

FUZZY LOGIC GRAPH APPROACH TO ELUCIDATE STRUCTURE-
PHOTOCATALYTIC ACTIVITY RELATIONSHIP OF CARBON-DOPED
TITANIUM DIOXIDE

SYAHIRA BINTI OMAR

UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MALAYSIA

FUZZY LOGIC GRAPH APPROACH TO ELUCIDATE STRUCTURE-
PHOTOCATALYTIC ACTIVITY OF CARBON-DOPED TITANIUM DIOXIDE

SYAHIRA BINTI OMAR

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree of
Master of Science

Faculty of Science
Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

AUGUST 2020

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my father, who taught me that the best kind of knowledge to have is that which is learned for its own sake. It is also dedicated to my mother, who taught me that even the largest task can be accomplished if it is done one step at a time.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Alhamdulillah, praise to Allah, with all His kindness and mercy, had gave me the chance to complete this thesis with a success. I would like to express special thanks to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Hadi Nur for the valuable advices and guidance throughout this project. This project could not have completed without his guidance.

I would like to thanks all the lecturers in the Department of Chemistry, Faculty of Science, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia. Thanks for enhance my knowledge in Chemistry and these knowledge really helps in accomplishing this project.

My fellow postgraduate student should also be recognised for their support. My sincere appreciation also extends to all my colleagues and others who have provided assistance at various occasions. Their views and tips are useful indeed. Unfortunately, it is not possible to list all of them in this limited space. I am grateful to all my family member.

ABSTRACT

The discovery of photocatalytic water splitting of titanium dioxide (TiO_2) electrodes by Fujishima and Honda (1972) trigger the extensive study of the structure and the improvement in the performance of TiO_2 as photocatalyst in synthetic chemistry and environmental applications. Despite all the advantages provided from TiO_2 compared to other semiconductor photocatalysts, its two main concern issues, which are large band gap energy and high recombination rate of photogenerated electrons and holes pairs, restraint its usage in practical applications. Hence, doping TiO_2 with non-metal such as carbon is a promising way to modify the properties of TiO_2 for the enhancement the photocatalytic performance of TiO_2 . Although there are many reports about the improvement of TiO_2 's photocatalytic activity, the relationship between the structural and physical properties with the photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO_2 is still not well evaluated. In this study, a new approach has been proposed to elucidate the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship to better understand the dominant properties that determine the photocatalytic activities of carbon-doped TiO_2 which is focusing under UV light system only. Fuzzy Logic Graph with the combination of Fuzzy Inference System modelling has been used as a new approach in determining the dominant factor for the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO_2 . The logic of expertise and from repetition of promising data were used. Fuzzy Inference System contains three fundamental steps including fuzzification, rule evaluation and defuzzification. This study includes four main stages which were data collection, development of Fuzzy Logic Controller, construction of Fuzzy Inference System and assessment of the results by sensitivity analysis. Experimental data that was used in this study was collected from experimental results obtained by our research group. To unveil the structure and physical properties-activity relationship, the type of crystalline phases, surface area, crystallite size and electron-hole recombination were chosen as the factors to be analyzed. Fuzzy Logic Graph analysis shows that surface area is a dominant factor for photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO_2 , it is followed by rate of electron-hole recombination, phase and crystallite size. To summarize, with the help of Fuzzy Logic Controller, the structure physical properties activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO_2 can be evaluated to show which factors that were responsible for the photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO_2 . Although we used the limited source of experimental data to elucidate the physicochemical-photocatalytic properties relationship of carbon-doped TiO_2 , the correlation was successfully described in detail using Fuzzy Logic Graph.

ABSTRAK

Penemuan cemerlang fotomangkin pembelahan air pada elektrod titanium dioksida (TiO_2) oleh Fujishima dan Honda (1972) telah menyebabkan banyak kajian struktural dan penambahbaikan dalam prestasi fotopemangkin TiO_2 sebagai fotopemangkin dalam kimia sintetik dan aplikasi alam sekitar. Walaupun TiO_2 memberikan banyak kelebihan berbanding fotomangkin semikonduktor yang lain, dua masalah utamanya iaitu tenaga jurang jalur yang besar dan penggabungan semula pasangan elektron dan lubang yang tinggi telah menyebabkan penggunaannya di dalam aplikasi praktikal terhad. Oleh itu, pendopan TiO_2 dengan bukan logam seperti karbon adalah cara yang menjanjikan untuk mengubahsui sifat-sifat TiO_2 untuk meningkatkan prestasi fotopemangkin TiO_2 . Walaupun terdapat banyak laporan tentang peningkatan aktiviti fotopemangkinan TiO_2 , hubungan antara sifat-sifat struktural dan fizikal dengan aktiviti fotopemangkinan karbon-terdop TiO_2 dan nampak masih tidak dinilai dengan baik. Dalam kajian ini, satu kaedah baru telah dicadangkan untuk menjelaskan hubungan struktur – aktiviti fotopemangkinan dengan matlamat pemahaman yang lebih baik terhadap sifat-sifat utama yang menentukan aktiviti fotopemangkinan karbon-terdop TiO_2 yang memfokus di bawah sistem cahaya UV sahaja. Graf Logik Kabur dengan gabungan pemodelan Sistem Inferensi Kabur telah digunakan sebagai pendekatan baru dalam menentukan faktor dominan untuk mengenalpasti hubungan aktiviti fotopemangkinan karbon-terdop TiO_2 . Logik kepakaran dan dari pengulangan data yang menjanjikan telah digunakan. Sistem Inferensi Kabur mengandungi tiga langkah asas termasuk fuzzifikasi, penilaian peraturan dan defuzzifikasi. Kajian ini merangkumi empat peringkat utama seperti pengumpulan data, pembangunan Pengawal Logik Kabur, pembinaan Sistem Inferensi Kabur dan penilaian hasil analisis sensitiviti. Data eksperimental yang digunakan dalam kajian ini telah dikumpulkan dari keputusan eksperimental dari kumpulan penyelidikan kami. Untuk merungkai struktur dan hubungan sifat-sifat fizikal, fasa-fasa kristal yang berbeza, luas permukaan, saiz kristal, dan kadar rekombinasi lubang-elektron, akan dijelaskan menggunakan Graf Logik Kabur. Analisis Graf Logik Kabur menunjukkan bahawa kawasan permukaan adalah faktor dominan bagi aktiviti fotopemangkinan karbon terdop TiO_2 , diikuti dengan kadar rekombinasi lubang-elektron, fasa dan saiz Kristal. Untuk merumuskan, dengan bantuan Pemodelan Logik Kabur, sifat-sifat struktural dan fizikal dengan aktiviti fotopemangkinan karbon-terdop TiO_2 dapat dinilai untuk menunjukkan faktor-faktor yang bertanggungjawab terhadap aktiviti fotopemangkinan karbon-terdop TiO_2 . Walaupun kami menggunakan keputusan eksperimental data dari sumber data yang terhad untuk menjelaskan hubungan sifat fizikokimia-fotopemangkin karbon-terdop TiO_2 , korelasi telah berjaya dibincangkan dengan terperinci oleh Graf Logik.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	TITLE	PAGE
	DECLARATION	iii
	DEDICATION	iv
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	v
	ABSTRACT	vi
	ABSTRAK	vii
	TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
	LIST OF TABLES	xi
	LIST OF FIGURES	xii
	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
	LIST OF APPENDICES	xvi
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
	1.1 Background of Study	1
	1.2 Statement of Problem	5
	1.3 Objectives of Study	5
	1.4 Scope of Study	6
	1.5 Hypothesis of Study	7
	1.6 Significance of Study	7
CHAPTER 2	LITERATURE REVIEW	9
	2.1 Photocatalysis	9
	2.2 TiO ₂ as Semiconductor Photocatalyst	12
	2.2.1 Properties of TiO ₂	12

2.2.2	Modification Of TiO ₂ Photocatalyst	14
2.2.2.1	Advantages of Carbon-doped TiO ₂ as Photocatalyst	15
2.3	Mechanism of TiO ₂ as Photocatalyst	16
2.4	Structure-Photocatalytic Activity Relationship of TiO ₂ Photocatalyst	17
2.4.1	Surface Area	18
2.4.2	Crystallite Size	18
2.4.3	Porosity	18
2.4.4	Phase and Crystallinity	19
2.4.5	Rate of Electron-Hole recombination	19
2.4.6	Band Gap Energy	20
2.4.7	Oxygen Vacancy	20
2.4.8	Particle Size	20
2.5	Correlation of Relationship between Structural- Physical Properties and Photocatalytic Activity of Carbon-doped TiO ₂	22
2.6	Fuzzy Logic Theory	24
2.6.1	Application of Fuzzy Logic	24
2.6.2	Fuzzy Graph and its Taxonomy	25
2.6.3	Fuzzy Inference System	26
2.7	Usage of Fuzzy Logic on Photocatalytic Activity	28
CHAPTER 3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	33
3.1	Introduction	33
3.2	Data Collection	33
3.2.1	Preparation of carbon-doped TiO ₂ Photocatalyst	34
3.2.2	Photocatalytic Activity	34
3.2.2.1	Photodegradation of Phenolphthalein	34

	Under UV Light Irradiation	
	3.2.2.2 Photocatalytic Activity of Styrene with Aqueous Hydrogen Peroxide	35
	3.2.3 Characterization of Prepared Catalyst	35
	3.2.3.1 Total Surface Area (BET)	36
	3.2.3.2 X-ray Diffraction (XRD)	37
	3.2.3.3 Photoluminescence (PL)	40
3.3	MATLAB	42
	3.3.1 MATLAB Environment	42
	3.3.2 Toolboxes of MATLAB	42
3.4	Fuzzy Logic Theory	43
	3.4.1 Principle of Fuzzy Inference System	43
	3.4.2 Construction of Fuzzy Inference System	44
	3.4.3 Membership Function	46
	3.4.4 Fuzzy Set Operations	47
	3.4.5 Inference Rules	48
3.5	Sensitivity analysis	48
CHAPTER 4	RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS	51
4.1	Introduction	51
4.2	Structure-Photocatalytic Activity of Carbon-Doped TiO ₂ using Combination of Fuzzy Graph and Fuzzy Inference System	51
4.3	Crisp Graph Representing Structure-Physicochemical Properties Relationship with Photocatalytic Activity Of Carbon-doped TiO ₂	53
4.4	Vertices and Links of the Network of 4 Variables	55
4.5	Proposed Design of Fuzzy Inference System	56
	4.5.1 Fuzzy Rules	62

4.5.2	Response of Fuzzy Logic Model	64
4.6	Fuzzy Graph Representing Relationship between Structural-Physicochemical Properties and Photocatalytic Activity	64
4.7	Relationship between of Structural-Physicochemical Properties and Photocatalytic Activity TiO ₂	68
4.7.1	Particle Size	68
4.7.2	Structural Distortion and Oxygen Vacancy	69
4.7.3	Amount of Carbon	69
4.7.4	Band gap and Sub-band gap	70
4.7.5	Porosity	70
4.8	Summary of the Structure-Photocatalytic Activity Relationship of Carbon-doped TiO ₂ Photocatalyst Photocatalytic Activity	71
CHAPTER 5	CONCLUSIONS	73
5.1	Conclusions	73
5.2	Recommendations	75
REFERENCES		77
APPENDICES		91

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
Table 3.1	Values of BET surface area of the samples	37
Table 3.2	Crystallite size and phase composition of C/TiO ₂	40
Table 3.3	Crystallite size and phase composition of C-TiO ₂	40
Table 4.1	Experimental data and predicted response of fuzzy logic model for photocatalytic activity under UV light irradiations along with independent variables of physicochemical properties	52
Table 4.2	The name and range of linguistic variables for the inputs and outputs	57
Table 4.3	The linguistic values of each of the linguistic variables	59
Table 4.4	Sensitivity of each input parameter on photocatalytic activity of carbon doped TiO ₂ under UV light irradiations	62

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE NO.	TITLE	PAGE
Figure 2.1	Application of TiO ₂	10
Figure 2.2	Energy band in solids (a) insulator (b) semiconductor (c) conductor	11
Figure 2.3	Bulk structures of titanium dioxide (a) anatase, (b) rutile and (c) brookite	13
Figure 2.4	The tetragonal bulk unit cell of (a) anatase and (b) rutile dimension	13
Figure 2.5	Photoreaction of photocatalysts	17
Figure 2.6	Fuzzy Inference System	27
Figure 2.7	Fuzzy membership functions of the input variables (SA, PH, e-h and %C) and output variables (PCA of styrene under UV and visible light irradiations)	29
Figure 2.8	Fuzzy graph G showing the association between input-output variables of the relationship between structural and physical properties and photocatalytic activity of styrene under (a) UV light and (b) visible light irradiations. Red line is a fuzzy connectivity while black line is crisp connectivity.	31
Figure 3.1	N ₂ adsorption-desorption isotherms of (a) commercial TiO ₂ and carbon doped TiO ₂ (C/TiO ₂) samples at different calcination temperature of (b) 300, (c) 400, (d) 500, (e) 600, and (f) 700 °C	36
Figure 3.2	XRD patterns of (a) commercial TiO ₂ , (b) C/TiO ₂ -300, (c) C/TiO ₂ -400, (d) C/TiO ₂ -500, (e) C/TiO ₂ -600 and (f) C/TiO ₂ -700	37
Figure 3.3	XRD pattern of prepared TiO ₂ and carbon doped TiO ₂ (C-TiO ₂) samples at different calcination temperature	39

Figure 3.4	The Photoluminescence spectra for C/TiO ₂ samples at different calcination temperature.	40
Figure 3.5	The photoluminescence spectra for C-TiO ₂ samples at different calcination temperatures.	41
Figure 3.6	Fuzzy Inference System using MATLAB	44
Figure 3.7	Flow chart for the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO ₂ using fuzzy logic	46
Figure 4.1	Graph G showing the association between input-output variables of the relationship between structural and physicochemical properties and photocatalytic activity	54
Figure 4.2	Graph G showing the association between 4 inputs and 1 output variables of the relationship between structural and physicochemical properties and photocatalytic activity	56
Figure 4.3	Fuzzy membership functions of the input variables (a) SA, (b) CS, (C) PH, (d)e-h, (e)T EMP, output variables (f) PCA UV	61
Figure 4.4	Three Dimensional Surface of fuzzy rules for photocatalytic activity of carbon doped-TiO ₂ under UV light irradiations (a)-(e)	63
Figure 4.5	Comparison between the experimental data of photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO ₂ and the fuzzy data using fuzzy inference model	64
Figure 4.6	Relative importance of each input parameter of photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO ₂ by pie chart illustration	65
Figure 4.7	Fuzzy graph G showing the association between input-output variables of the relationship between structural and physicochemical properties and photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO ₂ . Red line is a fuzzy connectivity while black line is crisp connectivity.	66

LIST OF ABBREVIATION

%	-	Percentage
BET	-	Brunauer-Emmet-Teller
° C	-	Degree Celcius
C/TiO ₂	-	Carbon doped TiO ₂
CB	-	Conduction Band
CdS	-	Cadmiun Sulfide
CTAB	-	cetyltrimethylammonium bromide
CRYS	-	Crystallite Size
E _g	-	Band Gap Energy
e-	-	Electron
e/h	-	Rate of Electron-hole recombine
eV	-	Electron Volt
FESEM	-	Field emission scanning electron microscope
h+	-	Positive hole
H ₂ O ₂	-	Hydrogen peroxide
nm	-	Nanometers
PH	-	Phase
PL	-	Photoluminescence
PCA	-	Photocatalytic Activity
SA	-	Surface area
TEMP	-	Temperature
TiO ₂	-	Titanium Dioxide
UV	-	Ultraviolet-visible
UV-Vis DR	-	UV-Visible diffuse reflectance
VB	-	Valance Band
XRD	-	X-ray diffraction
ZnO	-	Zinc Oxide

LIST OF APPENDIX

APPENDIX	TITLE	PAGE
Appendix A	Rules of Fuzzy Inference System	91
Appendix B	Calculation of Sensitivity Analysis	93

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of Study

A significant problem faced by modern societies and threatening humankind's health is air and water pollution. It is due to the industrial and civil activities that create an enormous amount of organic and inorganic pollutants that unavoidably end up in our seas, soil, rivers, and air (Haider *et al.*, 2017). Nowadays, the rising number of environmental problems has resulted in the compulsive development of environmental purification method. This fundamental advanced environmental solution has drawn attention and gained importance over the past years due to its full potential in bringing a significant change in human life. Therefore, new alternatives, environmentally friendly, and sustainable efforts have been done on photocatalysis in various areas, including dye-sensitized solar cells, hydrogen production, removal of organic and inorganic pollutants, organic synthesis, and disinfection of pathogenic organisms (Lazar *et al.*, 2012).

The field of photocatalysis is one of the fastest growing areas both in research and commercial field. Titanium dioxide (TiO_2) has been given maximum attention due to its superior performance since 1972 when Fujishima and Honda reported water decomposition using TiO_2 electrode as a potential semiconductor photocatalytic material (Paulauskas *et al.*, 2013; Taga, 2009). TiO_2 is one of the most promising material because of their applicability in degradation of water pollutants, paint pigments, air purification, electrochemical electrodes, capacitors and dye-sensitized solar cell (DSSC) electrodes (Abdullah *et al.*, 2016; Wong *et al.*, 2011).

Titanium dioxide (TiO₂) was reported showing the best photostability and highest photocatalytic activity (Fox and Dulay, 1993). Besides, TiO₂ have strong oxidizing abilities for decomposition of organic pollutants, low cost and environmentally friendly (Janczyk et al., 2006; Mital & Manoj, 2011; Yoshio et al., 2004). TiO₂ mainly act as heterogeneous photocatalysts, because of its favourable combination of electronic structures which is characterized by a filled valence band and an empty conduction band, light absorption properties, charge transport characteristics and excited states lifetime (Konstantinou and Albanis, 2004; Nakata and Fujishima, 2012; Khan, 2015).

However, despite all the advantages provided by TiO₂ compared to other semiconductor photocatalysts, there are two main concern issues that restrain its usage in practical applications. Firstly, TiO₂ has a large band gap, which is 3.2 eV, and require UV light for the excitation of electrons to take place. Secondly, TiO₂ possesses fast electrons (e⁻) and holes (h⁺) recombination that will decrease the photocatalytic activity.

Many strategies and approaches has been proposed to improve the photocatalytic efficiency of TiO₂, which is known as the most active and suitable semiconductor photocatalyst (Dozzi and Selli, 2013). Various strategies, including using dye sensitization (Saïen and Mesgari, 2016), noble metal loading (Kmetýkó et al., 2016), transition metal addition (Yadav et al., 2016) and non-metal doping (Wang et al., 2012). Noble metals such as Ag, Au, Pt and Pd or the combinations of these metals with TiO₂ were of the particular interest due to its well-known properties of improving the photocatalytic efficiency of TiO₂ under visible light irradiation. They can act as an electron trap and delay the recombination of the e⁻/h⁺ pair through the promotion of the interfacial charge transfer (Fagan et al., 2016). However, due to some problems associated with metal doping, which the metals introduced were not incorporated into the TiO₂ framework, and block the reaction sites on the TiO₂ surface, non-metal elements such as carbon and nitrogen were studied comprehensively (Di Valentin *et al.*, 2005).

The use of non-metal as doping material such as nitrogen (Than et al., 2017), sulfur (Seo et al., 2016), fluorine (Zhang et al., 2016), iodine (Wang et al., 2016) and carbon (Zhang et al., 2016) can control the stability of the TiO₂. Carbon was found to be more efficient compared to most of the non-metal elements due to its useful properties. Carbon materials exist in various forms, such as diamond, graphite, and carbines (Derjaguin et al., 1977). It has been used in photocatalytic applications due to their excellent properties, including high chemical stability, high electrical and thermal conductivity, light weight, non-toxicity and radiation resistant (Zaleska, 2008). The modification of TiO₂ with carbon has generally changed the structure, physical, and electronic properties of TiO₂. The photocatalytic performance enhanced by facilitating faster transport to the active sites on the TiO₂ surface, narrowing the bandgap energy, extending the light absorption to visible range, and suppressing the rate of the recombination of photo-induced electrons and holes (Palanivelu et al., 2008).

Upon comprehensive review, there is no firm conclusion on the factors that affect the photocatalytic activity. Many studies have been carried out to modify the surface area (Nikhil et al., 2015; Kominami et al., 2003; Kowalska et al., 2012; Kowalska et al., 2015) pore structure in terms of size, volume and shape (He et al., 2015), band gap energy (Wajid Shah et al., 2015) and crystalline phase (Kominami et al., 2003; Ouzzine et al., 2014) of TiO₂. These factors remain the focus in the field of TiO₂ photocatalyst to enhance photocatalytic activity (Nakata and Fujishima, 2012).

The relationship between structural and physical properties of photocatalytic activity also have been studied by Prieto-Mahaney and coworkers (2009). In this study, statistical multivariable analyses were used with the aim of obtaining the structure-photocatalytic properties relationship of six properties of 35 commercially available TiO₂ samples with five photocatalytic reactions. The six properties included are specific surface area, density of lattice defects, primary and secondary particle size and existence of anatase and rutile phase. From the statistical multivariable analyses, it was found that the photocatalytic activities strongly depended on the properties of the TiO₂ powders. However, this method required higher number of samples which constitute a significant limitation on determining the structure-photocatalytic activity of TiO₂. In this case, the statistical method have been implemented but it is time-consuming and

also money wasting due to usage of chemicals and it needs a lot of data (Murakami et al., 2009).

The predominant factor that affects the photocatalytic activity of TiO_2 still remained unclear and becomes the grand challenge in the research field of TiO_2 (Ohtani, 2017). Therefore, the conventional analytical method is desperately required that accounts for all complexities and variations of data in investigating the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of TiO_2 photocatalyst. Fuzzy Logic is the nearest solution to complex problems which has the potential of combining human thought and experience into computer-assisted decision making. Fuzzy Set Theory has been studied extensively over the past 30 years. Most of the early interest in Fuzzy Set Theory pertained to representing uncertainty in human cognitive processes (Zadeh, 1965). It is now applied to problems in engineering, business, medical and related health sciences, and the natural sciences (Taylor and Yue, 2010). The use of the Fuzzy Logic Graph is a new approach to correlate the structure and photocatalytic activities. As mentioned above, there are many factors that affect the photocatalytic activity. However, none of the tools have yet been used to elucidate the dominant factors that affect the photocatalytic activity.

As reported, Fuzzy Graph is one of many approaches to solve various problems involving relations and networks (Ore, 1962). The Fuzzy Graph was another focus on the implementation of fuzzy theory in its relation to the theory of graphs. The Fuzzy Graph in the form of graph represents the relationship between the variables precisely indicating the level of the relationship between the variables. Hence, through elucidation using the Fuzzy Graph tool, determination of structure and physical properties-activity can be done.

Regardless of the numerous studies based on the relationship between structural and physical properties of photocatalytic activity remain controversial and still need to be investigated. Thus, in this research, the combination of Fuzzy Logic Graph and Fuzzy Inference System was used to determine the structural-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO_2 .

1.2 Statement of Problem

The utilization of TiO₂ photocatalyst has gained significant attention in air and water treatment as it provides high efficiency in degradation of organic pollutants (Zaleska, 2008). It has been concluded that the photocatalytic activity depends on structural and physicochemical properties of TiO₂. Since then, it is believed that there is a relationship between the structural properties and photocatalytic activity of TiO₂. However, comprehensive research on the correlation between the factors and the photocatalytic performance were not done comprehensively with proof. Many speculations have done to correlate the predominant factor that affects photocatalytic activity of TiO₂.

Furthermore, the dominant factor influencing photocatalytic activity for TiO₂ also have not been clearly clarified. In this study, the Fuzzy Logic Graph with the combination of Fuzzy Inference System modelling has been used as a new approach in determining the dominant factor for the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO₂.

1.3 Objectives of Study

Several objectives to study the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO₂ as follows:

- To study the usage of Fuzzy Inference System for photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO₂.
- To evaluate the relationship between structural and physicochemical properties and photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO₂.
- To determine the dominant factor of carbon-doped TiO₂ towards photocatalytic activity through sensitivity analysis.

1.4 Scope of Study

This study focuses on the elucidation of the physicochemical properties-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO₂ via Fuzzy Logic Controller. This study used a data collection on the physicochemical properties and photocatalytic activity from our research group. The data are the physicochemical properties of carbon-doped TiO₂ characterized using various instruments techniques such as X-ray diffraction (XRD), Scanning Electron Microscope (SEM), UV-visible diffuse reflectance (UV- Vis DR) and Photoluminescence (PL) spectroscopy. The structure and the physical properties-activity relationship was elucidated using the Fuzzy Graph. Four factors, i.e., crystalline phases, surface area, crystallite size, and rate of electron-hole recombination, are chosen as the parameters. In more specific, this study includes four main stages, such as (1) data collection, (2) development of Fuzzy Logic Controller, (3) construction of Fuzzy Inference System and, (4) assessment of the results by sensitivity analysis. In order to predict the dominant factor of physicochemical properties upon determining photocatalytic UV-vis light irradiations, a sensitivity analysis was carried out in the fuzzy model. Sensitivity analysis is the study of how the uncertainty in the output of a mathematical model or system can be divided and allocated to different sources of uncertainty in its inputs.

In this study, data collection on the physicochemical properties and photocatalytic activity were extracted from our research group only to ensure that all data comes in one source and same instrument which is identical system. By using same instruments during characterization, the consistency of data can be maintain. Hence, only four factors, i.e., crystalline phases, surface area, crystallite size and rate of electron-hole recombination, are chosen as the parameters due to the limitation of data from our research group. Therefore, this study will analyze the efficiency of Fuzzy Logic Graph in order to determine the dominant physiochemical properties of carbon-doped TiO₂ towards photocatalytic activity by using existing data only.

1.5 Hypothesis of Study

Fuzzy Logic Controller is one of the simplest methods to clarify the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO₂ photocatalyst. One hypothesized combining the physicochemical properties and photocatalytic activity of all data in current literature can determine the structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon-doped TiO₂ photocatalyst between them using Fuzzy Logic.

1.6 Significance of Study

The development of TiO₂ photocatalysts has led to its usage in many fields including in the degradation of organic pollutants in waste and wastewater treatment. Despite all the physicochemical properties that influence photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO₂, the question arises what the dominant factors influencing photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped TiO₂ are. Therefore, this research highlighted one main significance which is a new approach in photocatalysis to find the structure and physical properties-activity relationship using Fuzzy Graph. This research will be a guideline for future research that other photocatalyst can be precisely enhanced depending on the reaction.

REFERENCES

- A. Nikhil, G. S. Anjusree, S. V. N. and A. S. N. (2015). Visible light-induced photocatalytic activity of high surface area N-doped two-dimensional (2-D) TiO₂ sheets. *Communication*, 7(180 C), 88464–88470.
- Abdullah, A. M., Al-Thani, N. J., Tawbi, K., & Al-Kandari, H. (2016). Carbon/nitrogen-doped TiO₂: New synthesis route, characterization and application for phenol degradation. *Arabian Journal of Chemistry*, 9(2), 229–237.
- Alias S.H. (2019). Structure-photocatalytic activity relationship of carbon doped titanium dioxide analyzed by density functional theory and fuzzy logic graph. PhD Thesis, Universiti Teknolgi Malaysia.
- Amano, F., Nakata, M., & Ishinaga, E. (2014). Photocatalytic activity of rutile titania for hydrogen evolution. *Chemistry Letters*, 43(4), 509–511.
- An, Y., De Ridder, D. J., Zhao, C., Schoutteten, K., Bussche, J. Vanden, Zheng, H., Vanhaecke, L. (2016). Adsorption and photocatalytic degradation of pharmaceuticals and pesticides by carbon doped-TiO₂ coated on zeolites under solar light irradiation. *Water Science and Technology*, 73(12), 2868–2881.
- Bagheri, S., Muhd Julkapli, N., & Bee Abd Hamid, S. (2014). Titanium dioxide as a catalyst support in heterogeneous catalysis. *Scientific World Journal*, 2014.
- Blue, M., Bush, B., & Puckett, J. (2002). Unified approach to fuzzy graph problems. *Fuzzy Sets and Systems*, 125(3), 355–368.
- Braun, J. H., Baidins, A., & Marganski, R. E. (1992). TiO₂ pigment technology: a review. *Progress in Organic Coatings*, 20(2), 105–138.
- Castellote, M., & Bengtsson, N. (2011). Applications of titanium dioxide photocatalysis to construction materials. *Applications of Titanium Dioxide Photocatalysis to Construction Materials*.

- Chen, Q., Xue, C., Li, X., & Wang, Y. (2013). Surfactant's effect on the photoactivity of Fe-doped TiO₂. *Materials Science Forum*, 743–744, 367–371.
- Cheng, H., Wang, J., Zhao, Y., & Han, X. (2014). RSC Advances, 47031–47038.
- Derjaguin B. V., Fedoseev D. V., Varkin V.P. and Vnukov S.P. The nature of metastable phases of carbon. *Nature*. 1977. 269: 398–9.
- Diebold, U. (2002). The surface science of titanium dioxide. *Surface Science Reports*, 48(1), 53–229.
- Di Valentin, C., Pacchioni, G., & Selloni, A. (2005). Theory of carbon doping of titanium dioxide. *Chemistry of Materials*, 17(26), 6656–6665.
- Dong, F., Wang, H., & Wu, Z. (2009). One-step “Green” synthetic approach for mesoporous C-doped titanium dioxide with efficient visible light photocatalytic activity. *Journal of Physical Chemistry C*, 113(38), 16717–16723.
- Dong, F., Xiong, T., Sun, Y., Lu, L., Zhang, Y., Zhang, H., Wu, Z. (2017). Exploring the photocatalysis mechanism on insulators. *Applied Catalysis B: Environmental*, 219, 450–458.
- Dozzi, M. V., & Selli, E. (2013). Doping TiO₂ with p-block elements: Effects on photocatalytic activity. *Journal of Photochemistry and Photobiology C: Photochemistry Reviews*, 14(1), 13–28.
- El-Nahass, M. M., Ali, M. H., & El-Denglawey, A. (2012). Structural and optical properties of nano-spin coated sol-gel porous TiO₂ films. *Transactions of Nonferrous Metals Society of China (English Edition)*, 22(12), 3003–3011.
- Fagan, R., McCormack, D. E., Dionysiou, D. D., & Pillai, S. C. (2016). A review of solar and visible light active TiO₂ photocatalysis for treating bacteria, cyanotoxins and contaminants of emerging concern. *Materials Science in Semiconductor Processing*, 42, 2–14.
- Fischer, K., Gawel, A., Rosen, D., Krause, M., Latif, A. A., Griebel, J., Schulze, A. (2017). Low-temperature synthesis of anatase/rutile/brookite TiO₂ nanoparticles on a polymer membrane for photocatalysis. *Catalysts*, 7(7).

- Fox, M. A., & Dulay, M. T. (1993). Heterogeneous photocatalysis. *Chem. Rev.*, *93*, 341–357.
- Ganesan, N. M., Muthukumarasamy, N., Balasundaraprabhu, R., & Senthil, T. S. (2015). Importance of carbon (prepared from *Azadirachta indica*) for photocatalytic applications. *Optik*, *126*(22), 3317–3320.
- Gao, H., Ding, C., & Dai, D. (2010). Density functional characterization of C-doped anatase TiO₂ with different oxidation state. *Journal of Molecular Structure: Theochem*, *944*(1–3), 156–162.
- Giri, P. K., Galvagno, G., Ferla, A. La, Rimini, E., Coffa, S., & Raineri, V. (2000). Formation and annealing of defects during high-temperature processing of ion-implanted epitaxial silicon : the role of dopant implants. *Materials Science and Engineering B*, *71*, 186–191.
- Górska, P., Zaleska, A., Suska, A., & Hupka, J. (2009). Photocatalytic activity and surface properties of carbon-doped titanium dioxide. *Physicochemical Problems of Mineral Processing*, *43*, 21–30.
- Grima, M. A. (2000). Neuro-Fuzzy modeling in engineering geology. *Balkema Rotterdam*.
- Guo, B., Shen, H., Shu, K., Zeng, Y., & Ning, W. (2009). The study of the relationship between pore structure and photocatalysis of mesoporous TiO₂. *Journal of Chemical Sciences*, *121*(3), 317–321.
- Haider, A. J., Al-Anbari, R. H., Kadhim, G. R., & Salame, C. T. (2017). Exploring potential Environmental applications of TiO₂ Nanoparticles. *Energy Procedia*, *119*, 332–345.
- Hanaor, D. A. H., & Sorrell, C. C. (2011). Review of the anatase to rutile phase transformation. *Journal of Materials Science*, *46*(4), 855–874.
- He, K., Zhao, C., Zhao, G., & Han, G. (2015). Effects of pore size on the photocatalytic activity of mesoporous TiO₂ prepared by a sol – gel process. *Journal of Sol-Gel Science and Technology*, *75*(3), 557–563.

- He, Z., Que, W., Chen, J., He, Y., & Wang, G. (2013). Surface chemical analysis on the carbon-doped mesoporous TiO₂ photocatalysts after post-thermal treatment: XPS and FTIR characterization. *Journal of Physics and Chemistry of Solids*, 74(7), 924–928.
- Hoffmann, M. R., Martin, S. T., Choi, W., & Bahnemann, D. W. (1995). Environmental applications of semiconductor photocatalysis. *Chemical Reviews*, 95(1): 69–96.
- Irie, H., Watanabe, Y., & Hashimoto, K. (2003). Carbon-doped Anatase TiO₂ Powders as a Visible-light Sensitive Photocatalyst. *Chemistry Letters*, 32(8), 772–773.
- Jalalvand, A. R., Roushani, M., Goicoechea, H. C., Rutledge, D. N., & Gu, H. W. (2019). MATLAB in electrochemistry: A review. *Talanta*, 194, 205–225.
- Jańczyk, A., Krakowska, E., Stochel, G., & Macyk, W. (2006). Singlet oxygen photogeneration at surface modified titanium dioxide. *Journal of the American Chemical Society*, 128(49), 15574–15575.
- Jang, J. S. R., Sun, C. T., & Mizutani, E. (2005). Neuro-fuzzy and soft computing-A computational approach to learning and machine intelligence. *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, 42(10), 1482–1484.
- Javadian, H., Asadollahpour, S., Ruiz, M., Sastre, A. M., Ghasemi, M., Asl, S. M. H., & Masomi, M. (2018). Using fuzzy inference system to predict Pb (II) removal from aqueous solutions by magnetic Fe₃O₄/ H₂SO₄-activated Myrtus Communis leaves carbon nanocomposite. *Journal of the Taiwan Institute of Chemical Engineers*, 91, 186–199.
- Karbassi, M., Nemati, A., Zari, M. H., & Ahadi, K. (2011). Effect of iron oxide and silica doping on microstructure, bandgap and photocatalytic properties of titania by water-in-oil microemulsion technique. *Transactions of the Indian Ceramic Society*, 70(4), 227–232.
- Kavitha, R., & Devi, L. G. (2014). Synergistic effect between carbon dopant in titania lattice and surface carbonaceous species for enhancing the visible light photocatalysis. *Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering*, 2(2), 857–867.

- Khan, M. (2015). Metal oxides as photocatalysts. *Journal of Saudi Chemical Society*, *19*, 462–464.
- Kim, D. S., & Kwak, S. Y. (2007). The hydrothermal synthesis of mesoporous TiO₂ with high crystallinity, thermal stability, large surface area, and enhanced photocatalytic activity. *Applied Catalysis A: General*, *323*, 110–118.
- Kmetykó, Á., Szániel, Á., Tsakiroglou, C., Dombi, A., & Hernádi, K. (2016). Enhanced photocatalytic H₂ generation on noble metal modified TiO₂ catalysts excited with visible light irradiation. *Reaction Kinetics, Mechanisms and Catalysis*, *117*(1), 379–390.
- Kominami, H., Kato, J. I., Murakami, S. Y., Ishii, Y., Kohno, M., Yabutani, K. I., Ohtani, B. (2003). Solvothermal syntheses of semiconductor photocatalysts of ultra-high activities. *Catalysis Today*, *84*, 181–189.
- Kong, M., Li, Y., Chen, X., Tian, T., Fang, P., Zheng, F., & Zhao, X. (2011). Tuning the relative concentration ratio of bulk defects to surface defects in TiO₂ nanocrystals leads to high photocatalytic efficiency. *Journal of the American Chemical Society*, *133*(41), 16414–16417.
- Konstantinou, I. K., & Albanis, T. A. (2004). TiO₂ -assisted photocatalytic degradation of azo dyes in aqueous solution : kinetic and mechanistic investigations A review. *Applied Catalysis B: Environmental*, *49*, 1–14.
- Kowalska, E., Rau, S., & Ohtani, B. (2012). Plasmonic titania photocatalysts active under UV and visible-light irradiation: Influence of gold amount, size, and shape. *Journal of Nanotechnology*.
- Kowalska, E., Yoshiiri, K., Wei, Z., Zheng, S., Kastl, E., Remita, H., Rau, S. (2015). Hybrid photocatalysts composed of titania modified with plasmonic nanoparticles and ruthenium complexes for decomposition of organic compounds. *Applied Catalysis B: Environmental*, *178*, 133–143.
- Kuriechen, S. K., & Murugesan, S. (2013). Carbon-doped titanium dioxide nanoparticles mediated photocatalytic degradation of azo dyes under visible light. *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution*, *224*(9).

- Lan, Y., Lu, Y., & Ren, Z. (2013). Mini review on photocatalysis of titanium dioxide nanoparticles and their solar applications. *Nano Energy*, 2(5), 1031–1045.
- Lazar, M. A., Varghese, S., & Nair, S. S. (2012). Photocatalytic water treatment by titanium dioxide: Recent updates. *Catalysts*, 2(4), 572–601.
- Lee, H., Woo, C., Youn, B., Kim, S., Oh, S., Sung, Y., & Lee, H. (2005). Bandgap modulation of TiO₂ and its effect on the activity in photocatalytic oxidation of 2-isopropyl-6-methyl-4-pyrimidinol, 35(July), 255–260.
- Li, J., Yang, X., Yu, X., Xu, L., Kang, W., Yan, W., Guo, Y. (2009). Rare earth oxide-doped titania nanocomposites with enhanced photocatalytic activity towards the degradation of partially hydrolysis polyacrylamide. *Applied Surface Science*, 255(6), 3731–3738.
- Li Puma, G., Bono, A., Krishnaiah, D., & Collin, J. G. (2008). Preparation of titanium dioxide photocatalyst loaded onto activated carbon support using chemical vapor deposition: A review paper. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 157(2–3), 209–219.
- Linsebigler, A. L., Lu, G., & Yates, J. T. (1995). Photocatalysis on TiO₂ Surfaces: Principles, Mechanisms, and Selected Results. *Chemical Reviews*, 95(3), 735–758.
- Liu, G., Han, C., Pelaez, M., Zhu, D., Liao, S., Likodimos, V., Dionysiou, D. D. (2012). Synthesis, characterization and photocatalytic evaluation of visible light activated C-doped TiO₂ nanoparticles. *Nanotechnology*, 23(29).
- Liu, J., Zhang, Q., Yang, J., Ma, H., Tade, M. O., Wang, S., & Liu, J. (2014). Facile synthesis of carbon-doped mesoporous. *Chemical Communications*, 2–5.
- Liu, M., Zhou, M., Yang, H., Ren, G., & Zhao, Y. (2016). Titanium dioxide nanoparticles modified three dimensional ordered macroporous carbon for improved energy output in microbial fuel cells. *Electrochimica Acta*, 190, 463–470.
- Lu, J., Wang, Y., Huang, J., Fei, J., Cao, L., & Li, C. (2017). In situ synthesis of mesoporous C-doped TiO₂ single crystal with oxygen vacancy and its enhanced

- sunlight photocatalytic properties. *Dyes and Pigments*, 144, 203–211.
- Mamdani, E. H., & Assilian, S. (1975). An experiment in linguistic synthesis with a fuzzy logic controller. *International Journal of Man-Machine Studies*, 7(1), 1–13.
- Mathew, S., Prasad, A. K., Benoy, T., Rakesh, P. P., Hari, M., & Libish, T. M. (2012). UV-Visible Photoluminescence of TiO₂ Nanoparticles Prepared by Hydrothermal Method.
- Michael R. Hoffmann, Scot T. Martin, Wonyong Choi, and D. W. B. (1995). Environmental applications of photocatalysis. *Green Energy and Technology*, 71, 35–66.
- Mital, G. S., & Manoj, T. (2011). A review of TiO₂ nanoparticles. *Chinese Sci Bull*, 56(16), 1639–1657.
- Mulwa, W. M., Ouma, C. N. M., Onani, M. O., & Dejene, F. B. (2016). Energetic, electronic and optical properties of lanthanide doped TiO₂: An ab initio LDA+U study. *Journal of Solid State Chemistry*, 237, 129–137.
- Murakami, N., Abe, R., & Ohtani, B. (2009). Correlation between photocatalytic activities and structural and physical properties of titanium(IV) oxide powders. *Chemistry Letters*, 38(3), 238–239.
- Muthuchamy, N., Lee, K. P., & Gopalan, A. I. (2017). Enhanced photoelectrochemical biosensing performances for graphene (2D) – Titanium dioxide nanowire (1D) heterojunction polymer conductive nanosponges. *Biosensors and Bioelectronics*, 89, 390–399.
- Nakata, K., & Fujishima, A. (2012). TiO₂ photocatalysis: Design and applications. *Journal of Photochemistry and Photobiology C: Photochemistry Reviews*, 13, 169-189.
- Nave, R. (2015). Band theory of solids. Retrieved from <http://hyperphysics.phy-astr.gsu.edu/hbase/Solids/band.html>

- Nyamukamba, P., Tichagwa, L., Mamphweli, S., & Petrik, L. (2017). Silver/Carbon Co doped titanium dioxide photocatalyst for improved dye degradation under visible light. *International Journal of Photoenergy*, 2017.
- Ohtani, B. (2010). Photocatalysis A to Z-What we know and what we do not know in a scientific sense. *Journal of Photochemistry and Photobiology C: Photochemistry Reviews*, 11(4), 157–178.
- Ohtani, B., Mahaney, O. O. P., Amano, F., Murakami, N., & Abe, R. (2010). What are titania photocatalysts?-An exploratory correlation of photocatalytic activity with structural and physical properties. *Journal of Advanced Oxidation Technologies*, 13(3), 247–261.
- Ohtani, B. (2017). Great challenges in catalysis and photocatalysis. *Front. Chem*, 5(79), 1–3.
- Olkin, I., & Sampson, A. R. (2001). Multivariate Analysis: Overview. *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences*, 10240–10247.
- Ore, O. (1962). Theory of graphs. *American Mathematical Society Colloquium Publications*, 38.
- Ortega-Liébana, M. C., Sánchez-López, E., Hidalgo-Carrillo, J., Marinas, A., Marinas, J. M., & Urbano, F. J. (2012). A comparative study of photocatalytic degradation of 3-chloropyridine under UV and solar light by homogeneous (photo-Fenton) and heterogeneous (TiO₂) photocatalysis. *Applied Catalysis B: Environmental*, 127, 316–322.
- Ortiz A.L., Zaragoza M.M., Gutierrez J.S., Paula M.M. S.Martinez V. (2015). Silver oxidation state effect on the photocatalytic properties of Ag doped TiO₂ for hydrogen production under visible light. *International Journal of Hydrogen Energy*. : 1–8.
- Ouzzine, M., Maciá-agulló, J. A., Lillo-ródenas, M. A., Quijada, C., & Linares-solano, A. (2014). Environmental synthesis of high surface area TiO₂ nanoparticles by mild acid treatment with HCl or HI for photocatalytic propene oxidation. *Applied Catalysis B, Environmental*, 154–155, 285–293.

- Palanivelu, K., Im, J.-S., & Lee, Y.-S. (2007). Carbon doping of TiO₂ for visible light photo catalysis - A review . *Carbon Letters*, 8(3), 214–224.
- Parayil, S. K., Kibombo, H. S., Wu, C. M., Peng, R., Baltrusaitis, J., & Koodali, R. T. (2012). Enhanced photocatalytic water splitting activity of carbon-modified TiO₂ composite materials synthesized by a green synthetic approach. *International Journal of Hydrogen Energy*, 37(10), 8257–8267.
- Paulauskas, I. E., Modeshia, D. R., Ali, T. T., El-Mossalamy, E. H., Obaid, A. Y., Basahel, S. N., Sartain, F. K. (2013). Photocatalytic activity of doped and undoped titanium dioxide nanoparticles synthesised by flame spray pyrolysis. *Platinum Metals Review*, 57(1), 32–43.
- Pelaez, M., Nolan, N. T., Pillai, S. C., Seery, M. K., Falaras, P., Kontos, A. G., Dionysiou, D. D. (2012). A review on the visible light active titanium dioxide photocatalysts for environmental applications. *Applied Catalysis B: Environmental*, 125, 331–349.
- Prieto-Mahaney, O.-O., Murakami, N., Abe, R., & Ohtani, B. (2009). Correlation between photocatalytic activities and structural and physical properties of titanium (IV) oxide powders. *Chemistry Letters*, 38(3), 7–8.
- Rasalingam, S., Wu, C.-M., & Koodali, R. T. (2015). Modulation of pore sizes of titanium dioxide photocatalysts by a facile template free hydrothermal synthesis method: Implications for photocatalytic degradation of rhodamine B. *ACS Applied Materials & Interfaces*, 7(7), 4368–4380.
- Rosenfeld, A. (1975). Fuzzy graph: Fuzzy Sets and Their Applications to Cognitive and Decision Processes. 77–95.
- Sachs, M., Pastor, E., Kafizas, A., & Durrant, J. R. (2016). Evaluation of surface state mediated charge recombination in anatase and rutile TiO₂. *Journal of Physical Chemistry Letters*, 7(19), 3742–3746.
- Saien, J., & Mesgari, Z. (2016). Highly efficient visible-light photocatalyst of nitrogen-doped TiO₂ nanoparticles sensitized by hematoporphyrin. *Journal of Molecular Catalysis A: Chemical*, 414, 108–115.

- Sarmasti Emami, M. R. (2010). Fuzzy logic applications in chemical processes. *Journal of Mathematics and Computer Science*, 01(04), 339–348.
- Scanlon, D. O., Dunnill, C. W., Buckeridge, J., Shevlin, S. A., Logsdail, A. J., Woodley, S. M., Sokol, A. A. (2013). Band alignment of rutile and anatase TiO₂. *Nature Materials*, 12(9), 798–801.
- Sean N.A. (2017). The effect of calcination temperature on the structure photocatalytic activity of carbon-doped titanium dioxide prepared via sol-gel route. Dissertation. Universiti Teknologi Malaysia.
- Seines, M., Babuska, R., & Verbruggen, H. B. (1998). Rule-based modeling: Precision and transparency. *IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man and Cybernetics Part C: Applications and Reviews*, 28(1), 165–169.
- Seo, H., Nam, S. H., Itagaki, N., Koga, K., Shiratani, M., & Boo, J. H. (2016). Effect of sulfur doped TiO₂ on photovoltaic properties of dye-sensitized solar cells. *Electronic Materials Letters*, 12(4), 530–536.
- Shen, M., Wu, Z., Huang, H., Du, Y., Zou, Z., & Yang, P. (2006). Carbon-doped anatase TiO₂ obtained from TiC for photocatalysis under visible light.
- Shi, J. W., Chen, J. W., Cui, H. J., Fu, M. L., Luo, H. Y., Xu, B., & Ye, Z. L. (2012). One template approach to synthesize C-doped titania hollow spheres with high visible-light photocatalytic activity. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 195–196.
- Simonsen, M. E., & Søgaaard, E. G. (2010). Sol-gel reactions of titanium alkoxides and water: Influence of pH and alkoxy group on cluster formation and properties of the resulting products. *Journal of Sol-Gel Science and Technology*, 53(3), 485–497.
- Sunitha, M. S., & Mathew, S. (2013). Fuzzy Graph Theory: A Survey. *Annals of Pure and Applied Mathematics*, 92–110. Retrieved from www.researchmathsci.org.
- Tachibana, Y., Vayssieres, L., & Durrant, J. R. (2012). Artificial photosynthesis for solar water-splitting. *Nature Photonics*, 6(8), 511–518.

- Taga, Y. (2009). Titanium oxide based visible light photocatalysts: Materials design and applications. *Thin Solid Films*, 517(10), 3167–3172.
- Tahir A., Sabariah B. and Arshad, Khairil. A. (2009). Modeling a clinical incineration process using Fuzzy Autocatalytic Set. *Journal of Mathematical Chemistry*, Springer.
- Tanaka, K., Capule, M. F. V, & Hisanaga, T. (1991). Effect of crystallinity of TiO₂ on its photocatalytic action, 187(1), 2–5.
- Taylor, M. A. P., & Yue, W. L. (2010). Examining the possibility of fuzzy set theory application in travel demand modelling. *Journal of the Eastern Asia Society for Transportation Studies*, 8(10), 579–592.
- Than, L. D., Luong, N. S., Ngo, V. D., Tien, N. M., Dung, T. N., Nghia, N. M., Lam, T. D. (2017). Highly visible light activity of nitrogen doped TiO₂ prepared by sol–gel approach. *Journal of Electronic Materials*, 46(1), 158–166.
- Trengove, L. (1972). William Gregor (1761–1817) discoverer of titanium. *Annals of Science*. 29(4): 361–395.
- Vorontsov, A. V., Kabachkov, E. N., Balikhin, I. L., Kurkin, E. N., Troitskii, V. N., & Smirniotis, P. G. (2018). Correlation of surface area with photocatalytic activity of TiO₂. *Journal of Advanced Oxidation Technologies*, 21(1).
- Wajid Shah, M., Zhu, Y., Fan, X., Zhao, J., & Li, Y. (2015). Facile synthesis of defective TiO_{2-x} Nanocrystals with high surface area and tailoring bandgap for visible-light photocatalysis. *Sci. Rep.*, 5(15804).
- Wang, D. H., Jia, L., Wu, X. L., Lu, L. Q., & Xu, A. W. (2012). One-step hydrothermal synthesis of N-doped TiO₂/C nanocomposites with high visible light photocatalytic activity. *Nanoscale*, 4(2), 576–584.
- Wang, L., Kumeria, T., Santos, A., Forward, P., Lambert, M. F., & Losic, D. (2016). Iron oxide nanowires from bacteria biofilm as an efficient visible-light magnetic photocatalyst. *ACS Applied Materials and Interfaces*, 8(31), 20110–20119.

- Wong, C. L., Tan, Y. N., & Mohamed, A. R. (2011). A review on the formation of titania nanotube photocatalysts by hydrothermal treatment. *Journal of Environmental Management*, *92*(7), 1669–1680.
- Xi, X., Dong, P., Pei, H., Hou, G., Zhang, Q., Guan, R., Wang, Y. (2014). Density functional study of X monodoped and codoped (X = C, N, S, F) anatase TiO₂. *Computational Materials Science*, *93*, 1–5.
- Xie, Y., Zhao, X., Li, Y., Zhao, Q., Zhou, X., & Yuan, Q. (2008). CTAB-assisted synthesis of mesoporous F-N-codoped TiO₂ powders with high visible-light-driven catalytic activity and adsorption capacity. *Journal of Solid State Chemistry*, *181*(8), 1936–1942.
- Xu, N., Shi, Z., Fan, Y., Dong, J., Shi, J., & Hu, M. Z. C. (1999). Effects of particle size of TiO₂ on photocatalytic degradation of methylene blue in aqueous suspensions. *Industrial and Engineering Chemistry Research*, *38*(2), 373–379.
- Yadav, R., Waghadkar, Y., Kociok-Köhn, G., Kumar, A., Rane, S. B., & Chauhan, R. (2016). Transition metal ferrocenyl dithiocarbamates functionalized dye-sensitized solar cells with hydroxy as an anchoring group. *Optical Materials*, *62*(2), 176–183.
- Yang, D., Liu, H., Zheng, Z., Yuan, Y., Zhao, J. C., Waclawik, E. R., Zhu, H. (2009). An efficient photocatalyst structure: TiO₂(B) nanofibers with a shell of anatase nanocrystals. *Journal of the American Chemical Society*, *131*(49), 17885–17893.
- Yang, X., Cao, C., Hohn, K., Erickson, L., Maghirang, R., Hamal, D., & Klabunde, K. (2007). Highly visible-light active C- and V-doped TiO₂ for degradation of acetaldehyde. *Journal of Catalysis*, *252*(2), 296–302.
- Yoshio, N., Toshihiro, D., Atsuko, N. ., & Yoshinori, M. (2004). Singlet oxygen formation in photocatalytic TiO₂ aqueous suspension. *Physical Chemistry Chemical Physics*, *6*(11), 2917–2918.
- Yu, C., Zhou, W., Yu, J. C., Liu, H., & Wei, L. (2014). Design and fabrication of heterojunction photocatalysts for energy conversion and pollutant degradation. *Cuihua Xuebao/Chinese Journal of Catalysis*, *35*(10), 1609–1618.

- Zadeh, L. A. (1965) Fuzzy Sets. *Information and control*, 8, 338-353.
- Zadeh, L. A. (1988). Fuzzy Logic. *Computer*, 21(4), 83–93
- Zaleska, A. (2008). Characteristics of doped-TiO₂ photocatalysts. *Physicochemical Problems of Mineral Processing*, 42, 211–222.
- Zhang, J., & Nosaka, Y. (2014). Mechanism of the OH radical generation in photocatalysis with TiO₂ of different crystalline types. *Journal of Physical Chemistry C*, 118(20), 10824–10832.
- Zhang Li. (2013). Characterization and visible light photocatalytic activities for environmental remediation. Nanyang Technological University. Ph.D. Thesis
- Zhang, P., Tachikawa, T., Fujitsuka, M., & Majima, T. (2016). In Situ fluorine doping of TiO₂ superstructures for efficient visible-light driven hydrogen generation. *ChemSusChem*, 9(6), 617–623.