

INDIVIDUAL LEVEL DETERMINANTS MODEL FOR BENEFIT USE OF  
BUSINESS INTELLIGENCE IN MALAYSIAN MANUFACTURING  
ORGANIZATIONS

ERNIE MAZUIN BINTI MOHD YUSOF

UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MALAYSIA

INDIVIDUAL LEVEL DETERMINANTS MODEL FOR BENEFIT USE OF  
BUSINESS INTELLIGENCE IN MALAYSIAN MANUFACTURING  
ORGANIZATIONS

ERNIE MAZUIN BINTI MOHD YUSOF

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the  
requirements for the award of the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy

School of Computing  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

NOVEMBER 2021

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I thank Allah for giving me the strength, knowledge, and ability to complete this thesis.

My gratitude goes to my supervisor, Associate Professor Dr Mohd Shahizan Bin Othman for his contribution of knowledge, ideas, guidance, patience, and support during my research and in completing the thesis.

I am also thankful to Mrs. Lizawati Binti Mi Yusuf, Mrs. Shamini A/P Raja Kumaran and Mr. Qusay Al-Maatouk for their support and knowledge sharing.

My superior at my current workplace, the head of Instrumentation and Control Engineering section, UniKL MITEC, Dr Mohd Ismail Bin Yusof must also be acknowledged for his support, guidance and understanding throughout this journey.

My appreciation also extends to all my colleagues, friends, academicians, practitioners, and others who have provided assistance at various occasions.

I would also wish to express my gratefulness to my beloved family members for their endless support, encouragement, and love to make this thesis a reality.

Last but not least, I would like to thank Universiti Teknologi Malaysia for giving me the opportunity to do my postgraduate study, as well as providing a conducive and supportive environment to conduct the research.

## ABSTRACT

Over the past few years, there has been an uplifting trend in the usage of Business Intelligence (BI) in the manufacturing sector. The implementation of BI in the industry has helped many manufacturing organizations improve their business processes, by solving manufacturing issues and ensuring high efficiency. Despite the predominant implementation of BI in manufacturing organizations, there were still failures reported in the implementation of it, in which it could be due to the lack of readiness for the BI implementation and processing itself. The lack of readiness can be attributed not only to the technical aspects of the BI, but also to the social aspects of it, such as those related to humans and change management. Many studies were conducted on Critical Success Factors (CSF) of BI in manufacturing organizations; however, there were less studies conducted on the individual determinants for benefit use of BI in manufacturing organizations. The research of determinants for benefit utilization of BI that incorporate individual aspects is still underexplored in Malaysian manufacturing organizations. Therefore, this research aims to understand the potential factors that influence the benefit use of BI in Malaysian manufacturing industry. This study developed a model by integrating Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use Technology (UTAUT) and DeLone and McLean's (D&M) model to explore individual factors that affect benefit use of BI. A set of constructs and their interrelationships were formulated as the research hypotheses from the unification of theoretical backgrounds and interdisciplinary literatures related to BI in manufacturing. By surveying 477 employees of Malaysian manufacturing firms, a quantitative approach was utilized to test twelve hypotheses of the proposed model. All the survey data were analyzed utilizing IBM SPSS Statistics 24 and SmartPLS 3.0 based on Structural Equation Modelling (SEM). The results indicated that the following factors are the most significant determinants that influenced the benefit use of BI—training, top management's influence, performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence, facilitating condition, effective use and user satisfaction. In addition, this study also revealed that there is no significant relationship between training and facilitating condition, and between training and effective use. Theoretically, this study empirically proposed a new model based on UTAUT and D&M models in the context of developing countries for individual determinants that influence the benefit use of the system. Practically, this model presented a guideline encompassing user-related issues that practitioners and manufacturers might apply during the design and implementation of BI.

## ABSTRAK

Sejak beberapa tahun kebelakangan ini, terdapat trend yang menggalakkan dalam penggunaan Kepintaran Perniagaan (BI) dalam sektor pembuatan. Pelaksanaan kepintaran perniagaan dalam industri tersebut telah membantu banyak syarikat pembuatan untuk menambah baik proses-proses perniagaan mereka dengan menyelesaikan isu-isu yang berkaitan dengan pembuatan serta memastikan kecekapan yang tinggi. Walaupun kepintaran perniagaan telah banyak dilaksanakan di dalam syarikat pembuatan, masih ada kegagalan yang dilaporkan berkaitan dengan pelaksanaan tersebut. Ini disebabkan oleh ketidaksediaan dalam melaksana dan memproses kepintaran perniagaan tersebut. Ketidaksediaan tersebut boleh dikaitkan dengan bukan hanya daripada aspek teknikal tetapi juga daripada aspek sosial seperti yang berkaitan dengan manusia dan pengurusan perubahan. Banyak kajian telah dijalankan terhadap faktor kritikal kejayaan kepintaran perniagaan dalam syarikat pembuatan; walaupun begitu, terdapat kurangnya kajian yang dijalankan ke atas faktor penentu yang berkaitan dengan perseorangan terhadap penggunaan kepintaran perniagaan secara berfaedah di dalam syarikat pembuatan. Di syarikat pembuatan di Malaysia, kajian ke atas faktor penentu yang berkaitan dengan perseorangan terhadap penggunaan berfaedah kepintaran perniagaan masih lagi kurang diterokai. Oleh yang demikian, kajian ini bertujuan untuk memahami faktor yang berpotensi untuk mempengaruhi penggunaan berfaedah kepintaran perniagaan dalam industri pembuatan di Malaysia. Kajian ini membangunkan model dengan menggabungkan Teori Penyatuan Penerimaan dan Penggunaan Teknologi (UTAUT) dan model Delone & McLean (D&M) untuk meneroka faktor perseorangan yang mempengaruhi penggunaan berfaedah kepintaran perniagaan. Satu set konstruk dan hubungan kait di antara konstruk tersebut telah diformulasi sebagai hipotesis kajian berdasarkan penggabungan latar belakang teori-teori dan literatur antara disiplin yang berkaitan dengan kepintaran perniagaan dalam pembuatan. Pendekatan kuantitatif telah diaplikasikan dengan melakukan tinjauan ke atas 477 pekerja syarikat pembuatan di Malaysia bagi menguji dua belas hipotesis untuk model yang dicadangkan. Perisian IBM SPSS Statistics 24 dan SmartPLS 3.0 telah diguna pakai untuk menganalisis semua data tinjauan. Hasil kajian mendapati faktor penentu yang ketara yang mempengaruhi penggunaan berfaedah kepintaran perniagaan adalah seperti berikut—pengaruh pihak pengurusan atasan, jangkaan prestasi, jangkaan usaha, pengaruh sosial, keadaan memudahkan, penggunaan efektif, dan kepuasan pengguna. Di samping itu, kajian ini juga menunjukkan bahawa tiada hubungan kait yang ketara di antara latihan dan keadaan memudahkan, dan di antara latihan dan penggunaan efektif. Secara teorinya, dapatan kajian mencadangkan model yang baru berdasarkan UTAUT dan model D&M di dalam konteks negara membangun untuk faktor penentu berkaitan perseorangan yang mempengaruhi penggunaan berfaedah sistem tersebut. Secara praktikalnya, model ini mencadangkan garis panduan yang mengandungi isu-isu berkaitan dengan pengguna yang boleh digunakan oleh para pengamal dan pemilik syarikat pembuatan, semasa reka bentuk dan pelaksanaan kepintaran perniagaan.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
	<b>DECLARATION</b>	<b>iii</b>
	<b>DEDICATION</b>	<b>iv</b>
	<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</b>	<b>v</b>
	<b>ABSTRACT</b>	<b>vi</b>
	<b>ABSTRAK</b>	<b>vii</b>
	<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	<b>viii</b>
	<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	<b>xiii</b>
	<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	<b>xv</b>
	<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>	<b>xvii</b>
	<b>LIST OF SYMBOLS</b>	<b>xix</b>
	<b>LIST OF APPENDICES</b>	<b>xx</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Overview of Business Intelligence in Organizations	1
1.3	Background of the Problem	4
1.4	Problem Statement	7
1.5	Research Questions	8
1.6	Research Objectives	8
1.7	Research Scope	9
1.8	Significance of the Study	10
	1.8.1 Theoretical Contribution	10
	1.8.2 Contribution to Practitioners and Manufacturing Industry	11
1.9	Organization of the Thesis	11
1.10	Summary	13

<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	<b>LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	<b>15</b>
2.1	Introduction	15
2.2	The Manufacturing Industry	17
	2.2.1 Size of Manufacturing Organizations in Malaysia	19
2.3	Business Intelligence	20
	2.3.1 Business Intelligence Usage in Manufacturing	22
	2.3.2 Benefit Use of Business Intelligence	26
2.4	Prior Studies on Business Intelligence	29
2.5	Related Models and Frameworks Used in Previous Research	34
2.6	Theoretical Model	48
	2.6.1 Unified Technology of Acceptance and Usage of Technology (UTAUT) Theory	49
	2.6.2 Benefit Use Theories	51
	2.6.2.1 IS Continuance Model (ISCM)	52
	2.6.2.2 DeLone and McLean IS Success Model (2003)	53
2.7	Selected Variables and its Definition	55
	2.7.1 Performance Expectancy	56
	2.7.2 Effort Expectancy	57
	2.7.3 Social Influence	57
	2.7.4 Facilitating Conditions	58
	2.7.5 Net Benefits	58
	2.7.6 Training as a Construct	59
	2.7.7 Top Management Influence as a Construct	61
	2.7.8 Effective Use	63
	2.7.9 The Role of User Satisfaction in Benefit Use	65
2.8	Research Conceptual Model	71
2.9	Research Hypotheses	73
2.10	Summary	78
<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	<b>RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>81</b>
3.1	Introduction	81

3.2	Research Paradigm	81
3.3	Research Approach	83
3.4	Research Operational Framework	85
3.4.1	Theoretical Foundation (Phase 1)	87
3.4.2	Development of Research Model and Instrument (Phase 2)	88
3.4.3	Pilot Study (Phase 3)	89
3.4.4	Survey for Main Study and Test the Hypotheses (Phase 4)	89
3.4.5	Documentation and Research Completion (Phase 5)	90
3.5	Elaboration of Research Instrument Design	91
3.6	Pilot Study	93
3.7	Development of Measurement Items	95
3.8	Sampling Strategy	98
3.8.1	Population Selection	99
3.8.2	Sample Size	99
3.8.3	Data Collection	101
3.9	Data Analysis	102
3.10	Data Analysis Process	103
3.10.1	Evaluation of Measurement Model	104
3.10.2	Evaluation of Structural Model	106
3.11	Summary	110
<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	<b>DATA ANALYSIS AND MODEL EVALUATION</b>	<b>111</b>
4.1	Introduction	111
4.2	Pilot Study	111
4.3	Background of the Main Survey Analysis	112
4.3.1	Demographic Analysis	113
4.3.2	Business Intelligence System Use	116
4.3.3	Employees' Years of Working Experience	117
4.3.4	Employees Business Intelligence Login Frequency	118
4.4	Data Analysis	119



4.5	Evaluation of the Measurement Model	120
4.5.1	Internal Consistency Reliability	120
4.5.2	Convergent Validity	121
4.5.3	Discriminant Validity	123
4.6	Evaluation of the Structural Model	126
4.6.1	Collinearity Assessment	126
4.6.2	Path Coefficients	127
4.6.2.1	Hypotheses Testing Results	128
4.6.3	Coefficient of Determination ( $R^2$ )	132
4.6.4	Effect Size ( $f^2$ )	133
4.6.5	Predictive Relevance $Q^2$	134
4.6.6	Importance-Performance Map Analysis (IPMA)	134
4.7	Summary	136
<b>CHAPTER 5</b>	<b>RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b>	<b>139</b>
5.1	Introduction	139
5.2	Discussion of Measurement Model Results	139
5.3	Discussion of Structural Model Results and IPMA	140
5.4	Discussion of Hypotheses Review and Confirmation by Experts	141
5.4.1	Discussion on Hypotheses Review	143
5.4.2	Confirmation by Experts	151
5.5	Chapter Summary	156
<b>CHAPTER 6</b>	<b>CONCLUSION AND FUTURE WORKS</b>	<b>157</b>
6.1	Overview	157
6.2	Research Summary and Achievement	157
6.2.1	First Research Objective	158
6.2.2	Second Research Objective	160
6.2.3	Third Research Objective	161
6.3	Research Contribution	163
6.3.1	Theoretical Contributions	163
6.3.2	Practical Contributions	165

6.4	Limitations of the Research	166
6.5	Recommendations and Future Research Avenues	167
6.6	Concluding Remarks	168
6.7	Summary	168
<b>REFERENCES</b>		<b>169</b>

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>TABLE NO.</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
Table 2.1	Classification for Size of Malaysian Manufacturing Organizations	20
Table 2.2	Summary of Prior Studies on BI Implementation in Manufacturing Organizations	33
Table 2.3	Summary of Frameworks and Models Used in Previous Research	43
Table 2.4	Constructs of Research Model and Their Causal Links Summary	47
Table 2.5	Summary of Mostly Referred Variables	67
Table 2.6	Definition of Research Variables	72
Table 2.7	Summary of Hypotheses and Structural Relationship	78
Table 3.1	Activities in Theoretical Foundation Phase	87
Table 3.2	Operational Framework for Phase 2	88
Table 3.3	Operational Framework for Phase 3	89
Table 3.4	Operational Framework for Phase 4	90
Table 3.5	Operational Framework for Phase 5	90
Table 3.6	Expert Evaluators' Profile	92
Table 3.7	Measurement Items for Each Construct	95
Table 3.8	Summary of Measurement Model Evaluation Criteria	106
Table 3.9	Summary of Structural Model Evaluation Criteria	108
Table 4.1	Reliability of Instrument Results - Cronbach's Alpha Values (Pilot Study)	112
Table 4.2	Respondents' Position and Gender	113
Table 4.3	Respondents' Age	114
Table 4.4	Respondents' Level of Education	115
Table 4.5	Type of BI System Used by Employees	116
Table 4.6	Employees' Years of Working Experience	117
Table 4.7	Respondents' Position by BI Login Frequency	118

Table 4.8	Internal Consistency Reliability Measures - Cronbach's Alpha and Composite Reliability values	121
Table 4.9	Convergent Validity Measures – Outer Loadings and AVE	122
Table 4.10	Discriminant Validity based on Cross-loading Matrix	125
Table 4.11	Discriminant Validity based on Fornell-Larcker Criterion	126
Table 4.12	Results of Collinearity Assessment (VIF Values)	127
Table 4.13	Coefficient of Determination ( $R^2$ )	132
Table 4.14	Effect Size ( $f^2$ )	133
Table 4.15	Predictive Relevance ( $Q^2$ ) for all the Dependent Variables	134
Table 4.16	Summary of Findings of IPMA	135
Table 5.1	Summary of Results of Hypotheses Testing	142
Table 5.2	Interview Session Information	152
Table 5.3	Data Analysis and Final Model Validation Experts' Profile	153
Table 5.4	Feedback of the Expert	155

## LIST OF FIGURES

<b>FIGURE NO.</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
Figure 2.1	Literature Review Organization	16
Figure 2.2	Research Framework (Bailey, 2018)	35
Figure 2.3	Research Model (Hornyak, Rai and Dong, 2020)	36
Figure 2.4	Research Model (Gaardboe, Nyvang and Sandalgaard, 2017)	37
Figure 2.5	Research Model (Isaac <i>et al.</i> , 2018)	38
Figure 2.6	Conceptual Model for Effective Use Enablers (Sejahtera <i>et al.</i> , 2018)	38
Figure 2.7	Research Model (Mudzana and Mahara, 2015)	39
Figure 2.8	Conceptual Model of e-Learning Acceptance (Kadek <i>et al.</i> , 2018)	40
Figure 2.9	Extended Model (Aldholay <i>et al.</i> , 2018)	41
Figure 2.10	Hypothesized Model (Hazen <i>et al.</i> , 2014)	41
Figure 2.11	Research Model (Arasanmi, 2016)	42
Figure 2.12	UTAUT and Virtual Teamwork Training Model (Godin <i>et al.</i> , 2017)	43
Figure 2.13	The UTAUT Theory (Venkatesh <i>et al.</i> , 2003)	50
Figure 2.14	Expectation Confirmation Theory (ECT) (Oliver, 1980)	52
Figure 2.15	IS Continuance Model (Bhattacharjee, 2001)	52
Figure 2.16	Delone and Mclean IS Success Model (Delone and McLean, 1992)	53
Figure 2.17	Updated DeLone and McLean's Model (DeLone and McLean, 2003)	54
Figure 2.18	Conceptual Model for the Research	72
Figure 3.1	Research Operational Framework	86
Figure 3.2	G*Power Software Interface and Setting	101
Figure 3.3	General SEM Model Comprising of Measurement and Structural Components	103

Figure 3.4	Data Analysis Process (Hair <i>et al.</i> , 2017)	109
Figure 4.1	The Measurement and Structural Model	119
Figure 4.2	Structural Model Evaluation – Path Coefficients and R <sup>2</sup>	128
Figure 4.3	Results of Hypotheses Testing	129
Figure 4.4	Findings of IPMA	136
Figure 5.1	Summary of Hypotheses Testing Results	142
Figure 6.1	The Model of Benefit Use of BI Through Individual Determinants	162

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AMOS	-	Analysis of Moment Structure
ANOVA	-	Analysis of Variance
AVE	-	Average Variance Extracted
BI	-	Business Intelligence
BDPA	-	Big Data and Predictive Analytics
CB	-	Covariance-based
CEO	-	Chief Executive Officers
CIRP	-	International Conference on Production Engineering
CR	-	Composite Reliability
CRM	-	Customer Relationship Management
CSF	-	Critical Success Factors
D&M	-	Delone and McLean
ECM	-	Expectation-Confirmation Model
ECT	-	Expectation – Confirmation Theory
EE	-	Effort Expectancy
ERP	-	Enterprise Resource Planning
EPR	-	Electronic Patient Record
ES	-	Enterprise System
EE	-	Effective Use
FC	-	Facilitating Conditions
GDP	-	Gross Domestic Product
HIS	-	Healthcare Information Systems
HOT-Fit	-	Human, Organization, and Technology-Fit
ICT	-	Information and Communications Technology
IPMA	-	Importance-Performance Map Analysis
IS	-	Information System
ISCM	-	Information System Continuance Model
IT	-	Information Technology
LISREL	-	Linear Structural Relations
MNCs	-	Multinational Companies

NB	-	Net Benefits
PE	-	Performance Expectancy
PLS	-	Partial Least Square
R&D	-	Research and Development
RBV	-	Resource-Based View
ROB	-	Realization of Benefits
ROI	-	Return on Investment
S	-	User Satisfaction
SAP	-	Systems Applications and Products
SAS	-	Statistical Analysis System
SEM	-	Structural Equation Modelling
SMS	-	School Management System
SI	-	Social Influence
SPSS	-	Statistical Package for the Social Science
SQL	-	Structured Query Language
SSM	-	Suruhanjaya Syarikat Malaysia
TAM	-	Theory Acceptance Model
TOE	-	Technology-Organization-Environment
TMI	-	Top Management's Influence
TPB	-	Theory of Planned Behavior
TPC	-	Technology-to-Performance Chain
TR	-	Training
TRA	-	Theory of Reasoned Action
TTF	-	Task-Technology Fit
UniKL	-	Universiti Kuala Lumpur, Malaysian Institute of Information Technology
MIIT		
UniKL	-	Universiti Kuala Lumpur, Malaysian Institute of Industrial Technology
MITEC		
UTAUT	-	Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use Technology
UTM	-	Universiti Teknologi Malaysia
VIF	-	Variance Inflation Factor



## LIST OF SYMBOLS

$f^2$	-	Effect size
$\alpha$	-	Alpha (probability of error)
$Q^2$	-	Predictive relevance
$R^2$	-	Coefficient of determination
$\beta$	-	Path coefficient
$p$	-	Significance level or error probability level
$t$	-	Size of the difference relative to the variation in data

## LIST OF APPENDICES

<b>APPENDIX</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
Appendix A	Questionnaire	193
Appendix B	Invitation to Experts for Research Instrument Validation	197
Appendix C	Comments from Expert Evaluators on Instruments Content Validity	203
Appendix D	Permission Letter for Data Collection	208
Appendix E	Invitation to Experts for Research Data Analysis and Final Model Hypotheses Results	209
Appendix F	Expert Evaluators' Feedback Forms	216

# CHAPTER 1

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Introduction

This chapter provides the overview of the research. Firstly, the background of the research problem is presented. The problem background section describes the existing problems that lead to the emergent of the research. This is followed by the problem statement section. Then, the research questions are developed, that lead to the next section which is the research objectives. The research objectives describe the research goals. Next, research scope is presented which explains the extent of the research. After that, the significance of the study section outlines the research contributions both to the theoretical and industrial practitioners' standpoints. Finally, organization of the thesis section describes the structure and synopsis for each chapter of the thesis.

### 1.2 Overview of Business Intelligence in Organizations

The ability of the Business Intelligence (BI) technology to gather and analyze considerable volume of data into information that enables businesses to operate, accomplish their objectives and elevate their performance has made it a valuable technological tool for organizations (Fourati-Jamoussia and Niambab, 2016). As every organization retains the record of their data which is obtained from various transactions, the role of BI that turned the data into knowledge to facilitate users and aid the decision making process makes the system well recognized by organizations (Wall, 2017). Imagine a supermarket having lots of receipts with multiple lines inside the receipts every day. Those are in fact valuable data that will be able to be extracted by BI and processed accordingly, to provide users with useful information which in turn will assist the organizations to discover their needs intelligently. The data can be

used to learn and predict customers' trend in buying goods. This eventually can assist the company to plan diligently in the future to increase its sales. Hence, the benefits of implementing BI in organizations are not only in the internal business process, but in forecasting sales and attracting future customers as well.

The Business Intelligence (BI) term is coined since 1958 by Luhn and is defined as “an automatic system that is being developed to disseminate information to the various sections of any industrial, scientific or government organization” (Grossmann and Rinderle-Ma, 2015). At that time, Luhn's BI system is used to extract and summarize documents and deliver the information for actions to be taken. There are different definitions of BI took place since then. One of them was by Negash (2004) who stated the important aspects of BI which are “business intelligence systems provide actionable information delivered at the right time, at the right location, and in the right form to assist decision makers.” On the other hand, the BI term is expected to gradually change and perhaps will be replaced by other terminology. Thus, in this research, BI is defined as the information acquired from existing data, with the purpose to assist the decision making process of an organization, which is presented visually.

Taking into account the numerous capabilities and benefits offered by BI, more and more organizations had begun to implement the system. There are various industries that implemented BI covering the public and private sectors (Nasab, 2016). The industries are ranging from healthcare, banking, retail, manufacturing, supply chain, software, service and even tourism (Attaran and Attaran, 2018; Chianese and Piccialli, 2018; Karageorgou, 2018; Owuor and Njeru, 2018; Mishra, 2016; Moniruzzaman *et al.*, 2015). Studies also revealed that banking or financial services, manufacturing, software and retail are among the fields that are having the highest users of BI (Attaran and Attaran, 2018). Thus, BI is popular among wide range of organizations, both public and private sectors. The role of BI in translating organizational data into actionable information has made it prevalently used in various industries, including manufacturing.

Over the recent decades, manufacturers have continued to improve the quality of their products and services as well as optimize their processes, in order to withstand the competitive environment to meet the market demand (Lee *et al.*, 2015). The focus of the manufacturers is of course in the production of physical goods that encompasses various processes across the manufacturing plant itself (Sangar, 2014). Consequently, manufacturing organizations must ensure that all the processes and activities are carried out in accordance with the business objectives as well as remain visible to the related employees working in the area, including the decision makers. In relation to that, the use of innovative technologies is considered to be applied, to solve manufacturing issues and ensuring high efficiency (Petrillo *et al.*, 2018). BI is one of the technologies that is able to accomplish those needs and eventually as a tool for sturdier decision making process supporting the growth of the business. This is important to ensure the competitiveness of the organizations in the manufacturing sector which is dynamic and of a fast pace working environment.

There are various business divisions and departments in manufacturing organization that use BI. They are materials planning and management, capacity planning, and shop floor control departments (Koupaei, Mohammadi and Naderi, 2016). The shop floor control can be further categorized into order management, maintenance and repair, and staffing decisions. The focus of the manufacturing division in this research is on the order management decision making, since the use of BI in this division is crucial in determining how fast the manufactured product can reach customer. Therefore, the potential context for such investigation to be carried out is the order management division of manufacturing organizations.

According to the Economic Report 2017/18 (2018), Malaysian manufacturing sector, inclusive of small to medium and large enterprise contributed to sales amounted to RM500.2 billion in the first six months of 2017 which is having the rise of up to 15.6% from 2016. Whereas on the supply aspect of Malaysian economy, the manufacturing and services sectors remain as the main driver for the growth, which indicated a strong performance. Moreover, high number of work opportunities are offered by the manufacturing sector in Malaysia (Azami, Ungku and Choi, 2016), and it is an important sector in Malaysia (Sangar, 2014). All the evidence indicate that the

manufacturing sector has played an important role in fostering growth, employment, income, and has been an integral to the Malaysian economy.

In Malaysian manufacturing organizations, the rate of BI adoption is increasing (Azman *et al.*, 2019; Kharuddin *et al.*, 2015). Employing BI in manufacturing organizations is an important project. However, there is insufficient evidence that highlighted the success stories of BI implementation in Malaysian manufacturing organizations, both in small to medium and large enterprises. In other words, many BI projects in Malaysian manufacturing organizations have failed, due to the lack of pushing factors that influence users to utilize the system while realizing the benefits given by the system (Abai, Yahaya and Deraman, 2016; Hatta *et al.*, 2015). Additionally, Rahaman (2017) also mentioned in her study that only few instances of BI implementation in Malaysia are being reported and studied. This means that despite the prevailing capabilities and benefits offered by BI, there are still failures in its implementation projects in Malaysian manufacturing organizations.

Apart from the literature, an interview result with a project manager of BI system implementation in one of Malaysian manufacturing organizations revealed that the capabilities of BI in supporting the decision making are always not being realized by the employees in the order management division. This leads to issues, challenges and subsequently to failure of implementing the system in the organizations. Most of the time, the failure leads to ROI and additional cost involved, which need to be avoided by the management of any manufacturing organization.

### **1.3 Background of the Problem**

According to Boyton *et al.* (2015), the failure for BI projects is in meeting the faster decision making process in organizations. This is also supported by Mudzana and Maharaj (2015) who asserted that the failure of BI implementation in organizations is on the inability of the system to assist users to produce better decision making. Mudzana and Maharaj (2015) also outlined other form of failure for BI implementation which is failing to meet the expectation of stakeholders. Other than that, unclear

implementation goals of BI among the top management (Hasan *et al.*, 2016), and failure to realize the benefits offered by BI (Lautenbach and Johnston, 2017) are also among the disappointments of BI. All the letdowns are also contributing to the low usage rate of BI within organizations. In a nutshell, BI implementation failures are related to not only the technical aspects, but also to the social aspects of it, which is beyond the technological, such as those related with humans, change management and individual.

The attention of scholars towards the social aspects of BI is in due consideration of the barriers and failures on the implementation of BI. The failures are related to not only the technology as the key role, but to other non-technological factors as well, such as individuals, processes, management and also the organizational culture (Mesároš, Čarnický and Mandičák, 2015). The current arguments among the scholars are, the issues and obstacles towards the implementation of BI that could possibly contributing to the failures of it are not merely related to the technical aspect, but there were many cases reportedly related to the social aspects too (Grublješič, Coelho and Jaklič, 2019; Weiler, Matt and Hess, 2019; Mesároš, Čarnický and Mandičák, 2015). The factors classified in the social aspect include corporate policy, corporate culture, and communication, which can be further narrowed down into elements that are the people, individual or human.

In the context of social aspect related to the implementation of a technology in an organization, an individual is the employee or worker of the organization that uses a particular technology (Karimika, 2017). Individuals that used an information system (IS) over a period of time after their first time use would result to the successful implementation of the IS (Hou, 2018; Al-Sharafi, Arshah and Abu-Shanab, 2017). This is mainly due to seldom and ineffective use of IS could lead to unforeseen expenses and useless effort in developing the IS, which could further lead to unattainable business benefits. However, less studies have been given attention by researchers on the benefit use of software systems as compared to the effect upon the initial adoption of the systems (Fitzgerald and Stol, 2017; Gebauer, Söllner and Leimeister, 2013). There were few studies on the intention of using IS grounded based on common matured theories such as Technological Acceptance Model (TAM),

Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA), Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB) and Unified Theory of Acceptance and Usage of Technology (UTAUT). These theoretical foundations are used to explain IS adoption at the initial stage. To discuss on the benefit use of a system and the underlying theories for this study, it cannot be presumed right after the initial judgment to use the system but most importantly, it should be discussed after the benefit use of the system and on the perspective of economic remuneration or the benefits that the system provides, rather than after the initial use of the system (Fitzgerald and Stol, 2017). It must be understood that the influence of BI and the benefits that the system offers could not be seen in a short period of time, i.e. after the initial acceptance (Weaver, 2016). Therefore, this leads to a theoretical gap between the initial use of an IS and the benefit use of it. It is crucial to explore the long-term effect of BI usage in organizations.

A comprehensive literature review revealed that there are few studies exploring the benefit use of BI in manufacturing organizations. For instance, Hou (2015) adopted matured theories like Technological Acceptance Model (TAM) by (Davis, Bagozzi and Warshaw, 1989) and Expectation-Confirmation Model (ECM) by Bhattacharjee (2001), to study on the benefit use of BI by individuals from the perspective of organizational decision making capability at the post-adoption stage. More recently, Cheng (2018) studied on the users benefit use of cloud ERP, which is also one the BI systems. The study utilized the Expectation-Confirmation Model (ECM) by Bhattacharjee (2001), DeLone and McLean (D&M) Information System Success Model by DeLone and McLean (2003) and Task-Technology Fit (TTF) by Goodhue and Thompson (1995). Although all these theories are appropriate and had been utilized in technology acceptance studies, the theories were originated based on the age where users were relatively new to the digital world (Fitzgerald and Stol, 2017). In addition, those theories do not incorporate individual aspects that ultimately lead to benefit use. Furthermore, most of the research used the term ‘intention’ all the while where the word is not suitable to be used in BI system context, since ‘intention’ is more appropriate to be used in voluntary setting of an IS (Gewald and Gewald, 2020). BI is used as a mandatory system for the decision making in the order management division of manufacturing organizations. Therefore, the benefit use agenda of a BI system in manufacturing organizations is still under question and need to undergo



further research that encompasses a holistic view, especially on the user or individual aspects.

Moreover, there is almost no research done in Malaysian manufacturing organizations on modelling the benefit use of BI. Researches were previously done in different country like Taiwan, which focused on the intention of the users to use BI rather than the benefit use of BI in manufacturing organizations (Cheng, 2018; Hou, 2018). The research utilized theories like ECM, D&M and TTF. Although the theories are appropriate and had been used in technology acceptance studies, they do not incorporate individual characteristics that affect the benefit use of BI, which is the focus of this research. For these reasons, the gap in knowledge exists whereby there is a need to develop a comprehensive model to confer more understanding on individual determinants that affect the benefit use of BI in Malaysian manufacturing organizations. Furthermore, since Malaysia is witnessing a major change in IS used for decision making, therefore, Malaysian manufacturing sector, covering small to medium and large enterprises is an appropriate context to conduct a research on the benefit use of BI. In addition, the evidence upon interviewing the BI project manager as stated previously disclosed the importance of understanding the individual determinants that influence the benefit use of BI in Malaysian manufacturing organizations.

#### **1.4 Problem Statement**

Despite the predominant implementation of BI in manufacturing organizations, there were failures reported in relation with the implementation of it. Additionally, in Malaysia, although the implementation of BI in manufacturing industry is rising, there are still failures reported on the implementation of it, especially in the order management section of manufacturing organizations, ranging from small to medium and large enterprises. For this reason, many research were conducted to study pertaining to the issues. Those research developed models that were originated from various underlying theoretical models whose variables were evaluated using respective measurement method. However, the developed models did not incorporate individual

related factors in them as influential determinants among the users that eventually lead to the benefit use of BI. Therefore, the research problem for this study is to investigate and explore the determinants related to individual and how the determinants influence the benefit use of BI in Malaysian manufacturing sector. Consequently, in-depth study is required to model the individual determinants, to confer more understanding on the benefit use of BI in Malaysian manufacturing organizations.

## **1.5 Research Questions**

The research questions to be attempted by this study have been identified as follows:

1. What are the determinants related to individual that influence the beneficial use of BI in manufacturing-based organizations?
2. How to develop a model of individual determinants that influences the benefit use of BI which identifies the relationship between the determinants?
3. How to evaluate a model of individual determinants that influence the benefit use of BI in manufacturing-based organizations.

## **1.6 Research Objectives**

The main objective of this research is to develop a model of individual level determinants for BI that consequently affects the benefit use of the system in manufacturing organizations. The specific objectives of this research are as follows:

1. To identify the individual determinants that influence the benefit use of BI in manufacturing-based organizations.

2. To develop a model of individual determinants that influences the benefit use of BI which identifies the relationship between the determinants.
3. To evaluate a model of individual determinants that influence the benefit use of BI in manufacturing-based organizations.

## **1.7 Research Scope**

This study focuses on identifying the individual determinants that influence the benefit use in the context of BI system. Therefore, the scope of this study is only on the BI systems, including Baan Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP), Infor ERP, Systems Applications and Products (SAP), Statistical Analysis System (SAS), Oracle, IBM, and others that fall in the similar category (Kemboi, Wanyoike and Langat, 2019; Azeroual and Theel, 2018; Sneller, 2014).

The study targets Malaysian manufacturing organizations that have implemented BI, ranging from small to medium and large enterprises. The division involved was the order management of the manufacturing organizations. The target participants were the employees in the division that used BI in their work. The employees were of any levels until the top management, since the sample from users of diverse levels are required to see more comprehensive pattern on the results (Hou and Gao, 2018; Sönmez, 2018).

In gathering data from employees at each manufacturing organization, quantitative method was used. UTAUT and D&M model were used as the basis for gathering quantitative data. The Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) was used to perform empirical validation of the model proposed which includes the evaluation of measurement model and structural model. SmartPLS 3.0 was utilized in this research.

## **1.8 Significance of the Study**

The result of this study can be used to support future research on BI system particularly in relations with individual determinants that leads to **benefit** use of the system. The contribution of this study can be categorized into theoretical and practical standpoints as outlined in the next sub sections.

### **1.8.1 Theoretical Contribution**

The endeavour of this research is to identify the individual related determinants of BI in Malaysian manufacturing organizations, which consequently affects the benefit use of the system and the relationship between the determinants. Thus, for researchers and practitioners, this research provides in-depth understanding of the determinants from users' context that influence the benefit use of BI.

Another endeavour of this research is to develop a conceptual model of individual related determinants that influence the benefit use of the system. For that reason, this research integrates UTAUT and D&M model to provide another in-depth understanding towards the factors among the BI users that consequently determine the benefit use of BI. As a result, this study enriched the previous academic research on BI system implementation through developing a more comprehensive model for benefit use of BI, catering a contribution to knowledge.

Furthermore, this investigation embarks on the context of manufacturing companies in Malaysia where previous research attempts were done in other countries such as Thailand, Taiwan, South Africa, China, Australia, Turkey, Iran and USA. Therefore, this research highlights Malaysia as one of the developing countries that contributes to the world's economy and spotlights on the BI implementation, which contributes to knowledge.

## **1.8.2 Contribution to Practitioners and Manufacturing Industry**

From practitioners and manufacturers standpoint, this research contributes to a valuable insights whereby whenever there is a plan to study, implement or provide services for consultancy for the BI system, they will be able to foresee any issues related to users of the system such as, can the system be acceptable by the users, what are the reasons for failures in accepting the system by the users, corrective actions to be taken whenever there are such cases, and how can the employees be stimulated to use the system. These considerations are important to ensure that the high investment and resources in implementing the BI is worth spending, which will eventually lead to improved business performance.

Other than that, the results of this research will be able to guide the practitioners and manufacturers on the current emerging trends of the BI system usage in the country and the culture of use of the system specific to users and employees in Malaysia context, to serve them a new platform in handling user-related issues. That is to say, the result will be able to increase their understanding on the current issues faced by manufacturing companies in Malaysia, considering the anomaly from other countries such as Thailand, Taiwan, South Africa, China, Australia, Turkey, Iran and USA.

## **1.9 Organization of the Thesis**

This thesis is structured into six chapters. Every chapter begins with an overview of the purpose and objective of the chapter and ends with the summary of the chapter. The synopsis for each chapter is outlined as follows.

Chapter 1 Introduction: This chapter presents a detailed introduction of the study in terms of the background of the problem, problem statement, research questions, research objectives, research scope and significance of the study. At the end of the chapter, the thesis organization is described.

Chapter 2 Literature Review: This chapter scrutinizes over the previous relevant literatures related to overview of manufacturing industry, BI system, BI system used in manufacturing, and interdisciplinary research review on BI. Based on that, the chapter discusses on the determinants selected for the research, the relationships established between the determinants and the relevant theories and models for the research that lead to the establishment of the research model. Ultimately, research conceptual model and research hypotheses are proposed.

Chapter 3 Research Methodology: This chapter explains on the justification for the method and illustration of the design used in this study. Details on each step of the research design are presented. Phases of the research are explained correspondingly. The analysis techniques that are used in the research utilizing the SmartPLS software version 3 are described in this chapter. This chapter also displays the processes employed for the development of the research instrument, which is the survey.

Chapter 4 Data Analysis: This chapter examines the data analysis results. Firstly, the pilot study results are presented. This is followed by the demographic analysis results, and the results of the main data analysis related to the proposed model and hypotheses using the Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) approach with SmartPLS 3.0.

Chapter 5 Results and Discussion: This chapter discusses the key findings that evolved from the outcomes of data analysis. The validation of the data analysis and final model with the experts is presented in this chapter. At the end of the chapter, the discussion on important factors to be considered by industrial practitioners using IPMA analysis is acquainted.

Chapter 6 Conclusion: This chapter wraps up the study in terms of achievement of objectives, summary of the research and emphasis on the research contributions in theoretical and practical aspects. The chapter also defines the guideline for recommendation among researchers intended to conduct future study. Finally, this chapter recognizes limitations, recommendations, and challenges for future research.

## **1.10 Summary**

This chapter introduced the research domain in terms of background of the research, followed by the discussion on the research gap that needs to be addressed. After that, research problem is determined. Then, the research questions and research objectives are outlined. Subsequently, the scope and significance of the research are presented. The last section of this chapter described the thesis structure. The subsequent chapter will review the relevant literatures as the foundation and justification for the research.

## REFERENCES

- Abai, N. H. Z., Yahaya, J. and Deraman, A. (2016) 'Business Intelligence and Analytics in Managing Organizational Performance: The Requirement Analysis Model', *Journal of Advances in Information Technology*, 7(3), pp. 208–213.
- Abouzahra, M. (2017) *Exploring the Continuous Use of Knowledge-Based Clinical Decision Support Systems and Its Relationship with Knowledge Translation*. PhD Thesis, McMaster University, Canada.
- Addo-Tenkorang, R. and Helo, P. T. (2016) 'Big Data Applications in Operations/Supply-Chain Management: A Literature Review .', *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, 101, pp. 528–543.
- Adenuga, K. I. (2018) *Telemedicine Adoption Model for Clinicians in Nigeria*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Malaysia.
- Adenuga, K. I., Mbarika, V. W. and Omogbadegun, Z. O. (2019) 'Technical Support: Towards Mitigating Effects of Computer Anxiety on Acceptance of E-Assessment Amongst University Students in Sub Saharan African Countries', in *International Federation for Information Processing 2019*, pp. 48–72.
- Ahmad, A. (2015) 'Business Intelligence for Sustainable Competitive Advantage', *Sustaining Competitive Advantage Via Business Intelligence, Knowledge Management, and System Dynamics (Advances in Business Marketing and Purchasing)*, 22A, pp. 3–220.
- Al-Dmour, R. H. (2014) *An Integration Model for Identifying the Determinants of the Adoption and Implementation Level of HRIS Applications and Its Effectiveness in Business Organisations in Jordan*. PhD Thesis, Brunel University London, England.
- Al-Rahmi, W. M. *et al.* (2019) 'Integrating innovation diffusion theory with technology acceptance model: supporting students' attitude towards using a massive open online courses (MOOCs) systems', *Interactive Learning Environments*. Taylor & Francis, pp. 1–13.



- Al-Rahmi, W. M. A. (2015) *The Impact of Social Media Use in Collaborative Learning Towards Learning Performance Among Research Students*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Malaysia.
- Al-Rahmi, W. M. and Zeki, A. M. (2016) 'A model of using social media for collaborative learning to enhance learners' performance on learning', *Journal of King Saud University - Computer and Information Sciences*. King Saud University, 29(4), pp. 526–535.
- Al-Sharafi, M. A., Arshah, R. A. and Abu-Shanab, E. A. (2017) 'Factors Affecting the Continuous Use of Cloud Computing Services from Expert's Perspective', in *Proceedings of the 2017 IEEE Region 10 Conference (TENCON)*, pp. 986–991.
- Aldholay, A. *et al.* (2018) 'An extension of Delone and McLean IS success model with self-efficacy: Online learning usage in Yemen', *International Journal of Information and Learning Technology*, 35(4), pp. 285–304.
- Alghamdi, A. D. G. (2014) *An Integrated Model of the Influence of Personal Psychological Traits and Cognitive Beliefs on Customer Satisfaction and Continuance Intentions in Relation to Internet Banking Usage within the Saudi Arabian Context*. PhD Thesis, Plymouth University, United Kingdom.
- Ali, F. *et al.* (2018) 'An assessment of the use of partial least squares structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM) in hospitality research', *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 30(1), pp. 514–538.
- Angelina, R. J., Hermawan, A. and Suroso, A. I. (2019) 'Analyzing E-Commerce Success using DeLone and McLean Model', *Journal of Information Systems Engineering and Business Intelligence*, 5(2), pp. 156–162.
- Arasanmi, C. N. (2016) 'Understanding Post-Training Behaviour in Information Systems', *Australian Academy of Business and Economics Review*, 2(3), pp. 196–207.
- Arvidsson, J. and Kojic, D. (2017) *Critical Success Factors in ERP Implementation: The Perspective of the Procurement System User*. Jönköping University, Sweden. Available at: <http://hj.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A1104451&dswid=6277>.
- Asadi, S. (2017) *Green Information Technology Adoption Model Based on Decision Makers Intention in Malaysian Manufacturing Industry*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Malaysia.

- Asadi, S. *et al.* (2019) 'Investigating factors influencing decision-makers' intention to adopt Green IT in Malaysian manufacturing industry', *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 148(March), pp. 36–54.
- Attaran, M. and Attaran, S. (2018) 'The Rise of Embedded Analytics : Empowering Manufacturing and Service Industry With Big Data', *International Journal of Business Intelligence Research*, 9(1), pp. 16–37.
- Audzeyeva, A. and Hudson, R. (2015) 'How to get the most from a business intelligence application during the post implementation phase ? Deep structure transformation at a U . K . retail bank', *European Journal of Information Systems*. Nature Publishing Group, pp. 1–18.
- Avkiran, N. K. (2018) 'Rise of the Partial Least Squares Structural Equation Modeling: An Application in Banking', in *Partial least squares structural equation modeling*. Springer, Cham, pp. 1–29.
- Azami, N. ., Ungku, A. U. . and Choi, S. . (2016) 'A Study on Relationship between Organizational Justice and Turnover Intentions in Malaysian Manufacturing Industries Akademia Baru', *Journal of Advanced Research in Business and Management Studies*, 2(1), pp. 31–38.
- Azer, I. *et al.* (2016) 'Contribution of Economic Sectors to Malaysian GDP', in *Regional Conference on Science, Technology and Social Sciences (RCSTSS 2014)*.
- Azeroual, O. and Theel, H. (2018) 'The Effects of Using Business Intelligence Systems on an Excellence Management and Decision-Making Process by Start-Up Companies: A Case Study', *International Journal of Management Science and Business Administration*, 4(3), pp. 30–40.
- Azman, S., Idris, N. and Chun, G. C. F. (2019) 'The Challenges and Benefits of Enterprise Resource Planning ( ERP ) System Implementation : A Case in Malaysian Manufacturing Firm', *Management Research Spectrum*, 9(1), pp. 10–14.
- Bailey, A. (2018) *A Case Study Exploring Enterprise Resource Planning System*. PhD Thesis, Capella University, USA.
- Bailey, J. E. (1983) 'Development of a Tool for Measuring and Analyzing Computer User Satisfaction', *Management Science*, 29(5), pp. 530–545.

- Bala, H. and Venkatesh, V. (2015) 'Adaptation to Information Technology: A Holistic Nomological Network from Implementation to Job Outcomes', *Management Science*, (October), pp. 1–24.
- Barclay, D. W., Higgins, C. and Thompson, R. (1995) 'The Partial Least Squares (PLS) Approach to Causal Modeling: Personal Computer Use as an Illustration', *Technology Studies*, 2(2).
- Bargshady, G. *et al.* (2014) 'Business intelligence technology implementation readiness factors', *Jurnal Teknologi (Sciences and Engineering)*, 68(3), pp. 7–12.
- Barnet, A. T. and Liang, N. Y. (2019) 'Method of 3D printing with finishing tool'.
- Batarseh, S. (2018) *Extrinsic and Intrinsic Drivers of BIM Adoption in Construction Organizations*. Master Thesis, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia.
- Bhattacharjee, A. (2001) 'Understanding Information Systems Continuance: An Expectation-Confirmation Model', *MIS Quarterly*, 25(3), pp. 351–370.
- Bischoff, S. *et al.* (2015) 'Understanding continuous use of business intelligence systems: A mixed methods investigation', *Journal of Information Technology Theory and Application*, 16(2), pp. 5–38.
- Bolton, B. and Jakobsson, A. (2018) *Business Intelligence : Transforming Intelligence into Actions*. PhD Thesis, Uppsala University.
- Bolton, R. and Lemon, K. N. (1999) 'A dynamic model of customers' usage of services: Usage as an antecedent and consequence of satisfaction', *Journal of Marketing Research*, 36(2), pp. 171–186.
- Boonsiritomachai, W., McGrath, G. M. and Burgess, S. (2016) 'Exploring business intelligence and its depth of maturity in Thai SMEs', *Cogent Business & Management*. Cogent, 53, pp. 1–17.
- Boonsiritomachai, W., McGrath, G. M. and Burgess, S. (2016) 'Exploring business intelligence and its depth of maturity in Thai SMEs', *Cogent Business and Management*. Cogent, 3(1), pp. 1–17.
- Boyton, J., Ayscough, P. and Kaveri, D. (2015) 'Suboptimal business intelligence implementations: understanding and addressing the problems', *Journal of Systems and Information Technology*, 17(3), pp. 307–320.
- Bozkurt, B. (2016) 'Brand Equity for Tablet Chocolate and Convenience Product Purchases By Women', *British Journal of Marketing Studies*, 4(2), pp. 8–23.

- Brichni, M. *et al.* (2015) 'Business Intelligence for Business Intelligence : A case study at STMicroelectronics', in *9th IEEE conference on Information Science RCIS 2015*, pp. 239–249.
- Browne, R. H. (1995) 'On the use of a pilot sample for sample size determination', *Statistics in Medicine*, 14(17), pp. 1933–1940.
- Burton-Jones, A. and Grange, C. (2013) 'From use to effective use: A representation theory perspective', *Information Systems Research*, 24(3), pp. 632–658.
- Burton-Jones, A. and Straub, D. W. (2006) 'Reconceptualizing system usage: An approach and empirical test', *Information Systems Research*, 17(3), pp. 228–246.
- Busalim, A. H., Masrom, M. and Zakaria, W. N. W. (2019) 'The impact of Facebook Addiction and self-esteem on students' academic performance: A multi-group analysis', *Computers & Education*, 142, pp. 1–14.
- Byrne, B. M. (2016) *Structural Equation Modeling with Amos: Basic Concepts, Applications, and Programming*. Third. Taylor & Francis.
- Candy, P. C. (1989) 'Constructivism and the study of self-direction in adult learning', *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 21(2), pp. 95–116.
- Carpenter, S. (2018) 'Ten Steps in Scale Development and Reporting: A Guide for Researchers', *Communication Methods and Measures*. Routledge, 12(1), pp. 25–44.
- Chattopadhyaya, A. *et al.* (2016) 'Wavelet Decomposition based Skewness and Kurtosis Analysis for Assessment of Stator Current Harmonics in a PWM – Fed Induction Motor Drive during Single Phasing Condition Key words', 59, pp. 1–14.
- Cheng, Y.-M. (2018) 'What drives cloud ERP continuance? An integrated view', *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 31(5), pp. 724–750.
- Chianese, A. and Piccialli, F. (2018) 'A perspective on Applications of In-memory and Associative Approaches Supporting Cultural Big Data Analytics', *International Journal of Computational Science and Engineering*, 16(3), pp. 219–233.
- Chin, W. W. (1998) *The Partial Least Squares Approach to Structural Equation Modeling*. LAWRENCE ERLBAUM ASSOCIATES.
- Chopdar, P. K. *et al.* (2018) 'Mobile shopping apps adoption and perceived risks: A cross-country perspective utilizing the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use

- of Technology', *Computers in Human Behavior*. Elsevier B.V., 86, pp. 109–128.
- Chui, M., Manyika, J. and Miremadi, M. (2017) *Where machines could replace humans—and where they can't (yet)*, *Digital McKinsey* 7.
- Cleff, T. (2019) *Applied Statistics and Multivariate Data Analysis for Business and Economics*. Springer.
- Cohen, J. (1988) *Statistical Power Analysis for the Behavioral Sciences*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L. and Morrison, K. (2000) *Research Methods in Education*. 5th editio.
- Cresswell, J. W. (2014) *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. 4th Editio. SAGE.
- Davis, F. D., Bagozzi, R. P. and Warshaw, P. R. (1989) 'User Acceptance of Computer Technology: A Comparison of Two Theoretical Models', *Management Science*, 35(8), pp. 982–1003.
- Dayan, I. (2017) *A Method for Measuring Internal Fraud Risk (IFR) of Business Organisations with ERP Systems*. PhD Thesis, Brunel University, London.
- Dedić, N. and Stanier, C. (2016) 'Measuring the Success of Changes to Existing Business Intelligence Solutions to Improve Business Intelligence Reporting', *International Federation for Information Processing*, pp. 225–236.
- Delacre, M., Lakens, D. and Leys, C. (2017) 'Why Psychologists Should by Default Use Welch's t-test Instead of Student's t-test', *International Review of Social Psychology*, 30(1), pp. 92–101.
- Delone, W. H. and McLean, E. R. (1992) 'The quest for the dependent variable. Information Systems Research', *Information System Research*, 3(1), pp. 60–95.
- DeLone, W. H. and McLean, E. R. (2003) 'The DeLone and McLean model of information systems success: A ten-year update', *Journal of Management Information Systems*, 19(4), pp. 9–30.
- Denis, D. J. (2019) *SPSS Data Analysis for Univariate, Bivariate, and Multivariate Statistics*. First. John Wiley & Sons, Inc. Library.
- Dremel, C. *et al.* (2020) 'Information & Management Actualizing big data analytics affordances: A revelatory case study', *Information & Management*. Elsevier, 57(1), pp. 103–121.

- Dubey, R. *et al.* (2016) 'The impact of big data on world-class sustainable manufacturing', *The International Journal of Advanced Manufacturing Technology*, 84, pp. 631–645.
- Economic Report 2017/18* (2018). Putrajaya.
- Evermann, J. and Tate, M. (2016) 'Assessing the predictive performance of structural equation model estimators', *Journal of Business Research*. Elsevier Inc., 69(10), pp. 4565–4582.
- Fadlilah, S. and Utama, A. A. G. S. (2017) 'The Adaptation of Delone and Mclean's Information System Model to Test The Success of the Erp-Sap Implementation in Middle-Level Management: A Study Case at PT Petrokimia Gresik', in *1st International Conference on Islamic Economics, Business, and Philanthropy*, pp. 295–299.
- Faghiharam, B. (2013) *Factors affecting usage of ICT among faculty members in a private university in Iran* Batoul Faghiharam. Doctoral Dissertation, University of Malaya, Malaysia.
- Fahrianta, R. Y., Chandarin, G. and Subiyantoro, E. (2018a) 'ICT Adoption Evaluation Model in a Mandatory Environment', in *3rd International Conference of Graduate School on Sustainability (ICGSS)*, pp. 1–11.
- Fahrianta, R. Y., Chandarin, G. and Subiyantoro, E. (2018b) 'The Conceptual Model of Integration of Acceptance and Use of Technology with the Information Systems Success', *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering*, 407(1), pp. 1–6.
- Fitzgerald, B. and Stol, K. J. (2017) 'Continuous software engineering: A roadmap and agenda', *Journal of Systems and Software*. Elsevier Ltd., 123, pp. 176–189.
- Firat, S. Ü. O. *et al.* (2016) 'Lean Thinking via Business Intelligence Technologies and Innovation Process', in *Handbook of Research on Driving Competitive Advantage through Sustainable, Lean, and Disruptive Innovation*. IGI Global, pp. 59–85.
- Fornell, C. and Larcker, D. F. (1981) 'Evaluating Structural Equation Models with Unobservable Variables and Measurement', *Journal of Marketing Research*, XVIII(February), pp. 39–50.
- Fourati-Jamoussia, F. and Niambab, C. N. (2016) 'Journal of Intelligence Studies in Business', *Journal of Intelligence Studies in Business*, 6(1), pp. 37–47.

- Gaardboe, R. (2018) 'The Relationship Between System User's Tasks and Business Intelligence (BI) Success in a Public Healthcare Setting', *The Electronic Journal of e-Government*, 16(2), pp. 87–97.
- Gaardboe, R., Nyvang, T. and Sandalgaard, N. (2017) 'Business Intelligence Success applied to Healthcare Information Systems', *Procedia Computer Science*. Elsevier B.V., 121, pp. 483–490.
- Gaardboe, R. and Svarre, T. (2017) 'Critical factors for business intelligence success', *Proceedings of the 25th European Conference on Information Systems, ECIS 2017*, 2017, pp. 471–486.
- Gaardboe, R. and Svarre, T. (2018) 'Business Intelligence Success Factors: A Literature Review', *Journal of Information Technology Management*, XXIX, pp. 1–15.
- Gao, Z. *et al.* (2019) 'Image Compressive Sensing Reconstruction Based on z-Score Standardized Group Sparse Representation', *IEEE Access*. IEEE, 7, pp. 90640–90651.
- García, J. M. V. and Pinzón, B. H. D. (2017) 'Key success factors to business intelligence solution implementation', *Journal of Intelligence Studies in Business*, 7(1), pp. 48–69.
- Garson, G. D. (2016) *Partial Least Squares: Regression & Structural Equation Models*. Statistical Associates Publishing.
- Gartner (2015) *Gartner's 2015 Hype Cycle for Emerging Technologies Identifies the Computing Innovations That Organizations Should Monitor*. [Press Release]. Available at: <https://www.gartner.com/en/newsroom/press-releases/2015-08-18-gartners-2015-hype-cycle-for-emerging-technologies-identifies-the-computing-innovations-that-organizations-should-monitor>.
- Gebauer, L., Söllner, M. and Leimeister, J. M. (2013) 'Towards Understanding the Formation of Continuous IT Use', in *Thirty Fourth International Conference on Information Systems*, pp. 1–17.
- Gewald, H. and Gewald, C. (2017) 'Physicians' Use of Mandatory Information Systems: An Exploratory Research in German Hospitals', in *Proceedings of the 50th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences (2017)*, pp. 3411–3420.

- Gewald, H. and Gewald, C. (2020) 'Inhibitors of Physicians' Use of Mandatory Hospital Information Systems (HIS)', *Data Analytics in Medicine: Concepts, Methodologies, Tools, and Applications*, pp. 1720–1737.
- Gibson, A. (2019) *Assessment of Acceptance Factors Impacting Adoption and Use of Business Intelligence and Analytics Systems Among Small and Medium-Size US Manufacturing Organizations*. PhD Thesis, Capella University.
- Godin, J. *et al.* (2017) 'Virtual teamwork training: factors influencing the acceptance of collaboration technology', *International Journal of Information and Communication Technology*, 10(1), pp. 5–23.
- Godin, J., Marshall, B. and Cardon, P. W. (2017) 'Virtual teamwork training : factors influencing the acceptance of collaboration technology Lars Leader and Nicole Gibson Amit Poddar', 10(1).
- Goodhue, D. L. and Thompson, R. L. (1995) 'Task-Technology Fit and Individual Performance', *MIS Quarterly*, 19(2), pp. 213–236.
- Groover, M. P. (2019) *Fundamentals of Modern Manufacturing: Materials, Processes, and Systems*. Seventh. John Wiley & Sons Inc.
- Grossmann, W. and Rinderle-Ma, S. (2015) *Data-Centric Systems and Applications Fundamentals of Business Intelligence*. Springer.
- Grublješič, T., Coelho, P. S. and Jaklič, J. (2019) 'The Shift to Socio-Organizational Drivers of Business Intelligence and Analytics Acceptance', *Journal of Organizational and End User Computing*, 31(2), pp. 37–64.
- Grublješič, T. and Jaklič, J. (2015a) 'Business Intelligence Acceptance: The Prominence of Organizational Factors', *Information Systems Management*, 32, pp. 299–315.
- Grublješič, T. and Jaklič, J. (2015b) 'Conceptualization of the business intelligence extended use model', *Journal of Computer Information Systems*, 55(3), pp. 72–82.
- Guba, E. G. and Lincoln, Y. S. (1994) 'Competing Paradigms in Qualitative Research', *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 2, pp. 163–194.
- Gunasekaran, A. *et al.* (2017) 'Big data and predictive analytics for supply chain and organizational performance', *Journal of Business Research*, 70, pp. 308–317.
- Günther, W. A. *et al.* (2017) 'Debating big data: A literature review on realizing value from big data', *Journal of Strategic Information Systems*, 26(3), pp. 191–209.



- Haake, P. (2017) *Understanding Effective Use in the ( Post ) -Implementation Phase of Information Systems*. PhD Dissertation, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology (KIT), Karlsruhe, Germany.
- Haake, P. *et al.* (2018) 'TOWARD AN OPERATIONALIZATION OF EFFECTIVE USE', in *Twenty-Sixth European Conference on Information Systems (ECIS2018)*.
- Hair, J. F. *et al.* (2017) *A Primer on Partial Least Squares Structural Equation Modeling (PLS-SEM)*. Second Edi, SAGE. Second Edi.
- Hair, J. F., Ringle, C. M. and Sarstedt, M. (2011) 'PLS-SEM: Indeed a Silver Bullet', *Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice*, 19(2), pp. 139–152.
- Hair, J. F., Sarstedt, M. and Ringle, C. M. (2019) 'Rethinking some of the rethinking of partial least squares', *European Journal of Marketing*, 53(4), pp. 566–584.
- El Halabieh, R., Beaudry, A. and Tamblyn, R. (2017) 'Impacts of Stress, Satisfaction and Behavioral Intention on Continued Usage: Evidence from Physicians Transitioning to a New Drug Management System', in *Proceedings of the 50th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences (2017)*, pp. 3381–3390.
- Hamad, H. (2014) *Antecedents of business-to-business e-commerce adoption and its effect on competitive advantage in manufacturing small and medium-sized enterprises: A comparative study of United States of America and Egypt*, Plymouth Graduate School of Management. PhD Thesis, University of Plymouth, UK.
- Hambrick, D. C. and Mason, P. A. (1984) 'Upper Echelons: The Organization as a Reflection of Its Top Managers', *Academy of Management Review*, 9(2), pp. 193–206.
- Harris, M. E. *et al.* (2016) 'Examining the Impact of Training in the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology', *Journal of Computer Information Systems*. Taylor & Francis, 58(3), pp. 221–233.
- Harris, M. E. (2016) *Incorporating a Training Construct into the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology*. PhD Thesis, Utah State University, Utah.
- Harris, M. E. *et al.* (2018) 'Examining the Impact of Training in the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology', *Journal of Computer Information Systems*, 58(3), pp. 221–233.
- Hasan, N. A., Rahman, A. A. and Lahad, N. A. (2016) 'Issues and challenges in business intelligence case studies', *Jurnal Teknologi*, 78(8–2), pp. 171–178.

- Hassan, H. (2016) *Evaluation of School Management System Using*. Master Thesis, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Malaysia.
- Hassandoust, F. and Tan, F. B. (2016) 'Factors Influencing the Infusion of Information Systems: A Literature Review', *Pacific Asia Journal of the Association for Information Systems*, 8(1), pp. 1–31.
- Hatta, N. N. M. *et al.* (2015) 'Business intelligence system adoption theories in SMES: A literature review', *ARPN Journal of Engineering and Applied Sciences*, 10(23), pp. 18165–18174.
- Hatta, N. N. M., Abdullah, N. S. and Miskon, S. (2017) 'Business Intelligence System Adoption Model for SMEs', *Pacific Asia Conference on Information Systems (PACIS) Information Systems (PACIS)*, p. 15.
- Hazen, B. *et al.* (2014) 'Performance expectancy and use of enterprise architecture: training as an intervention', *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 27(2), pp. 180–196.
- Hejazi, A., Abdolvand, N. and Harandi, S. R. (2016) 'Assessing the Organizational Readiness for Implementing BI Systems', *International Journal of Information Technology Convergence and Services (IJITCS)*, 6(1).
- High-value manufacturing – Malaysia's next frontier* (2014) *Business Circle*.
- Hilbert, M. (2016) 'Big Data for Development: A Review of Promises and Challenges', *Development Policy Review*, 34(1), pp. 135–174.
- Hizam-Hanafiah, M. and Soomro, M. A. (2021) 'The Situation of Technology Companies in Industry 4.0 and the Open Innovation', *Journal of Open Innovation*, 7(34), pp. 1–20.
- Hoo, L. W. (2016) 'The Manufacturing Sector in Malaysia', *Organisational Justice and Citizenship Behaviour in Malaysia, Governance and Citizenship in Asia*, (November 2014), pp. 21–36.
- Hornyak, R., Rai, A. and Dong, J. Q. (2020) 'Incumbent System Context and Job Outcomes of Effective Enterprise System Use', *Journal of the Association for Information Systems*, 21(2), pp. 364–387.
- Hou, C.-K. (2014a) 'Exploring the user acceptance of business intelligence systems in Taiwan's electronics industry: applying the UTAUT model', *International Journal of Internet and Enterprise Management*, 8(3), pp. 195–226.

- Hou, C.-K. (2014b) 'User acceptance of business intelligence systems in Taiwan's electronics industry', *Social Behavior and Personality*, 42(4), pp. 583–596.
- Hou, C. K. (2015) 'Understanding business intelligence system continuance intention: An empirical study of Taiwan's electronics industry', *Information Development*, 32(5), pp. 1359–1371.
- Hou, C. K. (2018) 'Examining users' intention to continue using business intelligence systems from the perspectives of end-user computing satisfaction and individual performance', *International Journal of Business Continuity and Risk Management*, 8(1), pp. 49–70.
- Hou, W. and Gao, S. (2018) 'An Investigation of the Managerial Use of Mobile Business Intelligence', *Pacific Asia Journal of the Association for Information Systems*, 10(3), pp. 87–108.
- Howson, C. (2014) *Successful Business Intelligence*. Second Edi. USA: McGraw-Hill Education.
- Hsieh, J. *et al.* (2012) 'Impact of user satisfaction with mandated CRM use on employee service quality', *MIS Quarterly: Management Information Systems*, 36(4), pp. 1065–1080.
- InfinityQS International, I. (2016) 'Visibility across the manufacturing enterprise: How manufacturers can use data to reimagine quality and improve operations'.
- Isaac, O. *et al.* (2018) 'Factors determining user satisfaction of internet usage among public sector employees in Yemen', *International Journal of Technological Learning, Innovation and Development*, 10(1), pp. 37–68.
- Jarrahi, M. H. and Eshraghi, A. (2019) 'Digital natives vs digital immigrants: A multidimensional view on interaction with social technologies in organizations', *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 32(6), pp. 1051–1070.
- Jayakrishnan, M. *et al.* (2018) 'Implementation of business intelligence framework for Malaysian halal food manufacturing industry towards initiate strategic financial performance management', *Management Science Letters*, 8(10), pp. 1059–1076.
- Jiang, Song *et al.* (2017) 'Correlation and Path Coefficient Analyses of the Morphological Characteristics and Body Weight of *Penaeus monodon* (Crustacea , Decapoda , Penaeidae)', *Insights Aquac Cult Biotechnol*, 1(2:6), pp. 1–5.

- Jorge, M. *et al.* (2015) 'A Data Quality in Use Model for Big Data', *Future Generation Computer Systems*. Elsevier B.V., 63, pp. 123–130.
- Julious, S. A. (2005) 'Sample size of 12 per group rule of thumb for a pilot study', *Pharmaceutical Statistics*, 4(4), pp. 287–291.
- Kadek, N. *et al.* (2018) 'Conceptual Model of Evaluation and Acceptance of E-Learning in Vocational Education', in *International Conference on Science and Technology*, pp. 1120–1123.
- Kante, M., Chepken, C. and Oboko, R. (2018) 'Partial Least Square Structural Equation Modelling' use in Information Systems: An Updated Guideline of Practices in Exploratory Settings', *Kabarak Journal of Research & Innovation*, 6(1), pp. 49–67.
- Karageorgou, M. (2018) *Business Intelligence Systems in the Field of Epidemiology. The Case of Greece*. Master Thesis, University of Patras, Greece.
- Karimika, H. (2017) *The Impact of Positive Behaviours on the Effectiveness of Information Systems Departments*. PhD Thesis, Auckland University of Technology, New Zealand.
- Kauppila, O. (2016) 'When and How Does Lmx Differentiation Influence Followers' Work Outcomes? The Interactive Roles of One's Own Lmx Status and Organizational Context', *Personnel Psychology*, 69, pp. 357–393.
- Kemboi, H., Wanyoike, D. and Langat, E. K. (2019) 'An Assessment of Factors Affecting the Implementation of Enterprise Resource Planning Systems (ERP) in Geothermal Industry in Kenya', *International Academic Journal of Procurement and Supply Chain Management*, 3(1), pp. 125–142.
- Khaldi, K. (2017) 'Quantitative, Qualitative or Mixed Research: Which Research Paradigm to Use?', *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 7(2), pp. 15–24.
- Khalipha, A. N. *et al.* (2018) 'Investigating user responses to mandatory IT-induced organisational changes: A pre-implementation study', *26th European Conference on Information Systems: Beyond Digitization - Facets of Socio-Technical Change, ECIS 2018*.
- Khanam, L., Mahfuz, M. A. and Yuanjian, Q. (2017) 'The Role of Habit-Technology Fit on Employees' Acceptance of Knowledge Management in Bangladesh', *ANVESHAK-International Journal of Management*, 6(2), pp. 130–147.

- Kharuddin, S., Foong, S.-Y. and Senik, R. (2015) 'Effects of decision rationality on ERP adoption extensiveness and organizational performance', *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 28(5), pp. 658–679.
- Kivunja, C. and Kuyini, A. B. (2017) 'Understanding and Applying Research Paradigms in Educational Contexts', *International Journal of Higher Education*, 6(5), p. 26.
- Klein, K. J., Hall, R. J. and Laliberte, M. (1990) 'Training and the organizational consequences of technological change: A case study of computer-aided design and drafting', in *Technological Innovation and Human Resources: End-User Training*, pp. 31–79.
- Knowles, M. (1984) *The Adult Learner: A Neglected Species*. 3rd edn. Houston, TX.
- Koh, C. E. *et al.* (2010) 'A Model for Mandatory Use of Software Technologies : An Integrative Approach by Applying Multiple Levels of Abstraction of Informing Science', 13.
- Koupaei, M. N., Mohammadi, M. and Naderi, B. (2016) 'An integrated enterprise resources planning (ERP) framework for flexible manufacturing systems using business intelligence (BI) tools', *International Journal of Supply and Operations Management*, 3(11), pp. 1112–1125.
- Kulkarni, U. and Robles-Flores, J. A. (2013) 'Development and Validation of a BI Success Model', in *The 19th Americas Conference on Information Systems (AMCIS)*, pp. 1–11.
- Kumar, R. (2019) *Research Methodology: A Step-by-Step Guide for Beginners*. SAGE.
- Kuo, Y.-F., Chen, J.-Y. and Deng, W.-J. (2012) 'IPA–Kano model: A new tool for categorising and diagnosing service quality attributes', *Total Quality Management & Business Excellence*, 23(7–8), pp. 731–748.
- Lautenbach, P. and Johnston, K. (2017) 'Factors influencing business intelligence and analytics usage extent in South African organisations', *South African Journal of Business Management*, 48(3), pp. 23–33.
- Lautenbach, P., Johnston, K. and Adeniran-Ogundipe, T. (2017) 'Factors influencing business intelligence and analytics usage extent in South African organisations', *South African Journal of Business Management*, 48(3), pp. 23–33.

- Lee, J. *et al.* (2015) 'Industrial Big Data Analytics and Cyber-physical Systems for Future Maintenance & Service Innovation', in *The Fourth International Conference on Through-life Engineering Services Industrial*. Elsevier B.V., pp. 3–7.
- Legris, P., Ingham, J. and Colletette, P. (2003) 'Why do people use information technology? A critical review of the technology acceptance model', *Information and Management*, 40(3), pp. 191–204.
- Lonbani, M. (2016) *Business Strategy, Environmental Uncertainty, Balanced Scorecard and Performance Among Malaysian Small and Medium Enterprises*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Johor Bahru, Malaysia.
- López-Gómez, C. *et al.* (2017) *Emerging Trends in Global Advanced Manufacturing: Challenges, Opportunities and Policy Responses*.
- Luen, W. K., Hooi, C. M. and Fook, O. S. (2015) 'Are Malaysian Companies Ready for the Big Data Economy? A Business Intelligence Model Approach', in *Proceedings of the International Conference on Accounting Studies (ICAS)*, pp. 113–119.
- Madadipouya, K. (2015) 'A Review on the Strategic Use of IT Applications in Achieving and Sustaining Competitive Advantage', *International Journal of Managing Public Sector Information and Communication Technologies (IJMP ICT)*, 6(2), pp. 21–30.
- Mahmud, I., Ramayah, T. and Kurnia, S. (2017) 'To Use or Not to Use: Modelling End User Grumbling as User Resistance in Pre-Implementation Stage of Enterprise Resource Planning System', *Information Systems*. Elsevier Ltd, 69, pp. 164–179.
- Maillet, É., Mathieu, L. and Sicotte, C. (2015) 'Modeling factors explaining the acceptance, actual use and satisfaction of nurses using an Electronic Patient Record in acute care settings: An extension of the UTAUT', *International Journal of Medical Informatics*. Elsevier Ireland Ltd, 84(1), pp. 36–47.
- Majeed, I. (2020) 'Understanding Positivism in Social Research: A Research Paradigm of Inductive Logic of Inquiry', *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 9(11), pp. 118–125.

- Al Mansoori, K. A. (2017) *Use of a modified UTAUT model to investigate Emirati Citizens' adoption of e-Government in Abu Dhabi*. PhD Thesis, University Wollongong.
- Marshall, B., Mills, R. and Olsen, D. (2008) 'The Role Of End-User Training In Technology Acceptance', *Review of Business Information Systems (RBIS)*, 12(2), pp. 1–8.
- Masele, J. J. (2015) 'Towards E-commerce use for pro-poor tourism promotion: Local providers' ICT training needs in Tanzania', *International Journal of Innovation and Technology Management*, 12(4).
- Mesároš, P., Čarnický, Š. and Mandičák, T. (2015) 'Key Factors and Barriers of Business Intelligence Implementation', *US-China Law Review*, 12(2), pp. 220–231.
- Mishra, R. (2016) 'Business Intelligence and Analytics : Paving way for Operational Excellence in Indian Banks', in *Proceedings of the 2016 International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Operations Management Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*, pp. 53–58.
- Mobarhan, R. (2015) *Motivational Model for Continuous Intention of Electronic Portfolio Usage Among Students*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Malaysia.
- Mobarhan, R. and Rahman, A. A. (2015) 'Understanding E-Portfolio Continuance Intention among Students: A Self-Determination Perspective', in *Pacific Asia Conference on Information Systems (PACIS)*.
- Mohammed, F. (2016) 'Cloud computing adoption model for e-government implementation', *Information Development*, 33(3), pp. 303–323.
- Mohammed, F. *et al.* (2018) 'Cloud Computing Fitness for E-Government Implementation: Importance-Performance Analysis', *IEEE Access*. IEEE, 6, pp. 1236–1248.
- Moniruzzaman, M. *et al.* (2015) 'Business Intelligence and Supply Chain Agility', in *Australasian Conference on Information Systems*.
- Mudzana, T. and Mahara, M. (2015) 'Measuring the success of business-intelligence systems in South Africa: An empirical investigation applying the DeLone and McLean Model', *South African Journal of Information Management*, 17(1), pp. 1–7.

- Mudzana, T. and Maharaj, M. (2015) 'Measuring the success of business-intelligence systems in South Africa: An empirical investigation applying the DeLone and McLean Model', *SA Journal of Information Management*, 17(1), pp. 1–7.
- Murali, S., Pugazhendhi, S. and Muralidharan, C. (2016) 'Integration of IPA and QFD to assess the service quality and to identify after sales service strategies to improve customer satisfaction – a case study', *Production Planning & Control*. Taylor & Francis, 27(5), pp. 394–407.
- Naghdipour, N. (2014) *New Trends in Business Intelligence*. Master Thesis, Jönköping University, Sweden.
- Nasab, S. S. (2016) *Critical Success Factors Framework For Business Intelligence System Project Implementation In Malaysian Public Sector*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Johor, Malaysia.
- Nawanir, G., Fernando, Y. and Lim, K. T. (2018) 'A Second-order Model of Lean Manufacturing Implementation to Leverage Production Line Productivity with the Importance- Performance Map Analysis', *Global Business Review*, 19(3S), pp. 1–16.
- Negash, S. (2004) 'Business Intelligence', *Communications of the Association for Information Systems*, 13(January 2004), pp. 177–195.
- Neufeld, D. J., Dong, L. and Higgins, C. (2007) 'Charismatic leadership and user acceptance of information technology', *European Journal of Information Systems*, 16, pp. 494–510.
- Nguyen, T. T. L. (2019) 'Selection of Research Paradigms in English Language Teaching: Personal Reflections and Future Directions', in *The Second Annual International Conference on Language and Literature*, pp. 1–19.
- Nofal, M. I. M. and Yusof, Z. M. (2016) 'Conceptual model of enterprise resource planning and business intelligence systems usage', *International Journal of Business Information Systems*, 21(2), pp. 178–194.
- Nor, S. A. B. M. (2017) 'The Relationship between Operational and Market Efficiency Improvement Towards Financial Performance in Malaysia', *Elsevier*, pp. 1–20.
- Oliveira, T. *et al.* (2016) 'Mobile payment: Understanding the determinants of customer adoption and intention to recommend the technology', *Computers in Human Behavior*. Elsevier Ltd, 61(2016), pp. 404–414.



- Oliver, R. L. (1980) 'A Cognitive Model of the Antecedents and Consequences of Satisfaction Decisions', *Journal of Marketing Research*, 17(4), pp. 460–469.
- Osborne, J. W. and Banjanovic, E. S. (2016) *Exploratory Factor Analysis with SAS*. SAS Institute Inc.
- Owuor, E. O. and Njeru, W. (2018) 'Business Intelligence Technology and Marketing Strategy in the Retail Sector', *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal*, 5(11), pp. 1–26.
- Pecherskaya, E. P. *et al.* (2016) 'Assessment of Critical Success Factors Transformation in ERP Projects', *International Electronic Journal of Mathematics Education*, 11(7), pp. 2608–2625.
- Perugini, M., Gallucci, M. and Costantini, G. (2018) 'A Practical Primer to Power Analysis for Simple Experimental Designs', *International Review of Social Psychology*, 31(1), pp. 1–23.
- Petrillo, A. *et al.* (2018) *Fourth Industrial Revolution: Current Practices, Challenges, and Opportunities*. INTECH.
- Pool, J. K. *et al.* (2018) 'The effect of business intelligence adoption on agile supply chain performance', *International Journal of Productivity and Quality Management*, 23(3), pp. 289–306.
- Popovič, A., Puklavec, B. and Oliveira, T. (2019) 'Justifying business intelligence systems adoption in SMEs: Impact of systems use on firm performance', *Industrial Management and Data Systems*, 119(1), pp. 210–228.
- Puklavec, B., Oliveira, T. and Popovič, A. (2018) 'Understanding the determinants of business intelligence system adoption stages an empirical study of SMEs', *Industrial Management and Data Systems*, 118(1), pp. 236–261.
- Qureshi, M. I. (2016) *Work Design Practices for Sustainable Manufacturing*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Malaysia.
- Rachmawati, I. (2020) 'Importance-Performance (IPMA) Analysis of Loyalty in Indonesia Cellular Operator During COVID-19 Pandemic', *Jurnal Manajemen Teknologi*, 19(2), pp. 177–195.
- Rahaman, F. (2017) *A Qualitative Study into the Supplier Selection Decision-making Process in the Malaysian SME Manufacturing Industry*. PhD Thesis, University of Westminster, UK.
- Ramli, D. H. Z. Bin (2014) *Department of Social Welfare Statistics Report 2014*. Available at: [http://www.jkm.gov.my/file/Buku\\_JKM\\_2014.pdf](http://www.jkm.gov.my/file/Buku_JKM_2014.pdf).

- Razak, D. A., Abdullah, M. A. and Ersoy, A. (2018) 'Small medium enterprises (smes) in turkey and malaysia a comparative discussion on issues and challenges', *International Journal of Business, Economics and Law*, 15(3), pp. 1–10.
- Ringle, C. M. and Sarstedt, M. (2016) 'Gain More Insight from Your PLS-SEM Results: The Importance-Performance Map Analysis', *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 116(9).
- Roscoe, J. T. (1975) *Fundamental Research Statistics for the Behavioral Sciences*. 2nd edn. Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Sabherwal, R. and King, W. R. (1992) 'Decision Processes for Developing Strategic Applications of Information Systems: A Contingency Approach', *Decision Sciences*, 23(4), pp. 917–943.
- Sangar, A. B. (2014) *Measurement Metrics for Measuring Success of Business Intelligence System*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Johor, Malaysia.
- Sarstedt, M., Ringle, C. M. and Hair, J. F. (2017) 'Partial Least Squares Structural Equation Modeling', in *Handbook of market research*. Springer International Publishing, pp. 1–40.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2016) *Reserch Methods for Business Students*. Seventh. Pearson Education Limited.
- Saxena, D. K. (2017) *Key Factors and Underlying Mechanisms for the Enterprise Systems Lifecycle in Public Service Organisations*. PhD Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, The University of Dublin, Ireland.
- Saygili, E. E., Ozturkoglu, Y. and Kocakulah, M. C. (2017) 'End Users' Perceptions of Critical Success Factors in ERP Applications', *International Journal of Enterprise Information Systems*, 13(4), pp. 58–75.
- Schreier, M. (2018) 'Sampling and Generalization', in *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Data Collection*, pp. 84–98.
- See, B. P., Yap, C. S. and Ahmad, R. (2019) 'Antecedents of continued use and extended use of enterprise systems', *Behaviour and Information Technology*. Taylor & Francis, 38(4), pp. 384–400.
- Sejahtera, F. *et al.* (2018) 'Enablers and Inhibitors of Effective Use of Big Data: Insights From a Case Study', in *Proceedings of the 22nd Pacific Asia Conference on Information Systems*, pp. 27–32.

- Sejahtera, F. P., Indulska, M. and Sadiq, S. (2018) 'Enablers and Inhibitors of Effective Use of Big Data: Insights from a Case Study Harmonized Messaging View project Effective Use of Big Data View project', (July). Available at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/326316869>.
- Sekaran, U. and Bougie, R. (2016) *Research Methods for Business: A Skill-Building Approach*. 7th Editio. John Wiley & Sons Ltd.
- Senaviratna, N. A. M. R. and Cooray, T. M. J. A. (2019) 'Diagnosing Multicollinearity of Logistic Regression Model', *Asian Journal of Probability and Statistics*, 5(2), pp. 1–9.
- Senthilnathan, S. (2019) 'Usefulness of Correlation Analysis', *Social Science Research Network (SSRN), Elsevier*, (July).
- Serumaga-Zake, P. A. E. (2017) 'The role of user satisfaction in implementing a Business Intelligence System', *South African Journal of Information Management*, 19(1), pp. 1–8.
- Shahid, S. S., Tavallaee, R. and Shobeiri, S. H. (2017) 'The Human Factors Affecting the Acceptance of Business Intelligence Us Behavioral ing the Behavioral Model of Reasoned Action Theory', in *9th International Conference on Information and Knowledge Technology, IKT 2017*, pp. 62–70.
- Shao, Z. and Feng, Y. (2016) 'Effectiveness of top management support in enterprise systems success: a contingency perspective of fit between leadership style and system life-cycle', *European Journal of Information Systems*. Nature Publishing Group, 25(2), pp. 131–153. A
- Shiau, Y. C. P. H. W. (2014) 'An empirical study of managers ' usage intention in BI', (5), pp. 247–258.
- Shrestha, N. (2020) 'Detecting Multicollinearity in Regression Analysis', *American Journal of Applied Mathematics and Statistics*, 8(2), pp. 39–42.
- Silesia, U., Olszak, C. M. and Ziemba, E. (2012) 'Critical Success Factors for Implementing Business Intelligence Systems in Small and Medium Enterprises on the Example of', *Interdisciplinary Journal of Information, Knowledge, and Management*, 7, pp. 129–150.
- Skyrius, R. *et al.* (2016) 'Factors Driving Business Intelligence Culture', *Issues in Informing Science and Information Technology*, 13, pp. 171–186.

- Skyrius, R. and Nemitko, S. S. (2018) 'The Support of Human Factors for Encompassing Business Intelligence', in *Proceedings of the Informing Science + Information Technology Education Conference*, pp. 21–34.
- Sneller, R. C. (2014) *A Guide to ERP - Benefits, Implementation and Trends*. 1st edn. Bookbon.
- Sönmez, F. (2018) 'Technology Acceptance of Business Intelligence and Customer Relationship Management Systems within Institutions Operating in Capital Markets Technology Acceptance of Business Intelligence and Customer Relationship Management Systems within Institutions Op', *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(2),
- Sparks, B. H. and Mccann, J. T. (2015) 'Factors influencing business intelligence system use in decision making and organisational performance', *Int. J. Sustainable Strategic Management*, 5(1), pp. 31–54.
- Sparks, B. H. and McCann, J. T. (2015) 'Factors influencing business intelligence system use in decision making and organisational performance', *International Journal of Sustainable Strategic Management*, 5(1), p. 31.
- Su, C.-H. and Cheng, T.-W. (2019) 'A Sustainability Innovation Experiential Learning Model for Virtual Reality Chemistry Laboratory: An Empirical Study with PLS-SEM and IPMA', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11(4), pp. 1–24.
- Subramaniam, C., Suan, C. L. and Johari, J. (2019) 'Employee Retention in the Manufacturing Sector : Is There a Simple Solution?', in *Proceedings of the Second International Conference on the Future of ASEAN*, pp. 103–110.
- Supramaniam, M. and Kuppusamy, M. (2010) 'ERP System Implementation: A Malaysian Perspective', *Journal of Information Technology Management*, XXI(1).
- Surbakti, F. P. S. *et al.* (2019) 'Factors influencing effective use of big data: A research framework', *Information and Management*. Elsevier B.V., 57(1), pp. 1–64.
- Tabachnick, B. G. and Fidell, L. S. (2019) *Using Multivariate Statistics*. Seventh. Pearson Education Inc.
- Taber, K. S. (2017) 'The Use of Cronbach 's Alpha When Developing and Reporting Research Instruments in Science Education', *Res Sci Educ*. Research in Science Education, 48, pp. 1273–1296.
- Taipale, A. (2019) *Technology acceptance among public sector nurses in cancer care*. Master Thesis, Aalto University.

- Turan, A. H. and Ugur, N. G. (2018) 'Strategies for BI Acceptance: Challenges and Solutions', *Pressacademia*, 7(1), pp. 237–240.
- Ugur, N. G. and Turan, A. H. (2018) 'Strategies for BI Acceptance: Challenges and Solutions', in *PressAcademia Procedia*, pp. 237–240.
- Urumsah, D. (2015) 'E-services Adoption: Processes by Firms in Developing Nations', *Advances in Business Marketing and Purchasing*, 23B, pp. 5–254.
- Venkatesh, V. *et al.* (2003) 'User Acceptance of Information Technology: Toward a Unified View', *MIS Quarterly*, 27(3), pp. 425–478.
- Verma, K., Pandey, R. and Gupta, A. (2015) 'Big Data: Does it Call for Distributed File System', *International Journal of Computer Applications*, 131(13), pp. 12–17.
- Verma, S. (2017) 'The Adoption of Big Data Services by Manufacturing Firms: An Empirical Investigation in India', *Journal of Information Systems and Technology Management*, 14(1), pp. 39–68.
- Villa, G. (2018) 'e-Learning Culture: From Theory to Practice', in *Dynamic Learning Spaces in Education*. Springer Singapore, pp. 31–49.
- Wall, N. (2017) *The Business Intelligence Mediator*. Master Thesis, Blekinge Institute of Technology, Karlskrona, Sweden.
- Wang, C. H. (2016) 'A novel approach to conduct the importance-satisfaction analysis for acquiring typical user groups in business-intelligence systems', *Computers in Human Behavior*. Elsevier Ltd, 54, pp. 673–681.
- Wang, W. (2005) 'Factors Influencing Employees' Deep Usage of Information Systems', in *Proceedings of the 9th Pacific Asia Conference on Information Systems (PACIS)*, pp. 30–43.
- Wang, W. (2014) 'Comprehensive Understanding the Inhibitors and Enablers of Knowledge Transfer in ERP Assimilations: A Multi-Case Study', in *Association for Information Systems*.
- Wang, Z. *et al.* (2019) 'Multipath mitigation based on trend surface analysis applied to dual-antenna receiver with common clock', *GPS Solutions*. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 23(104), pp. 1–15.
- Weaver, B. (2016) 'Explaining the Continuous Use of BI Systems Explaining the Continuous Use of BI Systems', p. 79. Available at: <http://lup.lub.lu.se/luur/download?func=downloadFile&recordOID=8882314&fileOID=8882319>.

- Wee, D. *et al.* (2015) *Industry 4.0: How to navigate digitization of the manufacturing sector*.
- Weiler, S., Matt, C. and Hess, T. (2019) ‘Understanding User Uncertainty during the Implementation of Self-Service Business Intelligence: A Thematic Analysis’, in *Proceedings of the 52nd Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*, pp. 5878–5887.
- Wellek, S. (2017) ‘A critical evaluation of the current “p-value controversy”’, *Biometrical Journal*, 00, pp. 1–19.
- Whitehead, A. L. *et al.* (2016) ‘Estimating the sample size for a pilot randomised trial to minimise the overall trial sample size for the external pilot and main trial for a continuous outcome variable’, *Statistical Methods in Medical Research*, 25(3), pp. 1057–1073.
- Wibowo, M. I., Santoso, A. J. and Setyohadi, D. B. (2018) ‘Factors Affecting the Successful Implementation of E-Government on Network Documentation and Legal Information Website in Riau’, *CommIT (Communication and Information Technology) Journal*, 12(1), pp. 51–57.
- Williams, M. D., Rana, N. P. and Dwivedi, Y. K. (2015) ‘The unified theory of acceptance and use of technology (UTAUT): A literature review’, *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 28(3), pp. 443–488. d
- Williams, S. and Williams, N. (2010) *The Profit Impact of Business Intelligence*. San Francisco: Morgan Kauffman.
- Wu, C. *et al.* (2008) ‘Impact of Internal Factors on Information Technology Adoption: An Empirical Investigation of Chinese Firms’, *Tsinghua Science and Technology*, 13(3), pp. 318–322.
- Wu, H. and Leung, S. (2017) ‘Can Likert Scales be Treated as Interval Scales? — A Simulation Study’, *Journal of Social Service Research*. Taylor & Francis, 0(0), pp. 1–6.
- Xiong, G. *et al.* (2018) ‘From mind to products: towards social manufacturing and service’, *IEEE/CAA Journal of Automatica Sinica*, 5(1), pp. 47–57.
- Yadegaridehkordi, E. *et al.* (2018) ‘Influence of big data adoption on manufacturing companies’ performance: An integrated DEMATEL-ANFIS approach’, *Technological Forecasting & Social Change*, 137(July), pp. 199–210.

- Yang, S. *et al.* (2018) 'Perceived values on mobile GMS continuance: A perspective from perceived integration and interactivity', *Computers in Human Behavior*. Elsevier B.V., 89, pp. 16–26.
- Yeoh, W. and Popovic, A. (2015) 'Extending the Understanding of Critical Success Factors for Implementing Business Intelligence Systems', *Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology*, 67(1), pp. 134–147.
- Yin, R. K. (2018) *Case Study Research and Applications*. 6th editio. SAGE.
- Yoon, T. E., Ghosh, B. and Jeong, B. K. (2014) 'User acceptance of business intelligence (BI) application: Technology, individual difference, social influence, and situational constraints', in *Proceedings of the Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*, pp. 3758–3766.
- Yoseph, F., Heikkila, M. and Howard, D. (2019) 'Outliers identification model in point-of-sales data using enhanced normal distribution method', in *Proceedings - International Conference on Machine Learning and Data Engineering, iCMLDE 2019*, pp. 72–78.
- Yu, T. and Richardson, J. C. (2015) 'An exploratory factor analysis and reliability analysis of the student online learning readiness (SOLR) instrument', *Online Learning*, 19(5), pp. 120–141.
- Yusof, A. F. Bin (2015) *Enhanced Information Systems Continuance Model for Mobile Wellness Applications*. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Malaysia.
- Ziraba, A. and Kayode, A. (2019) 'Schoology: the Adoption of Learning Management Platform in the Ict University Using Technology Acceptance Model', *EDULEARN19 Proceedings*, 1(January 2020), pp. 1924–1930.