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.03.748

Liebert, R. M., & Morris, L. W. (1967). Cognitive and emotional components of test anxiety: A distinction and some initial data. *Psychological Reports*, *20*(3), 975–978.

Liu, H., Yan, C., & Fu, J. (2022). Exploring livestream English teaching anxiety in the Chinese context: An ecological perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *111*, 103620. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103620

Liu, M., & Huang, W. (2011). An Exploration of Foreign Language Anxiety and English Learning Motivation. *Education Research International*, *2011*, 1–8. https://doi.org/10.1155/2011/493167

Liu, M., & Wu, B. (2021). Teaching Anxiety and Foreign Language Anxiety Among Chinese College English Teachers. *SAGE Open*, *11*(2), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211016556

MacIntyre, P. D. (1995). On Seeing the Forest and the Trees: A Rejoinder to Sparks and Ganschow. *The Modern Language Journal*, *79*(2), 245. https://doi.org/10.2307/329623

MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1989). Anxiety and Second-Language Learning: Toward a Theoretical Clarification. *Language Learning*, *39*(2), 251–275. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-1770.1989.tb00423.x

MacIntyre, P. D., & Gardner, R. C. (1991). Investigating language class anxiety using the focused essay technique. *The Modern Language Journal*, *75*(3), 296–304. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.1991.tb05358.x

Mercer, S. (2018). Psychology for language learning: Spare a thought for the teacher. *Language Teaching*, *51*(4), 504–525. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444817000258

Mercer, S., Oberdorfer, P., & Saleem, M. (2016). Helping Language Teachers to Thrive: Using Positive Psychology to Promote Teachers' Professional Well-Being. In D. Gabryś-Barker and D. Gałajda (eds.), *Positive psychology perspectives on foreign language learning and teaching* (pp. 213–229). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-32954-3_12

Moskowitz, S., & Dewaele, J. M. (2021). Is teacher happiness contagious? A study of the link between perceptions of language teacher happiness and student attitudes. *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching*, *15*(2), 117–130. https://doi.org/10.1080/17501229.2019.1707205

Orafi, S. M. S. (2008). *Investigating teachers' practices and beliefs in relation to curriculum innovation in English language teaching in Libya.* I (Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation). University of Leeds, UK. Available at http://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/1485/

Pipuš, D. (2021). Overcoming Speaking Anxiety in the EFL Classroom. *World Confrence on Education and Teaching*, pp. 15–25.

Rapee, R. M., & Heimberg, R. G. (1997). A cognitive-behavioral model of anxiety in social phobia. *Behaviour Research and Therapy*, *35*(8), 741–756.

Rivers, D. J. (2022). The Situation Specific Arousal Analyzer: Innovation in the Physiological Assessment of Foreign Language Education Anxiety. *Frontiers in education*, pp. *7*, 1–8. https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2022.802639

Scovel, T. (1978). the Effect of Affect on Foreign Language Learning: a Review of the Anxiety Research. *Language Learning*, *28*(1), 129–142. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-1770.1978.tb00309.x

Sparks, R. L., & Ganschow, L. (1991). Foreign Language Learning Differences: Affective or Native Language Aptitude Differences? *The Modern Language Journal*, *75*(1), 3–16. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.1991.tb01076.x

Spielberger, C. D., Jacobs, G. A., Russell, S., & Crane, R. J. (1983). Assessment of anger: The state-trait anger scale. *Advances in Personality Assessment*, *2*, 112–134.

Tang, T. (2007). *Investigating NNS English teachers' self-assessed language proficiency in an EFL context*. Retrieved from https://escholarship.mcgill.ca/concern/theses/tq57nr25f

Toyama, M., & Yamazaki, Y. (2022). Foreign Language Anxiety and Individualism-Collectivism Culture: A Top-Down Approach for a Country/Regional-Level Analysis. *SAGE Open*, *12*(1), 5–6. https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211069143

Tum, D. O. (2015). Foreign Language Anxiety's Forgotten Study: The Case of the Anxious Pre-

service Teacher. *TESOL Quarterly*, *49*(4), 627–658. https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.190

Tüm, D. Ö. (2019). Foreign language anxiety among prospective language teachers. *Folklor/Edebiyat*, *25*(97), 343–358. https://doi.org/10.22559/FOLKLOR.946

Vorobel, O. (2022). A systematic review of research on distance language teaching (2011–2020): Focus on methodology. *System*, *105*, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2022.102753

Williams, K. E., & Andrade, M. R. (2008). Foreign language learning anxiety in Japanese EFL university classes: Causes, coping, and locus of control. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language teaching*, *5*(2), 181–191. Retrieved from http://e-flt.nus.edu.sg/v5n22008/williams.pdf

Winton, E. C., Clark, D. M., & Edelmann, R. J. (1995). Social anxiety, fear of negative evaluation and the detection of negative emotion in others. *Behaviour Research and Therapy*, *33*(2), 193–196.

Wollheim, R. (1999). *On the emotions*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Woodrow, L. (2006). Anxiety and speaking English as a second language. *RELC Journal*, *37*(3), 308–328. https://doi.org/10.1177/0033688206071315

Yangın Ekşi, G., & Yılmaz Yakışık, B. (2016). To Be Anxious or Not: Student Teachers in the Practicum. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, *4*(6), 1332–1339. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2016.040610

Young, D. J. (1991). Creating a Low-Anxiety Classroom Environment: What Does Language Anxiety Research Suggest? *The Modern Language Journal*, *75*(4), 426–437. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.1991.tb05378.x