THE EFFECT OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMPLIANCE ON BOARD DIVERSITY, AUDIT COMMITTEE AND VOLUNTARY DISCLOSURE OF THE NIGERIAN LISTED COMPANIES

ALI SHARIFF KABARA

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Azman Hashim International Business School Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

JANUARY 2021

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my late father, who taught me that perseverance, honesty and dedication are the secret of a successful life especially during the learning process. It is also dedicated to my mother, who taught me that no matter the size of a task can be completed if it is done one-step at a time.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I express my praise and gratitude to my Creator, the most gracious the most merciful for my creation, guidance and blessing me with the aspiration to study, then imparting me with good health, determination and endurance to complete the PhD Accounting programmed within a reasonably short period. May the blessings of Allah be upon to our noble prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H).

Specifically, I wish to thank and express my sincere appreciation to my main thesis supervisor, Dr. Dewi Fariha Abdullah, who patiently guided and propelled me along this extended journey through encouragement, critics and friendly manner. I am also very thankful to my co-supervisor Dr. Aniza Othman for her guidance and motivation. Without their continued support and interest, this thesis would not have been the same as presented here.

My exalted gratitude goes to my parents late. Alh Shariff Auwal Kabara and Hajiya Binta Ahmad Kabara for their parental care, love, total supports and encouragement throughout my life. May Allah bestow on them mercy as they cherish me in my childhood. I am equally, very grateful to my elder brother Engr. Ameen Shareeff Kabara who is always at my side with his elderly advice and support. May Allah reward them all with paradise (Alfirdaus).

The support of my wife, Shafa'atu, and kids, Fatima, Khadija, Muhammad, Ibrahim and Naseer has been critical. Fortunately, she understand the time commitment that a project like this demands. I equally, thank all my brothers, sisters, and the entire family members for their prayer, support and encouragement.

My special regards and appreciation goes to my Dean, Prof. A.M. Bashir for his mentorship, support and encouragement. My HOD Assoc. Prof M. Y. Abubakar and the entire staff of the accounting dept. academic and nonacademic. Equally, to my former lecturers like Prof. K.I. Dandago, Prof J.M. Kurawa, Prof K. H. Tahir, Prof M. I. Barde and Prof Bashir Tijjani among others.

In preparing this thesis, I was in contact with many people, researchers, academicians, and practitioners. They have contributed towards my understanding and thoughts like Assoc Prof. Aminu Isa, Dr. Rabi'u Ado, Dr. Abdulaziz Shehu, Dr. Zahradeen M/ Goshi.

My fellow postgraduate student should also be recognised for their support. My sincere appreciation also extends to all my co-workers and friends (Muhd Na'taala, Mal. Magaji, Mal. Jazuli, Mal Murtala, Baba A. Kabara and Mal. Lawan (Officer) who have provided assistance at various occasions. Their views and tips are useful indeed. Unfortunately, it is not possible to list all of them in this limited space. I am very grateful to all of you may Allah bless you.

ABSTRACT

Issues related to board diversity and audit committee characteristics have attracted significant interest from capital market regulators, legislators, and academics in recent years due to persistent corporate financial failures in the world. Consequently, inadequate disclosures by firms due to the ineffectiveness of corporate governance attributes like board and audit committee characteristics have been accepted as the major reasons behind most of the corporate financial failures. However, the outcomes of previous empirical researches examining this relationship have been inconclusive and inconsistent. This study examines the effect of corporate governance compliance on the relationship between board diversity, audit committee, and voluntary disclosure reporting in the Nigerian listed companies using an agency theory as the key theory. It aims to combine the advantage from obtaining perception towards voluntary disclosure from a semi-structured interview with a quantitative data analysis resulting from a self-constructed disclosure index adapted from prior studies. Results from the qualitative analysis were used to confirm the results and enhance in-depth understanding and interpretation of the results from quantitative analysis. Hence, an explanatory sequential mix-method research design is employed. The study collected quantitative data from the annual reports of 71 sampled companies listed on the Nigerian Stock Exchange for seven years i.e., 2011-2017. The study used statistical techniques include descriptive and inferential panel statistics like system GMM estimator approach and correlation analysis. Primary data was entered into the Statistical Package NVivo, for coding and data management purpose. This study used a content analysis technique for primary data. The empirical findings revealed that the interaction of corporate governance code compliance with overall audit committee diversity has a significant positive impact on the firms' voluntary disclosure. In other words, the audit committee influence voluntary disclosure of Nigerian listed companies while CG compliance do act as a moderator to the relationship. Significantly, the results indicated that the ethnic diversity (as the components of board diversity), audit committee independence and financial expertise of audit committee member are the other important determinants of voluntary disclosure enhanced by the interaction effect. The interview findings have shown synonymous results with the quantitative findings. This study provides a strong practical implication for policymakers, business firms, future research, and larger society by indicating empirically that corporations with higher compliance to CG codes and diversified board and effective audit committee are more transparent about their financial and CG practices, and thereby providing useful information on voluntary disclosure. Accordingly, this is one of the few attempts, which provides empirical results using a superior and contemporary tool of analysis (i.e. dynamic panel models). However, this is the first attempt that explicitly measured the effect of CG compliance on board diversity, audit committee and voluntary disclosure in corporate governance studies, especially in the developing economy like Nigeria. Finally, this study offers a direction for future research and useful recommendations.

ABSTRAK

Isu yang berkaitan dengan kepelbagaian lembaga dan jawatankuasa audit telah menimbulkan minat yang ketara daripada pengatur pasaran modal, penggubal undang-undang, dan ahli akademik pada tahun-tahun kebelakangan ini kerana kegagalan kewangan korporat yang berterusan di dunia. Akibatnya, pendedahan yang tidak mencukupi oleh syarikat disebabkan oleh ketidakpatuhan tadbir urus korporat seperti kepelbagaian lembaga dan audit jawatankuasa telah diterima sebagai sebab utama di sebalik sebahagian besar kegagalan kewangan korporat. Walau bagaimanapun, hasil kajian empirikal terdahulu yang meneliti hubungan ini tidak dapat disimpulkan dan tidak konsisten. Kajian ini mengkaji kesan pematuhan tadbir urus korporat mengenai hubungan antara kepelbagaian lembaga, jawatankuasa audit, dan laporan pendedahan sukarela di syarikat tersenarai Nigeria menggunakan teori agensi sebagai teori utama. Ia bertujuan untuk menggabungkan kelebihan daripada mendapatkan persepsi terhadap pendedahan sukarela daripada temubual separa berstruktur dengan analisis data kuantitatif yang terhasil daripada indeks pendedahan gubahan sendiri yang disesuaikan daripada terdahulu. Keputusan dari analisis kualitatif digunakan untuk mengesahkan hasil dan meningkatkan pemahaman dan tafsiran yang mendalam terhadap hasil daripada analisis kuantitatif. Justeru, reka bentuk penyelidikan kaedah campuran jujukan digunakan. Kajian ini mengumpulkan data kuantitatif daripada laporan tahunan sampel 71 syarikat di Bursa Saham Nigeria selama tujuh tahun iaitu 2011-2017. Kajian ini menggunakan teknik statistik seperti statistik panel deskriptif dan kesimpulan seperti pendekatan sistem penganggar GMM dan analisis korelasi. Data primer dimasukkan ke dalam Pakej Statistik NVivo, untuk tujuan pengekodan dan pengurusan data. Kajian ini menggunakan teknik analisis kandungan untuk data primer. Penemuan empirikal menunjukkan bahawa interaksi pematuhan peraturan tadbir urus korporat dengan kepelbagaian lembaga dan kepelbagaian jawatankuasa audit mempunyai kesan positif yang signifikan terhadap pendedahan sukarela firma. Dalam erti kata lain, jawatankuasa audit mempengaruhi pendedahan secara sukarela syarikat-syarikat tersenarai Nigeria sementara pematuhan CG bertindak sebagai moderator kepada hubungan. Secara ketara, keputusan menunjukkan bahawa kepelbagaian etnik, (sebagai komponen kepelbagaian lembaga), kebebasan jawatankuasa audit dan kepakaran kewangan ahli jawatankuasa audit adalah antara penentu penting kepada pendedahan sukarela yang dipertingkatkan oleh kesan interaksi. Kajian ini memberikan implikasi praktikal yang penting bagi pembuat dasar, firma perniagaan, penyelidikan masa depan, dan masyarakat yang lebih besar dengan menunjukkan secara empirikal bahawa syarikat dengan pematuhan yang lebih tinggi terhadap peraturan dan kepelbagaian lembaga dan jawatankuasa audit adalah lebih jelas mengenai amalan kewangan dan CG mereka, adalah depat menyediakan maklumat berguna mengenai pendedahan sukarela. Walau bagaimanapun, ini adalah salah satu daripada beberapa percubaan yang memberikan hasil empirikal dengan menggunakan alat analisis yang unggul dan kontemporari (iaitu model panel dinamik). Oleh itu, daripada, ini adalah antara percubaan pertama yang secara jelas mengukur kesan pematuhan CG terhadap kepelbagaian jawatankuasa audit dan pendedahan sukarela dalam kajian tadbir urus korporat, terutamanya dalam ekonomi membangun seperti Nigeria. Akhir sekali, kajian ini memberikan panduan dan cadangan yang berguna untuk penyelidikan masa depan.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	TITLE	PAGE
DE	CLARATION	iii
DE	DICATION	iv
AC	KNOWLEDGEMENT	v
AB	STRACT	vi
AB	STRAK	vii
TA	BLE OF CONTENTS	viii
LIS	ST OF TABLES	XV
LIS	ST OF FIGURES	xvii
LIS	ST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xviii
LIS	ST OF SYMBOLS	xix
LIS	ST OF APPENDICES	XX
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Overview	1
1.2	Background of the Study	4
1.3	Problem Statement	6
1.4	Research Aim	11
1.5	Research Questions	12
1.6	Research Objectives	12
1.7	Research Motivation and Contribution	13
1.8	Scope of the Study	15
1.9	Significance of the study	16
1.10	Definition of Terms	18
1.1	1 Chapters Organization	20
CHAPTER 2	LITERATURE REVIEW	21
2.0	Introduction	21

2.1			Financial Reporting and Corporate ctices in Nigeria	21
	2.1.1	Backgro	und of Nigeria	22
	2.1.2	Financia Nigeria	l and Accounting Monitoring Bodies in	23
	2.1.3	Importar Stock Ex	nt Laws and Regulations in Nigerian schange	24
	2.1.4	The Dev	elopment of CG Code and Compliance	25
	2.1.5	_	g and Classifying Corporate nce Mechanisms	28
	2.1.6	Econom	y of the Nigeria	30
2.2	The E	xtent of V	oluntary Disclosures	31
	2.2.1	Types of Vs Volu	f Accounting Disclosures – Mandatory ntary	31
	2.2.2	Definition	on of Voluntary Disclosures	33
		2.2.2.1	Benefits and Limitations of Voluntary Disclosure	34
	2.2.3	Studies Disclosu Market	of the Extent of Voluntary Corporate in Developing and Developed	35
2.3		Moderatin liance	g Effect of Corporate Governance	37
2.4	The Devel	Determin oping and	ants of Voluntary Disclosure in Developed Markets	37
	2.4.1	Board D	iversity	38
		2.4.1.1	Defining and Classifying Board Diversity Variables	39
		2.4.1.2	The Effect of Board Gender Diversity (BGD) on Voluntary Disclosure (VD)	40
		2.4.1.3	The Effect of Educational Background Diversity (EBD) on VD	46
		2.4.1.4	The Effect of Ethnic Diversity (ETHD) on VD	49
	2.4.2	Audit Co	ommittee Characteristics (AC)	51
		2.4.2.1	The Roles of the Audit Committee	52

		2.4.2.2	The Effect of Audit Committee Independence (ACI) on VD	54
		2.4.2.3	The Effect of Audit Committee Financial Expertise on VD	57
		2.4.2.4	The Effect of Audit Committee Size on Voluntary Disclosure	60
	2.4.3	Corporat	e Governance Compliance	62
2.5	Summ	nary		68
CHAPTER 3	RESE	CARCH M	IETHODOLOGY	69
3.1	Introd	uction		69
3.2	Resea	rch Paradi	gms and Approaches	69
3.3	Resea	rch Proces	SS	71
3.4	Resea	rch Desigi	n: Triangulation Strategy	73
3.5	Funda	mental Th	neories	75
	3.5.1	Agency '	Theory and Voluntary Disclosure	75
		3.5.1.1	The Agency Theory and Board Diversity	76
	3.5.2	Stakehol	der Theory and Voluntary Disclosure	77
		3.5.2.1	The Stakeholder Theory, Board Diversity and Audit Committee	78
	3.5.3	Signaling	g Theory and Voluntary Disclosure	79
	3.5.4		e Dependency Theory, Board Diversity untary Disclosure	80
3.6	Conce	ptual Fran	nework	82
3.7	Resea	rch Hypot	heses	83
3.8	Unit o	of Analysis	s and Respondents	85
3.9	Targe	t Populatio	on and Sampling Method	85
3.10	Varial	oles and M	leasures	88
	3.10.1	Research	Instrument	91
		3.10.1.1	Construction of the Voluntary Disclosure Checklist/Index	92
		3.10.1.2	Measuring Voluntary Disclosure	92
		3.10.1.3	Validity and Reliability of the Checklist	95

			3.10.1.7	Index (Moderating Variable)	98
			3.10.1.5	Measuring Compliance Checklist (Index) of CG Best Practice Code	98
			3.10.1.6	Validity and Reliability Tests	100
		3.10.2	Interview	Structure and Justification	101
		3.10.3	Time Ho	rizons	102
	3.11	Data A	Analysis M	fethod	103
		3.11.1	Quantitat	ive Data Analysis	103
			3.11.1.1	Descriptive Statistics	105
			3.11.1.2	Inferential Panel Model Specification and Estimations	105
			3.11.1.3	Generalized Method of Moments (GMM)	105
			3.11.1.4	Test of the Moderation Effect	108
			3.11.1.5	Correlation Analysis	110
		3.11.2	Qualitativ	ve Data Analysis	111
	3.12	Summ	ary		115
СНАРТЕ			·	VE ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS	
СНАРТЕ			NTITATI	VE ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS	117
СНАРТЕ	R 4	QUAN Introd	NTITATI uction	VE ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS stics for All Listed Firms	
СНАРТЕ	R 4 4.1	QUAN Introd Descri	NTITATI uction aptive Stati		117 117 117
СНАРТЕ	R 4 4.1	QUAN Introd Descri 4.2.1	NTITATI uction iptive Stati Summary	stics for All Listed Firms of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics	117 117 117 119
СНАРТЕ	R 4 4.1 4.2	QUAN Introd Descri 4.2.1	NTITATI uction aptive Stati Summary Result collenearity	stics for All Listed Firms of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics	117 117
СНАРТЕ	R 4 4.1 4.2	QUAN Introd Descri 4.2.1 Multid 4.3.1	NTITATI uction iptive Stati Summary Result collenearity The Varia	stics for All Listed Firms of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics	117 117 117 119 122 123
СНАРТЕ	R 4 4.1 4.2	QUAN Introd Descrit 4.2.1 Multid 4.3.1 4.3.2	NTITATI uction iptive Stati Summary Result collenearity The Varia	stics for All Listed Firms of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics where the sector of the	117 117 117 119 122
СНАРТЕ	R 4 4.1 4.2 4.3	QUAN Introd Descrit 4.2.1 Multid 4.3.1 4.3.2	NTITATI uction ptive Stati Summary Result collenearity The Varia Correlatio	stics for All Listed Firms of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics	117 117 119 122 123 124 125
CHAPTE	R 4 4.1 4.2 4.3	QUAN Introd Descrit 4.2.1 Multid 4.3.1 4.3.2 The Ex	NTITATI uction ptive Stati Summary Result collenearity The Varia Correlation xtent and The External	stics for All Listed Firms of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics of Overall VIF) on Analysis Results of Trend of Voluntary Disclosure Level of Overall Voluntary Disclosure of Voluntary Disclosure by	117 117 119 122 123 124
CHAPTE	R 4 4.1 4.2 4.3	QUAN Introd Descrit 4.2.1 Multid 4.3.1 4.3.2 The E. 4.4.1	NTITATI uction aptive Stati Summary Result collenearity The Varia Correlatio xtent and T The Exte The Exte Category Developr	stics for All Listed Firms of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics of Overall VIF) on Analysis Results of Trend of Voluntary Disclosure Level of Overall Voluntary Disclosure of Voluntary Disclosure by	117 117 119 122 123 124 125 126

	4.6	GMM Findings of Research Objective and Research Hypothesis Testing		
		4.6.1.1	Research Objective 2 & 3 (Model 1): Relationship between the Board Diversity, Audit Committee Attributes and Voluntary Disclosure Index	133
		4.6.1.2	Research Objective 4 & 5 (Model 2): Relationship between the Interaction Tests with Board Diversity, AC Attributes and Voluntary Disclosure Index	138
		4.6.1.3	Research Objective 2 & 3 (Overall Model 3): Relationship between Board Diversity, AC Attributes and Voluntary Disclosure	145
		4.6.1.4	Research Objective 4 & 5 (Overall Model 4) Relationship between the Interaction Tests with Board Diversity, AC and Voluntary Disclosure Index	148
	4.7	Additional Ana	alysis for Robustness Check	154
	4.8	Summary of F	ndings	155
СНАРТЕ	R 5	QUALITATI	VE DATA ANALYSIS	159
	5.1	Introduction		159
	5.2	Semi-structure	d Interview Guide and Process	160
	5.3	An Interviewee	es' Company Background	165
		5.3.1 Consum	ner Goods Company (Respondent A)	165
		5.3.2 Agricul	tural Goods (Respondent B)	165
		5.3.3 Industri	al Goods (Respondent C)	166
		5.3.4 Service	s (Respondent D)	166
		5.3.5 Conglo	merate (Respondent E)	167
		5.3.6 Consum	ner Goods (Respondent F)	167
	5.4	•	verall Findings (Noticeable Features) of dents Interviewed According to Themes	1.60
				168
		5.4.1 Board I	Diversity and its Components	173

		5.4.1.1	Findings Obtained from Each Interviewee on Board Diversity	174
		5.4.1.2	Gender Diversity and Voluntary Disclosure	174
		5.4.1.3	Educational Background Diversity and Voluntary Disclosure	178
		5.4.1.4	Ethnic Diversity and Voluntary Disclosure	182
	5.4.2	Audit Co	ommittee and its Components	184
		5.4.2.1	Findings Obtained from Each Interviewee on Audit Committee	185
		5.4.2.2	Audit Committee Independence and Voluntary Disclosure	186
		5.4.2.3	Audit Committee Financial Expertise and VD	189
		5.4.2.4	Audit Committee Size and VD	193
	5.4.3	Impact of BD and	of corporate governance compliance on VD	195
		5.4.3.1	Findings from Each Interviewee on the Effect of CG Compliance on BD and VD	196
	5.4.4	Impact of on AC a	of Corporate Governance Compliance and VD	198
		5.4.4.1	Findings from Each Interviewee on the Effect of CG Compliance on AC and VD	200
5.5	Sumn	nary		202
CHAPTER 6			AND CONCLUSION	205
6.1		uction		205
6.2		ssion of F		205
	6.2.1		ent of Voluntary Disclosure (VD) in the Reports of the Nigerian listed ies	207
	6.2.2	The Rel Disclosu	ationship between BD and Voluntary are	210
	6.2.3		ationship between Audit Committee untary Disclosure	215

LIST OF PUBLI	CATIO	ONS	283
REFERENCES			231
	6.3.4	An Extended Research Framework	225
	6.3.3	Practical and Managerial Implication	224
	6.3.2	Methodological and Theoretical Implication	222
	6.3.1	Contribution to Knowledge	221
6.3	Contri	ibution of Study	221
	6.2.5	The Moderation Effect of the CG compliance on the Relationship between AC and Voluntary Disclosure	219
	0.2.4	the Relationship between BD and Voluntary Disclosure	217

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
Table 2.1	Nigerian CG laws and legislations	24
Table 2.2	Nigerian Existing Corporate Governance Codes	26
Table 2.3	Major Changes in the Nigerian Code of Corporate Governance (NCCG 2011- 2016)	27
Table 2.4	Summary of the Research Gaps	67
Table 3.1	Research Hypotheses	84
Table 3.2	Study Population from Nigerian Stock Exchange (NSE)	86
Table 3.3	Study Population by Sector	86
Table 3.4	Operational Definition of Variable Measurement	91
Table 3.5	Reliability Test for VD Index	96
Table 3.6	Requirements of the CG Code	99
Table 3.7	Components of CG Compliance Checklist	100
Table 3.8	Reliability Test for CG Compliance Index	101
Table 3.9	Linkage between RQ, RO, Methods of Data Collection, Analysis Technique	104
Table 3.10	Summary of the Final Sample of Semi Structured Interview with the demographic information of the respondents	113
Table 3.11	Semi-Structured Interviews Questions Modifications	114
Table 4.1	Descriptive Statistics Results	119
Table 4.2	Summary of Sectoral Descriptive Statistics Results	122
Table 4.3	Variance Inflation Factor (VIF) Test Result	123
Table 4.4	Pearson Correlation Matrix	125
Table 4.5	Spearman Correlation Matrix	125
Table 4.6	Descriptive Statistics of the Extent of Overall VD and by Categories	126
Table 4.7	Extent of Overall VD and its Categories Overtime	128

Table 4.8	Model (I) GMM Findings, Relationship between the Board Diversity, Audit Committee Attributes and Voluntary Disclosure Index	135
Table 4.9	Model (II) GMM Findings, Relationship between the Interaction Tests (CG compliance and BD, AC attributes) in Voluntary Disclosure Regression	141
Table 4.10	GMM Findings, Relationship between Board Diversity, AC attributes and the Voluntary Disclosure (Overall Models Objective 1&2).	146
Table 4.11	GMM Findings, Relationship between the Interaction Tests (CG Compliance and Overall BD, AC) in Voluntary Disclosure Regression	150
Table 4.12	Results of the Direct and Indirect Relationship Using OLS Regression	154
Table 4.13	Summary of Quantitative Analysis Findings	157
Table 5.1	Summary of Noticeable Features (Interviews from 6 Companies)	169
Table 5.2	Hypotheses Testing Adjacent to Case Study Findings	202
Table 6.1	Summary of Quantitative and Interview Findings	206

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE NO	. TITLE	PAGE
Figure 3.1	Research Process (Adapted and reproduced: Saunders et al., 2019; Cooper and Schindler, 2003)	72
Figure 3.2	Explanatory Sequential Mixed Methods Design (Adapted from Creswell, 2014)	73
Figure 3.3	Research Design (Source: Creswell and Creswell, 2018; Babbie, 2007).	74
Figure 3.4	Research Framework of the Moderation Effect of CG Compliance on the Board Diversity, Audit Committee and Voluntary Disclosure	83
Figure 3.5	Listed Companies by Sector	87
Figure 3.6	Data Analysis in Qualitative Research. Adopted from (Creswell, 2014, p. 311)	112
Figure 4.1	Extent of VD by Categories (Bar Chart) 2011-2017	129
Figure 4.2	Extent of VD by Categories (Pie Chart) 2007-2010	130
Figure 4.3	Relationship between Board Diversity and AC Attributes on VD	138
Figure 4.4	Effect of Overall Board Diversity and AC on Voluntary Disclosure	148
Figure 4.5	The Effect of CG Compliance on the Relationship between BD, AC and VD	153
Figure 5.1	Semi-structured Interview Guide and the Major Stakeholders.	160
Figure 5.2	Word Cloud Describing Disassembling of Data (Computed from the data 2011-2017 using NVIVO version 15)	162
Figure 5.3	Tree Map Describing Disassembling of Data (Computed from the data 2011-2017 using NVIVO version 15)	162
Figure 5.4	Coding System and Data Structure	164
Figure 6.1	The Moderation Model	227

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AC - Audit Committee

BD - Board Diversity

CFR - Corporate Financial Report

CG - Corporate Governance

DV - Dependent Variable

FRC - Financial Reporting Council

GAAP - Generally Accepted Accounting Principles

GMM - Generalized Method of Moments

IASB - International Accounting Standards Board

IFAC - International Federation of Accountants

IFRS - International Financial Reporting Standards

NCCG - Nigerian Code of Corporate Governance

NSE - Nigerian Stock Exchange

PLCs - Public Listed Companies

REG - Corporate Governance Compliance

STATA - Is a general-purpose statistical software package

UK - United Kingdom

US - United States

VDI - Voluntary Disclosure Index

LIST OF SYMBOLS

%	-	Percentage
α	-	Alpha Cronbach
f	-	Frequency
β	-	Beta
ε	-	Error Term

- Minimal error

δ

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX	TITLE	PAGE
Appendix A	Voluntary Disclosure Checklist	259
Appendix B	Corporate Governance Compliance Checklist	260
Appendix C	Letter of Request for Validation of Research Instrument	261
Appendix D	Evidence of Validation of Instrument by Accounting Professional 1	262
Appendix E	Evidence of Validation of Instrument by Accounting Professional2	264
Appendix F	Evidence of Validation of Instrument by Academician 1	266
Appendix G	Evidence of Validation of Instrument by Academician 2	268
Appendix H	Cover Letter for Research Interview	270
Appendix I	Semi-structured Interview Questions	273
Appendix J	Companies Included in the Final Sample	274
Appendix K	Descriptive Statistics of Sector-level Disclosure and the Determinants	276
Appendix L	2-Step System GMM Results for all IVs with DV (Model 1)	278
Appendix M	Voluntary Disclosure Score Sheet	280
Appendix N	Sample Interview Transcript	281

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Overview

There is a consensus by authorities and market regulators all over the world that, corporate governance and disclosure reports are two joint key instruments for investor's protection and proper running of the capital markets. (OECD, 2004; Akhtaruddin, et al., 2009; Chau and Gray, 2010; Wang and Hussainey, 2013; Rouf, 2017; Abad and Bravo, 2018; Lepore, Pisano, Amore, and Guida, 2019; Munther, 2019). The insufficient disclosures by companies due to ineptitude of corporate governance characteristics like corporate board diversity among which gender, ethnic and educational diversities are among the major determinants plus lack of experts in the audit committees have been established as the main causes for most of the corporate financial scandals in the world (Cadbury-Report, 1992; Ho and Wong, 2001; Catalyst, 2005; Hili and Affes, 2012; Samaha, Khlif and Hussainey, 2015; Wagana and Nzulwa, 2016; Hassan, et al., 2017).

Since occurrence of major financial frauds at the gigantic companies like WorldCom, Enron, Lehman brothers and Banco Espírito Santo in places like US, UK and Portugal following the financial crisis of the past few decades, there has been an increased demand for an adequate disclosure report and the diversity on corporate boards. Indicating an often-made claim, that lack of diversity was partly to blame for the crisis. For instance, the UK corporate governance code states that the problems arising from 'group-think' have been exposed in particular because of the financial crisis. One of the ways in which constructive debate (being essential to the effective functioning of any board) can be encouraged is through having sufficient diversity on the board. This includes, but is not limited to, gender and race (Financial Reporting Council, 2016).

In the same vein, the argument that gender and ethnic diversity will improve the key board role of oversight or monitoring of executive management has been made in many quarters (Guest, 2019). Similarly, the ineffectiveness of corporate governance attributes such as audit committee independence, size, and financial expertise of the committee members have been attributed to many corporate financial crisis worldwide (Lepore et al., 2019; Zhou et al., 2018; Cadbury-Report, 1992)

It has been established that the Asian financial crisis was not only the result of a loss of investor confidence, but, more importantly, of a lack of effective corporate governance and transparency in many of Asia's financial markets and individual firms (Wang and Hussainey, 2013; Sukthomya, 2011; Chau and Gray, 2010; Hongxia and Ainian, 2008 and Ho and Wong, 2001). Similarly, the confidence of users on the reliability of the financial statement became eroded (Bagudu, Badru and Alfa, 2015; Garba and Abubakar, 2014; Lincoln and Adedoyin, 2012; Tijjani and Dabor, 2010; Beasly, 1996; McMullen, 1996) as a result of highly publicized financial reporting frauds in Nigeria. Among the prominent financial scandals, include the case of African Petroleum Public Listed Company (PLC), and the Nigerian banking crisis that led to many banks distress in 2006 and 2009 due to deregulation of the banking sector. As a result, many capital market regulators, researchers from different fields of academics, like accounting, finance, economics and management became much more interested in corporate board diversity studies. According to Ferrari et al. (2016) the abovementioned scandals could have been prevented if a boardroom is diversified by incorporating a significant number of women in the affairs of the companies.

Adequate disclosure is believed to be a remedy to the corporate failure problem and it comprises both mandatory and voluntary disclosure as noted by Miller and Bahnson (1999); Gul and Leung (2004); Samaha et al. (2015) and Modugu and Eboigbe (2017). Voluntary disclosure refers to the free choices in the release of information on the part of managers to users of the annual reports. It comprises social, environmental, and intellectual capital disclosures. More precisely, it includes different types of information such as financial, social, historical, environmental and intellectual capital information (Stubbs and Higgins, 2018). However, voluntary disclosure improves the quality of mandatory disclosure as it always considers the need

for all users of accounting information besides reducing information asymmetry and therefore reduce the cost of external financing through reduced information risk, as well as, enhancing its market value (Healy and Palepu, 2001; Leuz and Wyscki, 2008). Consequently, the corporate governance literature has paid close attention to investigating factors influencing voluntary corporate disclosure (Wang and Hussainey, 2013).

In the same vein, corporate governance is the system by which companies are directed and controlled taking into consideration the interest of all stakeholders. However, codes of corporate governance (CG) are the set of best practices' recommendations regarding boards issued to address deficiencies in a country's governance systems by recommending a set of norms aimed at improving transparency and accountability among top managers and directors. In recent years, there has been an apparent increase in the number of countries from both developed (e.g., Japan and the UK) and developing (e.g., Brazil, South Africa and Nigeria), that have introduced corporate governance codes to enhance CG standards among listed firms. Unfortunately, entities in Nigeria, according to the report of the ROSC Team of World-Bank (2011) are considerably found to be less compliance with corporate accounting codes.

Board diversity (BD) is best described as heterogeneity among board members, and has an infinite number of dimensions ranging from age to nationality, from religious background to functional background, from task skills to relational skills and from political preference to sexual preference. This definition is comprehensive, as it comprises all-important BD components used in the current study. Due to sophistication, the market is highly complex and segregated according to factors such as age, gender, educational background, experience and ethnicity. Therefore, having a diverse board is advantageous because the board members have different educational backgrounds, ethnicities, genders, and ages, all of which may easily reflect the changing market (Jaafar, 2016).

Society for Corporate Governance Nigeria, SCGN (2014) observes that corporations are increasingly under pressure to ensure diversity within their

boardrooms. It has also been argued that many failures in corporate governance practices, which in turn contributed, to significant low profitability and investor losses that was observed to be due to the highly homogenous board composition (Nwanyuku, 2016). On the other hand, audit committee (AC) being responsible for monitoring overall financial reporting process, was also found to be significant in terms of exciting the reputation of good corporate governance, improving communication between board of directors and auditors, and reconciling conflict between management and auditors (Lin, Xiao and Tang, 2008). Additionally, the role of AC also, comprises of reviewing the financial reporting process, overseeing the internal control system (ICS) and management of financial risks, the audit process and the company's process for monitoring compliance with laws and CG codes. Hence, this study addresses voluntary disclosure practices and its determinants in a developing economy Nigeria.

1.2 Background of the Study

Financial malpractices and abuse of the system by capital market operators in Nigeria, have been receiving a great concern by all stakeholders. Many firms have sunk into liquidation on the ground of ineffectiveness or non-existing system of corporate governance. Similarly, the revelation of financial accounts misconduct perpetrated by Cadbury Nigeria PLC's management in 2006 is another financial scandal leading to over thirteen billion naira (N13b) balance sheet overstatement and profit to shareholders. It was over a number of years the company has been operating in the loss of almost N2 billion in 2006, which was undisclosed using creative accounting (Lincoln, and Adedoyin, 2012). It finally, led to fear in the Nigerian stock markets as investors and other stakeholders affected severely and began to dump their shares on the stock exchange. Other similar cases include Abacus Merchant Bank, Afribank, Unilever and Onwuka Hitech, besides the prominent case of African Petroleum PLC (now Forte PLC) where credit facilities of over 24 billion Naira were off the financial statement (Tijjani and Dabor, 2010). Therefore, the importance of corporate transparency through voluntary disclosure is believed to be enhanced through board diversity, apart from protecting the shareholders' interests, it also serve as a deterrent to the collapse of the capital markets and maintaining economic stability.

This study emphasises on the Nigerian context because certain ethnicities dominate specific areas. For example, politics is controlled by Hausa/Fulani and business and economics are dominated by Igbo people, while, the civil service sector was dominated by Yoruba people. Therefore, having directors from all three of the main ethnic groups including Hausa/Fulani, Igbo and Yoruba is beneficial for commercial reasons. Nigeria is an extremely ethnically diverse multinational state with over 250 ethnic groups and over 500 languages (Economic-section's Report, 2012). Therefore, ethnically diverse boards are able to bring different ideas and solutions to ethnic issues. Board members have a responsibility to links the disclosure decisions offered by the firm with investors' behaviour and background. This is because investors belong to many ethnicities that have their own beliefs, cultures and values regarding investment decisions. The situation becomes worse when boards are unable to understand their investors' backgrounds and beliefs, which may lead to poor disclosure decision-making (Jaafar, 2016). Thus, in order to lead the market by restoring the investors' confidence boards should often discuss ethnicity by generating ideas with ethnic diversity directors.

Furthermore, it is observed that women are considered to be more risk-averse (Valsan, 2015), less tolerance of unethical behaviour. This, in turn, helps them to be more effective in monitoring manager's decision making especially when they are part of the boardroom. In view of the foregone, the corporate world of today became much more interested in gender studies. Therefore, studying the effect of board diversity which includes gender, ethnic and educational background diversity on voluntary disclosure has become imperative for a company to improve voluntary disclosure (Hongxia and Ainian, 2008; Bagudu et al., 2015; Wagama and Nzulwa, 2016). In addition, voluntary disclosure can be a critical device to moderate the information asymmetry between different types of shareholders since it is product of management's decision (Healy and Palepu, 2001). Furthermore, other important of adequate accounting disclosure includes promotion of a good CG, attract investors, improve companies' image, improve accountability to shareholders, accountability to society and lastly promote international comparability.

This study is also motivated by the fact that corporate governance codes especially on board diversity and audit committees are mechanisms that help companies to achieve their corporate goals while disclosure is a prerequisite tool to report their performance and subsequently for investors to assess firms' performance (Akhtaruddin et al., 2009). Moreover, instilling a persistent role of codes of best practices in the corporate world today remains uncompromised; particularly in Nigeria, where the economy is dwindling due to financial crisis and overdependence on petroleum, the literature of promoting good corporate governance codes remains the only hope of restoring public confidence and boost accountability and transparency within the Nigerian firms.

It should be noted that, in practice corporate directors are directly involved in making decisions regarding which information is disclosed in the corporate annual reports. Therefore, to study the influence of governance mechanisms like corporate board and audit committee diversities on voluntary disclosure is of utmost importance; especially, due to the fact that it reduces agency problem (information asymmetry); and mandatory legal requirements do not always satisfy stakeholders' need (Wang and Hussainey, 2013; FASB, 2010). This is because, some strategic and other non-financial information that are very essential for good financial and investments decisions were absent in the mandatory, like information about directors or capital market data. Also, for being more transparent (Ho and Wong, 2001) which invariably increases the investor's confidence as well as, enhancing firms market value.

1.3 Problem Statement

Ideally, all corporate firms are supposedly guided by regulations and relevant codes of best practice (i.e. Corporate Governance) more specifically those pertaining to transparency in financial reporting. Recently, an empirical study conducted by Modugu and Eboigbe (2017) revealed that, level of voluntary disclosure reported from Nigerian listed companies was low showing the average index for 2012 of 44.5 percent, while 2013 and 2014 had the same index of 45 percent. Similar result was also, found by Adelopo (2011) in Nigeria that revealed average VD of 44% based on

modified Meek's et al. (1995) disclosure index on a study of listed companies. In addition, Okike et al. (2015) argued that, despite the varieties of policies and regulatory interventions, the practice of CG in Nigeria (i.e. code compliance) is inadequate which leads to financial crises and many bank distresses in the country. This is in addition to ineffective shareholders right, low degree of transparency and increasing the risks of companies being undervalued by market. Undoubtedly, without board and audit committee diversity the aforementioned problems are likely to continue and retard the achievement of attracting both foreign and local investors, lowering the cost of capital and increasing the firms value, among others (Healy and Palepu, 2001).

However, these problems could have been solved if the board and audit committee have been diversified (Ferrari et al., 2016 and Fidanoski, et al. 2014). Furthermore, according to Hamzah and Zulkafli (2014) failure of the board characteristics in terms of directors' skills, experience and independent status is a major factor that leads to the collapse of Lehman Brothers in 2008. Hence, this study aimed to investigate empirically whether board diversity (BD) and audit committee (AC) have any effect on voluntary disclosure (VD), which invariably enhances company's performance and effectiveness.

Many studies suggest that corporate board and audit committee diversity have become a contemporary topic especially because of its impacts on firms' performance (Katmon, et al., 2017). According to Hoang, Abeysekera, and Ma (2018) board diversity is a current debate around corporate governance literature, sufficiently offer as a key attribute to task executive management. Moreover, gender, ethnic and educational diversity is an important aspect of board diversity. Gender diversity refers to the presence of women on corporate boards of directors (Dutta and Bose, 2006; Nalikka, 2009; Bowrin, 2013; Liao, Luo, and Tang, 2015; Ben-Amar, Chang and McIlkenny, 2017). However, educational diversity according to Haniffa and Cooke (2002) is when directors with a good background in either finance, business or accounting education are presence in the board room as they are expected to report voluntary information to display accountability.

It has been widely accepted that corporate board diversity has been least explored in corporate governance literature (Cucari, Esposito De Falco, and Orlando, 2018; Eden and Gupta, 2017; Bullough et al., 2017). Moreover, scholars such as, Baker, Pandey, Kumar, and Haldar, (2020), have highlighted it as a contemporary future research topic after critical literature reviews of hundreds of empirical studies. While, Baker et al. (2020) revealed that there is quite less attention on ethnicity after using a bibliometric analysis to identify research activity on board diversity between 1999 and early 2019 studies from the ISI Web of Science database. This clearly, shows that the topic under review is contemporary. In addition, the presence of ethnic diversity (like Hausas, Igbo and Yoruba) in the board tends to integrate different knowledge bases and experiences. Not every investment is suitable for every investor because each has his or her own beliefs, especially regarding religious matters. For Muslim investors, halal issues are serious problem that need to be taken into consideration by every company. For example, in Northern Nigeria, the majority of investors/consumers of goods or services are Hausas' and Muslim, which influence the investment decision; unlike Southern part, that adopts western cultures. A firm's failure to understand these disparities may lead to inadequate or inappropriate disclosure.

Many have been studied for the effect of board diversity on firm performances. However, the effect of board diversity on VD has not been reached as broadly. Even though, there is a growing amount of literature suggesting that female directorship can influence various board decisions, yet, the research examining gender and VD decision-making process is rare (Rao and Tilt, 2016; Catalyst, 2014). Therefore, given such importance placed by academics, policy makers, and firms, hence, it is crucial to examine whether gender diversity truly matters in VD decisions.

A study from the US and other developed market confirmed that audit committee diversity has a positive influence on financial disclosure reporting (Harris, 2016) and it reduced the likelihood of financial misstatement. Moreover, comprehensive study of Nigerian listed companies revealed that Nigerian financial reporting practices are non-effective in terms of completeness, mainly due to non-existence of expertise in the audit committee (World Bank, 2014; Modugu and

Eboigbe, 2017). Despite the importance of audit committees in influencing the quality of financial reporting, there has been little research on the link between AC characteristics and voluntary disclosure reporting especially, in the context of Nigerian stock exchange.

Previous studies like Griffith (2016); Larcker et al. (2010); Cheng and Courtenay (2006); confirmed that, the CG code compliance enhances the strength of the link between the board independence and the level of VD. Notwithstanding, very few CG researches incorporate CG compliance. For example Garcia et al. (2018) investigate the relationship between the level of compliance with CG recommendations on how to improve the effectiveness of the audit committee of the Spanish Unified Code and financial reporting quality. But, the later used code compliance as independent variable only; while the former test the interaction effect of code compliance with single variable i.e. board independence. However, to fill this gap this current study believes that, CG code compliance can moderate the relationship between BD, AC and their components (independent variables) and VD (the dependent variable).

This study, specifically aims to extend previous studies on corporate governance (CG) mechanisms and VD (Buzby, 1975; Frost and Pownall, 1994; Meek, Roberts and Gray, 1995; McKinnon and Dalimunthe, 2009) in-developed markets and Asia (Haniffa and Cooke, 2002; Eng and Mak, 2003; Mohd-Nasir and Abdulah, 2004; Akhtaruddin et al., 2009; Chau and Gray 2010; Wang and Hussainey, 2013; Samaha et al., 2015; Jizi, 2017). Only Few studies were from Africa such as in Zimbabwe (Owusu-Ansah, 1998), Kenya (Barako, Hancock and Izan, 2006a). All these studies focuses on finding a direct relationship using few of the CG proxies such as board composition, power separation, ownership concentration and audit committee composition.

However, this study focused on finding the indirect/moderation effect of CG code compliance on the BD, AC and voluntary disclosure. This is in addition to adapting qualitative design (using interview) for in-depth understanding of the actual relationship directly from the source. Nigeria was chosen to investigate this issue

because the legal system and cultural practices differs among the nations (Haniffa and Hudaib, 2006). While some nations shares a single culture and language, others like Nigeria has more than 250 ethnic background. Hence, the effects of CG practices on voluntary disclosure can be expected to differ between developing and developed countries. Therefore, an investigation of corporate governance reforms in developing countries, where there is weak CG practice and lack of empirical evidence is of utmost importance.

Similarly, other scholars from Nigeria focus on examining corporate attributes and disclosure level of listed companies like Modugu and Eboigbe (2017). Moreover, Dembo and Rasaratnam (2014) conducted their study to explore the standard and quality of CG practices disclosure by Oando PLC, over the period 2010-2012, using the Nigerian 2011 Corporate Governance Code as a benchmark. Additionally, in Nigeria, the period covered by some of the previous studies leaves a gap. For example, the work of Damagum and Chima (2013), 1999-2009 covered; Modugu & Eboigbe (2017) covered the period of 2012-2014. Their observations were comparable as they all established that Nigeria corporate financial reporting practices to be defective. None of these earlier studies was exclusively devoted to examining the moderating effect of CG code but all concentrate on finding the direct effect of corporate characteristics on voluntary disclosure mostly using financial institutions like banks and insurance firms. However, this study is out to address the aforementioned gap. Moreover, these periods cannot be regarded as current as many activities have taken place between 2016 and 2017, which include the CG code amendment in 2016. Furthermore, it was this period that Nigeria Economy was deeply in recession. Therefore, some of the findings of these studies may not be relied upon in view of the circumstances.

Linck, Netter, and Yang (2008) and Hossain, Prevost, and Rao (2001) discussed the role of governance codes and how it enhances board performance. Although, Braendle (2019) recently investigates correlation between compliance to the Austrian Code of Corporate Governance and financial success of Austrian stock listed companies; however, to date, there is lack of evidence that links the CG Code compliance within VD studies. While, Inchausti (1997) and Cheng and Courtenay

(2006) have initiated the effort to include CG regulatory regime in examining the influence of board independence on disclosure reporting, this research is taking their effort a step further by incorporating the CG code compliance in voluntary disclosure studies. Thus, this research is unique in the sense that it tries to associate an explicit role of CG code compliance in a company's when evaluating a relationship between the corporate governance variables.

1.4 Research Aim

This research has three main aims to achieve. First, to explore whether Board Diversity (BD) and Audit Committee (AC) are adopted in the Nigerian PLC's, to examine the inclusion of gender, educational and ethnic diversities as a component of BD; and whether experts are included in the audit committee (AC). Second, to investigate the relationship between BD, AC and corporate VD, and examine whether compliance to CG compliance act as moderator on the relationship between BD, AC and VD of Nigerian PLC's. Lastly, to investigate the perception of those in authority to influence the release of VD (like CEO/ Senior Managers of Nigerian PLC's) regarding the factors that are considered more influential to their VD releases in terms of strategic, financial and non-financial type of voluntary disclosure.

It is a major aim of this study to see if the board diversity and audit committee bring positive synergy in improving voluntary disclosure of Nigerian PLC's. Therefore, if the two variables are proven to play a significant role in a company's success, then Nigerian listed companies should begin to seriously consider adopting gender, education and ethnic diversities and make sure experts especially those members with accounting and finance knowledge are incorporated in the audit committees apart from being independent of the management.

1.5 Research Questions

In light of the foregoing issues raised in the problem statement, this study aims to proffer answers to the under listed questions:

- 1. What is the extent of voluntary disclosure (VD) in the annual reports of the Nigerian listed company?
- 2. Does board diversity (BD) influence corporate voluntary disclosure (VD) of the Nigerian listed company?
- 3. Does an audit committee (AC) influence corporate voluntary disclosure (VD) of the Nigerian listed company?
- 4. Does corporate governance compliance moderate the relationship between board diversity and corporate voluntary disclosure reporting of Nigerian listed company?
- 5. Does corporate governance compliance moderate the relationship between the audit committee and corporate voluntary disclosure reporting of the Nigerian listed company?
- 6. What are the perceptions of those in authority to influence the release of voluntary disclosure, in order to gain more insights into voluntary disclosure practices of the Nigerian listed companies?

1.6 Research Objectives

The research objectives of this study comprise the following:

- 1. To investigate the extent of voluntary disclosure level of the Nigerian listed company.
- 2. To investigate the relationship between board diversity and voluntary disclosure.

- 3. To investigate the relationship between the audit committee and voluntary disclosure.
- 4. To investigate the moderation effect of corporate governance compliance on the relationship between board diversity and corporate voluntary disclosure.
- 5. To investigate the moderation effect of corporate governance compliance on the relationship between the audit committee and corporate voluntary disclosure.
- 6. To ascertain the perceptions of those in authority to influence the release of voluntary disclosure, in order to gain more insights into voluntary disclosure practices of Nigerian listed companies.

1.7 Research Motivation and Contribution

In the past few decades, corporate governance has attracted much attention from policy-makers and academics following the downfall of gigantic companies in developed countries, such as Enron and WorldCom, which is somewhat attributed to weak corporate governance practices (Ntim et al., 2012a). Likewise, many financial crisis in different part of the world like Asian stock market crisis in 1997/1998 have been attributed to improper disclosure practices, poor corporate governance and lack of transparency (Haniffa and Hudaib, 2006).

In light of the above, this study aims to investigate the effect of corporate governance code compliance on the relation between BD, AC and extent of VD of the Nigerian firms for a number of reasons. First, audit committees have been used to overcome observed corporate failures from their beginning (Martinov-Bennie et al., 2015). Second, board diversity becomes a current debate around CG literature being offer as a key attribute to task executive management sufficiently. Baker et al. (2020) revealed that there is quite less attention on ethnicity after using a bibliometric analysis to identify research activity on BD between 1999 and early 2019. Using a sample of 579 studies from ISI web of science database.

Similarly, educational background diversity in boardrooms is presently becoming a vital and interested area in board diversity studies. Consequently, a number of studies have been conducted but mainly focuses on measuring to find whether educational diversity has an impact on firm's performance. According to Clark and Maggitti (2012), different educational background of the board members is fundamental to speed up the strategic decision-making as it increases their ability due to diversity of knowledge. In addition, educational background diversity help to reduce the problem of bounded rationality (as advocated by agency theory) that will be helpful in gaining competitive advantage (Barroso-Castro et al. 2017). Therefore, educational background diversity is becoming an interesting area for many researchers (Fidanoski et al. 2014; Bathula, 2008). However, all the above-mentioned studies were conducted in the developed capital market and mostly focuses on measuring performance; therefore, there is a need to investigate whether educational background diversity has any significant impact on VD in the developing economy like Nigeria.

Moreover, Salterio, Smith, Kenno and McCrackern (2017) in their book titled Financial Reporting Qualitative Interview Based Research: A Primer With an Illustrative Examples, opine that conducting an interview in the field of financial reporting based research is relatively new. This indicates the high need for more qualitative research method in the field of disclosure study. Similarly, McNulty et al. (2013) and Rao and Tilt (2015) opined that majority of the empirical papers focus on examining the effect of board diversity on corporate financial performance mainly using quantitative technique while neglecting a qualitative method such as interviews which according to him would help in gaining in-depth understanding of board decision-making process. Hence, to overcome this problem, this study intends to extend previous literature by incorporating an interview into the methodology.

However, to the best of this study's knowledge, very little studies attempt to test the influence of corporate codes' compliance in corporate governance literature. For instance, Braendle (2019) focuses on analysis of the correlation between compliance to the Austrian Code of Corporate Governance and financial success of Austrian stock listed companies using a sample of 52 Austrian companies. Nevertheless, none is conducted (that considered all listed firms) in Nigerian context

and specifically investigates the relationship between board diversity (gender, ethnic and educational background diversity); audit committee (Independence, financial and committee size) and voluntary disclosure with CG codes' compliance as a moderator between them, that is why this study is aimed to bridge this gap. Thus, this will serve as a major contribution of this study.

The contributions to knowledge in this thesis are first, it provided empirical evidence concerning voluntary disclosure and its relationship with BD and AC. Second, it is the first empirical longitudinal study in Nigeria that provided evidence of the importance of CG code compliance to enhancing the relation between BD, AC and the extent of voluntary disclosure as far as the researcher is aware. Third, employed many quantitative methods, such as 1-step difference GMM regressions, 2-step difference GMM, 2-step difference GMM (VCE-Robust), 1-step System-GMM and 2-step System-GMM (as the main result of the study). Fourth, a self-constructed disclosure index developed in this thesis could be suitable for other developing countries that share similar business characteristics and experiencing the similar economic changes. Moreover, this thesis implies that the management and regulatory authorities, in particular, the capital markets authority Nigeria, need to intensify efforts to enhance the role of corporate governance practices in Nigerian listed companies.

1.8 Scope of the Study

This study covers all companies in Nigeria that are listed on the floor of the Nigerian Stock Exchange. This is because data on the variables that would be used to analyze the relationship between corporate board diversity, audit committee, corporate governance codes and voluntary disclosure can only be readily available from quoted companies. As difficulties may be encountered in acquiring information from unlisted companies (Chau and Gray, 2010; Gulzar and Zongjun, 2011; Hili and Affes, 2012; Fodio and Oba, 2012; Allegrini and Greco, 2013 and Garba and Abubakar, 2014). However, companies in the financial sector were excluded as they have separate CG code; hence, the final number of unit of analysis stands as 71. In addition, other non-listed were removed on the ground of being smaller besides there being a private

ownership. More importantly, lack of comprehensive accounting records which invariably may lead to inadequate and improper financial reports.

This study also covers the impact of corporate board diversity and audit committee characteristics on the voluntary disclosure reporting with CG compliance as moderator. Board diversity is to be measured by gender diversity (GD), ethnic (ETD), educational diversity (EBD) i.e. director's educational background. While, Audit Committee is to be measured by Audit Committee Independence (ACI), Audit Committee with Financial Expertise (ACFE) and Audit Committee Size (ACSIZE). On the other hand, the CG compliance is to be measured by the level of compliance with CG code compliance of 2011 by listed firms, which are considered as an important element of corporate governance.

This study also covers a period of seven years (i.e. the benchmark year 2011 and the end year 2017). The period chosen for the study is justified by the fact that, it reflects the time when the financial reporting council of Nigeria (FRCN) amended the existing code of corporate governance (SEC, 2011). The end year 2017 is chosen as the last because the stock exchange Fact Books used for selecting the sample are available up to 2017 and not beyond at the time of conducting this study and each stock exchange fact book reports on the activities of five (5) previous years. In addition, the period of seven years is considered adequate to determine the moderating effect of CG on BD, AC and VD reporting in the Nigerian listed companies. Likewise, is consistent with duration used in prior PhD researches conducted in the similar field for example, Albassam (2014) and many other empirical studies like: Jizi, 2017; Garba and Abubakar, 2014; Black, Jang and Kim, 2006 and Abbott, Parker and Peters, 2004.

1.9 Significance of the study

The contributions of this study can be observed from the several dimensions. Firstly, this study contributes to the body of knowledge by establishing the link between corporate board diversity, audit committee expertise and corporate voluntary disclosure is relatively new in Nigeria. Most of the studies conducted focused on the

UK, United States of America, Canada, India, South Africa and Malaysia. Hence, findings from this study will assist to build a comprehensive international understanding of the linkage between corporate board diversity and firms' voluntary disclosure as a continuously growing concept.

Secondly, this study is positioned as an empirical contribution to stand along with other recent empirical studies of the state of knowledge in corporate governance as it integrates the literature on BD and AC diversity and voluntary disclosure reporting when it confirms the positive, direct influence of BD and AC roles on voluntary disclosure reporting. Also, by establishing the moderating effects of CG compliance on the relation between BD and VD reporting.

Thirdly, this study provides practical contribution to users of accounting information in the sector, which includes the management, shareholders, investors, financial analyst, and other stakeholders. They shall find the findings of this study resourceful in which it will help them in taking various decisions and judgments such as investment and financing. The findings of the study will assist shareholders of Nigerian companies in aligning their capital structure and assist in deciding a better way of financing. Both current and potential shareholders will benefit from this study, as it would assist them in deciding whether to invest or not in those companies. Regulators like Financial Reporting Council of Nigeria (FRCN), Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) and professional accounting bodies will benefit from the study. The FRCN will benefit from the study, as it will reveal the extent of financial reports in the individual industry that will be critical for future review of CG code and decision-making.

This can help in findings ways in which the quality of financial reporting standard guidelines can be improved in all the companies from different sectors of the Nigerian economy, as recommendations has been made at the end of the study for the enhancement of the financial reporting quality. The professional accounting bodies particularly will find this study resourceful as it will reveal the effect of accounting knowledge of board and audit committee members on the quality of financial reporting of all the listed companies. The professional bodies in maintaining, as well as,

improving its training programs can also use the findings. It will highlight the need and importance for companies in developing economy to understand the roles of BD and AC diversity in influencing VD, which invariably increases the value of the firm. Similarly, it also shows the important dimensions of voluntary disclosure perceived by listed companies, like, social responsibility and environmental disclosure.

This study, therefore, is driven primarily by the existence of the aforementioned gaps. The results and empirical findings of this study may be of interest to regulators, investors, corporate executives, special interest groups, academia, and researchers, not only in Nigeria but also in other regions of the world. Moreover, other significance of these contributions includes ability to discover the voluntary disclosure level, the compliance level to CG code and more importantly factors determining the voluntary disclosure level of the Nigerian listed companies. Lastly, the significance of the additional insight provided by this study especially from qualitative findings is that, issues of concerning the integrity and level of commitment of the board members has been a critical. Hence, should be investigated by future research.

1.10 Definition of Terms

This section tends to explain in brief the definitions of the most frequent terms that have been used in this study such as corporate governance, voluntary disclosure, board gender diversity and audit committee among others. Brief definitions are as follows:

Audit Committee – refers to the board's sub-committee responsible for overseeing the financial reporting process and ensuring the objectivity of the external audit (Uzun, Szewczyk and Varma, 2004).

Audit Committee Independence – refers to the proportion of nonexecutive directors in the audit committee (Li, Mangena, and Pike, 2012).

Audit Committee Financial Expertise – refers to the proportion AC members with finance experience to overall AC members (Albernathy, et al., 2014)

Audit Committee Size – refers to a number of audit committee members (Lepore et al., 2019; Rastegar et al., 2018; Katmon et al., 2017).

Board Diversity - is defined as being inclusive of various attributes that may be represented among directors in the boardroom in relation to board process and decision-making, including age, gender, ethnicity, culture, religion, constituency representation, independence, knowledge, educational and professional background, technical skills and expertise, commercial and industry experience, career and life experience (Milliken and Martins, 2016).

Board Educational Diversity- refers to the presence of board members with business, accounting and or finance educational background in the corporate boards of directors (Hannifa and Cooke, 2002).

Board Ethnic Diversity- refers to the presence of different ethnic backgrounds or identities within the boardroom (Marimuthu, 2008).

Board Gender Diversity – refers to an important aspect of board diversity that means the presence of women in the corporate boards of directors (Rouf, 2016).

Corporate Governance – A set of relationships between a company's management, its board, its shareholders and other stockholders. Corporate governance also provides the structure through which the objectives of the company are set and the means of attaining those objectives and monitoring performance are determined (OECD, 2004).

Corporate Governance Compliance – is a means by which companies adapt behavior to legal, regulatory, and social norms (Griffith, 2016). Hence, CG code compliance refers to adherence to the code of best practice by the Nigerian listed firms.

Voluntary Disclosure – Voluntary disclosure is a free choice on the part of company management to provide accounting and other information deemed relevant to the decision needs of users of their annual reports (Meek et al. 1995).

1.11 Chapters Organization

This thesis comprises of six chapters. The general introduction as chapter one which covers the background to the study, statement of the problem, research questions, objectives of the study, significance of the study and the scope of the study. An overview of the conceptual framework of this study and limitations of the study are also discussed. Chapter 2 contains the introduction and review of relevant conceptual and theoretical literatures on various corporate board diversity, AC characteristics and their influence on firms' voluntary disclosure reporting. Such characteristics include board diversity on gender and education; and audit committees members' composition, their financial expertise and size of the audit committee and lastly whether corporate governance code compliance as an external CG element has an effect on all other variables. Chapter 3 explains the methodology adopted in this study by highlighting the research process, research design, research paradigm, data collection method adopted, measurement of variables and the methods of analysis to be used. Chapter 4 presents the quantitative data analysis, while, qualitative analysis comes in chapter 5. Chapter 6 integrates the discussions on both quantitative and qualitative findings after which conclusions and recommendations for future research follows.

REFERENCES

- Abad, C. and Bravo, F. (2018) 'Audit committee accounting expertise and forward looking disclosures: A study of the US companies', *Management Research Review*, 41(2), pp. 166–185.
- Abad, D., Lucas-Pérez, M. E., Minguez-Vera, A. and Yagüe, J. (2017) 'Does gender diversity on corporate boards reduce information asymmetry in equity markets?', *BRQ Business Research Quarterly*, 20(3), pp. 192–205.
- Abbott, L. J., Parker, S. and Peters, G. F. (2004) 'Audit committee characteristics and restatements', *Auditing: A Journal Of Practice and Theory*, 23(1), pp. 69–87.
- Abd-Elsalam, O. and Weetman, P. (2007) 'Measuring accounting disclosure in a period of complex changes: The Case of Egypt', *Advances in International Accounting*, 20, pp. 75–104.
- Abdelsalam, O. H., Bryant, S. M. and Street, D. L. (2007) 'An examination of comprehensiveness of corporate internet reporting provided by London listed companies', *Journal of International Accounting Research*, 6(2), pp. 1-33.
- Abdullah, D. F. (2014) The Moderate Mediation Effect of Internal Audit Function and Corporate Governance on Intellectual Capital and Corporate Performance. PhD Thesis. Universiti Technologi Malaysia, Skudai.
- Abdullah, S. N. (2006) 'Board composition, audit committee and timeliness of corporate financial reports in Malaysia', *Corporate Ownership and Control*, 4(2).
- Abdullah, S. N. and Ismail, K. N. I. K. (2013) 'Gender, ethnic and age diversity of the boards of large Malaysian firms and performance', *Jurnal Pengurusan*, 38, pp. 27–40.
- Abdur-Rouf, M. (2017) 'Firm-specific characteristics, corporate governance and voluntary disclosure in annual reports of listed companies in Bangladesh', *International Journal of Managerial and Financial Accounting*, 9(3).
- Abu Baker, A. B. S., Ghazali, N. B. M. and Ahmad, M. B. (2019) 'Sustainability Reporting and Board Diversity in Malaysia Sustainability Reporting and Board Diversity in Malaysia Aishah Binti Sheikh Abu Bakar', *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 9(3), pp. 1044–1067.

- AbuRaya, R. K. (2012) The Relationship Between Corporate Governance and Environmental Disclosure: UK Evidence. PhD Thesis. Durham University, Durham.
- Adelopo, I. (2011) 'Voluntary disclosure practices amongst listed companies in Nigeria', *Advances in Accounting*, 27(2), pp. 338–345.
- Adznan, S. and Nelson, S. P. (2014) 'Financial instruments disclosure practices: Evidence from Malaysian listed firms', *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 164(August), pp. 62–67.
- Agarwal, B. (2010) Gender and Green Governance: The Political Economy of Women's Presence Within and Beyond Community Forestry. Oxford University Press.
- Aguinis, H. (2004) Regression analysis for categorical moderators. New York: Guilford Press.
- Aguinis, H., Edwards, J. R. and Bradley, K. J. (2017) 'Improving Our Understanding of Moderation and Mediation in Strategic Management Research', *Organizational Research Methods*, 20(4), pp. 665–685.
- Akhtaruddin, M. and Abdur Rouf, M. (2011) Corporate Governance, Cultural Factors

 And Voluntary Disclosure: Evidence From Selected Companies In

 Bangladesh. 2011 Baasana International Conference. USA.
- Akhtaruddin, M. and Haron, H. (2010) 'Board ownership, audit committees' effectiveness, and corporate voluntary disclosures', *Asian Review of Accounting*, 18(3), pp. 245–259.
- Akhtaruddin, M., Hossain, M. A., Hossain, M., & Yao, L. (2009) 'Corporate governance and voluntary disclosure in corporate annual reports of Malaysian listed firms', *JAMAR*, 7(1), pp. 1–20.
- Akinlabi, A. O., Hamed, B. and Awoniyi, M. A. (2011) 'Corruption, foreign direct investment and economic growth in Nigeria: An empirical investigation', *Journal of Research in International Business Management*, 1(9), pp. 278–292.
- Akpan, E. O. and Amran, N. A. (2014) 'Board characteristics and company performance: Evidence from Nigeria', *Journal of Finance and Accounting*, 2(3), p. 81.
- AL-Dhamari, R. A., Ismail, K. N. I. and Al-Gamrh, B. A. (2016) 'Board diversity and corporate payout policy: Do free cash flow and ownership concentration matter?', *Corporate Ownership and Control*, 14(1Continued2), pp. 373–383.

- Al-Shaer, H., Salama, A. and Toms, S. (2017) 'Audit committees and financial reporting quality: Evidence from UK environmental', *Journal of Applied Accounting Research*, 18(1), pp. 2–21.
- Al-Shammari, B. (2008) 'Voluntary disclosure in Kuwait corporate annual reports', *Review of Business Research*, 8, pp. 62–81.
- Albassam, W. M. (2014) Corporate governance, voluntary disclosure and financial performance: An Empirical analysis of Saudi listed firms using a mixed-methods research design. PhD Thesis. University of Glasgrow, Glasgrow.
- Aldamen, H., Hollindale, J. and Ziegelmayer, J. L. (2018) 'Female audit committee members and their influence on audit fees', *Accounting and Finance*, 58(1), pp. 57–89.
- Allegrini, M. and Greco, G. (2013) 'Corporate boards, audit committees and voluntary disclosure: Evidence from Italian Listed Companies', *Journal of Management and Governance*, 17(1), pp. 187–216.
- Alotaibi, B. M. N. A. (2014) Corporate Governance and Voluntary Disclosure in Kuwait. PhD Thesis. University of Bedfordshire, Bedford.
- Alsaeed, K. (2006) 'The Association between Firm–Specific Characteristics and Disclosure: The Case of Saudi Arabia', *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 25(5), pp. 476–496.
- Alshfire, F. M., Subekti, I. and Widya, Y. (2016) 'The effect of audit committee characteristics on timeliness of financial reporting by Using auditor quality and the moderating variable (An Empirical Study From Indonesian Manufacturing Companies)', *The International Journal of Accounting and Business Society*, 24(1), pp. 1–34.
- Alves, S. (2013) 'The impact of audit committee existence and external audit earnings management', *Journal of Financial Reporting and Accounting*, 11(2), pp. 143–165.
- Arcay, B. R. M. and Vazquez, M. F. M. (2005) 'Corporate characteristics, governance rules and the extent of voluntary disclosure in Spain', *Advances in Accounting*, 21(05), pp. 299–331.
- Arellano, M. and Bond, S. (1991) 'Some tests of specification for panel data: Monte carlo evidence and an application to employment equations', *The Review of Economic Studies*, 58(2), p. 277.

- Armstrong, C. S., Core, J. E. and Guay, W. R. (2014) 'Do independent directors cause improvements in firm transparency?', *Journal of Financial Economics*, 13(3), pp. 383–403.
- Asadi, L. (2014) The assessment of the implementation of accounting standards by investment firms. PhD Thesis. Azad University Tehran, Iran.
- Babbie, E. (2007) The Practice of Social Research. Thomson: Wadsworth.
- Bagudu, H. D., Badru, O. B. and Alfa, A. B. (2015) 'The vital role of gender diversity on corporate outcomes: The need for empirical studies concerning frontier markets', *Asian Journal of Finance & Accounting*, 7(2), p. 183.
- Bailey, B. and Peck, S. (2013) 'Boardroom strategic decision-making style: Understanding the antecedents', *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 21(2), pp. 131–146.
- Baker, H. K., Pandey, N., Kumar, S. and Haldar, A. (2020) 'A bibliometric analysis of board diversity: Current status, development, and future research directions', *Journal of Business Research*, 108(August 2019), pp. 232–246.
- Barako, D. G., Hancock, P. and Izan, H. Y. (2006a) 'Factors influencing voluntary corporate disclosure by Kenyan companies', *Corporate Governance*, 14(2), pp. 107–125.
- Barako, D. G., Hancock, P. and Izan, H. Y. (2006b) 'Relationship between corporate governance attributes and volutarry disclosures in annual reports: The Kenyan experience', *Journal of Financial Reporting, Regulation and Governance*, 5(1), pp. 1–25.
- Baron, R. and Kenny, D. (1986) 'The Moderaor-Mediator Variable Distinction in Social Psychological Reseach: Conceptual, Strarategic, and Statistical Considerations', *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 51(6), pp. 1173–1182.
- Barroso-Castro, C., Villegas-Perin an, M. M. and Dominguez, M. (2017) 'Board members' contribution to strategy: The mediating role of board internal processes', *European Research on Management and Business Economics*, 23(2), pp. 1–8.
- Bastomi, M., Salim, U. and Aishjah, S. (2017) 'The role of corporarte governance and risk management on banking financial performance in Indonesia', *Jurnal Keuangan Dan Perbankan*, 21(4), pp. 589–599.

- Bathula, H. (2008) *Board Characteristics and Firm Performance: Evidence from New Zealand*. University of Technology, Auckland.
- Beasly, M. S. (1996) 'An empirical analysis of the relation between the board of director composition and financial statement fraud', *The Accounting Review*, 71, pp. 443–465.
- Becker, T. (2005) 'Potential problems in the statistical control of variables in organizational research: A qualitative analysis with recommendations', *Organizational Research Methods*, 8, pp. 274–289. doi: 10.1177/1094428105278021.
- Ben-Amar, W., Chang, M. and McIlkenny, P. (2017) 'Board gender diversity and corporate response to sustainability initiatives: Evidence from the carbon disclosure project', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 142(2), pp. 369–383.
- Bernerth, J. B. and Aguinis, H. (2016) 'A Critical Review and Best-Practice Recommendations for Control Variable Usage', *Personnel Psychology*, 69(1), pp. 229–283.
- Bin-Ghanem, H. and Akmalia, A. M. (2016) 'The effect of board of directors and audit committee effectiveness on internet financial reporting: Evidence from gulf cooperation', *Journal of Accounting in Emerging Economies*, 6(4), pp. 429–448.
- Blundell, R. and Bond, S. (1998) 'Initial conditions and moment restrictions in dynamic panel data models', *Journal of Econometrics*, 87(1), pp. 115–143.
- Bond, S., Hoeffler, A. and Temple, J. (2001) 'GMM Estimation of Emoirical Growth Models'. Economic P. Nuffield College University of Oxford.
- Bonsón, E. and Escobar, T. (2002) 'A survey on voluntary disclosure on the internet: Empirical evidence from 300 European Union companies', *The International Journal of Digital Accounting Research*, 2, pp. 27–52.
- Borgia, F. (2005) Corporate Governance and Transparency Role of Disclosure: How Prevent New Financial Scandals and Crimes?, School of International Service. Washington D.C.
- Bowrin, A. R. (2013) 'Corporate social and environmental reporting in the Caribbean', *Social Responsibility Journal*, 9(2), pp. 259–280.
- Boyd, B. K., Bergh, D. D., Ireland, R. D. and Ketchen, D. J. (2013) 'Constructs in strategic management', *Organizational Research Methods*, 16, pp. 3–14.

- Boyd, C. (1996) 'Ethics and corporate governance: the issues raised by the Cadbury report in the United Kingdom', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 15(2), pp. 167–182.
- Braendle, U. (2019) 'Corporate Governance Code Compliance and financial performance: the case of Austrian stock listed companies', *Investment Management and Financial Innovations*, 16(3), pp. 131–141.
- Brammer, S. and Pavelin, S. (2006) 'Voluntary environmental disclosure by large UK companies', *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 33, pp. 1168–1188.
- Breaugh, J. (2008) 'Important considerations in using statistical procedures to control for nuisance variables in non-experimental studies', *Human Resource Management Review*, 18, pp. 282–293.
- Brunk, K. (2010) 'Exploring origins of ethical company/brand perceptions-a consumer perspective of corporate ethics', *Journal of Business Research*, 63(3), pp. 255–262.
- Bryman, A. (2012) Social Research Methods. Fourth. New York, US: Oxford Press.
- Bryman, A. and Bell, E. (2007) *Business Research Methods*. New York: Oxford University Press Inc.
- Bullough, A., Moore, F. and Kalafatoglu, T. (2017) 'Research on women in international business and management: Then, now, and next', Forthcoming in cross cultural and strategic management, special issue on 'Gender in International Business and Management'.
- Buzby, S. L. (1975) 'Company size, listed versus unlisted stocks, and the extent of financial disclosure', *Journal of Accounting Research*, 13(1), pp. 16–37.
- Cadbury-Report-Committee (1992) *The Financial Aspects of Corporate Governance*. London: Gee and Co. Ltd.
- CAMA (1990) *Company and Allied Matters Act.* Nigeria. Retrieved from http://www.nigerialaw.org
- Campbell, D., Shrives, P. and Saager, H. B. (2001) 'Voluntary disclosure of mission statements in corporate annual reports: signaling what and to whom?', *Business and Society Review*, 106(1), pp. 65–87.
- Carlson, K. D. and Wu, J. (2012) 'The illusion of statistical control: Control variable practice in management research.', *Organizational Research Methods*, pp. 413–435.
- Carmines, E. G. and Zeller, R. A. (1991) *Reliability and Validity Assessment*. London, UK: SAGE Publications, Inc.

- Catalyst (2005) *Census of Women Board Directors of the Fortune 500*. Retrieved from http://www.catalyst.org/knowledge/2005-catalyst-census-women-board-di
- Catalyst. (2014). *Increasing gender diversity on boards: Current index of formal approaches*. New York: Catalyst. Retrieved from https://springforward.unwomen.org/en/~/documents/sitecore/content/documents/2014/12/1
 https://springforward.unwomen.org/en/~/documents/sitecore/content/documents/sitecore/content/
- Cerf, A. R. (1961) *Corporate reporting and investment decision, Barkeley*. Califonia: University of Califonia Press.
- Chau, G. and Gray, S. J. (2010) 'Family ownership, board independence and voluntary disclosure: Evidence from Hong Kong', *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*, 19(2), pp. 93–109.
- Chau, G. K. and Gray, S. J. (2002) 'Ownership structure and corporate voluntary disclosure in Hong Kong and Singapore', *The International Journal of Accounting*, 37(2), pp. 247–265.
- Chen, H. (2011) 'Does Board Independence Influence the Top Management Team? Evidence from Strategic Decisions toward Internationalization', *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 19(4), pp. 334–350.
- Chen, J. and Roberts, R. (2010) 'Toward a more coherent understanding of the organization–society relationship: A theoretical consideration for social and environmental accounting research', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 97, pp. 651–665.
- Chen, S. and Komal, B. (2018) 'Audit committee financial expertise and earnings quality: A meta analysis', *Journal of Business Research*. Elsevier, 84(November 2016), pp. 253–270.
- Cheng, E. C. M. and Courtenay, S. M. (2006) 'Board composition, regulatory regime and voluntary disclosure', *International Journal of Accounting*, 41(3), pp. 262–289.
- Chithambo, L. (2013) *The Extent and Determinants of Greenhouse Gas Reporting in the United Kingdom*, PhD Thesis. Bournemouth University.
- Clark, K. D. and Maggitti, P. G. (2012) 'TMT potency and strategic decision-making in high technology firms', *Journal of Management Studies*, 49(7), pp. 1168–1193.

- Coleman, L., Maheswaran, K. and Pinder, S. (2010) 'Narratives in managers' corporate finance decisions', *Accounting and Finance*, 50(3), pp. 605–633.
- Collett, P. and Hrasky, S. (2005) 'Voluntary disclosure of corporate governance practices by listed Australian companies', *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 13(2), pp. 188–196.
- Collis, J., Hussey, R. and and Hussey, R. (2014) *Business Research: A practical Guide* for Undergraduate and Postgraduate Students. 4Th Editio. New York: Palagrave Macmillan.
- Cooke, T. E. (1989) 'Voluntary corporate disclosure by Swedish companies', *Accounting and Business Research*, 19, pp. 113–124.
- Cooke, T. E. (1992) 'The impact of size, stock market listing and industry type on disclosure in the annual reports of Japanese listed corporations', *Accounting and Business Research*, 22(87), pp. 229–237.
- Cooke, T. E. and Wallace, R. S. O. (1990) 'Financial Disclosure Regulation and Its Environment: A Review and Further Analysis', *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 9, pp. 79–110.
- Cooper, D. R. and Schindler, P. S. (2003) Business Research Methods. McGraw-Hill.
- Corbin, J. and Strauss, A. (2008) Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory. 3rd Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Cortina, J. M. (1993) 'Interaction, Nonlinearity, and Multicollinearity: implications for Multiple Regression', *Journal of Management*, 19(4), pp. 915–922.
- Corwin, S. A. and Schultz, P. (2012) 'A simple way to estimate bid-ask spreads from daily high and low prices', *Journal of Finance*, 67(2), pp. 719–760.
- Creswell, J. and Clark, V. (2011) *Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research*. Second. London, UK: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014) Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. 4th edn. Edited by Editor: Brittany. California, USA: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Creswell, J. W. and Creswell, J. D. (2018) *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Fifth Edit. USA: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Crotty, M. (1998) The Foundations of Social Research. London: SAGE.

- Cucari, N., Esposito De Falco, S. and Orlando, B. (2018) 'Diversity of Board of Directors and Environmental Social Governance: Evidence from Italian Listed Companies', *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 25(3), pp. 250–266.
- Dalton, D. R. and Dalton, C. M. (2010) 'Female and corporate boards of directors: The promise of increased, and substantive, participation in the post Sarbanes-Oxley era'. *Business Horizon*, 53(3), pp. 257-268.
- Damagum, Y. and Chima, E. (2013) 'The impact of corporate governance on voluntary information disclosures of quoted firms in Nigeria: An empirical analysis', *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*, 4(13), pp. 166–178.
- Dancey, C. P. and Reidy, J. G. (2008) *Statistics without Maths for Psychology*. 4th edn. Harlow: Prentice Hall: Prentice Hall.
- Dawson, J. F. (2014) 'Moderation in Management Research: What, Why, When, and How', *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 29(1), pp. 1–19.
- DeFond, M., Hann, R. and Hu, X. (2005) 'Does the market value financial expertise on audit committees of boards of directors?', *Journal of Accounting Research*, 43(2), pp. 153–193.
- Dembo, A. M. and Rasaratnam, S. (2014) 'Corporate governance and disclosure in Nigeria: An empirical study', *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 164(August), pp. 161–171.
- Denis, D. K. and McConnell, J. J. (2002) 'International corporate governance', *Journal of Finance and Quantitative Analysis*, 38(1), pp. 1–36.
- Depoers, F. (2010) 'A cost benefit study of voluntary disclosure: Some empirical evidence from French listed companies', *European Accounting Review*, 9(2), pp. 245–263.
- Dewayanto, T., Suhardjanto, D., Bandi and Setiadi, I. (2017) 'Ownership structure, audit committee, and internal control disclosure: Indonesia and Philippines', *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 6(4), pp. 353–363.
- Dezoort, F. T., Hermanson, D. R., Archambeault, D. S. and Reed, S. A. (2002) 'Audit Committee Effectiveness: A Synthesis of the Empirical Audit Committee Literature', *Journal of Accounting Literature*, 21, pp. 38–75.
- Dierkes, M. and Antal, A. . (1985) 'The usefulness and use of social reporting information', *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 10(1), pp. 29–34.

- Duru, A., Iyengar, R. J. and Zampelli, E. M. (2016) 'The dynamic relationship between CEO duality and firm performance: The moderating role of board independence', *Journal of Business Research*. Elsevier Inc., 69(10), pp. 4269–4277.
- Dutta, P. and Bose, S. (2006) 'Gender diversity in the boardroom and financial performance of commercial banks: Evidence from Bangladesh', *The Cost and Management*, 34(6), pp. 70–74.
- Easterby-Smith, M., Thorpe, R. and Jackson, P. (2008) *Management Research*. Third Eds,. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Eccles, R. G., Krzus, M. P. and Serafeim, G. (2011) 'Market interest in nonfinancial information', *Journal of Applied Corporate Finance*, 23(4), pp. 113–127.
- Economic-Section (2012) 'Nigeria Fact Sheet', *United States Embassy in Nigeria, retrieved from http://nigeria.usembassy.gov*.
- Eden, L. and Gupta, S. F. (2017) 'Culture and context matter: Gender in international business and management', *Cross Cultural and Strategic Management*, 24(2), pp. 194–210.
- Edwin, A. and Timothy, P. (2019) 'Board gender diversity and financial reporting quality: Empirical evidence from Nigeria', *Global Journal for Research Analysis*, (4), pp. 120–126.
- Eng, L. L. and Mak, Y. T. (2003) 'Corporate governance and voluntary disclosure', *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 22(4), pp. 325–345.
- Farag, H. and Mallin, C. (2016) 'The impact of the dual board structure and board diversity: Evidence from Chinese Initial Public Offerings (IPOs)', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 139(2), pp. 333–349.
- FASB (2010) Statement of Financial Accounting Concepts. Connecticut, USA.
- Fernandez-feijoo, B., Romero, S. and Ruiz-blanco, S. (2014) 'Women on boards: Do they affect sustainability reporting?', *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 21, pp. 351–364.
- Ferrari, G., Ferraro, V., Profeta, P. and Pronzato, C. (2016) 'Gender quotas: Challenging the boards, performance, and the stock market', *CESifo Working Paper Series No. 6084.*, (10239).

- Fidanoski, F., Simeonovski, K. and Mateska, V. (2014) 'The impact of board diversity on corporate performance: New evidence from Southeast Europe', *Corporate Governance in the US and Global Settings*, 26, pp. 81–123.
- Field, A. (2016) An adventure in Statistics: The Reality Enigma. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Financial Reporting Council (2016) *The UK Corporate Governance Code*. London: Financial Reporting Council.
- Firth, M. (1979) 'The Impact of Size, Stock Market Listing, and Auditors on Voluntary Disclosure in Corporate Annual Reports', *Accounting and Business Research*, 9(36), pp. 273–280.
- Fox, R. P. (1984) 'Agency theory: A New perspective', *Management Accounting*, 62, pp. 36–38.
- Fodio, I. M., & Oba, V. C. (2012) 'Gender diversity in the boardroom and corporate philanthropy: Evidence from Nigeria. *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*', 3(8), 63–69.
- Francoeur, C., Labelle, R. and Sinclair-Desgagné, B. (2008) 'Gender diversity in corporate governance and top management', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 81(1), pp. 83–95.
- Frantz, P. and Walker, M. (1997) 'Information disclosure to employees and rational expectations: A game-theoretical perspective', *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 24(9), pp. 131–142.
- FRC (2012) Guidance on Audit Committees. London: FRC. London.
- Freebody, P. (2003) *Qualitative Research in Education: Interaction and Practice*. London: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Freeman, R. E. (1984) *Strategic Management: A Stakeholder Approach*. Boston, MA: Pitman.
- Freeman, R. E., Wicks, A. C. and Parmar, B. (2004) 'Stakeholder theory and the corporate objective revisited', *Organization Science*, 15(3), pp. 364–369.
- Frost, C. A. and Pownall, G. (1994) 'Accounting disclosure practices in the United States and the United Kingdom', *Journal of Accounting Researches*, 32(1), pp. 75–102.
- Galbreath, J. (2010) 'Drivers of corporate social responsibility: the role of formal strategic planning and firm culture', *British Journal of Management*, 21(2), pp.

- Garba, T. and Abubakar, B. A. (2014) 'Corporate board diversity and financial performance of insurance companies in Nigeria: an application of panel data approach', *Asian Economic and Financial Review*, 4(2), 257–277.
- García-Sánchez, I. M., García-Meca, E. and Cuadrado-Ballesteros, B. (2017) 'Do financial experts on audit committees matter for bank insolvency risk-taking? The monitoring role of bank regulation and ethical policy', *Journal of Business Research*, 76, pp. 52–66.
- Garcia, J., Josep, B. and Argilés, M. (2018) 'On the relationship between compliance with recommendations on the audit committee of codes of good practices and financial reporting quality', *Journal of Management and Governance*. Springer US, 22(4), pp. 921–946.
- Gibbs, G. R. (2007) *Thematic Coding and Categorizing, Analyzing Qualitative Data*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Gilbert, N. (2008) Researching Social Life. 3rd Editio. London, UK: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Gillan, S. L. (2006) 'Recent developments in corporate governance: An overview', Journal of Corporate Finance, 12(3), pp. 381–402.
- Gray, R., Owen, D. and Adams, C. (1996) Accounting and Accountability: Changes and Challenges in Corporate Social and Environmental Reporting. London: Prentice-Hall.
- Gray, S. J. (1988) 'Towards a theory of cultural influence on the development of accounting systems internationally', *Abacus*, 24(I), pp. 1–15.
- Gray, S. J., Radebaugh, L. H. and Roberts, C. B. (1990) 'International perceptions of cost constraints on voluntary information disclosures: A comparative study of UK and US multinationals', *Journal of International Business Studies*, 21(4), pp. 597–621.
- Greenbury, R. (1995) *Directors Remuneration: Report of A Study Group Chaired By Sir Richard Greenbury*. London: Gee and Co.
- Griffith, S. J. (2016) 'Corporate governance in an Era of Compliance', William and Mary Law Review, 57(6), pp. 2075–2140.
- Grossman, S. (1981) 'The informational role of warranties and private disclosure about product', *Journal of Law and Economics*, pp. 461–483.

- Guest, P. M. (2019) 'Does board ethnic diversity impact board monitoring outcomes?', British Journal of Management, 30, pp. 53–74.
- Gulzar, M. A., & Zongjun, W. (2011) 'Corporate governance characteristics and earnings management: Empirical evidence from Chinese listed firms', International Journal of Accounting and Financial Reporting, 1(1), 133.
- Gul, F.A. and Leung, S. (2004) 'Board leadership, outside directors' expertise and voluntary corporate disclosures', *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 23(5), pp. 351–379.
- Hair, F. J., Babin, B., Money, A. H. and Samouel, P. (2003) *Essentials of Business Research Methods*. New Jersey: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J. and Anderson, R. E. (2018) *Multivariate Data Analysis*. Eight Edit. China: Annabel Ainscow.
- Hamid, K. T. (2008) An Assessment of the Relationship between Corporate Governance and Internal Control Systems in the Nigerian Banking Industry. PhD Thesis. Bayero University Kano.
- Hamid, K. T. (2009) 'The Impact of Board Size on Management and Personnel Controls of Banks in Nigeria', in Dandago, K. I. (ed.) *Contemporary Issues in Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*. First edit. Kano: Triumph Publishing co., pp. 134–148.
- Hampel, R. (1998) *Committee on Corporate Governance: Final Report*. London: Gee and Co.
- Hamzah, A. H., & Zulkafli, A. H. (2014) 'Board diversity and corporate expropriation. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*', *164*(August), pp. 562–568.
- Haniffa, R. M. and Cooke, T. E. (2002) 'Culture, Corporate Governance and Disclosure in Malaysian Corporations', *ABACUS*, 38(3), pp. 317–349.
- Haniffa, R. M. and Cooke, T. E. (2005) 'The impact of culture and governance on corporate social reporting', *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 24(5), pp. 391–430.
- Haniffa, R. and Hudaib, M. (2006) 'Corporate governance structure and performance of Malaysian listed companies', *Journal of Business Finance & Accounting*, 33, pp. 1034–1062
- Harjoto, M., Laksmana, I. and Lee, R. (2015) 'Board diversity and corporate social responsibility', *Journal of Business Ethics*. Springer Netherlands, 132(4), pp. 641–660.

- Harris, M. K. (2016) Professional Diversity of the Audit Committee and the Effect on the Financial Reporting Process. PhD Thesis. University of Nebraska, Nebraska.
- Hassan, O., Giorgioni, G. and Ronilly, P. (2009) 'The value relevance of disclosure: Evidence from the emerging capital market of Egypt', *The International Journal of Accounting*, 44, pp. 79–102.
- Hassan, O., Giorgioni, G. and Ronilly, P. (2006) 'The extent of accounting disclosure and its determinants in an emerging capital market: The case of Egypt', . *International Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Performance Evaluation*, 3, pp. 41–67.
- Hassan, O. and Marston, C. (2010) Disclosure measurement in the empirical accounting literature: A Review article. No. 10-18. West London, Brunel Business School Uxbridge: Brunel University
- Hassan, R., Marimuth, M., Tariq, E. and Aqeel, R. (2017) 'Ethnic and gender diversity in top level management and firm performance: Shareholder's perspectives', *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 18(4), pp. 1–12.
- Hayes, A. F. (2013) *Introduction to mediation, moderation and conditional process analysis: A regression based approach.* The Gilford Press.
- Hayes, A. F. (2018) *Introduction to mediation, moderation, and conditional process analysis A regression based approach.* The Guilford Press.
- Healy, P. M. and Palepu, K. G. (2001) 'Information asymmetry, corporate disclosure, and the capital markets: a review of the empirical disclosure literature', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 31(1), pp. 405–440.
- Hili, W. and Affes, P. H. (2012) 'Corporate boards gender diversity and earnings Persistence: The case of French listed firms', *Global Journal of management and Business Resaerch*, 12(22), pp. 2249–4588.
- Hillman, A. and Dalziel, T. (2003) 'Boards of Directors and Firm Performance: Integrating Agency and Resource Dependence Perspectives', *The Academy of Management Review*, 28(3), pp. 383–396.
- Hillman, A. J., Cannellas, A. A. and Harris, I. C. (2002) 'The Resource Dependence Role of Corporate Directors: Strategic Adaptation of Board Composition in Response to Environmental Change.', *Journal of Management Studies*, 37, pp. 235–255.

- Ho, S. S. M. and Wong, K. S. (2001) 'A study of the relationship between corporate governance structures and the extent of voluntary disclosure', *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*, 10(2), pp. 139–156.
- Hoang, T. C., Abeysekera, I. and Ma, S. (2018) 'Board Diversity and Corporate Social Disclosure: Evidence from Vietnam', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 151(3), pp. 833–852.
- Hoitash, R. and Bedard, J. C. (2009) 'Corporate Governance and Internal Control over Financial Reporting', *The Accounting Review*, 84(3), pp. 839–867.
- Holland, J. (1995) 'Private voluntary disclosure, financial intermediation and market efficiency', *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, 25(1), pp. 29–68.
- Holthausen, R. W. and Leftwich, R. W. (1983) 'The economic consequences of accounting choice', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 5, pp. 77–117.
- Hongxia, L. and Ainian, Q. (2008) 'Impact of corporate governance on voluntary disclosure in Chinese listed companies', *Corporate Ownership and Control*, 5(2).
- Hossain, M., Prevost, A. and Rao, R. (2001) 'Corporate governance in New Zealand: The effect of the 1993 companies act on the relation between board composition and firm performance', *Pacific-Basin Finance Journal*, 9(2), pp. 119–145.
- Hossain, M. and Reaz, M. (2007) 'The determinants and characteristics of voluntary disclosure by Indian banking companies', *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 14(5), pp. 274–288.
- Humphrey, C. and Lee, B. (2004) *The Real Life Guide to Accounting Research: A Behind- the-Scenes View of Using Qualitative Research Methods*. 1st edn. London, UK: Elsevier.
- Hussey, R. (1999) 'The familiarity threat and auditor independence', *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 7(2), pp. 190–197.
- ICAEW (2001) *The Effective Audit Committee: A Challenging Role*. London: Institute of Charted Accountants in England and Wales.
- Imbens, G. W. and Wooldridge, J. M. (2009) 'Recent developments in the econometrics of program evaluation', *Journal of Economic Literature*, 47(1), pp. 5–86.
- Inchausti, B. na G. (1997) 'The influence of company characteristics and accounting regulation on information disclosed by Spanish firms', *European Accounting*

- *Review*, 6(1), pp. 45–68.
- Inyang, B. J. (2009) 'Nurturing corporate governance system: The emerging trends in Nigeria', *Journal of Business Systems, Governance and Ethics*, 4(2), pp. 1–13.
- Jaafar, S. B. (2016) 'Board diversity in family firms'. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 1–22. Retrieved from http://ssrn.com/abstract=2797718
- Jebran, K., Chen, S. and Zhang, R. (2020) 'Board diversity and stock price crash risk', Research in International Business and Finance. Elsevier, 51, p. 101-122.
- Jensen, M. (1993) 'The modern industrial revolution: Exit and failure of internal control systems', *Journal of Finance*, 48, p. : 831â "880.
- Jizi, M. (2017) 'The Influence of Board Composition on Sustainable Development Disclosure', *Business Strategy and the Environment*. 26(5).
- Kamel, H. and Awadallah, E. (2017) 'The extent of voluntary corporate disclosure in the Egyptian Stock Exchange Its determinants and consequences', *Journal of Accounting in Emerging Economies*, 7(2), pp. 266–291.
- Kamonjoh, E. (2014) Gender diversity on boards: A Review of Global Trends, Institutional Shareholder Services. Retrieved from: www.issgovernance.com
- Kamwana, M. K. and Ombati, R. (2018) 'Effect of Selected Board Characteristics on Financial Voluntary Disclosure among Manufacturing Firms Listed in Nairobi Securities Exchange', 9(12), pp. 141–148.
- Kathavate, J. and Mallik, G. (2012) 'The impact of the Interaction between institutional quality and aid volatility on growth: Theory and evidence', *Economic Modelling*, 29(3), pp. 716–724.
- Katmon, N., Mohamad, Z. Z., Norwani, N. M. and Al-Farooque, O. (2017) 'Comprehensive board diversity and quality of corporate social responsibility disclosure: Evidence from an emerging market', *Journal of Business Ethics*, pp. 1–35.
- Kelton, A. S. and Yang, Y. (2008) 'The impact of corporate governance on internet financial reporting', *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, 27(1), pp. 62–87.
- Kilic, M. and Kuzey, C. (2019) 'The effect of corporate governance on carbon emission disclosures', *International Journal of Climate Change Strategies and Management*, 11(1), pp. 35–53.

- Klein, A. (2002) 'Economic determinants of audit committee independence', *The Accounting Review*, 77(2), pp. 435–52.
- Klein, A. (1998) 'Firm performance and board committee structure', *Journal of Law and Economics*, 41(1), pp. 275–304.
- Knutson, P. (1992) *Financial Reporting in the 1990's and Beyond*. Association for Investment Management and Research, New York.
- Kohler, E. L. (1957) A Dictionary for Accountants. Prentice-Hall.
- Krippendorff, K. (1980) 'Validity in Content Analysis', *Computerstrategien für die Kommunikationsanalyse*, pp. 69–112.
- Krishnamurti, C. and Velayutham, E. (2018) 'The influence of board committee structures on voluntary disclosure of greenhouse gas emissions: Australian evidence', *Pacific Basin Finance Journal*, 50, pp. 65–81.
- Lambert, R. A. (2001) 'Contracting theory and accounting', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 32(1), pp. 3–87.
- LaPorta, R., Lopez-de-Silanes, F., Shleifer, A. and Vishny, R. W. (1998) 'Law and finance', *Journal of Political Economy*, 106, pp. 1113–1155.
- Larcker, D. F., Ormazabal, G. and Taylor, D. J. (2010) The market reaction to corporate governance regulation, *The Regulation of Corporate Governance*. US. 101(2), 431-448..
- Laughlin (1995) 'Methodological themes-empirical research in accounting: Alternative approaches and a Case For "Middle-Range" Thinking", *Accounting, Auditing and Accountability Journal*, 8(1), pp. 63–87.
- Lepore, L., Pisano, S., Amore, G. D. and Guida, C. Di (2019) 'The moderating role of ownership structure on the relation between board independence and voluntary financial disclosure: An Analysis of italian listed company', *Journal of Modern Accounting and Auditing*, 15(7), pp. 323–342.
- Leuz, C. and Wysocki, P. (2008) 'Economic consequences of financial reporting and disclosure regulation: A review and suggestions for future research', *The CPA Journal*, 79(10), p. 24.
- Li, J., Mangena, M. and Pike, R. (2012) 'The effect of audit committee characteristics on intellectual capital disclosure', *The British Accounting Review*. Elsevier Ltd, 44(2), pp. 98–110.

- Liao, L., Luo, L. and Tang, Q. (2015) 'Gender diversity, board independence, environmental committee and greenhouse gas disclosure', *British Accounting Review*. Elsevier Ltd, 47(4), pp. 409–424.
- Lin, J. Z., Xiao, J. Z. and Tang, Q. (2008) 'The roles, responsibilities and characteristics of audit committee in China, *Accounting, Auditing and Accountability Journal*. 21(5), 721-751.
- Linck, J., Netter, J. and Yang, T. (2008) 'The determinants of board structure', *Journal of Financial Economics*, 87, pp. 308–328.
- Lincoln, A. and Adedoyin, O. (2012) 'Corporate governance and gender diversity in Nigerian boardrooms', World Academy of Science, Engineering and Technology, 6(11), pp. 3286–3292.
- Loukil, N., Yousfi, O. and Yerbanga, R. W. kuuni (2019) 'Does gender diversity on boards reduce information asymmetry problems? Empirical evidence from the French market', *Journal of Family Business Management*, pp. 1–50.
- Lückerath-Rovers, M. (2013) 'Women on boards and firm performance', *Journal of Management and Governance*, 17(2), pp. 491–509.
- MacKinnon, D., Fairchild, A. and Fritz, M. (2007) 'Mediation analysis', *Annual review of Psychology*, 58, pp. 593–602.
- Madi, H. K., Ishak, Z. and Manaf, N. A. A. (2014) 'The impact of audit committee characteristics on corporate voluntary disclosure', *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*. Elsevier B.V., 164, pp. 486–492.
- Marimuthu, M. (2008) 'Ethnic diversity on boards of directors and its implications on firm financial performance', *The Journal Of International Social Research*, 1(4).
- Marquardt, C. A. and Wiedman, C. I. (2016) 'Can shareholder activism improve gender diversity on corporate boards?', *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 24(4), pp. 443–461.
- Marshall, C. and Rossman, G. B. (1999) *Designing Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage.
- Martinov-Bennie, N., Soh, D. S. B. and Tweedie, D. (2015) 'An investigation into the roles, characteristics, expectations and evaluation practices of audit committees', *Managerial Auditing Journal*, 30(8/9), pp. 727–755.

- Mas'ud, A., Manaf, N. A. A. and Saad, N. (2014) 'Do trust and power moderate each other in relation to tax compliance?', *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 164(August), pp. 49–54.
- Matemilola, B. T., Bany-Ariffin, A. N., Azman-Saini, W. N. W. and Nassir, A. M. (2018) 'Does top managers' experience affect firms' capital structure?', Research in International Business and Finance, 45(August 2017), pp. 488–498.
- Matsa, D. A. and Miller, A. R. (2011) 'Chipping Away at the Glass Ceiling: Gender Spillovers in Corporate Leadership', *American Economic Review*, 101(3), pp. 635–639.
- Mavrinac, S. and Eccles, R. (1995) 'Improving the corporate disclosure process', *Management Review*, 36(4), pp. 11–25.
- McKinnon, J. and Dalimunthe, L. (2009) 'Voluntary disclosure of segment information by Australian diversified companies', *Accounting and Finance Research*, 33(1), pp. 33-50).
- McMullen, D. A. (1996) 'Audit committee performance: An investigation of the consequences associated with audit committees', *Auditing: A Journal of Practice and Theory*, 15(1), pp. 87–103.
- McNulty, T., Zattoni, A. and and Douglas, T. (2013) 'Developing corporate governance research through qualitative methods: A Review of Previous Studies', *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 21(2), pp. 183–198.
- Meek, G. K., Roberts, C. B. and Gray, S. J. (1995) 'Factors influencing voluntary report disclosures by U.S., U.K. and Continental European multinational corporations', *Journal of International Business Studies*, 26(3), pp. 555–572.
- Mengoli, S., Pazzaglia, F. and Sapienza, E. (2009) 'Effect of governance reforms on corporate ownership in Italy: Is it still Pizza, Spaghetti, and Mandolino?', *Corporate Governance: An International Review*, 17(5), pp. 629–645.
- Mercedes, P. A. (2017) Women on Board: Female Presence on the Board of Directors and Corporate Social Responsibility. PhD Thesis. Georgetown University.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, M. a and Saldana, J. (2014) *Drawing and Verying Conclusions*. 3 edition, *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook*. 3 edition. SAGE.

- Miller, P. R. and Bahnson, B. W. R. (1999) 'Quality financial reporting: Why you Need it and how to implement it?', *Journal of corporate Accounting and finance*, Autumn, pp. 83–103.
- Milliken, F. J. and Martins, L. l. (2016) 'Searching for common threads: Understanding the multiple effects of diversity in organizational groups', Academy of Management Review, 21(2), pp. 402–433.
- Modugu, K. P. and Eboigbe, S. U. (2017) 'Corporate attributes and corporate disclosure level of listed companies in Nigeria: A post-IFRS adoption study', *Journal of Finance and Accounting*, 5(2), pp. 44–52.
- Mohammadi, M. A. D. (2018) Corporate Governance and Financial Information Disclosure in a Developing Country. PhD Thesis. University Tecknologi Malaysia, Skudai.
- Mohd-Nasir, N. and Abdulah, S. N. (2004) 'Voluntary disclosure and corporate governance among financially distressed listed firms in Malaysia', *Financial Reporting, Regulation and Governance*, 1(1), pp. 95–139.
- Mohd Ghazali, N. A. and Weetman, P. (2006) 'Perpetuating traditional influences: Voluntary disclosure in Malaysia following the economics crisis', *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*, 15(2), pp. 226–248.
- Morris, R. (1987) 'Signalling, agency theory and accounting policy choice', *Accounting and Business Research*, 18(69), pp. 47–56.
- Murray, M. P. (2006) 'Avoiding invalid instruments and coping with weak instruments', *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 20(4), pp. 111–132.
- Musallam, S. R. M. (2018) 'The direct and indirect effect of the existence of risk management on the relationship between audit committee and corporate social responsibility disclosure', *Benchmarking: An International Journal*, 25(9), pp. 4125–4138.
- Mustapa, I. R., Ghazali, N. A. M. and Mohamad, M. H. S. (2014) 'The moderating influence of organizational capacity on the association between corporate governance and corporate performance', *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 164, pp. 76–83.
- Naguib, R. and Smucker, J. (2009) 'When economic growth rhymes with social development: The Malaysia experience', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 88, pp. 99–113.

- Nalikka, A. (2009) 'Impact of gender diversity on voluntary disclosure in annual reports', *Accounting and Taxation*, 1(1), pp. 101–113.
- Nekhili, M. and Hayette, G. (2013) 'Are demographic attributes and firm characteristics drivers of gender diversity? Investigating women's positions on French boards of directors', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 118(2), pp. 227–249.
- Newcombe, N. S. (2003) 'Some controls control too much.', *Child Development*, 74, pp. 1050–1052.
- Nguyen, T., Locke, S. and Reddy, K. (2014) 'A dynamic estimation of governance structures and financial performance for Singaporean companies', *Economic Modelling.*, 40, pp. 1–11.
- Nurudeen, S. O., Ahnda, I. M. and Shalli, A. M. (2018) 'Effect of corporate characteristics on voluntary disclosure of listed financial service firms in Nigeria', *Amity Journal of Corporate Governance*, 3(2), pp. 29–49.
- Ntim, C. G. (2016) 'Corporate governance, corporate health accounting, and firm value: The case of HIV/AIDS disclosures in Sub-Saharan Africa', *International Journal of Accounting*, 51(2), pp. 155–216.
- Ntim, C. G. (2015) 'Board diversity and organizational valuation: Unravelling the effects of ethnicity and gender', *Journal of Interprofessional Care*, 19(1), pp. 167–195.
- Ntim, C. G. and Soobaroyen, T. (2013) 'Black empowerment disclosures by South African listed corporations: The influence of ownership and board characteristics', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 116(1), pp. 121–138.
- Ntim, C. G., Opong, K. K., Danbolt, J. and Thomas, D. A. (2012a) 'Voluntary corporate governance disclosures by post-Apartheid South African corporations', *Journal of Applied Accounting Research*, 13(2), pp. 122–144.
- Nwonyuku, K. N. (2016) 'Corporate Governance and Profitability of Listed Food and Beverages Firms in Nigeria', 6(3), pp. 47–105.
- Oba, V. C. and Fodio, M. I. (2013) 'Boards' gender mix as a predictor of financial performance in Nigeria: An empirical study', *International Journal of Economics and Finance*, 5(2), pp. 170–178.
- OECD (2004) Oecd principles of corporate governance. OECD Publishing.

- Okike, E, S., Adegbite, E. and Adegbite, N. F. (2015) 'A review of internal and external influences on corporate governance and financial accountability in Nigeria', *International Journal of Business Governance and Ethics*, 10(2), pp. 65-185.
- Omar, B. and Simon, J. (2011) 'Corporate aggregate disclosure practices in Jordan', Advances in Accounting, Incorporating Advances in International Accounting, 27(1), pp. 166–186.
- Othman, R., Farhana, I., Mohd-Arif, M. S. and Abdul, N. (2014) 'Influence of audit committee characteristics on voluntary ethics disclosure', *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*. Elsevier B.V., 145, pp. 330–342.
- Oxelheim, L. and Randøy, T. (2003) 'The impact of foreign board membership on firm value', *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 27, pp. 2369–2392.
- Pallant, J. (2007) SPSS Survival Manual: A Step by Step Guide to Data Analysis Using SPSS for Windows. Third Edit. Berkshire, England: Open University Press.
- Parker, R. H. (1992) *The macmillan dictionary of accounting*. London: Macmillan.
- Pathan, S. and Faff, R. (2013) 'Does board structure in banks really affect their performance?', *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 37, pp. 1573–1589.
- Pearce, J. and Zahra, S. (1992) 'Board Composition from a Strategic Contingency Perspective', *Journal of Management Studies*, 29(4), pp. 411–438.
- Penttilä, E. (2016) *How do women in top management affect firms ' performance?* Helsinki University.
- Peters, G. and Romi, A. (2013) 'Does the voluntary adoption of corporate governance mechanisms improve environmental risk disclosures? Evidence from greenhouse gas emission accounting', *Journal of Business Ethics*, pp. 1–30.
- Pfeffer, J. and Salancik, G. R. (1978) *The External Control of Organizations: A Resource Dependence Perspective*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Pige, B. (2002) 'Stakeholder theory and corporate governance: The nature of the board information', *Management Journal of Contemporary Issue*, 7(1), pp. 1–17.
- Pletzer, J. L., Nikolova, R., Kedzior, K. K. and Voelpel, S. C. (2015) 'Does gender matter? female representation on corporate boards and firm financial performance A meta-analysis', *PLoS ONE*, 10(6), pp. 1–20.
- Rao, K. and Tilt, C. (2016) 'Board composition and corporate social responsibility: The role of diversity, gender, strategy and decision making', *Journal of Business Ethics*. Springer Netherlands, 138(2), pp. 327–347.

- Rastegar, H., Mohammadi, H. and Saremi, H. (2018) 'A study of identifying relationship between financial expertise of the audit committee members and presentation of financial statements in the Tehran stock exchange', *Pacific Business Review International*, 10(12), pp. 99–106.
- Rasul, I. and Rogger, D. (2015) 'The impact of ethnic diversity in bureaucracies: Evidence from the Nigerian civil service', *American Economic Review*, 105(5), pp. 457–461.
- Razek, M. A. (2015) 'The association between corporate social responsibility disclosure and corporate governance.', *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*, 5(1), pp. 2222–2847.
- Rini, R. (2014) 'The effect of audit committee role and sharia supervisory board role on financial reporting quality at islamic banks in Indonesia', *Journal of Economics, Business, and Accountancy/Ventura*, 17(1), pp. 145–156.
- Roberts, J. and Young, D. (2006) 'The Role of the Board in Creating a High Performance Organization', *Retrieved from: http://www.parcentre.com*.
- Roberts, R. W. (1992) 'Determinants of corporate social responsibility disclosure: An application of stakeholder theory', *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 17(6), pp. 595–612.
- Roodman, D. (2009) 'How to do xtabond2: An introduction to difference and system GMM in stata', *The Stata Journal*, 9(1), pp. 86–136.
- Rose, C. (2007) 'Does female board representation influence firm performance? The Danish evidence.', *Corporate Governance*, 15(2), pp. 404–413.
- Ross, S. A. (1977) 'The determination of financial structure: the incentive signaling approach', *Bell Journal of Economics*, 8(1), pp. 23–40.
- Ross, S. A. (1973) 'The economic theory of agency: The principal's problem', *American Economic Association*, 63, pp. 134–139.
- Rouf, A. (2011a) 'An Empirical Investigation into Corporate Voluntary Disclosure of Management' s Responsibilities in the Bangladeshi Listed Companies', *ASA University Review*, 5(1).
- Rouf, A. (2011b) 'Corporate characteristics, governance attributes and the extent of voluntary disclosure in Bangladesh', *African Journal of Business Management*, 5(19), pp. 7836–7845.
- Rouf, M. A. (2016) 'Board diversity and corporate voluntary disclosure in the annual reports of Bangladesh', *Risk Governance and Control: Financial Markets and*

- *Institutions*, 6(4), pp. 48–55.
- Rouf, M. A. (2017) 'Firm-specific characteristics, corporate governance and voluntary disclosure in annual reports of listed companies in Bangladesh', *International Journal of Managerial and Financial Accounting*, 9(3), pp. 263–282.
- Saldana, J. (2013) *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*. 2nd Edition. London, UK.: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Salterio, S. E., Smith, S. J. R., Kenno, S. A. and McCracken, S. A. (2017) 'Financial reporting interview-based research: A field research primer with an illustrative example', *Behavioral Research in Accounting*, 29(1), pp. 77–102.
- Samaha, K., Khlif, H. and Hussainey, K. (2015) 'The impact of board and audit committee characteristics on voluntary disclosure: A meta-analysis', *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*. Elsevier Inc., 24, pp. 13–28.
- Sarkar, J. and Selarka, E. (2015) 'Women on Board and Performance of Family Firms: Evidence from India', *SSRN Electronic Journal*, pp. 1–57.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2007) *Research Methods for Business Students*. 4th edn. London, UK: Prentice Hall.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2015) *Research Methods for Business Students*. Fifth edit. London, UK: Prentice Hall.
- Saunders, M. N. K., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2019) *Research Methods for Business Students*. Eighth edi. United Kingdom: Pearson Education Limited.
- SCGN (2014) 'Gender Diversity on Boards of Publicly Quoted Companies in Nigeria', Society for Corporate Governance Nigeria. 5(1).
- SEC (2003) Final rule: Disclosure required by sections 406 and 407 of the Sarbanes-Oxley act of 2002. Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office.
- SEC (2011) *Code of Best Practices on Corporate Governance of Nigeria*. Nigeria: Securities and Exchange Commission.
- Sekaran, U. (2013) *Research Methods for Business*. 6th Editio. United States: John Wiley and Sons.
- Sekaran, U. and Bougie, R. (2013) *Research methods for business: A skill-building approach*. New York, US: Wiley and Sons publishers.
- Shehata, N. F. (2014) 'Theories and Determinants of Voluntary Disclosure', *Accounting and Finance Research*, 3(1), pp. 18–26.

- Sheikh, R. A. G., Abdullah and Shah, M. H. (2019) 'Impact of Audit Committee Characteristics on Voluntary Disclosures: Evidence from Pakistan', *Asian Journal of Economics and Empirical Research*, 6(2), pp. 113–119.
- Shleifer, A. and Vishny, R. (1997) 'A survey of corporate governance', *Journal of Finance*, 52, pp. 737–783.
- Shrader, C., Blackburn, V. and Iles, P. (1997) 'Women in management and firm financial performance: An exploratory study', *Journal of managerial issues*, pp. 355–372.
- Silverman, D. (2011) *Interpreting Qualitative Data*. 4th Edition. London, UK.: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Singhvi, S. S. and Desai, B. H. (1971) 'An empirical analysis of the quality of corporate financial disclosure', *The Accounting Review*, 46(1), pp. 129–138.
- Skinner, D. (1994) 'Why firms voluntarily disclose bad news', *Journal of Accounting Research*, 32(38–61).
- Sofian, S. (2005) *Intellectual Capital and Management Accounting Practices*. PhD Thesis. University of Bradford.
- Solomon, J. (2010) *Corporate Governance and Accountability*. Third ed. United Kingdom: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- Stubbs, W. and Higgins, C. (2018) 'Stakeholders' perspectives on the role of regulatory reform in integrated reporting', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 147(3), pp. 489–508.
- Sukthomya, D. (2011) The empirical evidence of voluntary disclosure in the annual reports of of listed companies: The case of Thailand. PhD Thesis. University of Nottingham.
- Swartz, N. P. and Firer, S. (2005) 'Board structure and intellectual capital performance in South Africa', *Meditari Accountancy Research*, 13(2), pp. 145–166.
- Tahir, M. and Anuar, M. B. A. (2016) 'The determinants of working capital management and firms performance of textile sector in pakistan', *Quality and Quantity*, 50(2), pp. 605–618.
- Tahir, M. S. (2017) Dynamic Behaviour of Corporate Cash Holding Determinants Across Sectors in Pakistan. PhD Thesis. Universiti Teknologi Malaysia.
- Tashakkori, A. and Teddlie, C. (2010) SAGE Handbook of Mixed Methods in Social and Behavioral Research. (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks,: CA: Sage.

- Tauringana, V. and Chithambo, L. (2015) 'The effect of DEFRA guidance on greenhouse gas disclosure', *British Accounting Review*, 47(4), pp. 425–444.
- Teh, C. T. (2009) Compliance and Impact of Coporate Governance Best Practice Code on the Financial Performance. PhD Thesis. Massey University.
- Tijjani, B. and Dabor, E. L. (2010) 'The impact of earnings management and corporate governace on firm performace', *Bayero International Journal of Accounting Research*, 4(1).
- Ullmann, A. A. (1985) 'Data in search of a theory: A critical examination of the relationships among social performance, social disclosure, and economic performance of U. S. firms', *Academy of Management Journal*, 10(3), pp. 540–557.
- Upadhyay, A. and Zeng, H. (2014) 'Gender and ethnic diversity on boards and corporate information environment', *Journal of Business Research*. Elsevier Inc., 67(11), pp. 2456–2463.
- Uzun, H., Szewczyk, S. H. and Varma, R. (2004) 'Board composition and corporate and corporate fraud', *Financial Analysts Journal*, pp. 33–43.
- Valsan, R. (2015). Gender Diversity in the Boards of Directors: A Corporate Governance Perspective. Canada. Retrieved from http://www.eucentre.ualberta.ca
- Van der Walt, N. T. and Ingley, C. B. (2003) 'Board Dynamics and the influence of professional Background, Gender and Ethnic Diversity of Directors', *Corporate Governance*, 11(3), pp. 218–234.
- Verrecchia, R. E. (1983) 'Discretionary disclosure', *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, 5(3), pp. 179–194.
- Vijayamohanan, P. N. (2017) Panel Data Analysis with Stata Part1: Fixed Effects and Random Effects Models, MPRA Paper No. 76869. Kerala, India.
- Walker, R. G. (2004) 'Gaps in guidelines on audit committees', *Abacus*, 40(2), pp. 157–192.
- Wallace RO, Naser K, M. A., Wallace, R. S. O., Naser, K. and Mora, A. (1994) 'The relationship between the comprehensiveness of corporate annual reports and firm characteristics in Spain', *Accounting and Business Research*, 25(97), pp. 41–53.

- Wagana, D. M. and Nzulwa, J. D. (2016) 'Corporate governance, board gender diversity and corporate performance: A critical review of literature', *European Scientific Journal*, 12(7), pp. 221–234.
- Wang, M., & Hussainey, K. (2013) 'Voluntary forward-looking statements driven by corporate governance and their value relevance. *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*', 32(3), pp. 26–49.
- Wang, K., Sewon, O. and CathyClaiborne, M. (2008) 'Determinants and consequences of voluntary disclosure in an emerging market: Evidence from China', *Journal of International Accounting. Auditing and taxation*, 17, pp. 14–30.
- Wintoki, M. B., Linck, J. S. and Netter, J. M. (2012) 'Endogeneity and the dynamics of internal corporate governance', *Journal of Financial Economics*. Elsevier, 105(3), pp. 581–606.
- World-Bank (2014) Report on the observance of standards and codes (ROSC) Nigeria, accounting and auditing. Retrieved from http://www.worldbank.org/ifa/rosc_aa_nga.pdf.
- World-Bank (2011) Report on the observance of standards and codes (ROSC) Nigeria, accounting and auditing. Retrieved from http://www.worldbank.org/ifa/rosc_aa_nga.pdf
- United Nations (2013). World Population Prospect, Retrieved from http://www.esa.un.org
- United States Congress, (2002). The Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002. 107th Congress of the United States of America. H.R. 3763. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office.
- Wu, H., Patel, C. and Perera, H. (2015) 'Implementation of audit committee and independent director for financial reporting in China', *Advances in Accounting*, 31(2), pp. 247–262.
- Wymeersch, E. (2002) 'Convergence or divergence in corporate governance patterns in Western Europe?', in J. A. McCahery, P. Moerland, T. R. and L. R. (ed.) *Corporate governance regimes: Convergence and diversity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press., pp. 230–250.
- Xie, B., Davidson, W. N. and Dadalt, P. J. (2003) 'Earnings management and corporate governance: The role of the board and the audit committee', *Journal of Corporate Finance*, 9(3), pp. 295–316.

- Yin, R. K. (2011) *Qualitative Research from Start to Finish*. New York, NY, US: The Guilford Press.
- Zahra, S. A. and Pearce, I. J. A. (1989) 'Board of Directors and Corporate Financial Performance: A Review and Integrative Model', *Journal of Management*, 15(2), pp. 291–334.
- Zhou, H., Owusu-Ansah, S. and Maggina, A. (2018) 'Board of directors, audit committee, and firm performance: Evidence from Greece', *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*, 31, pp. 20–36.

LIST OF PUBLICATIONS

Journal with Impact Factor:

 Kabara, A. S., Abdullah, D. F., Othman, A. B. (2019). The Effect of Governance Code Compliance on Audit Committee Diversity and Corporate Voluntary Disclosure: Evidence from Dynamic Panel Approach. Polish Journal of Management Studies, 20 (1): 223 -232. (Q2, IF: 1.78)

Indexed Journal:

1 Kabara, A. S., Abdullah, D. F., Othman, A. B. (2019). Audit Committee Diversity toward Voluntary Disclosure Reporting With Existence of Regulatory Regime as Moderation Variable. International Journal of Engineering and Advanced Technology, 8(6s3): 994 – 1001 (Indexed by SCOPUS).

Indexed Conference Proceeding:

1 Kabara, A. S., Abdullah, D. F., (2019). Does the Audit Committee Diversity Influence Discretionary Disclosure? A dynamic Panel Analysis on Developing Country. Conference Proceedings, in 2019 (ICBMIS) 1st International Conference on Business, Management and Information Systems. 13-14 November 2019. Universiti Teknologi Brunie, pp. 23. (Indexed by Google Scholar)

Non-Indexed Conference Proceeding:

1 Kabara, A. S., Abdullah, D. F., (2018). Board Gender Diversity and Corporate Financial Disclosure: A Review. *Conference Proceedings, in 2018 (ICEIM) 12th International Conference on Education and Information Management.* 6-8 April 2018. Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, pp. 61-72. ISSN: 2307-8588